

INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6" x 9" black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.

**ProQuest Information and Learning
300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346 USA
800-521-0600**

UMI[®]

THE CITY ENCOMIUM IN MEDIEVAL AND HUMANIST SPAIN

by

JEFFREY S. RUTH

A dissertation submitted to the Graduate Faculty in Hispanic and Luso-Brazilian Literatures in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy, The City University of New York

2002

UMI Number: 3047261

**Copyright 2002 by
Ruth, Jeffrey Stephen**

All rights reserved.

UMI[®]

UMI Microform 3047261

**Copyright 2002 by ProQuest Information and Learning Company.
All rights reserved. This microform edition is protected against
unauthorized copying under Title 17, United States Code.**

**ProQuest Information and Learning Company
300 North Zeeb Road
P.O. Box 1346
Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346**

© 2002

JEFFREY S. RUTH

All Rights Reserved

This manuscript has been read and accepted for the Graduate Faculty in Hispanic and Luso-Brazilian Literatures in satisfaction of the dissertation requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

April 25/2002

Date

Octavio Di Carmillo

Chair of Examining Committee

April 25/2002

Date

W. J. Lerner

Executive Officer

Dr. Isaiás Lerner

Dr. René Garay

Supervisory Committee

THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

Abstract

THE CITY ENCOMIUM IN MEDIEVAL AND HUMANIST SPAIN

by

Jeffrey S. Ruth

Adviser: Professor Ottavio Di Camillo

This dissertation narrates the history of city encomia in Spain from the genre's roots in the eighth-century De laude Spanie of Isidore through the humanist laudes urbium of ca. 1455 to 1506. Preliminary context for the Spanish tradition is provided in a survey of classical and medieval theoretical writings for the praise of place. The major European city encomia from those periods are also presented.

Ancient authors tended to write about Iberia as a unit - Hispania - rather than to focus on its regions or cities. Hence the establishment of the early laus Hispaniae tradition in passages of Pliny, Solinus, Claudian, and Pacatus. The commonplaces of a temperate climate, gold-bearing rivers, natural fertility, and others, were passed on to Isidore, whose De laude Spanie would influence the much later thirteenth-century encomia of Hispania as seen especially in Jiménez de Rada and the Alfonsine Primera

crónica general. These later texts also incorporated the lamentatio for a lost Hispania, an extended topos that was first applied to the Iberian situation in the eighth-century, post-conquest Crónica mozárabe.

The thirteenth-century city encomia written for Roncesvalles, Seville and Zamora represented a growing tendency in the Peninsula to mark the dignity and history of a local community, and not just Hispania as a wider entity. Fourteenth- and fifteenth-century laudes and lamentationes for cities (by Eiximenis, Pérez de Guzmán, Santillana, Corral, and others) were composed in Catalan and Castilian.

A return to the classical, oratorical model for a city encomium was effected in Spain by way of the Italian humanist example. Bruni's laus urbis for Florence (1404), and the subsequent imitations of it on behalf of Milan, Basel and Genoa, were adapted by five Spanish humanist authors who wrote similar Latin prose encomia for Peninsular cities (Palencia on Seville, 'Geronimo' on Cordoba, Pau on Barcelona, Proaza on Valencia and Sobrarias on Alcañiz). To better illustrate this transfer, the collective Italian model is first analyzed here in terms of its content, rhetoric and politics; these three criteria are then shown to be present in each of the Spanish texts. The brief vogue of the humanist laus urbis in Spain is described as a phase

of Peninsular city encomia that emerged from the literary and political circumstances of its time, and subsequently evolved into local, panegyrical history and verse praise of cities.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

It is a pleasure for me to remember the generosity of several individuals who helped me bring this dissertation to completion. Prof. Ottavio Di Camillo guided the project from the beginning; he was unstinting with his time, and proposed countless large and small improvements for every chapter. It is no exaggeration to say that his expertise in the field of Spanish humanism, as well as his dedication to my own research, made this dissertation possible.

Much of my interest in medieval history and literature came about through a course in the History of the Spanish Language, taught by Prof. Isaías Lerner. He has been a model for me of rigor in scholarship and excellence in teaching.

My experiences in the Luso-Brazilian cultures were extended through courses taught by Prof. René P. Garay. His wide-ranging scholarly interests and his friendship were valuable for me as I developed my study on Spanish city encomia.

I consider myself extraordinarily fortunate to have had the support of these three committee members, as much for their expertise as for their personal qualities. I thank them sincerely.

More recently, I have also enjoyed the unqualified support of Prof. Lía Schwartz, Executive Officer of our program at the CUNY-Graduate Center. Ms. Anna Santiago was

the first person to welcome me to the program, and has since helped me resolve many administrative questions, always with a sense of humor.

I am grateful for the financial assistance received from the CUNY-Graduate Center, and from the U.S.-Spain Program for Cultural Cooperation, the Gulbenkian Foundation, the Rotary Foundation Ambassadorial Program, and the Renaissance Society of America.

Many friends have been enthusiastic supporters of this project for years. To some of them, in Spain, I owe the simple lesson that a city begins with a community. Prof. Lydia Hunt's interest in my work was constant and inspiring. I offer special recognition to the late Prof. Haydée Vitale, who knew before I did that a dissertation lay in store for me. My family, especially my parents, long ago helped initiate this thesis by encouraging me to follow a career in teaching and learning. They have been with me in every way through this project and before it, and I am grateful to them.

For years much of my research has been complemented by that of my wife, Sara. Her insights have challenged my ideas and improved the outcome of my work in many ways. In addition, she brought enormous patience and joy to a difficult process. For all of this, and much more, I dedicate this dissertation to her.

What then is my purpose in this? And the lengthening of my discourse, entirely about the stoas, to what will it bring us? It seems to me that one of the most pleasing things in cities, and I might add one of the most useful, is meetings and mixings with other people. That is indeed a city, where there is much of this. Truly, it is good to speak, and to hear is better and to converse is best, and to add what is fitting to the fortunes of one's friends, rejoicing with them in some things, sorrowing with them in others, and to have the same return from them; and in addition to these there are ten thousand things in being near to one another.

Libanius, Antiochikos (ca. AD 360) 213-214

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction	1
Chapter One: Ancient and Medieval Theory for the Praise of Cities	6
Chapter Two: Ancient Precedents to Medieval and Humanist Encomia of Cities	49
Chapter Three: Medieval Latin Encomia of Cities	122
Chapter Four: The Medieval Iberian <u>laus Hispaniae</u> and <u>laus urbis</u>	153
Chapter Five: Vernacular Praise of City and Kingdom, 1300-1460	226
Chapter Six: The Early Humanist <u>laus urbis</u> and Its Adaptation in Spain	283
Conclusions	369
Bibliography	376

INTRODUCTION

The encomia of Spanish cities written during the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries were the literary descendants of a number of ancient, medieval and early humanist compositions that described and praised cities or countries. The first of these writings date to the formative periods of Western literatures, and are found in a great variety of works: brief passages of Homer and Pindar praising the Greek poleis, Hebrew descriptions of real and ideal places, Latin histories, and many others. Some texts were written and delivered as full panegyric orations, especially those of the Second Sophistic period of the later Roman empire.

During the medieval centuries Latin encomia were written in prose and poetry to exalt certain monastic communities, to dignify the seats of bishoprics, and to express the local pride felt in many of the Northern Italian city states. Iberian authors, beginning most notably with Isidore, gradually developed a tradition of praise for Hispania and for some of its cities, as well as a complementary planctus to grieve the loss of Christian lands after the Moslem invasion. Throughout Europe, it was

in the fourteenth century that vernacular languages increasingly came to be used for city writing. By then, these encomia - particularly in Italy, but not yet in Spain - had begun to approximate the longer extension and general characteristics of the classical models. A full return to the ancient roots of the genre was made by Leonardo Bruni in 1404; his prose Laudatio Florentine urbis was in turn adapted for other cities - notably Milan, Basel and Genoa - by several Italian humanists of the first half of the fifteenth century.

Although the Italian humanist recovery of the classical laus urbis would rather quickly dissolve as a Renaissance genre in Italy, becoming channeled into poetry and also absorbed into some historical writing, those city encomia were taken up as models by humanists from other parts of Europe, especially the northern countries and the Iberian kingdoms.

Five Latin city encomia were written for five Iberian cities - Seville, Cordoba, Barcelona, Valencia and Alcañiz - during the period ca. 1455 to 1506. These compositions resulted principally from the interactions among Italian and Iberian humanists, and the exposure of the latter to classical and humanist textual models. The development of the laus urbis genre in Iberia also derived from the

medieval Iberian precedents for praise of place, including Hispania as a whole and its major cities, such as Seville, Barcelona and Valencia.

The Iberian laus urbis mode of writing, essentially inspired in oratory, followed a similar course in the Peninsula as it had taken in the Italian states, impacting both history and poetry. By the mid-sixteenth century its panegyric qualities were fully assimilated into the municipal histories that were being commissioned in ever-greater numbers by local authorities. And verse encomia of cities were composed (in Latin and Castilian, as poems and within drama) throughout this century and into the seventeenth. Finally, an additional legacy of the laus urbis in Spain was the appearance of favorable city descriptions in many of the picaresque novels.

The six chapters of this dissertation narrate and analyze the several stages of development of the city encomium in Spain, including the classical, medieval Italian, and early humanist precedents that influenced the Peninsular writings at different historical moments. The chronological range of this study ends at approximately 1500 with the definitive implantation in Iberia of the classically inspired city encomium. The great majority of Iberian city texts written over the long period leading up

to the late fifteenth century concerned the cities of Spain, with very few references to Portugal. Where the latter occur, they are included here.

Chapter One reviews ancient and medieval writings that prescribe appropriate content and form for the praise of a country or city, especially the writings of Quintilian and Menander.

Chapter Two is a review of encomiastic writings on cities from ancient times through Late Antiquity, drawn from Greek and Latin prose and poetry, and from Hebrew and Christian scriptures.

Chapter Three extends the coverage of ancient city encomia into the medieval centuries, covering those Latin works written between the eighth and fourteenth centuries. Iberian works from this period are reserved for the next two chapters.

Chapter Four addresses the earliest writings directed to Hispania and, particularly, to its cities, and follows the development of these traditions - along with the planctus or lamentatio - into the prose and poetry of the late thirteenth century.

Chapter Five is an analysis of the newer vernacular versions of city praise in Spain, works that appeared during the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. While these

did reflect the increasing literary contacts with Italy at this time, they cannot be considered humanist encomia.

Chapter Six begins with a summary of the latest scholarship of humanist city encomia, most of it pertaining to the early Italian laudes urbium. Four of these Italian texts are analyzed in order to better define the essential characteristics of the humanist incarnation of city praise. From this analysis it becomes evident that three criteria are present in each of these works: 1) traditional content as modeled in the ancient encomia (noteworthy origins of the city, its favorable physical situation, and its accomplishments over time); 2) rhetorical sophistication previously absent in medieval laudes; and 3) political motivations inspiring the work. In the second half of the chapter, these three criteria are measured against the five laudes urbium written for Spanish cities. Each work is shown to feature all three of these criteria, although in varying combinations and circumstances. Collectively these Spanish city encomia offer further evidence for the more general transfer of humanist codes from Italy to Iberia during the fifteenth century. From a Peninsular perspective they represent, as well, the culminating phase of the long, local tradition for the expression of pride in place and community.

CHAPTER ONE

ANCIENT AND MEDIEVAL THEORY FOR THE PRAISE OF CITIES

This chapter is devoted not to the historical practice of the laus urbis but rather to the ancient and medieval commentaries and treatises written about that genre. That a number of early authors saw fit to include the city encomium in their theoretical tracts on rhetoric or literary composition suggests a considerable importance for the genre. As we shall see, it merited discussion in literary manuals alongside other modes of discourse, including the praise of gods or princes, speeches for the court or senate, philosophical inquiry, and others.

Reflections on the place of city praise among the other genres of speech and writing began with Quintilian (ca. AD 35-95?), but were largely a phenomenon belonging to the wider Greek tradition of rhetoric and literary criticism.¹ Following Quintilian a number of Greek rhetoricians of the Second Sophistic period (second through fourth centuries AD)

¹ Perhaps not surprisingly, the actual practice of the genre - as distinguished from its theory - was also stronger among Greek authors than Latin ones during the classical period and in Late Antiquity.

produced treatises prescribing the proper style and content for each oratorical task. These progymnasmata, or exercise handbooks, kept alive for several centuries the preferred, standardized techniques for praising a city. Two third-century AD Greek rhetoricians, Pseudo-Dionysius and Menander, produced much lengthier treatises. The last known work in this series of theoretical writing was (like the first) in Latin, the anonymous De laudes urbium of the eighth century. During the advancing medieval centuries, the fortune of rhetoric declined, a result of the disappearance of many Roman schools where the discipline had formerly been taught. With this decline we witness a corresponding rupture in the writing of treatises mentioning the praise of cities. Later medieval writers, such as Matthieu de Vendôme and Brunetto Latini, would recognize once again the importance of rhetoric (a prelude to greater attention by the humanists) but not with explicit norms for the praising of a city, as found in earlier theorists.

Each of the authors or phases just described will be examined in more detail in this chapter. Naturally enough, in order to study the city encomia of the Hispanic tradition one must first understand the theoretical references to that genre.² These references can provide a notion of the various

² Although the genre of the city encomium has been somewhat neglected by scholars, some excellent studies exist, each with its particular focus. The following bibliographic survey covers

ways in which the genre has been considered. With this appreciation, these theoretical norms can then be examined for any influence they may have exerted centuries later upon the Spanish medieval and humanist writers of city encomia. As with the heritage of ancient and medieval texts praising cities (i.e. the actual practice of the laus urbis genre), these prescriptive texts must be checked for their relative accessibility, and hence potential influence, during the later medieval and humanist periods in Spain.

some of the most useful studies; these normally attend not only to theory but also to practice. Other references will be cited later.

A comprehensive study of ancient city encomia is found in Laurent Pernot's La rhétorique de l'éloge dans le monde gréco-romain, 2 vols. (Paris: Institut d'Études Augustiniennes, 1993). A panoramic view of the European tradition to 1200 is Carl Joachim Classen's Die Stadt im Spiegel der 'Descriptiones' und 'Laudes urbium' in der antiken und mittelalterlichen Literatur bis zum Ende des zwölften Jahrhunderts (NY/Hildesheim/Zurich: Georg Olms Verlag, 1986). The Northern European Renaissance city encomium was studied by William Hammer in The City Encomium in Northern Europe (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1937); his dissertation ("Encomia of Cities from Antiquity to Humanism," University of Chicago, 1938) provides a wider survey, narrowing its later treatment to Germanic city texts. A lengthy article by Paolo Zanna analyzes several of the middle centuries in this genre: "'Descriptiones urbium' and Elegy in Latin and Vernaculars in the Early Middle Ages," Studi Medievali 3rd ser. 32.2 (1991): 523-596. Dario Cecchetti studies the city praise of the French humanist Nicolas de Clamanges in "'Descriptio loci' e 'laudatio urbis'." Persistenza e rinnovamento di strutture retoriche nell'opera di Nicolas de Clamanges Annali Istituto Universitario Orientale, Napoli, Sezione Romanza 35.2 (July 1993): 381-431. Richard L. Kagan has published several studies of the Hispanic city, especially municipal history and the visual representations of communities in Spain and Spanish America. His most recent contribution is Urban Images of the Hispanic World, 1493-1793, collab. Fernando Marías (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2000). See the bibliography for additional studies.

As a point of departure it seems fairly safe to advance the conclusion that the humanist authors of panegyrics to Seville, Cordoba, Barcelona and other Peninsular cities learned their craft not through the mandates of ancient theory, but rather by following the many examples of the genre. The texts of Quintilian and those who followed him were few and slim – with the special exception of Menander – and probably functioned more as a collective authorization to praise cities rather than as explicit guidance.³ Later chapters will add more information in this regard.

Classical Treatises

Although Quintilian was the first of the ancients to recognize the city encomium as a distinct rhetorical endeavor, a number of celebrated rhetorical manuals prior to his Institutio oratoria made relevant contributions.⁴

³ This was due in part to the standardization of rules for city praise, and the necessary inflection of them to suit each city. "All these handbooks are replete with commonplace and convention, pedantry and priggishness," note D. A. Russell and N. G. Wilson in the introduction to their edition of Menander Rhetor (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1981) xii. Russell and Wilson also observe that the arbiters of rhetoric understood that the best orators would adapt the hair-splitting rules for speaking to the circumstances of each speech, thereby avoiding a lifeless art. In actual practice, however, many orators of the Second Sophistic period (the age during which rhetorical theory flourished) produced formulaic speeches that gave rise to an enduring modern judgment against the literary quality of that age.

⁴ Throughout this chapter and the following ones, quotes are made from a variety of languages. Those quotes from original

The Rhetoric of Aristotle (384-322 BC) was the first such work of consequence. To it we owe the basic division of speechmaking into the three categories that remained widely recognized for centuries: judicial, political or epideictic. Judicial oratory concerned itself with events of the past (typically, a crime); political oratory with events of the future (such as governmental action); and epideictic oratory focused on the present (usually an event or personage to be praised or censured).⁵

In contrast to the more serious ends of judicial or political speeches, the epideictic kind was often pronounced outdoors as part of a celebration of athletic games, or for a politician's birthday, or on the occasion of a wedding. These speeches of praise became synonymous with the term panegyric (meaning "of an assembly"). Epideixis referred to "display," an opportunity for the orator to show his stylistic force or subtlety and to become as much a part of the speaking event as his words themselves. Speeches of

Greek or Hebrew sources are given here in their English translation, as are Latin quotes through Late Antiquity. However, medieval and humanist Latin sources are quoted in the original language, since those texts constitute the focus of this study. Spanish, Portuguese, Catalan, French and Italian quotes are provided in the original language. This scheme will be followed throughout with only a few exceptions. In addition, no attempt will be made to adapt medieval Latin quotes or titles to their classical equivalents, unless a modern norm dictates otherwise. For example, Isidore's seminal work for the Spanish laudes tradition is referred to as De laude Spanie.

⁵ Aristotle, Rhetoric, trans. W. Rhys Roberts (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1971) I, 3.

praise for a city ultimately derive from this vein of ancient oratory.⁶

Aristotle was the first to distinguish between praise (epainos) and encomium (enkōmion). The distinction he drew regarding these two words helped set the theoretical terms for later rhetoricians:

Praise is the expression in words of the eminence of a man's good qualities, and therefore we must display his actions as the product of such qualities. Encomium refers to what he has actually done; the mention of accessories, such as good birth and education, merely helps to make our story credible-good fathers are likely to have good sons, and good training is likely to produce good character. Hence it is only when a man has already done something that we bestow encomiums upon him. (I, 9)

Aristotle made the additional points that praise need not be always high-minded nor directed only at individuals; rather "Praise...may be serious or frivolous; nor is it always of a human or divine being but often of inanimate things, or of the humblest of the lower animals" (I, 9). In fact, certain encomia known as paradoxa enkomia were also written for the most mundane of objects or beings. In Aristotle's lifetime Polycrates had written on behalf of mice, pots, counters, salt, and bumblebees.⁷

⁶ The Greek and Latin terms for the three genres of oratory, as well as for praise and censure, is found in Quintilian, Institutio oratoria, trans. H. E. Butler (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1998) III, iv, 12-16.

⁷ Cited in Theodore C. Burgess, "Epideictic Literature," Studies in Classical Philology 3 (1902): 166.

Despite Aristotle's recognition of the wide variety of subjects suitable for praise, he never takes up the city as such a subject for public speech. Although this omission may seem uncharacteristic of an author so extraordinarily inclined toward commentary on the physical world, it may in fact be in keeping with his tendency to consider the city more as a community of people rather than a concrete assemblage of hills, buildings and the like. Such is the thrust of his Politics in its discussions of the ideal city. In this light, then, it is less surprising to read in Rhetoric the following logical comparison between a person and the state:

Now good birth in a race or a state means that its members are indigenous or ancient: that its earliest leaders were distinguished men, and that from them have sprung many who were distinguished for qualities that we admire. (I, 5)

Aristotle continues to omit mention of the physical city or state, or its praise, as he elaborates on his comparison:

The good birth of an individual, which may come either from the male or the female side, implies that both parents are free citizens, and that, as in the case of the state, the founders of the line have been notable for virtue or wealth or something else which is highly prized, and that many distinguished persons belong to the family, men and women, young and old.

The phrases 'possession of good children' and 'of many children' bear a quite clear meaning. Applied to a community, they mean that its young men are numerous and of a good quality: good in regard to bodily excellences, such as stature, beauty, strength, athletic powers; and also in regard to the excellences of the soul, which in a young man are temperance and courage. Applied to

an individual, they mean that his own children are numerous and have the good qualities we have described. Both male and female are here included; the excellences of the latter are, in body, beauty and stature; in soul, self-command and an industry that is not sordid. Communities as well as individuals should lack none of these perfections, in their women as well as in their men. Where, as among the Lacedaemonians, the state of women is bad, almost half of human life is spoilt. (I, 5)

Although this may seem of little consequence, Aristotle's notion that the state is only as good as its people would be utilized later by Cicero and especially Quintilian to explain how a state or city might be praised.⁸ It is worth noting that the metaphor employed here by Aristotle - the city as an individual person - was to be much used in later centuries.⁹

Aristotle had also written that "All eulogy is based on the noble deeds - real or imaginary - that stand to the credit of those eulogized" (II, 22), but another rhetorical

⁸ Despite the overall excellence of Casilda Elorriaga del Hierro's dissertation on the prescriptions for descriptio in rhetorical treatises, it errs with respect to this passage from Aristotle's Rhetoric. Elorriaga del Hierro wrongly concludes that Aristotle "expone un modelo de descripción de la ciudad a partir de los atributos de la persona" (589). Instead, it appears that Aristotle is simply making a comparison between person and state in a larger consideration of man's happiness (the topic of his Chapter 5), and not proposing a model to be used for the praise of a city. See "La descriptio en las retóricas españolas de 1500-1565. Bases para su estudio," diss., Universidad Complutense de Madrid, 1991.

⁹ Brunetto Latini, writing in approximately the 1260s under a revival of Aristotelian influence, would state that "the lord is like the head of the citizens, and all men desire to have a healthy head, because when the head is sick, all the limbs are sick..." (§75). See The Book of the Treasure, trans. Paul Barrette and Spurgeon Baldwin (NY: Garland, 1993).

treatise of his time, the anonymous Rhetorica ad Alexandrum, is even more blunt in asserting the need to exaggerate and invent when praising a person: "To speak generally," writes the author, "the eulogistic kind [of oratory] is the amplification of creditable purposes, deeds, and words, and the attribution of qualities which do not exist" (1425b 37).¹⁰

The Rhetorica ad Alexandrum gives more detail on praise and blame than does Aristotle, leading one scholar of city encomia, William Hammer, to find apparent "hints" in the text that a person's city or origin could be used as an element of praise for that person. However, this seems unlikely, given the very indirect wording in the Rhetoric.¹¹

Like Aristotle, the author of this treatise offers no prescriptions for the praise of cities. Here we might add that this apparent gap was actually consistent with the

¹⁰ Rhetorica ad Alexandrum, ed. and trans. E. S. Forster (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1971).

¹¹ William Hammer, diss., 57. With respect to the Renaissance availability of the Rhetorica ad Alexandrum, it can be noted that as early as 1508 a printed edition was made by Aldus Manutius in Venice, part of Rhetores Graeci. Further editions appeared in 1536 and 1551 (Venice) and 1539 and 1550 (Basel). Several others followed in the sixteenth century. A Latin translation was published in 1530 in Paris. This publication information is found in Anaximenis, Ars Rhetorica, ed. Manfred Fuhrmann (Leipzig: Teubner, 1966) intro. The Herennium was well known during the Middle Ages. For its presence in medieval Castile, see Charles Faulhaber, Latin Rhetorical Theory in Thirteenth and Fourteenth Century Castile (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1972).

overall dearth of theorizing on praise and blame during ancient times.¹²

Cicero (106-43 BC) had more to say about the description of a place, but only as connected to a legal investigation or trial. He wrote that

In the case of places too there are both natural qualities – on the coast or inland, flat or mountainous, smooth or rugged, salubrious or unhealthy, shady or sunny, and accidental qualities – cultivated or uncultivated, inhabited or deserted, built up or open, obscure or famous for historic monuments, consecrated or secular.
(Partitiones oratoriae, X, 36)¹³

Likewise, in De inventione, he addresses the aspects of place (locus) in a criminal investigation:

In connection with the performance of the act [...] inquiry will be made about place, time, occasion, manner, and facilities. In considering the place where the act was performed, account is taken of what opportunity the place seems to have afforded for its performance. Opportunity, moreover, is a question of the size of the place, its distance from other places, i.e., whether remote or near at hand, whether it is a solitary spot or one much frequented [...]. The following attributes are also to be considered: whether the place is or was sacred or profane, public or private, the property of the person in question or of another. (I, xxvi, 38)

Also in De inventione, Cicero mentions "place of birth" (patria; I, xxiv, 34-36) as an attribute of a person that

¹² For more on this topic, see O. B. Hardison, Jr., The Enduring Monument. A Study of the Idea of Praise in Renaissance Literary Theory and Practice (Westport, CN: Greenwood Press, 1973) 29.

¹³ Cicero, Partitiones oratoriae, trans. H. Rackham, vol. 2 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1960).

can be manipulated when speaking of that person in a court case.¹⁴ Later he lists a series of personal attributes that can be invoked for praising and censuring a person. One's "country" is a part of one's "external circumstances," as are public office, money, connections by marriage, high birth, friends, and power. In essence, a person's city or country could be praised in order to lend honor to that person in the eyes of a judge. The same notion is reiterated later, but without the judicial framework:

Praise and censure will be derived from the topics that are employed with respect to the attributes of persons; these have been discussed above. If one wishes to treat the subject more methodically, these may be divided into mind, body and external circumstances [...]. Extraneous virtues are public office, money, connexions by marriage, high birth, friends, country [patria], power, and all other things that are understood to belong to this class. (II, lix)

From what we can gather, then, Cicero appears not to have addressed the praise of cities as an independent rhetorical function. It is useful, nonetheless, to note that he participated in the growing recognition of epideixis among Latin writers during his lifetime. He himself wrote an encomium to Sicily as part of the speech In Verrem, actio secunda (II, 2-9 and IV, 117-119); he praised several prominent individuals of Roman life; and he described the theory for praising individuals. Laurent Pernot notes that

¹⁴ Cicero, De inventione, trans. H. M. Hubbell (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1960).

one of Cicero's final compositions, a funeral oration for a legion of soldiers, was heavily influenced by the classical Greek epitaphioi (52-53).¹⁵ This genre, known in Latinized form as laudatio funebris, and more generally the presence of the various laudationes of Cicero's age, may be seen collectively as evidence of a growing Latin acceptance of the long-established Greek category of epideixis (genus demonstrativum in Latin), at a time when the other two categories of speech, judicial and political, were ever more restricted in Roman life.

A far greater revitalization of occasional speeches in Greek (and less so in Latin) would soon follow during the Second Sophistic period. However, details of these speeches belong more to the realm of practice than to theory, and will accordingly be treated in the following chapter. For now, it will be essential to view the city during the Imperial age through theory alone. The fact that several authors did in fact choose to explain the norms for praising cities at this time – that is, that theory did accompany practice – attests to the increased importance of the city in the Roman Empire. This group of rhetorical writers began with Quintilian.

¹⁵ The best-known example of this Greek genre of oration was Pericles's speech over the dead in Thucydides's History of the Peloponnesian War (II, 35-46). It will be addressed in Chapter Two.

Quintilian

The most influential Latin rhetorician of the first century, Quintilian, often recognized the importance of encomium in rhetoric, noting its pervasiveness in all of the three genres of oratory (Institutio oratoria III, iv, 15). On the varied subject matter of panegyrics he wrote "This form of oratory is directed in the main to the praise of gods and men, but may occasionally be applied to the praise of animals or even of inanimate objects" (III, vii, 6). Similarly, "[a]gain praise in general terms may be awarded to noble sayings or deeds. Finally things of every kind may be praised. Panegyrics have been composed on sleep and death, and physicians have written eulogies on certain kinds of food" (III, vii, 27-28).

But Quintilian's importance for the present study rests in his recognition of a contemporary need to praise cities in a rhetorically polished manner.¹⁶ The following passage from Quintilian's Institutio oratoria represents the first

¹⁶ Because praise of a city implicitly requires the physical description of a place, it is not surprising to read elsewhere in the Institutio oratoria a discussion of regionum descriptio, even if applied to its utility in a courtroom argument rather than in the context of panegyric (IV, iii, 12). Cicero had used the same term in discussing the rules for historical speeches (De oratore II, xv, 63).

theoretical or abstract treatment of the topic in all of classical literature:

Cities are praised in a similar way to men. The founder takes the place of the parent, and age lends authority, for example to those who are said to be 'sprung from the earth'; virtues and vices in actions are the same as they are in individuals. What is special to this subject derives from the position and fortification of the site. Citizens do honour to cities as children to parents. Praise is given also to buildings; and herein honour, utility, beauty, and originator are considered (honour as in temples, utility as in walls, beauty and originator in both). There is praise too for countries, like the encomium of Sicily in Cicero. Hence we examine beauty and utility - beauty in places by the sea, level, or pleasant; utility in places that are healthy or fertile. (III, vii, 26)¹⁷

The three-part directions by Quintilian - to praise a city for its origins, for its deeds through history, and for its natural setting - seems to have become a kind of institution in later writers on the subject, beginning with the Second Sophistic period of the second through the fourth centuries. These later writers expressed themselves not so much in broad rhetorical manuals as in elementary exercise

¹⁷ The translation is found in the introduction of Menander Rhetor xxiv. Quintilian also recognizes the city as a proper topic for rhetoric when he discusses the appropriate education of a young man. He cites a number of exercises suitable for the development of oratorical skills, including narrative, panegyric and censure, and theses, the last of which "are concerned with the comparison of things and involve questions such as 'Which is preferable, town or country life?...' " (Institutio oratoria, II, iv, 24). The city vs. country debate derived from two classical literary topics - the locus amoenus and the laus urbis - and appears frequently during the following centuries. Examples may be found in Statius (Silvae, II, v, 85 ff.) and in the humanists Giovanni Moccia (Huc redii) and Mantuan (De disceptatione rusticorum & civium).

books for students of rhetoric, the Greek progymnasmata. Two of them have something to say about the encomia or description of cities.

The Progymnasmata of the Second Sophistic

The progymnasmata was not an unknown tool for rhetorical education in the time of Quintilian. In fact, he himself refers to a much earlier use of these exercise books, extending back to the fourth century BC (Institutio oratoria, II, iv, 41). In Quintilian's own prescriptions for the elementary rhetorical training of a boy he names several of the roughly one dozen categories of speeches that an orator needed to practice. His list of compositional exercises included narrative (fictitious, realistic, and historical), refutation and confirmation, praise and blame, commonplaces, theses, moral essays, and praise or denunciation of laws (II, iv). Because these exercises were formally aimed at producing courtroom orators (despite the few opportunities then available for that vein of speechmaking), Quintilian notes that two of his categories, praise and blame, more properly belong not in judicial education but rather in the epideictic realm (that is, for occasional speeches).

.

In fact, in Quintilian's lifetime the epideictic branch of oratory was the one most practiced, though not the most respected. Accordingly, the training manuals for students were not exclusively directed at the more prestigious category of judicial oratory, but often included examples and situations addressing the more ceremonial aspects of life. The vogue of the progymnasmata coincided with the Second Sophistic period, during which style overtook content, when oratorical formulae were sometimes as highly regarded as originality. The period was reminiscent, therefore, of the original sophistic age so criticized by Plato and other Greek thinkers who were more concerned with philosophy than with stylistics.

The progymnasmata alluded to by Quintilian soon developed into a fairly standard set of guidelines for a standard set of speech opportunities. Besides those already mentioned by Quintilian, these types of speeches included fable, anecdote, comparison, description and imaginary speech in character.¹⁸ Note that this variety of categories attempted to address all three categories of oratory. In addition to guidelines, some offered sample compositions, as well.

¹⁸ This terminology is drawn from Russell and Wilson xxvi, and is drawn from the texts of the four extant progymnasmata, those of Theon, 'Hermogenes', Aphthonius, and Nicolaus of Myra.

Perhaps the most useful of these exercises or guidelines was that on encomium. Recognized as the essence of the epideictic genre of oratory, encomium normally referred to the extensive praise of an individual. Its structure had become well established: a person was to be praised for his or her origin (country and city), ancestors and parents, early training and education, and, most importantly, achievements. These were described in Aristotle. Encomium also played a strong supporting role in other speech categories, including occasional addresses at weddings or at the welcoming of a dignitary. It is not difficult to imagine that the practice of encomium by beginning students of rhetoric was a formative experience for their future careers as orators.

The earliest of the four extant progymnasmata was one by Theon, probably dating from the first century. Although it covered a variety of speech topics, none referred to the praise of a city.

The first treatise to do so was one written about the year 200, linked to Hermogenes but not of his authorship. Although the rhetorical ideas of Hermogenes were in general a departure from the very old formula of three kinds of speeches – judicial, deliberative and epideictic – he did reiterate Quintilian on the subject of a city encomium, down

to the very notion of modeling the composition upon the praise of a person:

Subjects for encomia are: a race, as the Greek; a city, as Athens; a family, as the Alcmaeonidae. [...] Furthermore encomium of a city you may undertake from these topics without difficulty. For you will tell of its race that its citizens were autochthonous, and concerning its nurture that they were nourished by the gods, and concerning its education that they were educated by the gods. And you will expound, as in the case of a man, of what sort the city is in its manners and institutions, and what its pursuits and accomplishments.¹⁹

The guidelines above appear in the section dedicated to "Encomium," covering mostly the praise of a person. The section following "Encomium" is devoted to "Comparison" as an oratorical task, and mentions the comparison of one city with another. The next section, "Description," explains the great variety of subjects suitable for description, among them "places, e.g., of harbors, sea-shores, cities." Significantly, 'Hermogenes' notes here that description is necessarily exercised within encomiastic speechmaking (as well as in fable, tale, and commonplace). Modern critics have also noted the necessary use of description in an encomium.²⁰

¹⁹ From a translation by Charles Sears Baldwin, Medieval Rhetoric and Poetic (to 1400) (Gloucester, MA: Peter Smith, 1959) 33. The entire Progymnasmata is found on pages 22-38.

²⁰ "Most [encomia] rely heavily on description," according to O. B. Hardison, Jr. in The Enduring Monument 111. Similarly, Ángel Gómez Moreno states "...conviene recordar que la frontera entre la laus y la descriptio es difícil de establecer...", in España y la Italia de los humanistas. Primeros ecos (Madrid:

The Progymnasmata by 'Hermogenes' had a long life and high visibility via a Latin translation by Priscian, who rendered it as the Preexercitamina around the year 500.²¹ In a modern edition of this work Marina Passalacqua describes Priscian's translation as essentially faithful to the original text, but notes the striking adaptations from the Greek to the Latin cultural context.²² References to Homer, Herodotus, Thucydides, Menander and Aristides were dropped, being substituted with examples from Terence, Sallust, Virgil, Cicero, and other Latin authors. Similarly, the Athenian owl mentioned by 'Hermogenes' becomes the dove of the Roman world.

The significance of this adaptation is that such changes doubtless contributed to the exceptional reception of this text during the Latin medieval centuries, a textual transmission that kept alive the essential rules for city praise that had been articulated, we may recall, even before 'Hermogenes' by Quintilian. (The latter's Institutio oratoria was not rediscovered until the fifteenth century,

Gredos, 1994) 285.

²¹ The translation of the section on encomium ("De Laude") reads as follows: "Quin etiam urbium laudes ex huiusmodi locis non difficulter adquires. Dices enim et de genere, quod indigenae, et de victu, quod a deis nutriti, et de eruditione, quod a deis eruditi sunt. Tractes vero, quomodo de homine, qualis sit structura, quibus professionibus est usa, quid gesserit." See Prisciani Caesariensis, Opuscula, ed. Marina Passalacqua, vol. 1 (Rome: Ed. di Storia e Letteratura, 1987) 44.

²² Prisciani Caesariensis xxii.

when it was then promoted by Valla.)²³ In fact, no fewer than twenty-one copies of the Progymnasmata of 'Hermogenes' are known to have existed in Europe during the fourteenth through the sixteenth centuries.²⁴

The Progymnasmata of a later Greek writer, Aphthonius (approximately AD 400), reiterates the basic structure for the encomium of a person, then mentions in passing that "places" are among the other topics worthy of praise. No further details are offered. Yet it may be assumed that this author drew inspiration from 'Hermogenes' for several reasons: Aphthonius's teacher was Libanius, whose celebrated encomium of Antioch largely followed the prescriptions found in 'Hermogenes'; Aphthonius's own section on "Description" echoes that of 'Hermogenes' (e.g., he copies the example of a night battle found in Thucydides), and features a model composition describing the acropolis at Alexandria; and Aphthonius prescribes the praise of a person in much the same way that 'Hermogenes' had.

²³ In Ottavio Di Camillo, El humanismo castellano del siglo XV, trans. Manuel Lloris (Valencia: Fernando Torres, 1976) 23-24, the author notes that Quintilian's work did appear to be known in its entirety inside Spain as early as the final decades of the fourteenth century. This conclusion is drawn from references contained in the correspondence of the French humanist Nicholas de Clamanges (fl. ca. 1400).

²⁴ Passalacqua comments that "I motivi che suscitarono questo interesse e gli ambienti in cui esso precipuamente si risvegliò meriterebbero, a mio parere, uno studio specifico attraverso un esame dal punto di vista storico-cultural dei codici di questo periodo" (xlv, n. 66).

It is evident from the content of writings by Quintilian, 'Hermogenes' and Aphthonius that by about 400 the praise of a city had become firmly linked to the praise of a person. The following outline shows the similarity between the two kinds of encomium by comparing the prescriptions of two of these writers:

Aphthonius:

Encomium of a Person

- a. Birth (signs, dreams) ----->
- b. Nurture (circumstances of youth) ---->
- c. Training, education ----->
- d. Nature of soul and body ---->
- e. Pursuits (career, deeds) ---->
- f. external resources (kin, friends, possessions, household, fortune)
- g. Death (age, manner, funeral games, progeny)

Hermogenes:

Encomium of a City

- Autochthonous citizenry
- Nourished by gods
- Educated by gods
- Customs and institutions
- Accomplishments

The progymnasmata of both 'Hermogenes' and Aphthonius were not only transmitted through the medieval centuries but were well known to later rhetoricians of the Renaissance. During the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries several Latin translations of Aphthonius were made, assuring his continued use throughout Europe well into the seventeenth century. In Elizabethan England the most popular manual was essentially a vernacular translation and cultural adaptation of the most

popular of these Latin editions of Aphthonius.²⁵ Several treatises in sixteenth-century Spain were influenced in lesser ways, as shown by Casilda Elorriaga del Hierro.²⁶

Pseudo-Dionysius

During the Second Sophistic period in which Theon, 'Hermogenes' and Aphthonius wrote their respective progymnasmata,²⁷ two other authors produced similar but more fully developed treatises focusing on encomium, and paying remarkable attention to the city as a subject for praise.

²⁵ The Aphthonii Sophistae Progymnasmata, first edited by the Marburg University professor Reinhard Lorch in 1537, contained Rudolph Agricola's Latin translation of Aphthonius. A subsequent edition of 1542 added the translation of Joannes Maria Cataneo and voluminous commentary by Lorch. That later edition was quickly reprinted all over Europe. See Francis R. Johnson, ed. and intro., The Foundation of Rhetorike, by Richard Rainolde (New York: Scholars' Facsimiles & Reprints, 1945) iii-xv. According to Johnson, Lorch's enlarged edition "easily outdistanced all others in popularity in the countries of western Europe, and the total number of editions issued ran into the hundreds" (xiii).

²⁶ The influence of ancient rhetorical treatises on Renaissance Spanish theorists of rhetoric is examined with considerable detail by Elorriaga del Hierro in her dissertation. It is not clear whether sixteenth-century Spanish authors of city encomia would have been influenced more through their readings of ancient rhetoricians or of their modern contemporaries. What is certain is that most of the early Latin encomia of cities appeared by 1506, before the first Spanish publication of a rhetorical treatise, namely Alonso de Herrera's 1511 version of George of Trebizond's 1434 work.

²⁷ A slightly later progymnasmata was written during the first half of the fifth century by Nicolaus of Myra, differing little in structure from those already described here, and offering no further insights relevant to cities.

The shorter of these two treatises had been ascribed until fairly recently to Dionysius of Halicarnassus (fl. in Rome after 30 BC). D. A. Russell and N. G. Wilson have made clear that the work dates more likely from the late third century, and in any case is unlike the documented writings of Dionysius.²⁸ This treatise by Pseudo-Dionysius is known as On Epideictic Speeches, and addresses one Echebrates at several points in the text. Clearly a fragment of a larger manual, and similar in scope to the progymnasmata, the treatise is comprised of seven chapters, each of which guides the reader in the proper composition of a particular kind of encomiastic speech. Those kinds are intended for the following circumstances:

1. at festivals
2. for marriages
3. on birthdays
4. at bridal chambers
5. upon the visit of a dignitary to a city
6. at funerals
7. for athletes

As is evident from this list, all but the first chapter are implicitly concerned with praising individuals upon specific occasions. For example, in the chapter "Procedure for Marriage Speeches" the author specifies "Nor should you omit the personalities of the partners in the marriage, but

²⁸ The English translation of Pseudo-Dionysius (found as an appendix (362-81) to Russell and Wilson's Greek-English edition of Menander's treatises) features much more extensive instructions for the praise of cities.

praise them also. [...] The praise will contain the elements of encomia, and the topics are the same, viz. native country, family, nature, upbringing" (367-368). The author has discreetly left off the last (and normally most important) aspect of a person's encomium – accomplishments – presumably because the youthfulness of the bride and groom would preclude noteworthy deeds.

In fact, several chapters also broach the topic of city praise, beginning with the first, "Panegyrics." The term "panegyric" then referred to a public, festive gathering during which one or more celebratory speeches would be offered; only later did the word come to mean the speech itself. In this first chapter, then, directions are given for a panegyric speech. First comes the praise of the god associated with the festival; then the praise of the city, followed by the origin of the festival; then competitions, prizes, praise of the emperor, and lastly, appropriate style.²⁹ The paragraph on city praise is as follows:

One must next tackle the praise of the city in which the festival is held; its position, its origin – including the identity of the founder god or hero and anything that can be said about him – and what the city has done in war or in peace. It will also be in place to speak of its size if it is great, or, should it be small, to say that it is preeminent in beauty and, though small, yet equal to the great in influence. Add also its splendours, e.g. temples or the dedications in

²⁹ The summary of topics noted here is found in Menander Rhetor 362.

them, public and private holidays (e.g. Herodotus speaks of the buildings in Babylon that have five or six roofs), and any river that is there, large or clear or doing a service to the inhabitants of the country. Myths told about the city would also lend much sweetness to the speech. (363)

The above passage is similar in extension and in content to those of Quintilian and 'Hermogenes,' and in spirit also to Aphthonius. Topics covered include the city's physical setting ("position"), its divine or heroic founding, its accomplishments, other noteworthy aspects (temples, holidays, rivers), and local myth. Pseudo-Dionysius presents these elements in a logically organized fashion, adding pointed advice to his reader that the city's merits be heightened whenever possible, its disadvantages converted to advantage (e.g. size). This recalls the similarly direct advice of more ancient manuals, especially that of the Rhetorica ad Alexandrum (1441b 6-8; 1425b 37).

The city plays a small and predictable role in birthday speeches. The honored subject of the speech should be praised not only for the day and season of his birth, but also for where he was born. First comes the region of the world - Asia or Europe - and the honoree's people ("Greek or barbarian") with their attendant qualities. "Next the circumstances within the environment: his city, his metropolis: 'the city is close to a metropolis in honour - great, populous, fertile in manly virtue' - or any other

human excellence it may possess." The individual's relationship with that city must also be addressed.

Pseudo-Dionysius also informs us of another genre of speechmaking directly linked to cities, that described in his fourth chapter. When official representatives from the emperor visited a city, that city would provide a welcoming that included a speech:

Of course the practice is universal, and there is a sort of law or principle generally observed, under which cities make a public address to these persons at their first entrance within the gates, as one might say, by the mouth of some individual chosen from those noted for their education, who speaks as it were with the public voice and makes an address on the common behalf. (371)

Such a speech was to begin with a brief encomium of the emperor, noting the impossibility of doing justice to the man in the short time allotted. Following this was the encomium of the official being welcomed, typically a governor, as implied by Pseudo-Dionysius. The orator should then provide an "exhortation to show goodwill to the city," since "the city is one which shows gratitude to those who use her well." Implicit here seems to be a recognition of civic dignity, of pride among the city's populace, as well as a hint that the city exerted a certain power of its own to influence its destiny. "Next comes the praise of the city, if you wish," a passage meriting a longer citation:

[I]ts origin, its power in its revenues, the culture of the inhabitants, the tributary territory from which the revenue comes: if this is

extensive, reckon it to the city's strength; if small, 'she is content even with this'. You must then mention the founder, whoever he is, god, hero, ancient or recent monarch. If we have myths relating to the city, these should not be omitted either. After this comes the greatness of the city, its beauty, its position - whether it is a mainland city, or coastal, or an island. If we are in a position to mention honours from emperors, these must not be omitted either, any more than past actions, ancient or recent, or previous honours conferred by us on past rulers. (372-373)

Two comments can be made. First, the various elements of this city encomium are not especially well-organized. The related components origin-founder-past actions are interspersed with other elements. Second, the author is clearly aware of the political dimension of the speech, astutely advocating a telling of the city's tributary revenues and of honors received from previous rulers.

The next chapter takes up funeral speeches.

Predictably, again, we find mention of the city as part of the totality of the individual praised:

[...] [I]t is clear that it [the speech] must be based on the same topics as encomia, viz. country, family, nature, upbringing, actions. Up to a point, at least, one must go the same way: e.g. in saying of the subject's native land that it is great, famous, and old. [...] We may indeed have something to repeat which is related of it, as Apollo called Salamis 'divine': <or> that it was founded by a god, like Ionia, Byzantium, and other cities. (374)

The final chapter of Pseudo-Dionysius is an exhortation to athletes. Its minimal mention of the city is limited to this: "You should also compare the city [of the festival]

with others on grounds of size, beauty, founder, special characteristics: this has already been discussed" (380).

Overall, the treatise by Pseudo-Dionysius seems remarkable not only for highlighting the frequent occasions that apparently existed for praising a city during the third century of the Roman empire, but also for the shrewd perspective of the professional orator that is everywhere evident. Both aspects of this text remind us of the deeply political and personal ends of encomium itself.

Menander Rhetor

The Byzantine encyclopedia Suda provides a biography of Menander of Laodicea-on-Lycus, a leading rhetorician of southwest Asia Minor who flourished during the late third century. To him are ascribed the two treatises edited and translated by D. A. Russell and N. G. Wilson as Menander Rhetor.³⁰ Treatise I contains several elements: a brief outline of the epideictic branch of oratory; explanations of the eight kinds of hymns to gods; and prescriptions for praising countries and cities. It is likely that the original treatise contained other topics, as well. Treatise II is quite similar to the text of Pseudo-Dionysius, containing specific recommendations for speaking upon a

³⁰ See note 3 for full citation.

variety of public and private occasions. Although the two works are found together in a tenth-century manuscript, Parisinus graecus 1741, doubt remains that both were indeed written by Menander. The dates are similarly uncertain, although they are likely traceable to the final decade of the third century. Despite these problems, Treatise I and II reveal much about the theory and practice of encomium just prior to the more intense rhetorical revival of the fourth century.³¹

Treatise I devotes no less than some eight thousand words to the topic of praising a country and city, as compared to mere paragraphs found in all the other texts reviewed in this chapter. As such it merits close attention for the present study.

"We begin with the encomia of countries, not because anyone has praised a country just by itself without a city, but because the praises of a country are included in encomia of cities" (29). This opening section, then, describes the physical aspects of the land in which a city is found. Menander considers two categories: "position" and "nature". "Position" refers to the country's relation to land, sea, or sky (climate). "Nature" refers to a land's altitude (mountainous or level), water supply, and fertility.

³¹ Russell and Wilson refer to "the widespread revival of literary skills which accompanied the revival of prosperity and stability in the fourth century" (xviii).

Examples are provided for the praise of these features, even the less desirable ones provided by accident of nature. Menander specifies that such praise should refer always to two criteria, "pleasure" and "utility".³² Thus, "if it is mountainous, it is like a strong man, showing prominent muscles; if it is flat, it is orderly, even, and not bony. [...] If it bears all crops, it is 'like a fertile woman'; if it is barren and less fertile, it 'teaches philosophy and endurance' (31). Well-known authors are cited, including Aristides and Xenophon.

Next Menander proceeds to the praise of a city. His basic formula is the one conceived by Quintilian two centuries earlier:

Praises of cities, then, are combinations of the headings discussed in connection with countries and those which relate to individuals. Thus we should select 'position' from the topics relating to countries, and 'origins, actions, accomplishments' from those relating to individuals. These form the basis of encomia of cities. (33)

It is clear from this scheme that the first section on praise of a country provides one of the components for praise of a city, that is, its physical setting. We may remember that Quintilian referred to this topographical aspect as unique to city praise, since the rest – origin and

³² Quintilian concluded his paragraph on city praise by stating a similar proposition: "Hence we examine beauty and utility – beauty in places by the sea, level, or pleasant; utility in places that are healthy or fertile" (3, vii, 27).

accomplishments of the city – could be drawn from the model of the more traditional praise of a person. In fact, although Menander's words in the paragraph cited above are "origins, actions, accomplishments," he omits "actions," or rather subsumes them into a section on "accomplishments." We are left with a well-defined prescription for city praise in Menander that covers three aspects: 1) physical situation, 2) origin, 3) and accomplishments.

To the first category, already described under praise of a country, Menander adds several details. A city's relation to "sky" or season should include also the topic of its products, apparently its crops and fruit, or possibly its water supply.³³ These are to be judged with respect to duration, quantity and quality. Another element added by Menander refers to the nearness of the city to other territories or nations:

If it is in the middle, it is like a royal palace or government residence, or the boss of a shield – as Aristides said³⁴ – or like the centre of a circle. If it is at the end, 'it shrinks shyly from newcomers as a girl from her lovers.' (39)

³³ See Russell and Wilson's note on page 251.

³⁴ This detail from the Panathenaicus would be picked up later by Leonardo Bruni and adapted for his description of Florence. Both authors recognized the prevailing rivalry among the cities of their regions. This competitive coexistence is also addressed by Menander: "[A]s regards cities, as they say of the cities of Asia, 'though they are near to one another, they do not rob one another of their splendour'" (41). It should be noted that Russell and Wilson express uncertainty about the validity of this passage (252).

Menander also includes instructions for the praise of harbours, bays, and citadels as part of a city's physical setting. Typically, he is extraordinarily meticulous. Of harbors, "If artificial, you will say that they came into existence because of the city, not the city because of them. If they are natural, "they do not silt up because they are natural, whereas artificial harbours do silt up" (43).

Of citadels, "If it is in the centre, the city surrounds it as royal enclosures surround a temple. If it is high, but the area at the top confined, it is like a true holy place, unoccupied save by the gods who hold it" (45). Just as Aristotle had likened individuals to the polis, Menander here associates the key fortress of the polis with divinities. Concluding this section is a statement that could apply to encomium in general, echoing the goals of this genre as stated as early as the Rhetorica ad Alexandrum (fourth century BC): "The best thing, as I said, is to demonstrate the presence of all advantages, and the absence of all disadvantages, or at least to show that the advantages outnumber the disadvantages" (46-47).

Having reviewed the first of Menander's three components for the encomium of a city - that regarding its natural setting -- it remains for us to see the last two. These last two are those that find parallels in the encomium of a person, that is, origin and achievements.

The origin of a city may be praised under five subsections: 1) founders, 2) settlers, 3) date, 4) changes, and 5) causes of foundation.

A founder may be a god, a hero or a man, the first of these being the most laudable (e.g. Hermes for Hermopolis and Helios for Heliopolis). The founder's actions should be praised.

Settlers may be either barbarians (ancient, like the Phrygians, or royal, like the Lydians, Medes, Persians, Ethiopians, and Scythians), or Hellenes. The latter are further subdivided.

Regarding the founding date, Menander proposes three periods:

The oldest – when we may say that a city or country originated before the stars or with the stars or before the flood or after the flood, as the Athenians say they originated with the sun, the Arcadians before the moon, and the Delphians immediately after the flood. (49)

Next is the middle period, "the flowering time of Hellas." The third and final period was the time during which Roman cities were founded. For each period certain advantages must be stated.

The fourth part of a city's beginning refers to fundamental changes experienced by the city in its formative period. These include colonization, union or transferral, growth, or implantation. Again, favor can be found with each, although some negative historical circumstances –

plague, earthquake, or sackings – must be downplayed as much as possible.

The final category of origin proposes five subdivisions, although only three seem evident. Cities are founded 1) for divine, heroic or human reason, with several examples given; 2) because of disastrous or joyous events, or related figures (such as India's Bucephalus in memory of the eponymous horse of Alexander); or 3) in accordance with one of the four "heads of purpose": Justice, Honor, Expediency, or Necessity, each illustrated with historical or mythological examples.

Returning to Menander's original, overall scheme for the encomia of cities, we must address the third and final element, that of cultural achievements and ethical actions.

Achievements include 1) political system; 2) sciences and arts; 3) abilities; and 4) quality of daily life. A city's governance can be that of kingship, aristocracy, democracy, or a mixture of these. If it should be "defective" (e.g. a tyranny instead of a kingship), the writer of the encomium must conceal the defect. Menander notes the futility of describing particular laws, given the unifying Roman rule. Cultivation of the sciences includes astrology, geometry, music, grammar, and philosophy. Arts are either "vulgar" (e.g. pertaining to manual labor, such as that of a goldsmith or carpenter), or "liberal"

(unspecified, but probably pedagogical or administrative). Abilities include "rhetoric, athletics, and the like" (61). Finally, "[i]n addition to these accomplishments, we also consider activities, to judge if the city is governed with good order. This relates to the daily lives of men and women and the education of children" (61).

A city's achievements, as described above, are complemented by its actions. The latter may be judged against the four virtues: justice, temperance, prudence, and courage.

Justice includes piety towards the gods, fair dealing towards humans, and reverence towards the departed. Each is exemplified with well-known cities and their local religious customs, treatment of foreigners, overall management, and observance of funeral rites.

Temperance is manifested in several ways:

Many cities elect officials to control women, in others it is thought wrong for a young person to be seen abroad before mid-morning or after late evening, or for a woman to keep a shop or do any other market business. [...] In private lives, <we consider> whether there is very little adultery or other bad behaviour in the city. (68-69)

With respect to prudence,

we consider whether the city accurately lays down customs and the subjects of laws – inheritances by heirs and other legal topics. [...] On the private side, the question is whether there are many famous rhetors, sophists, geometers, and representatives of other sciences which depend on wisdom. (69)

Finally, "[c]ourage is assessed in peace and war" (69). The former is witnessed in responses to "accidents of fate — earthquakes, famines, plagues, droughts, and so on" (69). The latter weighs the causes, results, and manner of military actions.

Treatise I concludes by noting that the encomium of a city may occur with no special context, or conversely, upon a particular occasion. The latter is made at "feasts or festivals or at a competition or a gladiatorial show" (71). In these cases, the occasion itself deserves the most attention in the encomium, with reduced praise for the city. Instructions are then provided for accomplishing this sort of encomium of a festival.³⁵ This final prescription resembles the style of instruction given by Pseudo-Dionysius in that it is designed for a very particular occasion, rather than for a generic city praise.

Treatise II, like the text of Pseudo-Dionysius, is a collection of meticulous instructions for the crafting of occasional speeches. It is in fact far more detailed and lengthy than Pseudo-Dionysius, frequently offering entire paragraphs to illustrate its recommendations. Several of the speeches address city praise, and advocate the same

³⁵ For more detail on festival speechmaking, see Noel Robertson, Festivals and legends: The Formation of Greek Cities in the Light of Public Ritual (Toronto/Buffalo: University of Toronto Press, 1992).

strategies as in Pseudo-Dionysius. Further comments are therefore unnecessary, as they would be redundant to those made earlier.

The significance of Menander's writing is manifold: its introduction affirms the long tradition of encomium as the essence of epideixis; it reiterates the Aristotelian notion that encomium was normally reserved for persons, and organized by origin and actions; it reproduces the relatively new adaptation – by Quintilian, and followed by 'Hermogenes' – of praising a city as one praises a person; and it provides such a wealth of examples for the praise of cities as to suggest convincingly that the actual practice of the genre had become widespread by the late third century. Its considerable influence may be judged not only in the high estimation of its author during the Byzantine era, but also by the multiple manuscripts through which it was transmitted during the medieval centuries (and accompanied at least once by versions of Aristotle's Poetics and Rhetoric). In 1508, at Venice, it appeared in printed form as part of the Aldus edition Rhetores Graeci. The manuscripts and printed version suggest a likely presence of the text among the Italian humanists of the late fifteenth century, and its possible transmission to visiting Spanish humanists who would later write their own laudes urbium for Peninsular cities. Later chapters of the present study will

attempt to establish correspondences – even if tentative – between Menander's prescriptions for city praise and the Spanish city encomia.

Rhetorical Inactivity in the Medieval and Byzantine Eras

During the Byzantine era, when the divorce between the eastern Greek and western Latin worlds had become established, Menander was the most widely used authority on epideictic speaking in the Greek rhetorical schools at Athens, Constantinople, Antioch, Gaza and Alexandria. Aphthonius's Progymnasmata continued to be used. Hermogenes's several treatises were used for practice in declamatory speech, and grammar was taught from the text by Dionysius Thrax (first century AD). The only post-classical texts added to the canon in Greek schools were the Scriptures (in Greek) and writings by the Greek Church fathers. In terms of rhetoric – city praise included – the Byzantine period was rather conservative. G. A. Kennedy writes that "[t]he functions of primary rhetoric in Byzantium is to present decisions to the public and to strengthen loyalty to church and state through the use of the forms of epideictic."³⁶ The practice of occasional

³⁶ George A. Kennedy, Classical Rhetoric and Its Christian and Secular Tradition from Ancient to Modern Times (Chapel Hill: Univ. of North Carolina Press, 1980) 170. The preceding

speeches flourished, especially the encomia of emperors, but the rhetorical framework remained stable.

The situation of rhetoric in the Latin West after the collapse of the Roman empire was one not of stability as much as of decay. P. O. Kristeller observes that "[t]he practice of having a public audience, and of addressing it aloud, did not exist between the end of the Roman Empire and the twelfth century"³⁷ As in the East, original rhetorical work was little practiced, and the more fragmented nature of cultural production, centered in monastic schools, further reduced transmission of classical texts. For centuries, then, teaching and writing on the subject of rhetoric slavishly followed the dictates of Aristotle (where available), the Rhetorica ad Herennium, and Cicero (mostly the De inventione). The later medieval handbooks for preaching and letterwriting were not so much inventions as they were adaptations of classical rhetorical styles for emerging scenarios of communication.³⁸ Hence, this lack of

information in this paragraph also comes from this section of Kennedy's book.

³⁷ Paul Oskar Kristeller, Renaissance Thought and Its Sources, ed. Michael Mooney (New York: Columbia University Press, 1979) 236.

³⁸ Reference here is to the artes dictaminis and artes notaria of the tenth through twelfth centuries. After this time, civic opportunities for speechmaking returned to many northern Italian cities, and the artes arengandi and the artes predicandi appeared as another kind of adaptation of classical rhetoric. See Kristeller, Renaissance Thought 241.

innovation with respect to rhetorical theory naturally precluded any change in the theory for the encomia of cities. And even if any new approach to rhetorical theory had been developed, it seems unlikely that it would have modified much the scheme of site-origins-accomplishments. After all, the encomium of cities had always been a rather narrow rhetorical topic, with Quintilian's solitary paragraph being the only Latin source on the subject from all of antiquity. (Priscian's Latin version of 'Hermogenes' was, of course, a translation.) We might also remember that when the novel rhetorical approach of Hermogenes appeared in the second century, the dictates for city praise were essentially unchanged from the existing standard set by Quintilian.

The Latin theoretical tradition for the encomia of a city did witness one additional text during the early medieval period. It was the 125-word, eighth-century Lombard manuscript De laudibus urbium, a document that prescribed the same elements found in earlier writers.³⁹ These were: a) the dignity of the founder, and whether he was a god or human; b) the city walls and the physical setting, whether it be coastal or inland, mountainous or level; c) the fertility of the fields, the abundance of springs, and the

³⁹ De laudibus urbium, ed. C. Halm, Rhetores Latini Minores (Leipzig, 1863; Frankfurt: n. p., 1964) 587.

customs of the inhabitants; d) distinctions accrued to the city, good fortune, and deeds originated or carried forward through excellence of character or through war; e) glorious noblemen; and f) neighboring cities of note.

The elements of De laudes urbium appeared in roughly the same order as that advocated by Menander, with some mixing of the three categories of setting, origin, and accomplishments. Nonetheless, it may be prudent to assume that the theoretical inspiration for this text (if any) came not from Menander but from Quintilian. In the Latin world of Late Antiquity and after, the characteristic lack of Greek texts – and translations of them – might well have denied knowledge of Menander to any rhetorical writer, leaving him instead with the more available Latin authors, such as Quintilian (despite the increasing rareness of his work).

Another possibility is that De laudibus urbium was more directly inspired by Priscian's Latin translation of the progymnasmata of 'Hermogenes'. In fact, the content of each section on city praise is similar, and is preceded and followed by a discussion on the topic of "comparison." Regardless of its literary ancestry, as the sole Latin prescription for city praise during the medieval centuries, this text exemplifies the withering of rhetoric prior to its humanist-era revival.⁴⁰

⁴⁰ Kristeller notes that the teaching of rhetoric declined

Increased literary activity of the later medieval centuries brought with it at least one rhetorical tract dedicated in part to descriptio loci. The Ars versificatoria of Matthieu de Vendôme (fl. twelfth century) omits mention of encomium, but recognizes the usefulness of description:

Et notandum est quod, sicut dictum est de descriptionibus praelibatis, descriptio loci vel temporis plerumque potest esse superflua, plerumque opportuna. (I, 110)⁴¹

The author later provides his readers with a verse sample of praise of place. In this illustration he shows obvious knowledge of the ancient locus amoenus, highlighting what the critic Dario Cecchetti has called the essential elements of the topos: "albero, acqua e ombra" (389).

This medieval writer's thorough familiarity with the locus amoenus tradition reminds us that many of the classical sources endured through the Middle Ages, notwithstanding the overall absence of rhetorical theory specific to city praise. Vendôme's century would be followed by another that witnessed the resurgence of ancient theory, especially Aristotle's, and the embracing of rhetoric and its role in city government. This thirteenth-century phase

with the collapse of the Roman Empire. Grammar led rhetoric during the early Middle Ages, despite works such as the rhetorical treatise of Alcuin. During the eleventh and twelfth centuries rhetoric continued to be overshadowed in the schools, now by the field of logic (228-31).

⁴¹ As cited in Edmond Faral, Les arts poétiques du XIIe et du XIIIe siècle (Paris: Champion, 1924) 147-48, and noted in Cecchetti 389.

is best exemplified by Brunetto Latini, whose prescriptions for the strategic use of rhetoric may be seen as one of the early inspirations for the humanist rhetoricians. As such, a discussion of his work will be taken up later as background for the laudes urbium of Leonardo Bruni and other fifteenth-century authors.

Despite the glimmer of interest in descriptio represented by Vendôme's treatise, it is clear from reviewing the post-Carolingian medieval period that the theory of the city encomium stalled. The practice of the genre, however, continued uninterrupted from classical through medieval times. The history of that practice will be the subject of the next two chapters.

CHAPTER TWO

ANCIENT PRECEDENTS TO MEDIEVAL AND
HUMANIST ENCOMIA OF CITIES

The medieval and humanist Iberian authors whose works will be addressed in Chapters Four through Six were heirs to Greek, Hebrew and Latin literary traditions. In each of these traditions one finds numerous expressions of praise for specific cities and countries, and, at times, denunciation. The purpose of the present chapter is to review this extensive record of encomiastic writing for non-Iberian places during Antiquity (through the sixth century), exposing the diversity of genres in which it was practiced, the variety of its cultural orientations (especially classical and Christian), and its pervasiveness. Collectively these many texts can then be seen as a literary and thematic base that served the later medieval and humanist Iberian authors in different ways. Specific comparisons and links across the centuries will be taken up in subsequent chapters with the analysis of the Iberian

encomia.

The content of this chapter has been brought together here through a wide variety of sources, many of which are relatively accessible in modern editions or cited in critical studies. William Hammer's dissertation has provided many useful references, and to some extent the present chapter parallels his first chapter. Carl Joachim Classen's compilation of descriptions and encomia from ancient times through the twelfth century is broad in scope and an excellent reference. By far the most comprehensive source available for the topic of ancient city encomia is Laurent Pernot's La rhétorique de l'éloge dans le monde gréco-romain, in which many of the sources for this chapter are examined. Another quite valuable study is Theodore Burgess's Epideictic Literature.

While these and other studies offer valuable reflections on many of the ancient city encomia, they do not frequently provide excerpted quotes of the texts in question. I have endeavored to do so whenever possible in order to transmit the specific vocabulary and laudatory tone of the texts. This should allow for more meaningful comparisons with works of the following centuries, which we will introduce later.

Ancient Greek Encomiastic Writing on Cities

Poetry. The laudation of Greek cities is first seen in early epic, lyric and dramatic poetry. Normally, sentiments of pride for cities are contained in very brief passages within works of a wider focus. Thus the protagonist of Homer's Odyssey identifies himself by way of his native land:

I am at home in sunny Ithaka. There is a mountain
there that stands tall, leaf-trembling Neritos,
and there are islands
settled around it, lying one very close to
another.
There is Doulichion and Same, wooded Zakynthos,
but my island lies low and away, last of all on
the water
toward the dark, with the rest below facing east
and sunshine,
a rugged place, but a good nurse of men; for my
part
I cannot think of any place sweeter on earth to
look at.
(9.21-28)¹

This passage, brief as it is, draws from both praise (epainos) and description (ekphrasis); each element is necessarily present in varying degrees for any praise of place.

The odes of Pindar (522-443 BC) occasionally render homage to certain cities, while subordinated to another

¹ Homer, Odyssey, trans. Richmond Lattimore (NY: Harper, 1967).

theme. An athletic contest narrated in the Olympian Ode 13, for example, gives the poet opportunity to "recognize prosperous Corinth" for its contributions:

The fame for every work is due to its inventor.
Whence did the graces of Dionysius first come to light, with the ox-driving dithyramb? Who invented the bridle for the harness of horses, or placed the double king of birds on top of the temples of gods? And in Corinth the sweet-breathing Muse blossoms, and also Ares, with the deadly spears of young men. Highest lord of Olympia, ruling far and wide; for all time, father Zeus, may you be ungrudging of our words, and ruling this people in safety...

Another of the Olympic poems - Ode 5 - describes the praise rendered by an athlete to his city, Camarina:

Coming from the lovely homes of Oenomaus and of Pelops, he sings of your sacred grove, Pallas protector of the city, and of the river Oanis, and the local lake, and the sacred canals with which Hipparis waters its people, and swiftly builds a tall-standing grove of steadfast dwellings, bringing this host of citizens out of helplessness into the light.²

While epic and lyric poetry contained occasional praise of cities, as just seen, it was dramatic poetry that most often reflected this tendency. Aeschylus (525-456 BC) lauds Athens for its citizens in The Persians:

² With respect to this early phase of city praise, specifically that found in Pindar, Laurent Pernot writes "Enfin, les détails topographiques sont rares et ponctuels, les allusions aux monuments sont exceptionnelles" (179). This is not surprising, given the condensed structure of the Pindaric odes and the preferred use of lyric poetry to praise individuals, and not the physical world.

Has then their army such a multitude of men? /
 Aye, even such an army that it has smitten the
 Medes with sore calamity. / And what else have
 they besides? Have they sufficient store of wealth
 in their homes? / Of silver they possess a
 fountain, as it were, intreasured in their soil. /
 Is the shaft that stretches the bow native to
 their hand? / Nay, far from it; they have lances
 for close fight and shields that serve them for
 armour. / And who is set over them as shepherd and
 is master of their host? / Of no man are they
 called the slaves or vassals. (235-242)³

Sophocles (495?-406 BC) praises "white Colonus" in
Oedipus at Colonus as the "land most of all others eulogised
 with praise" (v. 720) It is a "country of fine horses" where

The melodious nightingale most likes to stay and
 sing her song beneath the green glades, living
 amid the wine-dark ivy and the inviolable leafage
 of the goddess, rich in fruit, never vexed by the
 sun or by the wind of many winters... And there
 flourishes ever day by day, fed by dew from
 heaven, the narcissus with its lovely clusters,
 the ancient crown of the two great goddesses, and
 the crocus that gleams with gold; nor are the
 sleepless streams that flow from the waters of
 Cephissus diminished, but ever each day the river,
 quick to bring crops to birth, flows over the
 plains of the broad-breasted earth with moisture
 free from stain. Nor is this place rejected by the
 choruses of the Muses, nor by Aphrodite of the
 golden reins. (668-694)⁴

Also praised is the native olive tree, the "gray-green
 nurturer of children" (701). Poseidon is recognized for
 "creating first in these roads the bridle that tames horses"

³ Aeschylus, The Persians, trans. Herbert Weir Smyth
 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1988).

⁴ Sophocles, Oedipus at Colonus, trans. Hugh Lloyd Jones
 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1994).

(715). The lyrical quality of this encomium is typical of the early manifestations of the genre, prior to the emergence of Greek prose in the following century. Also noteworthy is the emphasis given to natural and not manmade elements of the city. Both these tendencies would reemerge in the Latin and Christian encomia, exemplified to varying degrees in the works of authors such as Virgil, Ausonius and Isidore.

In the Hecuba of Euripides (480-406 BC) we see a lament for the city of Troy, lost to military defeat:

Ilium, our fatherland, no longer will you be
numbered among the cities that stand unsacked:
such is the cloud of Greeks that has covered you
about on every side, ravaging you with the spear.
You are shorn of your crown of towers and stained
most pitiably with the disfiguring mark of smoke.
No more, poor city, shall I tread your streets.
(905-913)⁵

The lament would become a standard variant of city praise in future centuries, functioning on the description of prior, rather than present, greatness.

The satirical denunciation of Athens for the litigious nature of its citizens appears as part of Wasps, by Aristophanes (450?-380? BC). This playwright satirizes the

⁵ Euripides, Hecuba, ed., trans. David Kovacs (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1995). City praise is also found in Medea, 824-845.

In Laws, Plato describes an ideal city state. It is hilly, like Crete, located sufficiently far from the coast (about ten miles) so as to spare its citizens the degradations of port life, and lacks timber for shipbuilding. The latter activity, we are told, brings citizens into contact with enemies, contaminating them, and promotes the imitation of their ways. This city produces nearly everything, but not so much to be an exporter of goods. "[I]f it were [...] it would be flooded in return with gold and silver money – the one condition of all, perhaps, that is most fatal, in a State, to the acquisition of noble and just habits of life..." (IV, 705b).⁸

Two encomiastic descriptions of cities – Atlantis and Athens – are embedded into philosophical tracts of Plato. In Critias, Plato describes the island of Atlantis as one originally taken into possession by the god Poseidon, who literally shaped the island into a series of concentric bands of land and sea in order to protect the future flowering of its many resources into a glorious civilization. Plato not only describes the bounty of the island, its metals, timbers, elephants, roots, fruits and

⁸ Plato, Laws, trans. R. G. Bury, vols. 10 and 11 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1984-96).

vegetables, but also clearly pays respect to the city and its civilization:

...all these [resources] that hallowed island, as it lay then beneath the sun, produced in marvelous beauty and endless abundance. And thus, receiving from the earth all these products, they furnished forth their temples and royal dwellings, their harbours and their docks, and all the rest of their country, ordering all in the fashion following. (115b, c)⁹

A palace, a bridge, a road, and a canal are then described, each contributing in some measure to the eventual civilization created by the inhabitants of Atlantis, and leading to a dominion extending as far east as Tuscany and Egypt.

In the dialogue Menexenus, Plato recreates a well known funeral speech in praise of Athens and the Athenians. Several of the themes which would become stock elements in encomia of cities are here already present:

Our country is deserving of praise, not only from us but from all men, on many grounds, but first and foremost because she is god-beloved. [...] Of all the lands that then existed, she was the first and the only one to produce human nourishment, namely the grain of wheat and barley, whereby the race of mankind is most richly and well nourished, inasmuch as she herself was the true mother of this creature. [...] But this her produce of grain she did not begrudge to the rest of men, but dispensed it to them also. And after it she brought to birth for her children the olive, sore labour's balm. [...] Such being the manner of

⁹ Plato, Critias, trans. R. G. Bury, vol. 9 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1984-96).

their birth and of their education, the ancestors of these men framed for themselves and lived under a civic polity which it is right for us briefly to describe. (237c- 238c)¹⁰

A number of other familiar themes are broached, including the autochthonous nature of the original inhabitants, their education at the hands of the gods, the exceptional military prowess of the city and the compassion it invariably demonstrated toward its defeated enemies ("[S]he has always been compassionate to excess and the handmaid of the weak" (244e)).

Aristotle considers the ideal polis in his Politics. His comments range over a remarkable spectrum of issues in the life of an urban community. Regarding the proper size, for example, a city's population must be of "the minimum number that is self-sufficient for the purpose of living the good life after the manner of a political community" (VII, iv, 7).¹¹ Likewise, it cannot be too large, for "it is necessary for the citizens to know each other's personal characters, since where this does not happen to be the case the business of electing officials and trying law-suits is bound to go badly" (VII, iv, 7). With respect to the

¹⁰ Plato, Menexenus, trans. R. G. Bury, vol. 9 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1984-96).

¹¹ For this and the following quotations see Aristotle, Politics, trans. H. Rackham (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1967).

territory commanded by a city, it should be no more extensive than what the eye can take in, insuring therefore its ready defense. It should produce all necessities. The city itself should be in easy communication with all of its surrounding lands. Aristotle echoes Plato's concern with a city's proximity to the sea, claiming that "it is in fact much debated whether it is advantageous to well-ordered states or harmful" (VII, v, 2). He appears not to be opposed to seaports, but expects local laws to defend local order. Ultimately he recognizes that "the state ought to engage in commerce for its own interest, but not for the interest of the foreigner" (VII, v, 4). The site of the city should be one of sloping ground, as this provides favorable breezes, a good water supply, ease of administration and of defense. Aristotle suggests a correspondence between the topography of a city and its form of government, setting an example that would be imitated throughout medieval times: "For example, a citadel-hill is suitable for oligarchy and monarchy, and a level site for democracy; neither is favourable to an aristocracy, but rather several strong positions" (VII, x, 4). The layout of the city should combine the ancient, more impenetrable fashion of haphazard streets with the appealing, "modern" grid prescribed by

Hippodamus (II, v), "for in this way it will combine security with beauty" (VII, x, 5).¹² A city must also be walled, "particularly in view of the inventions that have now been made in the direction of precision with missiles and artillery for sieges" (VII, x, 6). Prominent temples ought to be surrounded by an agora that is free of commerce and ennobled by the presence of nearby gymnasia. The countryside should receive similar considerations, although Aristotle believes it a "waste of time" to linger over that discussion. Civil institutions such as education, however, do merit discussion in this panoramic treatment of the ideal city. The Aristotelian vision would inspire many future political philosophers, including the Spanish humanist Sánchez de Arévalo (1404-60).¹³

Greek historical texts frequently contained laudatory passages of Greek cities and citizens, especially in military contexts. In Herodotus (484?-424? BC) we find a speech delivered by the Athenian army to its allies in which the Athenian superiority is argued (Histories, IX, 27). Basing their case upon military victories against the

¹² Aristotle also suggests a hybrid layout as found among the plants in a vineyard; the pattern is also that of the Roman quincunx. See Politics, translator's note c, page 589.

¹³ See Chapter Six for more regarding his 1455 treatise on the ideal city, Suma de la política.

Amazons and the Persians, as well as upon acts of compassion, the Athenians eventually prove their greater worth.

In the Memorabilia of the historian Xenophon (435?-355? BC) we find not the praise of Athens but its censure. Socrates and Pericles are engaged in a dialogue showing how the slackened behavior of the Athenian citizenry has brought shame upon their city: "As we want them to strive for pre-eminence in virtue, we must show that this belonged to them in old days, and that by striving for it they will surpass all other men" (III, v, 8).¹⁴ A brief account of the past glories of the Athenians serves to underline the extent of the current degradation. Pericles laments that "it is a long march for our city to perfection," decrying that the Athenians "despise all their elders, beginning with their own fathers" (III, v, 15). He says, "they not only neglect to make themselves fit, but mock at those who take the trouble to do so," and "are the most quarrelsome of men in public and private assemblies" (III, v, 16). This last comment reminds us of Aristophanes' satire of Athenian society. Summing up, Pericles declares

So it comes about that mischief and evil grow
apace in the city, enmity and mutual hatred spring

¹⁴ Xenophon, Memorabilia, trans. E. C. Marchant, vol. 4 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1980-97).

up among the people, so that I am always dreading
that some evil past bearing may befall the city.
(III, v, 17)

The longest and best known of the ancient encomia of Greek cities appears in a funeral oration ascribed to Pericles in the History of the Peloponnesian War by Thucydides (460-395 BC). The Athenian ruler first praises the ancestors of those assembled before him to honor the war's casualties. He emphasizes that the invaluable gift of the forefathers was no less than the totality of the Athenian sphere of power. Because the present victims of war had died in defense of those dominions, Pericles launches into a review of its virtues in an attempt to vindicate the great loss of life. In reality, his funeral speech soon becomes as much an encomium of Athens as a eulogy of the dead.¹⁵

Several aspects are explored. The government of Athens "does not emulate the institutions of our neighbours; on the contrary, we are ourselves a model which some follow, rather than the imitators of other peoples. [...] [W]e are restrained from lawlessness chiefly through reverent fear..." Peacetime pursuits, including games and sacrifices,

¹⁵ For this paragraph and the following quotes see II, 35-46 of Thucydides, The History of the Peloponnesian War, trans. Charles Forster Smith (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1988-96).

are provided for in abundance. Athenian homes are "fitted out with good taste and elegance. [...] And our city is so great that all the products of all the earth flow in upon us..." Training in the martial arts is superior to that seen among the Spartans, despite the less disciplined way of life found in Athens. "[W]hen we come to the test we show ourselves fully as brave as those who are always toiling..." Another gift found among Athenians is that of measure: "For we are lovers of beauty yet with no extravagance and lovers of wisdom yet without weakness. Wealth we employ rather as an opportunity for action than as a subject for boasting..." There is measure also in the Athenian tendency to reflect and debate before acting. Beneficence abounds among Athenians, who are possessed of a "nobility of spirit" and a "spirit of liberality" in bestowing favors.

Concluding, Pericles claims that Athens is "the school of Hellas," and so matchless in military might that "we shall need no Homer to sing our praise." In a final exhortation, the audience is urged to remember always the greater good involved in the eulogy of their beloved family members:

It is for this reason that I have dwelt upon the greatness of our city; for I have desired to show you that we are contending for a higher prize than those who do not enjoy such privileges in like

degree, and at the same time to let the praise of these men in whose honour I am now speaking be made manifest by proofs. Indeed, the greatest part of their praise has already been spoken, for when I lauded the city, that was but the praise wherewith the brave deeds of these men and men like them have already adorned her.

Later Greek historians, such as Dionysius of Halicarnassus (68-7 BC), would continue to write history imbued with an intermittent, panegyric sensibility, but this time the lauded subject would be Rome.¹⁶ Dionysius attempted to expose a Greek readership to the early history of Rome in his Roman Antiquities. Occasional panegyric representations of place include the following:

Rome from the very beginning, immediately after its founding, produced infinite examples of virtue in men whose superiors, whether for piety or for justice or for life-long self-control or for warlike valour, no city, either Greek or barbarian, has ever produced. (I, 5, 3)¹⁷

This favorable attitude is extended to all of the Roman dominions, as well:

But Rome rules every country that is not inaccessible or uninhabited, and she is mistress of every sea, not only of that which lies inside

¹⁶ The historian Polybius (b. 208 BC) wrote a consciously laudatory history of recent events in the Roman march toward empire. See, for example, V, 21, 4-10; III, 36-38, 57-59. Still, his content and style were distinctly less rhetorical and exaggerated than those of other Greek and Roman historians, such as Livy.

¹⁷ For this and the next quotation see Dionysius of Halicarnassus, The Roman Antiquities, trans. Earnest Cary (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1990).

the Pillars of Hercules but also of the Ocean, except that part of it which is not navigable; she is the first and the only State recorded in all time that ever made the risings and the settings of the sun the boundaries of her dominion.

(I, 3,3)

The several encomiastic historical passages just surveyed reveal a consistent reliance upon the recounting of military feats. The connection between battlefield victories and literary encomium is, of course, a natural one, and many city encomia lean heavily upon military glories for their content. Here we can also remember that the theory for praising a city (as developed especially by Quintilian and Menander) prescribed as essential elements not only a city's origins and physical setting, but also its achievements, especially historical accomplishments. Historians would occasionally rebel against the trend of exaggerating the exploits of a city or nation, but infrequently.¹⁸

We have seen that the encomia of cities in early Greek literature - verse, philosophy and history - always appeared subordinated to a larger context. This changed when the historian and rhetorical master Isocrates (436-338 BC) established the genre of the prose encomium, in which a variety of subjects - including cities - could be exalted in

¹⁸ Polybius became known for his protestations that history had become panegyric. See Burgess 195-197 and 205 for more on the relationship between ancient historiography and encomiastic writing. Also see page 98 of this chapter, on Lucian.

independent orations.¹⁹ Isocrates himself contributed two speeches to the tradition of city encomia. They are the Panegyricus and the Panathenaicus, both of which direct praise to Athens. These and most of the other compositions by him were not delivered as speeches, but rather were published in written form for circulation among a reading public. This was a key step toward what George A. Kennedy calls the letteraturizzazione of rhetoric, a shift that would be copied by the Latin imitators of Greek style, including Cicero.²⁰ The strong impact of the sophist Gorgias upon Isocrates is evident especially in the Panegyricus, which features long and balanced periodic sentences and ornamental figures of speech. The later Panathenaicus, published in 339 BC, reflects the faltering mind of its ninety-seven year-old author. It is generally dismissed as Isocrates's final and somewhat inartistic salute to his native Athens.

Quite to the contrary, the Panegyricus (380 BC) is held as the masterpiece of this author. It is not strictly an

¹⁹ His innovation was to compose panegyric in prose, rather than poetry, and to offer more detail, as seen first in his Evagoras. "He is the first to make portrayal of character the real theme" (Burgess 115).

²⁰ See George A. Kennedy, Classical Rhetoric and its Christian and Secular Tradition from Ancient to Modern Times (Chapel Hill: UNC Press, 1980) 3.

epideictic text, since its central theme is essentially political. Isocrates pretends to be offering an exhortation toward unity among the Hellenistic cities for the purpose of conquering the Persians. Only in this context does he find it necessary to praise Athens, since it is this city which must lead the Greek alliance. The encomium of Athens is presented, therefore, as justification of the leadership role he projects for the city, especially in comparison to Sparta.

Isocrates first appeals to the ancient origins of the city: "...we are of a lineage so noble and so pure that throughout our history we have continued in possession of the very land which gave us birth, since we are sprung from its very soil..." (24).²¹ The rest of the encomium is essentially a review of the city's accomplishments through history, summed up in this statement: "...we should find that not only was she the leader in the hazards of war, but that the social order in general in which we dwell, with which we share the rights of citizenship and through which we are able to live, is almost wholly due to her" (26). The lengthy catalogue of virtues includes the following: the double gifts of nourishing foods and sacred rites for the world;

²¹ For this and the following quotes, see Isocrates, Panegyricus, trans. George Norlin (Cambridge, MA: Harvard

leadership in the Ionic migration; the creation of laws and the establishment of a polity; the invention or betterment of many arts; a welcoming for strangers; the market at Piraeus for all of Greece; exuberant festival life; philosophy; eloquence; succor to those in need; and many military victories. Writing at a low point of Athenian power, Isocrates ascribes this ignoble condition to the lack of wise leadership on the part of the Spartans. It is noteworthy that this encomium ignores the physical setting of the city, its topography and buildings. This descriptive element, or ekphrasis, was in fact largely absent from Greek encomia until several centuries later during the Second Sophistic period, when it flourished even to occasional excess.

Biblical Praise and Condemnation of Cities

The writers of the Hebrew scriptures often portrayed cities as a source of spiritual and social corruption, hence the general lack of encomiastic writing contained therein. Frank Smith Frick sums up the many "anti-urbanisms" of the Hebrew scriptures, such as those in Hosea and Amos, with the statement that "The city, as a symbol of man's attempt to

University Press, 1998).

provide for his own material security, stands condemned."²²

The scorn for cities is best exemplified in the rigorous vilification of a morally bankrupt Jerusalem - just prior to its destruction in 586 BC - and of a degenerate Babylon. In Jeremiah, Jerusalem is portrayed as an errant city, fallen into idolatry, and captured and destroyed as a result (chapters 5, 52, etc.). Similar scenes appear in Ezequiel, chapters 7-10. Lamentations also depicts a conquered Jerusalem, wretched from sin and devoid of its former integrity: "Jerusalem sinned grievously, therefore she became filthy; all who honored her despise her, for they have seen her nakedness; yea, she herself groans, and turns her face away." (1.8); "The lord...has destroyed all the palaces, laid in ruins its strongholds... He caused rampart and wall to lament..." (2.5-9); and "'Is this is the city which was called the perfection of beauty, the joy of all the earth?'" (2.15).²³ As for Babylon, Isaiah is especially full of damning references, such as "Have I not held my peace, even for a long time, and so you do not fear me? I will tell of your righteousness and your doings, but they

²² Frank Smith Frick, "The City in the Old Testament," diss., Princeton University, 1970, 259 and 268.

²³ All Biblical references are to The New Oxford Annotated Bible with the Apocrypha, ed. Herbert G. May and Bruce M. Metzger (NY: Oxford University Press, 1977).

will not help you. When you cry out, let your collection of idols deliver you!" (57.11-13).²⁴ The theme of the destruction of sinful Babylon and its satellite cities is also heard in Jeremiah (e.g. chapters 50 and 51).

Jerusalem, of course, is later celebrated as a reborn city. As the historical center of Judaism, newly devout after a return from Babylon, it is lauded and idealized by the Biblical writers. Isaiah repeatedly refers to it in encomiastic terms when describing the return of the Jews after captivity, and their city's reconstruction: "Behold, I have graven you on the palms of my hands; your walls are continually before me" (49.16); "...put on your beautiful garments, O Jerusalem, the holy city"" (52.1); and "...behold, I will set your stones in antimony, and lay your foundations with sapphires. I will make your pinnacles of agate, your gates of carbuncles, and all your wall of precious stones. ...[A]nd great shall be the prosperity of your sons" (54.11-13). The latter passage attends rather completely to the two principle aspects - physical and communal - of an ideal city. The vision of a new Jerusalem

²⁴ The section of Isaiah containing this and other allusions to the historical captivity - and imminent freedom - of the Jews is thought to have been written about 540 BC, at the time of their release. The first part of the book was written much earlier, during the lifetime of the prophet in the eighth century.

in Isaiah is at once practical and spiritual; it depicts the reconstructed walls and gates as well as the renewed pact of its citizens to be governed by God's law. The people of Jerusalem will literally be enlightened by their Lord, who will replace sunlight by day and moonlight by night (60.19).

In Ezequiel the future, renewed city of Jerusalem is not praised as much as it is described. Extraordinary detail is provided for the dimensions and physical appearance of the temple and surrounding structures, as well as their ritual importance according to the sacred laws (chapters 40-48). This section amounts to a prophetic blueprint for not only the core of the new city, but for its governance and territorial extension as a city-state or nation. The book ends with a description of the city walls - perhaps the focal point of pride for any city - and with the announcement of a new name - "The lord is here" - for the new city. The founding, fortification and naming of cities had been, and would continue to be, essential elements of their praise in literature and history.

Babylon and Jerusalem also became pole cities for Christian Biblical writers. This is seen nowhere more clearly than in Revelations. Several passages illustrate the vision of condemnation suffered by Babylon: "Fallen, fallen

is Babylon the great! ...[A]ll nations have drunk the wine of her impure passion" (18.2-3); Babylon is the "great harlot" (19.2) that oppresses other nations with her quick wealth and immorality, who seemed like a woman dressed in fine linen of purple and scarlet (18.16).

The Jerusalem of Revelations is remarkably similar to that of Isaiah and Ezequiel. The book's author describes the ideal city in considerable detail, referring to it frequently as a beautifully adorned bride awaiting her groom, the Lord (e.g. 21.2). As in Isaiah and Ezequiel, here Jerusalem is an idealized city, described physically as well as communally. But while the earlier depiction of a rebuilt Jerusalem corresponded with the reality of the Jewish people's imminent return to the city, the Jerusalem of Revelations is completely - and explicitly - allegorical. All earthly existence will end before the holy city can appear: "Then I saw a new heaven and a new earth; for the first heaven and the first earth had passed away, and the sea was no more" (21.1). This Jerusalem is a city of the afterlife.

Republican and Early Imperial Encomiastic Writings on Cities

Authors of the republican and early imperial age

frequently inserted laudations of cities into their histories, orations, geography or poetry. As was true of the Greek and Biblical periods just surveyed, a fully developed, independent laus urbis was quite rare at this time. It may be remembered, however, that it was as late as the first century AD that a theoretical writer – Quintilian – would articulate the elements of this genre. His impact would be felt more concretely during the second through fourth centuries, when encomiastic oratory – in Greek but not Latin – flourished throughout the cities of the empire.

The historian Livy (59 BC-AD 17) provides an encomiastic passage on Rome in the speech of Camillus:

Not without cause did gods and men select this place for establishing our City—with its healthful hills; its convenient river, by which crops may be floated down from the midland regions and foreign commodities brought up; its sea, near enough for use, yet not exposing us, by too great propinquity, to peril from foreign fleets; a situation in the heart of Italy—a spot, in short, of a nature uniquely adapted for the expansion of a city. This is proved by the very greatness of so new a place. [...] Here is the Capitol, where men were told, when of old they discovered there a human head, that in that place should be the head of the world and the seat of empire... (V, liv, 4 and 7)²⁵

Later it is the territory of Campania that receives praise, now in the Epitome of Roman History of Lucius

²⁵ Livy, History of Rome, trans. B. O. Foster (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1919-59).

Annaeus Florus (fl. second century AD). "The district of Campania is the fairest of all regions not only in Italy but in the whole world. Nothing can be softer than its climate: indeed it has spring and its flowers twice a year" (I, xi).²⁶ Liber and Ceres are said to have vied for its soil. The coast is praised for its famous harbors, for its hot springs and lakes. The "vine-clad mountains" include Vesuvius, and several cities are enumerated. This brief regional encomium touches on myth and history, two standard elements for the praise of a place. In this case their mention serves to heighten the importance of Campania, thereby fulfilling the historian's intention of showing why Roman soldiers would defend this land in war against the Samnites.

In the works of Cicero (106-43 BC) a number of encomiastic passages on cities can be found. De re publica provides a glowing description of the physical advantages of Rome upon its founding by Romulus. Cicero dwells at length upon the strategic importance of the city's slightly inland location, noting that an arriving enemy can be discerned with some lead time and defenses prepared. This observation was also made by Plato and Aristotle with respect to an

²⁶ Lucius Annaeus Florus, Epitome of Roman History, trans. E. S. Forster (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1995).

ideal city. All three writers also concur on the dangers of a seaport to the integrity of a people, a point expressed in the following way by Cicero:

Maritime cities also suffer a certain corruption and degeneration of morals; for they receive a mixture of strange languages and customs, and import foreign ways as well as foreign merchandise, so that none of their ancestral institutions can possibly remain unchanged. (II, iv, 7)²⁷

Romulus "must at the very beginning have had a divine intimation that the city would one day be the seat and hearthstone of a mighty empire..." (II, v, 10), since the city boasts walls, rocks, a trench and multiple hills, all contributing to its defense. The ever important question of the water supply is also addressed: "In addition, the site which he chose abounds in springs and is healthful, though in the midst of a pestilential region; for there are hills, which not only enjoy the breezes but at the same time give shade to the valleys below" (II, vi, 11).

Cicero's second speech against Gaius Verres contains two well known passages in praise of places. The region of Sicily is taken up first (II, ii, §1, 2 through II, ii, §4, 11). The introduction to this encomium alludes to the greater, political context of the ravages inflicted upon the

²⁷ For this and other quotes here, see Cicero, De re publica, trans. Clinton Walker Keyes (Cambridge, MA: Harvard

island by Verres: "But before I speak of Sicily's distresses, I feel that I should say a little of the high position of that province, of its antiquity, and of its practical importance."²⁸ A catalogue of its virtues follows. Sicily was "the first of all foreign nations to become the loyal friend of Rome," the first "jewel in our imperial crown." Sicily had allowed Rome to destroy Carthage, "supplying us with corn and affording safe harbourage to our fleets." She is "'the nation's storehouse at whose breast the Roman people is fed'" (a quote from Cato Sapiens). The Sicilian people are deemed by Cicero as "hardy and upright and honest," as opposed to the "slothful and self-indulgent" Greeks. Although this encomium of Sicily is clearly somewhat disorganized and lacking in detail, it nonetheless broaches the soon-to-be codified topics of origin, topography and achievements. Quintilian took note of this passage when discussing the praise of a city (III, vii, 26-27). Finally, if we remember that most city encomia were texts expressing local pride, but trapped in an inevitable tension between local and national authority, it becomes interesting to note that in this encomium of Sicily the tables are turned. Here

University Press, 1957-89).

²⁸ Cicero, The Verrine Orations, trans. L. H. G. Greenwood (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1988).

it is a national or imperial figure, Cicero, who is praising a province. The larger political context, of course, helps explain this anomaly, for Sicily and the Sicilians had to be lauded in order to further vilify the target of this speech, Verres.

It is a Sicilian city, Syracuse, that receives more specific praise later in the same speech. Once again, this encomium is not precisely epideictic, since it serves the larger purpose of making Verres's crime - the plundering of the city - appear more abominable. Still, it is here that Cicero most closely approximates the expansive, epideictic tone of praise. His language is highly descriptive for both natural and manmade beauty.

You will often have been told that Syracuse is the largest of Greek cities and the loveliest of all cities. Gentlemen, what you have been told is true. Its position is not only a strong one, but beautiful to behold in whatever direction it is approached, by land or sea. Its harbours are almost enfolded in the embrace of the city buildings... (II, iv, §52, 117)

Among the special features of Syracuse are manifold temples, the fresh-water spring of Arethusa, "an incredibly large spring, teeming with fish," a colonnaded market-place, "a richly-adorned town-hall, a spacious senate-house," private houses, a spacious gymnasium, a great theatre, and a large

statue of Apollo Temenites. The physical description of Syracuse provided by Cicero is somewhat rare for the city encomia up to his lifetime, but would become the norm during the next few centuries. At the close of the third century, Menander would include the elements of harbor and noteworthy buildings among his rules for praising cities.

Not surprisingly, Rome and its empire was the subject of many poetic encomia during the first century BC and the one following it. The Aeneid of Virgil (70-19 BC) celebrated the founding and future deeds of the Romans, bringing together the essential elements of a city encomium.²⁹ The special mission of the Romans is exalted in comparison to other peoples, who may be skilled in bronzework, or sculpture, or law or astronomy:

But you, Roman, must remember that you have to guide the nations by your authority, for this is to be your skill, to graft tradition onto peace, to shew mercy to the conquered, and to wage war until the haughty are brought low. (VI, 851-853)³⁰

The unity of the Italian peoples and their religious devotion is addressed through the words of Jupiter:

'Custom and ritual of sacrifice I shall impose. I shall make all to be Latins of a single speech. From the union you shall see a race of mixed

²⁹ In his dissertation (13), William Hammer elaborates slightly on these elements.

³⁰ For this and subsequent quotes, see Virgil, The Aeneid, trans., intro. W. F. Jackson Knight (NY: Penguin, 1985).

Italian blood arise, exceeding in religious duty
all other men and even gods, nor shall any nation
celebrate your rites so devoutly as they.' (XII,
838-840)

The glorious achievements of the Romans are described by way
of the highly detailed scenes depicted on the shield
received by Aeneas:

Next appeared Augustus Caesar as he drove in a
threefold triumph past the buildings of Rome and
made to the Gods of Italy his solemn, deathless
vow to build three hundred mighty shrines
throughout his City. The streets were roaring with
joyful merry-making and applause. In every temple
mothers were dancing and in every one were
sacrifices at the altars, before which slain
bullocks lay stretched on the ground. (VIII, 714-
722)

Virgil's Georgics offer praise of Rome and Italy in a
less narrative and more lyrical fashion. After the poet
describes the marvelous fruits and woods of exotic lands, he
contends that those of Italy are superior:

But neither Media's groves, land of wondrous
wealth, nor beauteous Ganges, nor Hermus, thick
with gold, may vie with Italy's glories... [...] but
teeming fruits have filled her and the Vine-
god's Massic juice; she is the home of olives and
of joyous herds. Hence comes the war-horse...
[...] Here is eternal spring, and summer in months
not her own; twice the cattle breed, twice the
tree serves us with fruits. [...] Think, too, of
all the noble cities, the achievement of man's
toil, all the towns his handiwork has piled high
on steepy crags, and the streams that glide
beneath those ancient walls. Shall I tell of the
seas...? [...] Yea, and this land has shown
silver-streams and copper-mines in her veins, and
has flowed rich with gold. She has mothered a

vigorous breed of men... (II, 136-167)³¹

This is largely an encomium of Italy's natural resources, but it does briefly mention the origins of the various regional peoples (the Marsicans, Ligurians, et al.) as well as the human constructions of towns and cities. Virgil concludes his praise of Italy with a nod toward the capital: "Thus, surely, Etruria waxed strong, thus Rome became of all things the fairest, and with a single city's wall enclosed her seven hills" (II, 532-535).

Horace (65-8 BC) praises his native Tibur (Tivoli) in Ode VII of Book I. While others may praise Rhodes, Mitylene, Ephesus, Corinth, Thebes, or Athens, the poet prefers the groves and orchards of Tiburnus. Its dense shade, along with a mellow wine, offer consolation in times of sadness. Equally bucolic is the praise of Tibur and Tarentum found in Ode VII of the same book. The sheep, honey, olives, temperate seasons, and grapes of Tarentum move the poet to hope that land will be his final resting place.

On the occasion of the "Secular Games" in 17 BC, Horace offers fragments of praise for Rome in a hymn meant to insure continued success for the city. Of the sun god Apollo he asks "Look down on worlds outspread, yet nothing see /

³¹ Virgil, Georgics, trans. H. Rushton Fairclough, rev. G. P. Goold (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1999-2000).

Greater than Rome, and Rome's high sovereignty." Of the Fates, "accord / To Rome new blessings that shall last / In chain unbroken from the Past." And of the gods together Horace intones the prayer that they "On Rome herself bestow a teaming race / Wealth, Empire, Faith, and all befitting Grace."³²

Ovid (43 BC-AD 17) also refers to Rome's greatness in Fasti: "When from his citadel Jupiter looks abroad on the whole globe, naught but the Roman empire meets his eye" (I, 85-86).³³ On the founding of the city, "And now what of late had been woods and pastoral solitudes was a city..." (III, 71-72). The phrase "eternal city" is found here as aeternae urbis, one of several formulaic honorifics written of Rome at that time.³⁴

³² Horace, The Secular Hymn, in William Stearns Davis, ed., Readings in Ancient History: Illustrative Extracts from the Sources, 2 vols. (Boston: Allyn and Bacon, 1912-13) vol. 2: Rome and the West 174-179. Text modernized by J. S. Arkenberg for internet version. 29 Sep. 2000 <<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/ancient/augustancomions.html>>.

³³ For this and the next quote, see Ovid, Fasti, trans. James George Frazer, rev. G. P. Goold (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1989).

³⁴ Other authors who used this term were Tibullus, Frontinus, Ausonius, Ammianus Marcellinus, and Symmachos. It appeared as well on many coins from the time of Hadrian forward. This emperor also inscribed "aeterna" on his temple dedicated to Venus and to Rome. Sacra was also applied to Rome from the year AD 201, and to Constantinople. The cities were considered holy because its emperors were deified. This information can be found in F. G. Moore, "Urbs aeterna and urbs sacra," Transactions of the American Philological Association, 25 (1894): 34-60.

The theme of an eternal rule for Rome would later be voiced again by Silius Italicus (ca. AD 26-ca. 101) in the Punica: "So long as sea-monsters shall swim the deep and stars shine in the sky and the sun rise on the Indian shore, Rome shall rule, and there shall be no end to her rule throughout the ages" (476-478).³⁵

Catullus (84-54 BC) dedicates a poem of praise to his native Sirmio, "bright eye of peninsulas and islands."³⁶ Poem 31 celebrates his joyous return there and the nostalgic feelings he always carries for that land and its waters. The poem focuses on the poet's emotion rather than on the land itself, thus accounting for the lack of concrete detail concerning Sirmio's attributes, its history, its peoples, etc.

The Elegies of Propertius (50-14 BC) contain an encomium of Rome. After describing some famed mythical sites, the poet declares

...all these marvels shall yield before the land
of Rome. Whatever is best in all the world Nature
has placed here. It is a land more fit for war
than disposed to crime: Fame blushes not for your
history, Rome. For we stand a strong nation as

³⁵ Silius Italicus, Punica, trans. J. D. Duff (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1989-96).

³⁶ Catullus, trans. Francis Warre Cornish (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1988).

much through humanity as through the sword: our
anger stays its hand in victory. (III, 22)³⁷

Several rivers, lakes and springs are extolled. Then a curious variation is employed to praise the lands of Rome. Propertius suggests that all that can be said against any country or people cannot be said of Rome or the Romans. "But here glide no horned asps on scaly bellies, nor do Italian waters swarm with strange monsters..." A series of horrific mythological incidents is recounted, all of which took place not in Rome, but elsewhere.

A similar strategy by the same poet is used in his fourth book of elegies. Its first poem praises Rome by describing its crude beginnings:

All that you see here, stranger, where mighty Rome
now stands, was grass and hill before the coming
of Phrygian Aeneas. [...] The Curia, which now
stands high and resplendent with its hemfrocked
senate, then housed a rustic company of Fathers
clad in skins.

Building upon this contrast between past and present, Propertius writes, "The Roman of today has nothing from his ancestor but his name: he would not believe that a she-wolf nurtured the blood from which he sprang." The poem concludes with a profession of inadequacy on the part of the poet, a standard rhetorical element that would be increasingly

³⁷ For this and the next quote, see Propertius, Elegies, ed., trans. G. P. Goold (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press,

employed in poems and orations as the genre of city praise became more independent. It is not unexpected that this rhetorical topos appears in an elegy, a poem whose purpose is praise.

Like Horace and Catullus, Statius (AD 45-96) wrote nostalgically of his homeland (Silvae, III, v). His purpose in praising Naples was to convince his wife to return there for retirement from their long life in Rome. Sparing detail, Statius nonetheless attends to the origins of the city, its founding god, its topography (including Vesuvius), bay, climate, notable buildings, festivals, hot springs, and the nearby attractions of Capri and the hills of Sorrento. He concludes this list of praiseworthy features with the question, "Shall I recount to you the thousand beauties of my country?"³⁸ Answering himself in the negative, he is certain that his wife will go of her own accord without further pressure.

The geographer Strabo (64/3 BC-AD 21) described the physical layout and urban detail of the city of Rome just after the great building expansion of the Augustan age. Regarding the natural setting of the city,

1990).

³⁸ Statius, trans. J. H. Mozley (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1982).

...there was obviously a concourse, so to speak, of blessings that surpassed all natural advantages; and it is because of this concourse of blessings that the city, although it has grown to such an extent, holds out in the way it does, not only in respect to food, but also in respect to timber and stones for the building of houses... (Geography, 5.3.7)³⁹

In far more measured tones than those used by the encomiasts, Strabo recognizes that roads, aqueducts and sewers have greatly improved life in the city. He provides a superb narrative tour of the city's administrative and religious center:

And again, if, on passing to the old Forum, you saw one forum after another ranged along the old one, and basilicas, and temples, and saw also the Capitolium and the works of art there and those of the Palatium and Livia's Promenade, you would easily become oblivious to everything else outside. Such is Rome. (5.3.8)

Strabo later enumerates the many advantages of the entire Italian peninsula. Again, he falls short of encomium, but is clearly impressed with the favorable confluence of geographical and climatic circumstances. In particular he cites the asset of variety as being decisive for producing the Roman domination on the peninsula; Italy has hot and cold regions, mountains and seas, hot and cold springs, and a great abundance and diversity of natural life at the disposal of the Roman populace. Following this admiring

³⁹ Strabo, Geography, Horace Leonard Jones (Cambridge, MA:

account of the land, Strabo briefly recounts the entire history of the Roman conquests. Although it may be considered a chronology of famous achievements, and therefore fitting the demands of encomium, the tone is continually restrained, only occasionally breaking into moments of marvel.

A very different sort of city praise for Rome is registered in brief fragments authored by the public water commissioner, Frontinus (AD 35-ca. 103). His Aqueducts of Rome was largely a technical treatise on the expansion and operations of the city's aqueducts, but it includes occasional passages such as the following:

The effect of this care displayed by the Emperor Nerva, most patriotic of rulers, is felt from day to day by the present queen and empress of the world. [...] Not even the waste water is lost; the appearance of the City is clean and altered; the air is purer; and the causes of the unwholesome atmosphere, which gave the air of the City so bad a name with the ancients, are now removed. (II, 88)⁴⁰

The water supply was always an important element in city praise, reflecting its fundamental role in the welfare of the citizens. Curiously, this passage in praise of improvements to the water supply of Rome belies the

Harvard University Press, 1988).

⁴⁰ Sextus Julius Frontinus, The Aqueducts of Rome, ed. Mary B. McElwain, trans. Charles E. Bennett and Clemens Herschel (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1997).

exaggerations of prior praises of Roman water. It is a reminder, as well, of the essentially exaggerated nature of the genre of encomium.

The geographer Pausanias (fl. ca. AD 150)) produced an extensive description of Greece that is noteworthy for its mixture of history, mythology and chorography. Although a "philoathénien,"⁴¹ he rarely wrote encomiastic passages for the places he described. Pausanias maintained a formulaic approach to the description of terrain and towns that constitutes a valuable reference to ancient sites and local cults, but his writing was not infused with rhetorical craft.

Similarly, one can look to the Bellum Iudaicum by Flavius Josephus (AD 37-after 93) for a disciplined and dispassionate description of Jerusalem's built environment during the first century AD. This extensive and highly detailed account only rarely slides into near-ecstatic tones, such as in these passages: "Adjoining and on the inner side of these towers, which lay to the north of it, was the king's palace, baffling all description: indeed, in extravagance and equipment no building surpassed it" (V. 176), and

⁴¹ M. Casevitz, "La cité et le citoyen d'après et selon Pausanias," Kolaios 3 (1994): 58.

The exterior of the building wanted nothing that could astound either mind or eye. For, being covered on all sides with massive plates of gold, the sun was no sooner up than it radiated so fiery a flash that persons straining to look at it were compelled to avert their eyes, as from the solar rays. To approaching strangers it appeared from a distance like a snow-clad mountain... (V. 222).⁴²

Also from the first century was the Naturalis historia of Pliny the Elder (AD 23/4-79). Despite its largely encyclopedic nature, this massive work concludes with an encomium to Italy which contains the typical elements for praise of place:

...there is no land so well adorned with all that wins Nature's crown as Italy...with her men and women, her generals and soldiers, her slaves, her pre-eminence in arts and crafts, her wealth of brilliant talent, and, again, her geographical position and her healthy, temperate climate... (XXXVII LXXVI 201-203)⁴³

Pliny praises Italy's harbors, abundant water supply, forests, harmless wild creatures, fertile soil, crops, wine, oil, wool, flax, cloth, cattle, horses, and ores. Only India - and then Spain - deserve mention as second place rivals to Italy.

The second and third centuries saw a relative lapse of city encomia written in Latin, but a rise in those composed

⁴² Flavius Josephus, The Jewish War, trans. H. St. J. Thackeray (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1998).

⁴³ Pliny the Elder, Natural History, trans. H. Rackham, vol. 10 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1997).

in Greek. These Greek texts of the so-called Second Sophistic period (examined in the next section) would be succeeded by a return to Latin by the fifth century. Latin would then remain as the language of choice for the praise of cities throughout the subsequent medieval centuries, and into the humanist era.

City Encomia of the Second Sophistic Orators

With the Augustan age a new political and economic order had come to the lands under Roman control. During the long period of peace that ensued, travel along the Roman roads increased, bringing more frequent visits from administrative, commercial and diplomatic officials to towns and cities throughout the empire. This movement of people resulted in a wave of new social encounters, such as the arrival of a local governor to a city, and there arose with it a need to rhetorically mark each occasion. The category of speech required was invariably epideictic, rather than judicial or political, for the task at hand was normally the praise of a person. Epideixis, we may recall, consisted essentially of the praise - and less frequently the blame - of persons; the Greek terms were epainos/enkomium and esogos, while the Romans used laus/laudatio and vituperatio.

Well known examples of the encomium of persons from this period were the panegyric of Trajan (in 100?), by Pliny the Younger, and that of Constantine (in 336), by Eusebius.

The Greeks had always maintained a strong epideictic tradition (even if not recognizing it much in their earlier theoretical treatises) and they were thus the natural agents of this epideictic revitalization during the Roman imperial age. Perhaps the most compelling evidence of this expansion of encomiastic oratory is the fact that several speechmaking manuals were written during these centuries, most notably those of Pseudo-Dionysius and Menander Rhetor (each of the later third century; see Chapter One). Clearly, they fulfilled a demand created by an increase in oratorical situations, from wedding and birthday speeches to more official events. These treatises served the professional orators who needed guidance for the myriad sociopolitical situations in which they might find themselves.⁴⁴ Similarly, at the rhetorical schools the students would practice composition according to the dictates of the recently published progymnasmata.

⁴⁴ In Menander Rhetor (xi), Russell and Wilson cite a fifth- or sixth-century letter from one Victor to Theognostus requesting that he be sent the 'encomia' and 'methods,' apparently referring to rhetorical manuals.

These manuals attest not only to the greater importance of the praise of individuals in the oratory of this period, but also to that of city praise. The recommended elements for such praise – founders, harbors, citadels, temples, climate, military accomplishments, etc. – have already been reviewed here. According to these manuals, a city was sometimes to be praised alone as the sole focus of a speech, or more commonly as a subpart within an official welcoming, commemoration, or festival inauguration.

In addition to the increased movement of people throughout the empire, another factor – political in nature – contributed to the rise in city praise during this period. Many cities within the Greek sphere of influence suffered a decline in prestige under Roman dominion, and competed ferociously among themselves for honors. Speechmaking naturally helped portray a blemish-free city upon official occasions. A reported example of oratory on behalf of cities can be found in the Annales of Tacitus (AD 56/7-after 117), in which representatives from eleven cities take turns describing the particular attractions which make their city the ideal candidate to receive the honor of a temple to Tiberius (IV, LV).

To fulfill the need for more public oratory, the second

through fourth centuries saw a great rise in peripatetic orators - typically Greek - who addressed local audiences on a wide range of topics, including devotional, satirical, didactic and historical themes. Trained in the rhetorical schools to expound in formulaic ways upon almost any topic, they were essentially travelling practitioners of the epideictic mode of discourse. But just as the original sophists became the targets of Plato and other philosophers, those of the Second Sophistic were sometimes scorned as self-aggrandizing, bombastic and unoriginal opportunists.

Despite this polarization between the sensationalist sophists and their more even-toned (and frequently Christian) opponents, sophistic rhetorical training via the school exercises was so widespread that a sharp line of division cannot easily be drawn between a sophist and a non-sophist. Further blurring the line of distinction was the occasional gap between an orator's formal stance toward rhetoric and his actual use of it. In the Greek East, the fourth-century Church fathers of Cappadocia (Asia Minor) inveighed against the use of stylized rhetoric but applied it nonetheless in their works. In the Latin West, just after the close of the Second Sophistic period, Augustine would admit the use of rhetoric in service to Christian preaching,

despite the distraction it posed toward the reception of the message. His own metaphor of the community of Christians as an earthly Civitas Dei, especially from Book XI forward of that work, extended and popularized the Biblical notion of a celestial city in the following centuries.

An overall negative evaluation of the Second Sophistic orators has endured into modern times. Nonetheless, the most serious scholar of the encomiastic writing of the Second Sophistic, Laurent Pernot, proposes a revised and more favorable view. According to him, the exaggerations and fictions of encomiastic writing or speechmaking have been disparaged as "rhetoric" and "sophistry," obscuring the social and political role of the genre, as well as its literary value:

L'*enkômion* était enseigné dans les écoles, et des discours d'éloge étaient prononcés aussi bien dans les cérémonies universitaires que dans les fêtes de famille, dans la vie politique (au niveau de la cité, de la province, de l'Empire) ou dans les cénacles littéraires. Mais, face à ces faits, une convergence de jugements, antiques et modernes, ramène l'éloge rhétorique à une production d'apparat, à une exhibition vaine et stéréotypée qui délaierait tout souci de vérité et d'utilité pour viser l'inexplicable plaisir de l'auditoire. C'est la tradition du dédain et du décri. La dimension encomiastique de la société gréco-romaine d'époque impériale a été occultée par les jugements de valeur. (12)

A similar defense is made by George A. Kennedy:

If sophists have sometimes liked to shock or indulge conceits, it should be remembered that most sophists have believed that the orator should be a good man, and their most consistent theme has not been how to make the worse seem the better cause, but celebration of enlightened government, the love of the gods, the beauty of classical cities, the values of friendship, the meaning of patriotism, the triumph of reason, and the artistry of speech. (40)

These assertions are significant for the present study. They help explain why so eminent a linguist and rhetorician as Leonardo Bruni would later model his humanist encomium of Florence upon a product of the Second Sophistic era, the Panathenaicus of Aelius Aristides. Bruni's text, the Laudatio Florentine urbis (1404), would itself directly influence several Iberian humanist authors.

Who, then, were the orators of the Second Sophistic, and what city praise did they produce? Pernot cites Aristides, as well as Dio Chrysostom and Lucian, as the foremost practitioners of encomium during the Roman imperial age. Libanius deserves special notice, as well. The speeches of these and other orators of the period can now be examined to show how Hellenistic cities were celebrated within the context of Roman political domination.

Dio Chrysostom of Prusa (ca. AD 40-after 111) delivered several speeches that included short or medium length

encomia of cities. His Sixth Discourse briefly describes an Athens thought by Diogenes to be "far more beautiful than Ecbatana and Babylon." He continues:

Moreover, in respect to the beauty of the harbours, and, further, to the statues, paintings, the works in gold, silver, and bronze, in respect to the coinage, the furnishings, the splendour of the houses, he thought that Athens was far superior... (253)⁴⁵

The Thirty-Fifth Discourse includes a laudation of the city of Celaenae (synonymous with its offshoot settlement of Apameia) of Asia Minor, omitting the historical founding and deeds for a more straightforward description of the physical and economic advantages accruing to the citizens of that city:

For example, you occupy the strongest site and the richest on the continent; you are settled in the midst of plains and mountains of rare beauty; you have most abundant springs and a soil of greatest fertility, bearing, all told, unnumbered products, 'and there is wheat and millet here and white barley, wide grown,'⁴⁶ and many are the droves of cattle and the flocks of sheep you tend and pasture. And as for rivers... (404-405)

Dio adds details of the frequent court sessions and markets in Celaenae, then abruptly shifts to a topic surely

⁴⁵ For this and following quotes, see Dio Chrysostom, Speeches, trans. J. W. Cohoon and H. Lamar Crosby (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1971-93).

⁴⁶ This passage, repeated from Homer's Odyssey 4.604, is typical of the frequent literary citations within public oratory in ancient times.

calculated to entertain his listeners: the extravagant natural opulence of India. This he describes in fantastic terms typical of the locus amoenus tradition. A final descriptive flourish reports a people rich in gold that is acquired by the industry of ants "larger than foxes" (413).

Dio offered his audiences not only entertainment and the exaggerations typical of epideixis, but also didactic commentary on municipal affairs. His Thirty-Second Discourse aims to make his listeners in Alexandria aware of the need to behave less outrageously, more decently. He begins by praising the reach of the city's commerce:

For Alexandria is situated, as it were, at the crossroads of the whole world, of even the most remote nations thereof, as if it were a market serving a single city, a market which brings together into one place all manner of men, displaying them to one another and, as far as possible, making them a kindred people. (207)

But the orator now changes course, surprising his audience:

Perhaps...you fancy that you are being praised by me, as you are by all the rest who are always flattering you; but I was praising water and soil and harbours and places and everything except yourselves. (207)

Dio distinguishes between the physical glory of the city and the dignity of its people.⁴⁷ He reminds his listeners that

⁴⁷ Richard Kagan writes that this distinction can be traced from Thucydides forward through Cicero, who probably transmitted the notion to Isidore and later medieval writers on cities. See Chapters 1 and 2 of his Urban Images of the Hispanic World, 1493-1793 and his "Urbs and Civitas in Sixteenth- and Seventeenth-

the many visitors to Alexandria would return home to tell of the wondrous sights of the city, but would inevitably remember that "it is a city that is mad over music and horse-races and in these matters behaves in a manner entirely unworthy of itself" (211).

In the Forty-Fourth Discourse our author takes up the theme of one's native land on the occasion of receiving honors by his own homeland, Prusa. "For though I have been in many cities, I do not know better men than the men of Prusa," he declares, adding "...I would not have chosen either Athens or Argos or Sparta, the foremost and most distinguished of the Greek cities, as my native land in preference to Prusa" (195). Again, for Dio, the importance of a city's people overtakes that of its overall fame or historical excellence.

The topic of one's home city is also treated by the satirist Lucian (125-210) in a composition entitled "My Native Land." Like Dio in the Forty-Fourth Discourse, he quotes the appropriate Homeric verse "So it is that nothing is more sweet in the end than country and parents," (§7) and

Century Spain," ed. David Buisseret, Profiling the City: Six Studies in Urban Cartography (Chicago: U of Chicago P, 1998) 75-108. For the same topic as regards Rome, see Philip Jacks, The Antiquarian and the Myth of Antiquity. The Origins of Rome in Renaissance Thought (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), chapter 2.

claims that however humble may be one's place of origin, it cannot be traded for even the most impressive of cities.⁴⁸

To be sure, many admire cities for their size, their splendour and the magnificence of their public works, but everyone loves his own country; and even among men completely overmastered by the lust of the eye, no one is so misguided as to be forgetful of it because of the greater number of wonders in other countries. (211)

Although writing during the Second Sophistic period, and given to certain rhetorical flourishes, Lucian was well known as an opponent of the sophists. This can be seen in the opening statements of his Quomodo historia, in which he says of the too-many historians,

[M]ost of them neglect to record the events and spend their time lauding rulers and generals, extolling their own to the skies and slandering the enemy's beyond all reserve; they do not realise that the dividing line and frontier between history and panegyric is not a narrow isthmus but rather a mighty wall.⁴⁹

Similar sentiments - especially regarding flattery, an essential art of any encomiastic speaker - are found in The Wisdom of Nigrinus, in which he censures the degraded morals of Rome:

But a man who loves wealth and is enthralled by gold and measures happiness by purple and power, who has not tasted liberty or tested free speech

⁴⁸ Homer, Odyssey 9.33-34.

⁴⁹ For this and subsequent quotes, see Lucian, Lucian, trans. K. Kilburn, vol. 1 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1959).

or contemplated truth, whose constant companions are flattery and servility; a man who has unreservedly committed his soul to pleasure and has resolved to serve none but her, fond of extravagant fare and fond of wine and women, full of trickery, deceit and falsehood...should live in Rome, for every street and every square is full of the things they cherish most... (115-117)

This passage, then, illustrates Lucian's opposition to rhetorical decadence, and also exemplifies, if briefly, the rare genre of blame for a city.

Perhaps the most visible of the Second Sophistic orators, Aelius Aristides (117-180) was also the one who left the greatest legacy of encomia to cities. Well known in his own day as a rather sickly neurasthenic and a devotee of the healing god Asclepius, he delivered a series of speeches on behalf of Athens, Rome, Smyrna and Cyzicus that would be copied throughout post-classical times. Aristides wrote no theory on this topic, but his encomia were so conceptually sophisticated and rhetorically polished that they exerted enormous influence, eventually serving as a model for the reinvigorated genre of city praise during the humanist era.

The following are Aristides' major city speeches, with dates as established by the foremost scholar of this orator, Charles A. Behr:⁵⁰

⁵⁰ Information regarding Aristides and quotes from his orations are taken from Behr's edition, Aelius Aristides, The Complete Works, ed. and trans. Charles A. Behr, 2 vols. (Leiden: Brill, 1986).

Panathenaicus (155)
Regarding Rome (155)
The Smyrnaean Oration (157)
Panegyric in Cyzicus (166)
Concerning Concord (167)
A Monody for Smyrna (178)

These speeches are remarkable in that they are focused entirely upon cities, rather than being only peripherally dedicated to them. In light of their exceptional relevance to this study, a brief review of each follows.

The Panathenaicus was delivered at the Panathenaic Games with the intention of praising several aspects of Athens, especially its record of generosity and its military victories. The various sections include (in order of coverage): proem, geography, indigenous population, discovery of crops and their sharing, the honor of the gods toward Athens, generosity with reception of exiles and founding of colonies, deeds in war, Attic tongue, honors shown to Athens, superiority of Athens, and peroration.⁵¹ Aristides opens his speech with a recognition of the challenge before him, and a reverent nod to oratory as an art native to the Athenians. This self-conscious attitude toward public speaking recurs frequently in his other discourses. Regarding geography, the charm of the surrounding islands prepare the visitor "for the spectacle

⁵¹ This sectional breakdown is taken directly from the notes

of Athens" (8), those islands arranged outside of Attica "as if the sea purposely set them free to be like suburbs for the city, in the form of a chorus" (7). Athena named the city, accompanied by other deities. Aristides then calls upon the image of a Greek shield with its concentric layers of brass circles to illustrate the unique position of the city: "...Greece is in the center of the whole earth, and Attica in the center of Greece, and the city in the center of its territory, and again its namesake [the Acropolis] in the center of the city" (9). Additional local resources of note include the fruits, the pleasant climate, marble from the mountains which adorn other cities, silver mines ("veins of silver can be seen like drops passing through the whole mountain district" (10)), "ever flowing rivers" (10), "unstinting springs, crops of every kind" (10), etc. The citizens are "sprung from the earth" or autochthonous, and the Athenians were not only honored to receive gifts from the gods - plants, seed, livestock, fire - but they were generous enough to share those gifts with the rest of humankind. Athens "was the first of all cities to establish games" (13). The gods brought oratory, laws and government to the city, as well as weapons and chariots. The city is foremost among all for its ready reception of the exiles and

by Behr, page 428.

underprivileged of the world. An exceedingly long section ensues tracing the military victories of the Athenians. In describing the loss to the Spartans, Aristides carefully poses that defeat as a kind of model for all the world, so gracefully was it accepted (54). He also rejects charges against the Athenians for their 421 BC massacre of the Scionaeans (61). Throughout this section, and indeed throughout the entire panegyric of Athens, Aristides avoids calling attention to the deeds of individuals, preferring thereby to exalt the name of the city as a whole. An abrupt transition is then made to praise the Attic language as the best in all of Greece and in the world, more valuable even than its military might: "And all men have come to accept this dialect, in the belief that it is as it were a mark of education. This I call the great empire of the Athenians, not two hundred triremes, or more..." (66). Oratory, tragedy and comedy, and Homer's poetry are linked to the city, as well, all products of the Athenian tongue. The speech concludes with a review of the constitution and municipal generosity toward the poor, ending with a note of deference to the goddess Athena.

Perhaps the most significant aspect of the Panathenaicus is that its message of Athenian greatness is

couched within a clear respect for contemporary Roman authority. Near the end, Aristides reviews the history of what he calls the "tradition of five empires" (68), remarking that

...under the one at present existing, which is in every way the best and greatest, it has precedence over all the Greek race, and has fared in such a way that no one would readily wish for its old state instead of its present one. (68)

Likewise:

Indeed, some features it had in the past, and others it has now; and neither has it been deprived of the memory of its former excellence, nor again has it been wanting in the present felicity... (71)

This political aspect of Athens as a subject city within the Roman empire has been examined by Fernando Gascó.⁵² He calls attention to the fact that Aristides' long exposition of Athenian military glory is accompanied by frequent reminders of the city's self-sacrificing nature, its generosity even toward those who have wronged it:

Así las brillantes hazañas de guerra atenienses no estimulaban valores bélicos, ni afanes de revancha, ni nada que se le asemejara. Por el contrario, las guerras facilitaban la ocasión de dar lecciones de paz enalteciendo valores tales como los de solidaridad y filantropía en general. (149)

⁵² Fernando Gascó, "Modelos del pasado entre los griegos del s. II d.C.: el ejemplo de Atenas," Polis 5 (1993): 139-49.

Gascó notes that a similar purpose can be found in the writings of Plutarch, who advocated the celebration of Greek culture as well as the benefits of its subjugated status during Roman times.

Regarding Rome was delivered in that city just four months after the Panathenaicus, but in it Aristides deftly appears to have become a promoter of all things Roman at the expense of Athens. The speech is a celebration of the Roman empire; although the city of Rome is addressed at times, and is recognized as the essential root of the empire, the focus is on the good imperial governance administered by Roman officials. Aristides begins by professing the impossibility of doing justice to his topic: "Perhaps it is even for one greater than I to be able to carry out such a speech, which will equal the great and weighty dignity of the city." The city, with its "so many occupied hills" (74), is so vast that "Wherever in the city one is, nothing prevents him from being in its center all the same" (74).⁵³ The empire is correspondingly vast: "...the sun's course is always in your land" (75).⁵⁴ Aristides next reviews the defects of prior

⁵³ All page numbers for this and the following speeches of Aristides cited here refer to the second volume of the Behr edition.

⁵⁴ This would be repeated by the sixteenth-century Hapsburg emperor Carlos V to describe the breadth of the Spanish dominions.

empires - the Persian despots, the unfinished work of Alexander - and the virtues of the present one. These include the rapid communication - "...the letters are almost no sooner written than they arrive, as if borne by winged messengers" (80) - and the harmonious rule of administrators - "...you govern throughout the whole inhabited world as if in a single city and you appoint governors as it were by election for the protection and care of their subjects, not to be their master" (80). Even the Greeks are criticized at length for "dreaming more of empire than being able to possess it" (82). The virtues of the Athenians are enumerated, but Aristides insists that "they were as yet uneducated in the art of government, and when they attempted it, they failed" (83-84). Aristides continually returns to the greatness of Roman accomplishments. Regarding walls, "...you did not neglect walls, but you put these about your empire, not your city" (90). Aristides is fond of vivid, synthetic similes and of dramatic anecdotes, each serving to better illustrate whatever point he wishes to make. Two examples: "The proud and great city of Alexander in Egypt has become an ornament of your empire, like a necklace or bracelet of a rich woman among many other possessions" (94); and "...this man stood upon the walls of Thebes and

stretched forth to him a clod of earth and a cup of water from the Nile..." (92). This important oration concludes with a salute to the emperor, and with a reference to Rome and its empire as eternal.

Aristides praised his native city of Smyrna in the year 157. Of his several city speeches it is perhaps the one which best succeeds in gathering the various aspects of a city in a well balanced tribute. In fact, he fulfills the dictates of Quintilian to praise the city's founders, accomplishments, and physical setting. We read, accordingly, that of the original, lost city of Smyrna, not only "the gods and the heroes assembled in it when they feasted together" (1) but, in a reference to Plato's Atlantis, "the Nymphs have received that city, and now it is under water, submerged in a lake, as they say" (1). Aristides next provides a "garnish for the deeds of the city" (2), professing the need to move on quickly, lest the task occupy too much time. He then passes through a kind of tour of the physical city, an attempt to "guide the spectator about it" (2). This is consistent with Behr's notion that the official addressee of the speech may have followed this very route during his visit to Smyrna. Part of this oratorical tour follows:

The whole city is like an embroidered gown. Proceeding from west to east, you go from temple to temple and from hill to hill, along a single avenue which is fairer than its name. As you stand on the Acropolis, beneath flows the sea and the suburbs ride at anchor... [...] Everything as far as the seacost is resplendent with gymnasiums, market places, theaters, temple precincts, harbors, and natural and manmade beauties, competing with one another. (3)

The climate, water supply and teeming fish of the sea are all praised in turn. Also present is Aristides' characteristic theme of harmony:

There is that charm which is spread over everything like a rainbow, and which tunes the city like a lyre so that it harmonizes with itself and with its external adornments; and there is that pervasive splendor, like that of the bronze which Homer mentions, rising unbroken to heaven. (5)

Aristides concludes with a note of presumptuousness and humility, typical of an accomplished sophist cognizant of the need to profess his inadequacy before the honored subject of his speech:

Now I know that I seem both to you and to many of those present to have discoursed well enough. But all this will quickly prove to be too little. I myself am satisfied to be inferior to such a subject. (6)

Aristides would return to Smyrna as a topic of praise twenty-one years later, this time to lament the passing of its beauty after a violent earthquake destroyed it. This

brief address is punctuated by exclamations: "O Zeus, what am I to do? Am I to be silent when Smyrna has fallen? [...] O time who brings all things, what a city was your invention and contrivance! And you have destroyed it!" (7). The rest of the lamentation or planctus is given to highly poetic images of the losses and grief occasioned by the disaster, such as "Now the rivers ought to have flowed with tears, now the merchant ships to have sailed out with black sails" (8).

Aristides composed two other orations for cities, one which praises Cyzicus and the other Pergamum, Ephesus, and Smyrna. Both speeches contain the now predictable elements, but their common purpose is not praise itself, rather the encouragement of concord among the Roman-governed cities of Greek Asia Minor. Aristides rather falsely declares that he, unlike other insincere orators, cannot enter one city to praise its superiority and then do the same for another city. Instead his aim is to promote peace among them all. After praising them each in turn, he admonishes:

...when each of you [cities] has so many reasons for pride and there is no necessity for feeling less self-esteem if you behave virtuously toward one another, I do not see what sense there is in this dispute. Rather I should say, quite to the contrary, that kindly relations with others is the act of those who wish to preserve their honor...
(31)

The Cappadocian fathers of the fourth century were heavily influenced by sophistic rhetorical style, and inescapably wrote under that influence. In Gregory of Nazianzus' encomium of Basil is the following laudatory account of his city, Caesarea:

...he hastened to the city of Caesarea to attend its schools, I mean this illustrious city of ours, since she was also the guide and mistress of my studies, and not less the metropolis of letters than of the cities which she rules and which have submitted to her power. To rob her of her supremacy in letters would be to despoil her of her fairest and most singular distinction. Other cities take pride in other embellishments, either old or new, depending, I think, on their annals or their monuments. This city's characteristic mark, like the identification marks on arms or on plays, is letters.

Basil himself, however, protested at length against the use of encomium, citing its essential insincerity. In the following passage, his reference to native cities as a tool in the panegyric of a person is not casual. Aristotle, Cicero and other rhetorical theorists had always recommended that a person be praised in part through the praises due his place of origin. Basil's ideal of Christian piety opposes that procedure:

The school of God does not recognize the laws of the encomium, but holds that a mere telling of the martyr's deeds is a sufficient praise for the saints and sufficient inspiration for those who are struggling towards virtue... [...] How could I be an object of more reverence or be more

illustrious from the fact that my native city once upon a time endured great and heavy battles...? What if she is so happily located that in summer and winter her climate is pleasant? [...] In her herds of horses she surpasses all lands under the sun. [...] If we talk about these facts...shall we deceive ourselves into thinking that drawing praise from these facts give praise to men?⁵⁵

One other orator of the Second Sophistic, Libanius (314-ca. 400), deserves consideration here for his composition of an encomium to his native city of Antioch. Trained throughout the Hellenic world and founder of a well known rhetorical school, Libanius was perhaps the most respected orator of his day. His Antiochikos (ca. 360) was apparently conceived as a "gift to the city" (657), calculated to render homage to its considerable fame and also to teach an audience of listeners who might not be familiar with the city's ancient glories. It is nearly as long as the Panathenaicus of Aristides but is more similar in content to his encomium of Smyrna, achieving as it does a balanced coverage of the three major components of the genre - site, origins, and accomplishments. Abundant natural resources are first described, with each season being as pleasant as the one before it. With respect to vicinity of

⁵⁵ From In Gordium, 42D-143A, as translated by J. M. Campbell, The Influence of the Second Sophistic on the Style of the Sermons of St. Basil the Great (Washington: Catholic U of America, 1922) 147. Passage cited in Charles Sears Baldwin, Medieval Rhetoric and Poetic (to 1400) (Gloucester, MA: Peter Smith, 1959) 22.

the sea the city is blessed to be connected via the Orontes river, but at a distance of several miles. Here Libanius echoes the thoughts of Aristotle before him in claiming that

the greatest cause of harm is that a city placed on the sea is forced to suffer from the vulgarity of sailors and their disorderly brawls and their ribald talk and from all the other things which have to power to run and destroy the moral of a city. (659)⁵⁶

The mythical settling of Antioch is described in depth, with the narrative effortlessly moving into a more factually based history of the Seleucid kings. For Libanius, this is the story of "how the best of lands has come to be the possession of the best of men, like a well-made ship in the hands of good sailors" (659). Antioch's many peoples liberally embraced many religions, receiving at least as many exiles as had Athens, but, unlike that city, never setting its own gods at war among themselves for the honor of protecting the city. The city willingly accepted the new power of Rome, whose leaders "did not deprive the city of its place as metropolis of Asia" (667). Wives are praised for working toward the embellishment of the city. Libanius dwells at great length upon the rhetorical polish of the senators and their wisdom in governing. Although public

⁵⁶ Libanius, "Libanius' Oration in Praise of Antioch (Oration XI)," trans., intro., commentary Glanville Downey, Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society 103.5 (1959): 652-686.

order and discretion is sometimes found lacking in Egypt and Italy, Antioch's populace has the finest manners. The poor are well attended, and unlike Rome, Antioch never drives out its foreign residents.

The last and quite lengthy section of the Antiochikos is devoted to a careful description of the city's layout of streets and neighborhoods, offering far more detail than any other ancient city encomium. The old city and the new city are related almost cartographically, with the attendant advantages of various quarters. We hear of the stoas, dense with commerce, and yesteryear's vegetable garden being built upon to provide housing for Antioch's newcomers. The famed suburb of Daphne produces ecstatic tones in Libanius: "When a man sees this he cannot but cry out and leap for joy and skip and clap his hands and bless himself for seeing the sight, and, so to speak, soar on wings from pleasure" (677). Daphne and Antioch share one single resource unmatched by any other city-boundless, healthful waters. Thus the citizens of Antioch avoid the "pushing about the fountains and complaints about broken jars, and blows in addition to torrents of words" (679). Libanius bids farewell to his topic by taking on two giants of antiquity, gaining perhaps more sympathy from the audience by virtue of his

circumspection than might Aristides with his more strident comparisons:

What city can we say is worthy to be compared with this? [...] By one [Constantinople] it may be excelled in walls, but it is greater than this in the abundance of its water and in the mildness of its winter, in the refinement of its inhabitants and in its pursuit of learning; and it is more fair than that city which is even larger [Rome], because of that fairest thing, Hellenic education and literature. (681)

The Antiochikos is perhaps as complete, rich and literary a city encomium as was written before the humanist era. It seems fitting, therefore, to find evidence that its author was truly dedicated to the civic ideal, to the social benefits accruing from an urban lifestyle:

What then is my purpose in this? And the lengthening of my discourse, entirely about the stoas, to what will it bring us? It seems to me that one of the most pleasing things in cities, and I might add one of the most useful, is meetings and mixings with other people. That is indeed a city, where there is much of this. Truly, it is good to speak, and to hear is better and to converse is best, and to add what is fitting to the fortunes of one's friends, rejoicing with them in some things, sorrowing with them in others, and to have the same return from them; and in addition to these there are ten thousand things in being near to one another. (675)

After the close of the Second Sophistic period, during the first half of the fifth century, Sozomen (died ca. 450) wrote on the founding of Constantinople in 324. The

following passage from his Ecclesiastical History lauds the physical aspect of the city, explicitly comparing it to Rome's greatness and informed of a Christian perspective.

The subject is Constantine:

Led by the divine hand, he came to Byzantium..., and here he desired to build his city... In obedience to the command of God, he therefore enlarged the city formerly called Byzantium, and surrounded it with high walls; likewise he built splendid dwelling houses; and being aware that the former population was not enough for so great a city, he peopled it with men of rank and their families, whom he summoned from Rome and from other countries. He imposed special taxes to cover the expenses of building and adorning the city, and of supplying the inhabitants with food. He erected all the needed edifices for a great capital - a hippodrome, fountains, porticoes and other beautiful adornments. He named it Constantinople and New Rome - and established it as the Roman capital for all the inhabitants of the North, the South, the East, and the shores of the Mediterranean... He created another Senate...and he strove to render the city of his name equal in every way to Rome in Italy; ...[I]t became the most populous and wealthy of cities. ...[I]t was not polluted by altars, Grecian temples, nor pagan sacrifices. (II, 3)⁵⁷

A number of very minor encomia of cities occur as epigrams or inscriptions, as collected in the Greek Anthology. Dating these short texts is quite problematic,

⁵⁷ Sozomen, Ecclesiastical History, in William Stearns Davis, ed., Readings in Ancient History: Illustrative Extracts from the Sources, 2 vols. (Boston: Allyn and Bacon, 1912-13) vol. 2: Rome and the West 295-96. Text modernized by J. S. Arkenberg for internet version. 29 Sep. 2000 <<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/ancient/sozomen-constantinople1.html>>.

although they are thought to be from the first few centuries of this era. By 'Macedonius the Consul':

I am Sardis, the chief city of Lydia, who stands under flowery Tmolus, by the stream of Maeonian Hermus. I witnessed first the birth of Jove, for I refused to betray the secretly born son of my own Rhea. It was I, too, who nursed Bacchus, and I saw him shining with broader flame in the lightning-flash. First in my fields did Autumn, the giver of wine, milk from the udder of the grape-cluster the golden juice. Everything combined to adorn me, and old Time often saw me envied by the most flourishing cities.⁵⁸

Note that these few lines manage to include information on topography, natural resources, mythology, origin, and a minimal reference to enduring fame.

Following are two others from the same volume, both anonymous: "If you know of another city with the same name, Heraclea, know that I, the Pontic one, do not rank beneath it" (359); "Rome [i.e. Constantinople], queen of the world, thy fame shall never perish, for Victory, being wingless, cannot fly from thee" (359).⁵⁹

⁵⁸ The Greek Anthology, trans. W. R. Paton, Book IX, vol. 3 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1998) 357.

⁵⁹ Constantinople was considered, and sometimes called, the Rome of the eastern Mediterranean (editor's note, The Greek Anthology, 359). In Antiochikos, above, Libanius paired the two cities in his peroratio, and this correlation would also be seen in the title of the fifteenth-century Greek laus urbis by Manuel Chrysoloras, A Comparison of Old and New Rome. See Chapter Six for more on this.

The long series of Second Sophistic or early-Byzantine Greek encomia of cities seems to close with a work by Procopius of Caesarea (d. 565). His Buildings (ca. 560) was intended to flatter Justinian by surveying the extensive public works projects undertaken by that emperor in a variety of cities throughout his realm. Carthage and Ceuta to the west and Jerusalem and Jericho to the east are among the many cities restored, walled, cleaned or founded by Justinian, as told by Procopius. An encomiastic description of the Santa Sophia cathedral is included, as is another of the topography of Constantinople, excerpted here:

Thus the sea forms a garland about the city. [...] So that when a ship anchors there the stern rides upon the sea while the prow rests upon the land, as if the two elements contended with each other to see which of them would be able to render the greater service to the city. (I, v)⁶⁰

This passage is reminiscent of Aristides in style (i.e. the personification of natural elements) and content (the land and sea as friendly combatants in harmonious service to the city). Procopius was not concerned with the other traditional elements of city encomia, the origin and accomplishments of the city.

⁶⁰ Procopius, Buildings, trans. H. B. Dewing and Glanville Downey, vol. 7 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1996).

Latin City Encomia of Late Antiquity

The fourth-century poet, rhetorician and politician Decimus Magnus Ausonius (310-ca. 393), known for his poetic tendency to classify and catalogue, produced a group of verse encomia of twenty leading cities of his day. The Ordo urbium nobilium pretends to rank these cities, giving brief and sometimes epigrammatic descriptions of topographic features or celebrated moments of history or mythology relevant to the city being praised. Rome receives the honor of first place, and just one verse: "First among cities, the home of gods, is golden Rome" (269).⁶¹ Last place is given to Bordeaux, the poet's hometown, which nevertheless receives top honors for its length of forty-one verses. Following are the cities praised: Rome, Constantinople, Carthage, Antioch, Alexandria, Trier, Milan, Capua, Aquileia, Arles, Seville, Cordoba, Tarragona, Braga, Athens, Catania, Syracuse, Toulouse, Narbonne, and Bordeaux. The four Iberian cities are treated in five verses, receiving together less attention than any other single city in the group:

After these thou shalt be told, beloved Hispalis,
name Iberian, by whom glides a river like the sea,
to whom all Spain subjects her magistrates. Not
Cordova, not Tarragona with its strong citadel

⁶¹ Ausonius, trans. Hugh G. Evelyn White, vol. 1 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1988).

contends with you, nor wealthy Braga, lying
proudly in her bay beside the sea. (277)

Without doubt the poet was aware that these cities added geographical integrity to the Ordo as a whole, with Braga, near the distant Atlantic Ocean, reminding the reader of the far western limits of Roman rule. The absence of a British city may be due to the military rebellion of Brittania just prior to – or during – the writing of the Ordo.

The most famous composition by Ausonius is his Mosella, a naturalistic journey along the Moselle River. Although some towns or cities are mentioned, such as Trier, the focus is on ekphrasis, or pure description.

The epic poet Claudius Claudianus (365-408) chose to praise Rome's greatness in defeating the Goths (De bello Pollentino, 51 ff.; De consulatu Stilichonis, III, 51 ff., 130 ff.). In addition, he praises Pollenzo, the site of the victory.⁶² Claudian also wrote two naturalistic descriptions of places. One is a short meditation upon the harbor at Smyrna:

The city that meets our gaze veils the mountain
peaks, fronting a tranquil sea. The two headlands
that enclose the harbour protect the quiet water
from the north wind. Here the sea is disarmed by
the encircling land and learns to lie in
undisturbed tranquility. (175)⁶³

⁶² These passages are noted by Hammer, diss., 38-40.

⁶³ Claudian, trans. Maurice Platnauer (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1963).

Claudian's encomium of Hispania will be addressed in Chapter Four.

Another poem describes the hot springs of Abano (near Padua), with a highly detailed account of the plants, rocks, water, vapors, and fires native to the location.

The History of Ammianus Marcellinus (ca. 330-395) includes a passage in which Rome is described through the eyes of Constantius Augustus as he enters the city. It records the awe-inspiring panorama of monuments of the central city:

So then he entered Rome, the home of empire and of every virtue, and when he had come to the Rostra, the most renowned forum of ancient dominion, he stood amazed... [...] Then, as he surveyed the sections of the city and its suburbs, lying within the summits of the seven hills, along their slopes, or on level ground, he thought that whatever first met his gaze towered above all the rest: the sanctuaries of Tarpeian Jove...the baths... the huge bulk of the amphitheatre...to whose top human eyesight barely ascends... the Pantheon like a rounded city-district... and amongst these the other adornments of the Eternal City. (XVI, 10, 13-14)⁶⁴

The above account of Rome's monumental splendor differs immensely from Ammianus' description of the citizens of Rome, especially the upper class:

Rome is still looked upon as the queen of the earth, and the name of the Roman people is

⁶⁴ Ammianus Marcellinus, trans. John C. Rolfe, vol. 1 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1982).

respected and venerated. But the magnificence of Rome is defaced by the inconsiderate levity of a few, who...fall away into error and licentiousness as if a perfect immunity were granted to vice. Of these men, some, thinking that they can be handed down to immortality by means of statues, are eager after them... Others place the summit of glory in having a couch higher than usual, or splendid apparel. [...] The whirlpool of banquets, and divers other allurements of luxury I omit, lest I grow too prolix. (History, XIV.16)⁶⁵

Like Lucian on Rome, or Dio Chrysostom on Alexandria, Ammianus clearly distinguishes between the monumental city and the community of citizens inhabiting it (see note 47).

Writing at approximately the same time, the Gaul Rutilius Numatianus preferred to dwell upon the city as it once was, imagining an equally glorious future despite the recent ravages visited upon it by Alaric. This encomium is less descriptive than it is hymnic:

Give ear to me, Queen of the world which you
rule,
O Rome, whose place is amongst the stars!
.....
Through your temples we draw near to the very
heaven.
.....
Yea the sun himself, in his vast course,
Seems only to turn in your behalf.
He rises upon your domains;
And on your domains, it is again that he sets...
.....
You have made one city what was aforetime the
wide world!
.....

⁶⁵ Ammianus Marcellinus, History, 224 ff. of work cited in note 32. 29 Sep. 2000 <http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/ancient/ammianus-history14.html>.

The grandeur of your deeds surpasses even your
mighty destinies.⁶⁶

A fairly complete encomium of Narbonne was written as part of the poem "To Consentius" by the fifth-century author Sidonius. The city is praised for its urban assets of walls, shops, baths, etc., for its gods, and for its natural bountifulness. Sidonius deftly portrays the ruins occasioned by war as evidence of valor.⁶⁷

In the next chapter we will review the medieval Latin city encomia, a group of writings that is characterized by one major attribute, that is, a decidedly Christian, rather than pagan, outlook.

⁶⁶ Rutilius Numatianus, On His Return, 318-19 of work cited in note 32. 29 Sep. 2000 <<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/ancient/413rutilius.html>>. For additional comments regarding Rutilius and Marcellinus, see the article by Paolo Zanna, "'Descriptiones urbium' and Elegy in Latin and Vernaculars, in the Early Middle Ages."

⁶⁷ Rhetorical manuals, such as the Rhetorica ad Alexandrum and the first treatise of Menander, had always advised that a subject's disadvantages be converted to advantages in encomiastic writing.

CHAPTER THREE

MEDIEVAL LATIN ENCOMIA OF CITIES

During the long period covering approximately the years 700 through 1350 a steady increase in the production of city praises can be identified. The vast majority was written in Latin for the cities of Northern Italy, with a smaller number being dedicated to certain communities of England, France and Germany. This chapter is a review of the significant European encomia of cities of this period, presented as relevant context for our subsequent examination of the Iberian encomia.

Poetry is the genre first used during this period; it appears during Carolingian times and continues to be seen into the fourteenth century. City poems of the medieval period tend to be either laudatory narratives of a city's attributes or elegiacal lamentations on the loss of a city. Prose is used to praise cities from the ninth century forward, and by the twelfth century it overtakes poetry as the preferred genre. The first prose celebrations of cities are typically prefaces to larger works in honor of local

bishops, but eventually they evolve into independent documents dedicated almost entirely to the praise of the city in question.

Both the poetry and prose of cities undergo a fundamental change during the twelfth century, becoming less Christian in outlook and more concerned with classical origins and with local, civic pride in general. The Christian element by no means disappears, rather it is emphasized less. This change may be seen as a fairly logical development of the times, a result of increased trade and travel in the Mediterranean and the rise of the independent Italian communes. Although it is true that the religious phenomenon of pilgrimages to the holy cities - especially Rome and Jerusalem - also flourished at this time, the travel guides serving pilgrims seem to exalt the antiquity of these places as much as their religious role. After the twelfth-century turn toward a secularization of city praise, the texts become longer and more given to details and statistics evidencing local excellence. We may consider this medieval phase of city praise to end with the closing of the fourteenth century, since the 1404 laudatio of Florence by Leonardo Bruni would inaugurate a new, humanist step in the genre. This division between medieval and humanist eras must remain flexible, of course, since the medieval outlook in

city praise continued to be seen in some places (e.g. Germany) well into the fifteenth century.¹

In accordance with the outline traced above, our review of medieval Latin encomia of cities can be divided chronologically into two parts. The first includes those texts written from approximately 700 to 1100; the second, those composed from 1100 through the mid-1300s. As might be expected, considerable overlap occurred.²

¹ In this regard J. K. Hyde goes as far as to say that "Bruni's Laudatio was exceptional among Renaissance descriptions; most examples of the genre written in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries were much closer to the De Magnalibus." See J. K. Hyde, "Medieval Descriptions of Cities," Bulletin of the John Rylands Library 48.2 (1966): 308-40; here 329 n. 2.

² This lengthy and complicated medieval period of city praise has been studied in different ways by several critics. William Hammer's 1938 dissertation, Encomia of Cities From Antiquity to Humanism (chapters 1 and 3), offers a wide-ranging overview of the prose and poetry, and has a strong bibliography on relevant German criticism. Classen's chronology in Die Stadt im Spiegel der 'Descriptiones' und 'Laudes urbium' in der antiken und mittelalterlichen Literatur bis zum Ende des zwölften Jahrhunderts is complementary. Four more recent studies have been especially useful to me. J. K. Hyde (1966) provided the first panoramic view of the texts (including some non-Italian examples), suggesting a three-part evolution during medieval times. I have compacted slightly his scheme into two phases, in recognition of what I perceive to be a single, major change in the twelfth century. Gina Fasoli focused on the medieval laudes as an expression of the Italian communes' civic pride, in Fasoli, "La coscienza civica nelle 'Laudes civitatum'," in Scritti di storia medievale, ed. F. Bocchi, et al. (Bologna: Emiliana, 1974) 293-318. Chiara Frugoni (A Distant City: Images of Urban Experience in the Medieval World, trans. William McCuaig (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1991) 54-81) characterizes most of the Italian texts as both literature and as political products, introducing several not previously addressed

Praise of a City for Its Importance to Christianity

As noted above, poetry is the first genre employed to praise cities in the medieval period, with several texts appearing during Carolingian times. Probably the two best known are those composed to honor Milan and Verona during the eighth century, the latter often considered an implicit rebuttal of the former. They have been edited together by G. B. Pighi as Versus de Verona, Versum de Mediolano civitate.³

The encomium to Milan was written by an anonymous author in 739. Its seventy-two verses begin with a physical description of the city that may have issued in part from the contemporary rhetorical prescription for the laus urbis genre, the "De laudibus urbium." The city is described as

by others. Paolo Zanna (1991) analyzed in detail three kinds of medieval encomia of cities: Carolingian poems, non-Latin poems, and prose laudes of Rome.

Each of these scholars has made valuable contributions to our knowledge of this field. Nonetheless, their studies tend to be either panoramic (with reduced literary analysis) or quite focused. My own very brief account here aims at striking a compromise between these two approaches, indicating the full range of texts and the major examples, as well as identifying some of the literary contours. This view is intended to serve not as an exhaustive history of medieval laudes urbium, but rather as a useful description of the genre 1) as the foundation for its later humanist phase in Italy, and 2) as literary context and influence for the more particular manifestation of city praise in Iberia, during the medieval and humanist periods.

³ Anonymous, "Versus de Verona, Versum de Mediolano civitate," ed. G. B. Pighi, Studi Pubblicati dell'Istituto di Filologia Classica, 7 (Bologna: n. p., 1960).

being situated on a plain, with impressive towers, walls, gates, paved streets, and an aqueduct. Next, Milan's Christian devotion is detailed via a list of the saints buried there, and its citizens are said to generously offer their gifts to the Church. The Milanese are wealthy; the poor are satisfied. In Milan one finds wine, meat and merchandise of high quality, while militarily the citizens prevail over their enemies. Not surprisingly, the encomium ends with a prayer to Christ to govern well the city and deliver it from every danger. The poet asks that the citizens be admitted to the eternal city in heaven, employing a metaphor convenient to the subject of his poem.

A companion poem was written for Verona at the end of the same century, an answer to the challenge represented by the praise for Milan.⁴ Its structure is similar; after Verona's towers, bridges and paved streets are briefly described, its devout Christian character is affirmed. As compared to the laus of Milan, proportionally less attention is paid to the built city, and more to its religious heritage. In fact, the Veronese poem is noteworthy for its lengthy, narrative treatment of the city's Christian

⁴ For the text of both poems, see the edition by G. B. Pighi. Additional discussion is found in J.K. Hyde's article on city descriptions, as well as in Chapter 3 of Chiara Frugoni's The Better City.

history. In its one-hundred verses it conveys especially well a reverence for the saints and martyrs of the past, clearly citing them as a source of present glory. Pighi has noted the poem's consciousness of the city's prior phases, and its recognition of an essential unity over time.⁵ It seems noteworthy, as well, that the Veronese poet's fundamentally Christian outlook didn't prevent him from acknowledging that the pagan founders of Verona, although "malis hominibus," had been the ones who created the original beauties of that city.

Still in Carolingian times, Alcuin (735-804) composed a poem on the church history of his native York, the Versus de patribus regibus et sanctis Euboricensis ecclesiae.⁶ In his invocation to Christ - and significantly to the cives Olympi - the poet declares his intention:

Mecum ferte pedes, vestris componite carmen
hoc precibus, patriae quoniam mens dicere laudes
et veteres cunas properat proferre parumper
Euboricae raris praeclarae versibus urbis!
(vv. 15-18)

Alcuin then traces the virtues of the city's Roman-era fortifications, its strategic value as a river port with access to the sea, its resources of fish and the flowers of

⁵ Pighi 157.

⁶ Alcuin, The Bishops, Kings and Saints of York, ed. and trans. Peter Godman (Oxford: Clarendon, 1982).

its rich fields, and the many peoples attracted to it for its promise of wealth. As a cleric and as the chief literary figure of Charlemagne's court, Alcuin not surprisingly shows respect for both the Christian heritage of York and its Roman founding. In miniature he has also touched upon the bases for city praise as laid out by Menander and the anonymous author of the eighth-century "De laudes urbium." His is a remarkably complete example of the genre, occurring even as it does within the scope of a larger historical work.

Nearly contemporaneous with the praise of York were two elegiac poems that mourn the loss of Aquileia and Lindisfarne. Latin elegy had been recognized as early as Horace (in his Ars poetica), and its traditional role of grieving for a deceased person had been adapted in late imperial times, as we have seen, to grieve the loss of Rome itself.⁷ The more intensely emotional elegies, such as the two considered here, may also be considered lamentationes that were surely inspired by the Biblical precedents in Jeremiah and Lamentations. As the focus of these poems is on grief rather than description, relatively little mention is

⁷ "Versibus impariter iunctis querimonia primum, / post etiam inclusa est voti sententia compos." See Horace, "Ars poetica," Horace. Satires, Epistles and Ars Poetica, trans. H. Rushton Fairclough (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1961) vv. 75-76.

made of city walls, natural resources, etc. Nonetheless, since that grief can be made more intense by way of a specific comparison between the city's former condition of greatness and its current condition of absence and misery - for example, majestic buildings versus their ruins - some description is indeed employed.

This strategy of before-and-after comparison is seen in the first of the two elegies, the alphabet poem Versus de destructione Aquilegiae numquam restaurandae, by Bishop Paulinus of Aquileia, a colleague of Alcuin at Charlemagne's court. Its tone of lamentation begins appropriately "Ad flendos tuos, Aquilegia, cineres / non mihi ulle sufficiunt lacrimae, / desunt sermones, dolor sensum abstulit / cordis amari."⁸ Then the poet relates that the city's former greatness was complete, with walls and buildings and religious prominence. Excessive pride of the citizens caused God to send forth Attila, who ravaged the city. Citizens, Bibles and chalices alike were destroyed. The comparisons of Aquileia before and after the raid dramatize the loss: "urbs eras regum: pauperum tugurium / permanes modo"; "Repleta quondam domibus sublimibus / ornatis mire niveis marmoribus, / nunc ferax frugum metiris funiculo / ruricularum". The

poem ends with a heartfelt plea that God protect the citizenry from future harm.

Paulinus's Christian lamentatio blames the tragedy of Aquileia on unrestrained pride within the city. Another Christian response to the theme of loss is that of stoic resignation before the passing of all things of this earth, and the necessity of fixing one's sights on the immutable glories of heaven. This is seen especially well in the lamentatio known as De clade Lindisfarnensis monasterii, by Alcuin, written to commemorate the Vikings' sacking of that community: "Per varios casus mortalis vita cucurrit, / Diversosque dies omnis habebat homo."⁹ Alcuin invokes the greatness and subsequent destruction of Babylon, Persia, Alexander, Rome, and Jerusalem, focusing momentarily on Solomon's temple to parallel the case of the religious community of Lindisfarne. He intones "Sic fugit omne decus, hominis quod dextera fecit, / Gloria seclorum sic velut umbra volat." After noting that the world of his own day was witness to similar calamities (in Spain the people lie subject to a conquering foe: "Hesperiae populus, quondam gens inclita bello / Invisis sceptris servit et ipsa modo"),

⁸ More Latin Lyrics, from Virgil to Milton, trans. Helen Waddell, ed. and intro. Felicitas Corrigan (London: Gollancz, 1971) 138-45.

⁹ Waddell 160-75.

Alcuin minimizes, perhaps paradoxically, the need to lament: "Talia iam mundi, non Christi luget amator, / Sit, rogo, non aurum, sit tibi Christus amor." The De clade focuses almost entirely on the spiritual response of the Christian community after the Viking massacre, and gives exceedingly few details of the physical place of Lindisfarne. These include a very brief description of the desecration of the altar. Alcuin concludes with more encouragement and a final praise of God.

A final poem seems worthy of inclusion in this early group of city praises. Neither praise of a real city nor lamentatio of a lost city, the anonymous De sancta Hierusalem is a description of a heavenly Jerusalem, including elements of both a physical urbs and the community of Christians, the civitas.¹⁰ The anonymous poet, writing in the Merovingian or Carolingian era, proposes the allegory of a heavenly city, mentions its walls, its grand homes and good citizens, and then calls attention to the transcendent nature of this community: "Templum ipsa nullum habet manu factum civitas, / ipse deus huius templum est et agnus unicum." The poem clearly owes a conceptual debt to Augustine's Civitas dei, but has taken its central image

¹⁰ Poetarum latinorum medii aevi, ed. E. Duemmler, vol. 4, part II-1 of Mon. Germ. Hist. (Berlin: Weidmann, 1914) 512-14.

more specifically from the Biblical descriptions of Jerusalem found in Isaiah and in Revelations, as noted in the previous chapter. The language in each is strikingly similar, especially in these verses: "And the city has no need of sun or moon to shine upon it, for the glory of God is its light, and its lamp is the Lamb" (Rev. 21.23), and in our poem, "Solis nulla, nulla lunae urbs egebit lampade, / Christus illam namque suo totam lampat lumine." The Carolingian poet's accomplishment was to recast this inherited Biblical tradition in the mold of a devotional laus urbis for his own medieval times.

We turn now to a series of prose texts, written slightly later than the poems just seen. In the Christian era, bishops and saints replaced the emperors and politicians who had formed the subjects of classical-era panegyrics. Cicero had prescribed that such panegyrics of individuals begin with an encomium of the person's patria, so it is not surprising to see this recommendation continued in post-Classical writing. Accordingly, an encomium of Naples appears as the first chapter of a life of the city's Bishop Athanasius.¹¹ This chapter, titled "S. Athanasii patria, patentes, pia educati, and clericatus in pueritia,"

¹¹ Vita sancti Athanasii episcopi Neapolitani, in Muratori, RIS, II, 2, 1051-64. Citations below refer to pages 1051-53.

opens by locating Naples within the province of Campania, in Italy, within Europe. Concrete details, however, are scarce, with only brief mention being made of Campania's fertility ("frugum, omniumque pomorum foecunda; quae sicuti ferax est, diversa proferendo fructuum germina") and the noteworthy men it produced, explicitly linking Campania with Athanasius ("Deo dignos viros saepe produxit, & educavit: inter quos Athanasius, quasi novum sidus, non mediocriter emicuit").

Naples is then shown to have ancient and noble roots:

...Heneapolis, quae post civitatis Trojanae excidium, ab Enea filio Anchisae, & Veneris condita, ita praepotens, & amoena est in structurae scilicet munitionibus, situ suburbano, & Christicolarum, interius degentium, religione, ut in Hesperia, post Romanam urbem, nulli reperiatur esse inferior.

Vergil is also linked to the city. Following a few additional details regarding the public works sponsored by Octavian, Constantine, and Belisarius, the author notes that the city's Christian piety helped spare it great losses over the course of history. A transition is then made into the more recent history of Athanasius himself.

Several other prose texts of this period attest to the apparently perfunctory step of praising a city as an introduction to a religious subject, be it a bishop, saint or general chronicle of the local church. These texts have been analyzed with some detail by Chiara Frugoni, and

include the Mutinensis urbis descriptio (Modena, ca. 910); the influential De situ civitatis Mediolani (Milan, ca. 1000); and the De laude urbis Mettensis (Metz, 1050-60).

Growth of Classical and Secular Orientation in City Praises

The heightened circulation of people, goods and ideas throughout Europe during the twelfth century had a very noticeable impact upon the city texts written then. Two lamentationes, one each for Troy and Rome, exemplify the rise of a classical consciousness; prose laudes to Rome, London and Chester likewise show a stronger interest in Roman origins, and are filled with Horatian and Vergilian references, among others. Thirteenth- and fourteenth-century laudes urbium were increasingly written as longer and more descriptive prose documents that were independent of any overriding religious purpose, commonly reflecting the local, civic pride of the Italian commune.¹²

Hugh Primas of Orleans' lament for Troy, Urbs erat illustris (mid-1100s), depends throughout upon the same

¹² J. K. Hyde notes that these laudes somewhat anachronistically celebrated communal civic pride, since they appeared at a time when that form of government was already giving way to more despotic and less democratic ones: "Only when the communes were on the point of disappearance did they become conscious of themselves" (338).

before-and-after strategy of comparison used by Paulinus for Aquileia. It begins "Urbs erat illustris, quam belli clade bilustris / nunc facit exustrix fecundam flamma ligustris. / Urbs fecunda ducum, caput inclinata caducum, / nunc fecunda nucum stupet ex se surgere lucum."¹³ Priam and Hecuba are invoked, as are the "muros veteres" of the city, but everywhere one looks, tearfully, the natural world has invaded the site. This theme may be seen in "Vepres et spinas veteres operire ruinas" and "Heu quid agunt bella! preciosa iacent capitella / et Jovis in cella cubat hinc ovis inde capella." While this is doubtless an echo of similar Biblical passages (e.g. "...for Mount Zion which lies desolate; jackals prowl over it" Lamentations 5.18), the poem cannot be seen as religiously inspired. Even its insistence upon the sins of the Trojans having brought down the city (a theme that was set in a Christian perspective in Paulinus's poem, as we have seen) is virtually unaccompanied by any reference to Christianity. The poem is didactic, even moralistic, but seems rooted more in the author's vibrant erudition of a distant, classical period than in any Christian dogma.

Hildebert of Lavardin, architect and cleric, composed a number of poems on cities during the first half of the

¹³ Waddell 290-93.

twelfth century, most of which reflect a reverence for the metaphorical Jerusalem of the afterlife, as well as a didactic rejection of the glories of this world.

Nonetheless, his poem De Roma expresses genuine marvel at the lost greatness of that city, opening thus: "Par tibi, Roma, nihil, cum sis prope tota ruina. / Quam magni fueris integra, fracta doces."¹⁴ The Christian poet allows himself to exclaim, "Proh dolor! urbs cecidit, cujus dum specto ruinas, / Penso statum, solitus dicere: 'Roma fuit.'" In a desultory tour of the city, both temporal and spatial, Hildebert reviews the "arces Caesaris," the "gladii regum," the "jura senatus," and concludes that the manmade accomplishment that was Rome cannot be erased nor bettered.

Returning to the twelfth century, Chiara Frugoni has identified an altercatio by the cleric Donizone from ca. 1115 in which the town of Canossa disputes preeminence with Mantova. At the root of the contention were some quite particular local circumstances, i.e. Canossa's desire to recover the remains of the Marquis Bonifacio, who was an ancestor of the Countess Mathilde. Mathilde, in turn, was

¹⁴ Waddell 262-63. Paolo Zanna has analyzed several of Hildebert's poems in depth, noting the poet's opposed but complementary attitudes toward antiquity and paganism.

the subject of Donizone's book Vita Mathildis.¹⁵ Essentially we are before another example of a panegyrical text of an individual which follows the Ciceronian recommendation to praise the subject's patria, as well as his or her physical attributes, education, deeds, etc. Donizone, a resident of Canossa, establishes a dialectical victory for his town. When Mantua asserts "Urbs ego sum dicta, tu diceris arx Canusina," Canossa replies that Mantua lacks the firm protection of a real city: "Contra te bella si surgant, quive misella, / Tu facies? Duron non es circumdata muro: / Percuteris per aquas, per terras, quando rebellas." Canossa also attempts to defrock Mantua of its thousand-year tradition as the birthplace of Vergil. This dispute extends through 150 verses. Frugoni notes that the importance of this double laus lies in its secular treatment of Bonifacio's relics; that is, Canossa will be honored to have the remains of a lay dignitary, rather than of a saint. This flows also from the fact that the book itself is the life not of a saint but of a countess.

Frugoni has found a similar transfer of the religious to the secular in a contemporaneous poem to Bergamo by Mosè

¹⁵ Cited in Frugoni 75-76, who refers to the text in the 1930 edition of Rerum italicarum scriptores, originally edited by L. A. Muratori in 1726.

di Brolo, the Liber Pergaminus.¹⁶ Unfinished at over 370 distych verses, the poem reflects extraordinary faith in Bergamo's communal government, so much so that its council of twelve is called viris sanctis and their legal codes the sanctas leges (vv. 277, 279). It is also worth noting that the Liber Pergaminus is perhaps the first prose laus urbis to be written with the single purpose of rendering praise to the city in question.

Pilgrim guidebooks and itineraries were made from as early as the fourth century, when a traveler recorded the sites from Bordeaux to Jerusalem.¹⁷ The twelfth century witnessed an upsurge in literature of this sort. Much of it was devoted to ekphrasis, involving as it did the physical descriptions of shrines, landscapes, hills, churches, and decorations. Still, the tone of such description was frequently laudatory, or even ecstatic, as one might expect from a writer wishing to share the holiest sites of his religion with others. Writing in 1183, Theoderich says of the Church and Hospital of Saint John the Baptist that

¹⁶ Frugoni 73-75. This text is edited and commented by G. Gorni in "Il Liber Pergaminus di Mosè di Brolo" Studi medioevali 11.1 (1970): 409-60.

¹⁷ For this and other subsequent texts of a similar nature, consult the various translations published by the Palestine Pilgrims' Text Society, as reprinted by AMS in 1971.

no one can credibly tell another how beautiful its buildings are, how abundantly it is supplied with rooms and beds...how rich it is...and how devotedly it labors to maintain the needy, unless one has the opportunity of seeing it with one's own eyes.¹⁸

Theoderich describes not only wondrous places but provides in addition a great many historical notes, thereby underlining the essential antiquity of the holy sites.

Renewed interest in Rome at this time resulted in several new guidebooks for that city. A certain Benedict, canon of St. Peters, wrote the Mirabilia urbis Romae about 1143. In it not only the Christian holy sites of Rome are described but the pagan ones as well. Hence we read about the Colosseum ("It was of marvelous beauty and greatness, disposed with many different vaulted chambers and all covered with a heaven of gilded brass..."), and then immediately after are told of Constantine's churches ("During the days of Pope Silvester, Constantine Augustus built the Lateran Basilica...").¹⁹ Like the guidebooks to the Holy Land, the Mirabilia for Rome was explicitly Christian in outlook, but imbued with a respect - and frequently awe - for the accomplishments of the Romans. Several decades later

¹⁸ Theoderich, Guide to the Holy Land [Libellus de locis sanctis], notes and biblio. Ronald G. Musto, trans. Aubrey Stewart (NY: Italica Press, 1986) 22.

¹⁹ Benedict, The Marvels of Rome, trans. and ed. Francis Morgan Nichols (NY: Italica Press, 1986) 28.

another such guide to Rome would be written with much less attention to the Christian heritage of the city, and far more archeological, aesthetic and historical purpose. This was the Narracio de mirabilibus urbis Romae of Magister Gregorius. It may be seen as a precocious antecedent to the humanist-era compendium by Flavio Biondo, Roma instaurata (1446).

Two English prose texts of this century describe London and Chester. Although each is framed within a Christian structure, both show considerable interest and pride in the local, civic scene, and both are remarkably full of references from classical authors. The Descriptio Londoniae, written by William Fitzstephen in 1183 as a preface to the life of Thomas Becket, explicitly cites Plato and Sallust (though incorrectly) to justify the city description he goes on to make. It is worth noting that Fitzstephen recognized by way of these two authors that a city was composed of a civic aspect, civitas, as well as a physical reality, urbs. The text begins characteristically for this more modern phase of the laus urbis:

Among the noble cities of the world that are celebrated by Fame, the City of London, seat of the Monarchy of England, is one that spreads its

fame wider, sends its wealth and wares further,
and lifts its head higher than all others.²⁰

Buildings of note are then described, including the Tower of London and the Palace of Westminster, and the outlying gardens and pastures. Streams and "most excellent wells" are enumerated.²¹ The military valour and affluence of the men is asserted, and schools receive special attention, especially certain rhetorical contests sponsored by them. Fitzstephen is prolix in describing the mundane details of the commonfolk by the riverbank, at the market, and at the horsesellers' field. London is said to be older than Rome, but similar to that city in its administrative and legal structure, with Sheriffs substituting Consuls. Showing knowledge of ancient rhetoric, Fitzstephen notes that demonstrative, deliberative and judicial hearings each have a place or court. Holidays and sports are detailed with enthusiasm, including a description of using animal shinbones as ice-skates. A review of a few important Londoners of history concludes this text, surely the most entertaining and descriptive of the many medieval laudes urbium up to its time. It is also replete with echoes or

²⁰ William Fitzstephen, Norman London, trans. H. E. Butler, intro. F. Donald Logan, essay Frank Stenton (NY: Italica Press, 1990) 48.

²¹ Fitzstephen 50.

quotes from Plato, Horace, Vergil, Macrobius, Ausonius, and the medieval chronicler Geoffrey of Monmouth, and follows the classical dictates for the praise of a city. As such it is an important moment in the evolution of the medieval Latin laus urbis.

It is possible that the Descriptio Londoniae influenced a certain monk, Lucianus, in the writing of his Liber Luciani de laude Cestrie, about 1195.²² The plan of the work includes laudatory praise of the city's location, setting, history and layout (with special attention given to the author's monastery, St. Werbergh), and including an enthusiastic and entirely erroneous etymology of the name Cestria. Classical references are dropped here and there, and influence is evident from the English local historians and the important Welsh chorographer Geraldus Cambrensis. Nonetheless, Lucianus's laus of Chester is only a small part of a much more extensive text that can only be called a sermon, or sermons. Its modern editor notes that its 80,000 words (as compared to the 20,000 of the Fitzstephens tract on London) include several treatises on saints associated with local churches, on the Virgin Mary and on women, on nuns, and finally, on the comparative duties of abbots,

²² Lucian, Liber Luciani de laude Cestrie, ed. M. V. Taylor (London: The Record Society, 1912).

subpriors, and priors.²³ The work closes with meditations on metaphysical topics such as good and evil, power and wisdom, and lastly on the day of judgment.

Several prose laudes urbium of the later 1200s and early or mid-1300s constitute a collective portrait of the genre in its final, late-medieval phase, just prior to its humanist incarnation. The fact that many of these were written expressly for the purpose of rendering praise to the city, and less frequently are part of a larger religious document or city chronicle, indicates that the genre had assumed some importance.

Two texts that are still embedded in city chronicles may begin this portrait. The anonymous author of the Chronica parva Ferrariensis proudly claims that Ferrrara is the location of choice for many people from all over Italy, due to the city's natural and human resources:

Cum Civitas Ferrariae immensitate & fertilitate agrorum, paludum, silvarum, & tanti fluminis opportunitate, tot com meatibus, & bonis plurimis abundaret...²⁴

²³ Lucian 9, 17.

²⁴ Chronica parva Ferrariensis, ed. Lodovico A. Muratori, vol. 8. of Rerum italicarum scriptores (Rome, 1751-53) 469-87. Chiara Frugoni proposes, without explanation, a 1308 date for the work, although the text itself indicates 1264.

Ferrara's influential families are also listed.²⁵ The second work, Chronicon Astense, from 1294, becomes a laus urbis when it describes the newly rebuilt city after its prior destruction.²⁶ Again, the city is replete with wise men who will protect its honor. The local wealth is also emphasized with vivid mention of fashionable ladies dressed in gold, silver, pearls and precious stones. Its possessions in land amount to "libras quinque millia." The Chronicon is composed in a limping style typical of the annals tradition, its sentences very often beginning "Item Civitas Ast..."

The paradigmatic, pre-humanist laus urbis is that written by Bonvesin da la Riva in 1288, the De magnalibus Mediolani.²⁷ Its essential characteristics include a clarity of purpose to laud the city; a well-defined structure covering the classically-prescribed elements, by way of chapters on the physical setting, the buildings, the

²⁵ Frugoni (72-73) notes that in a slightly earlier laus urbis of Lodi (ca. 1253-1259; MGH, SS, vol. 22, 372-73) special mention is made not just of prominent or wise men, but specifically of the scriptores and medici. We remember that a few generations earlier William Fitzstephen had taken great pains to describe the oratorical contests at London's schools. These descriptions of the newly emerging literate professions, particularly that of the municipal administrator and clerk, could only have been a labor of love for the authors of city praises.

²⁶ Chronicon Astense, ed. Lodovico A. Muratori, vol. 11 of Rerum italicarum scriptores (Rome, 1751-53) 140-52.

²⁷ Bonvesin da la Riva, De Magnalibus Mediolani. Meraviglie di Milano, ed., trans., notes Paolo Chiesa (Milan: Scheiwiller, 1998).

inhabitants and the conspicuous abundance of all things; an attention to the civic qualities of "fortitudinis... fidelitatis... libertatis... dignitatis" via a chapter on each; and a high level of detail presented for each topic. Although Bonvesin opens his work with the greeting "Universis catolice fidei copulatis ad quos hec scripta pervenerint...", and although he waxes devout in closing, the overall orientation of the author is extraordinarily secular. He is concerned especially with good governance and with natural resources. J K. Hyde finds that in Bonvesin we have an author who accurately reflects the expanding economy of his time:

What the earlier descriptive writers lacked, and what Bonvesin and his public clearly had, was the kind of bourgeois mentality for which figures talk, and for which statistics are a not inelegant form of praise. (328)

Typical passages include the following: "Suntne ibi paludes aut lacus putride suis nebulis atque fetoribus aerem corrumpentes? Non certe, imo limpidi fonteset fertilia flumina" (58-60); "Sunt in comitatu loca amena voluptaria, burgi quidem decentes numero L...Ville vero cum castris CL sunt numero comunis iurisdictioni subiecte" (70); and "Hoc etiam secure annuntio, quod sunt civitates quam multe, que tantummodo tres de fontibus nostris ducentis milibus

marcarum argenti, si fieri posset, redimerent pro comuni"
(62).

Bonvesin provides a census of buildings, bell towers, churches and professions. The latter include not only bakers, butchers, tavernkeepers, fishermen, and surgeons, but also schoolteachers, grammarians, and copyists. Of these last he says "Librorum scriptores, licet non sit in civitate studium generale, quadragesimum superant numerum; qui digitis suis libros quotidie scribentes, panem et alias expensas lucrantur" (90). Bonvesin enumerates the quantity of many products as well as the months in which various fruits ripen. This overabundance of evidence, coupled with a language that occasionally slips into reverie or lamentation (as for the Christians martyred there: "O Mediolanum, o civitas inclita..." (132)), reveals the essential enthusiasm of the author for his city. His personality emerges also in a curiously honest moment of criticism: "Duo sunt in ipsa civitate, si michi dicere liceat, speciales defectus, videlicet civilis concordie et portus, quo ad ipsam valeret marinum perducere navigium" (182-84). The laudation concludes with a stirring peroration for harmony and Catholic fidelity.

While Bonvesin moved forward the sophistication of the laus urbis genre with his organization and depth of

description, coverage of the city's political nature was still lacking. It was precisely this element that the humanist rhetoricians would add to their city praises.²⁸

A rival answer to De magnalibus Mediolani was written in 1330 for the city of Pavia. It had lost preeminence to Milan over the preceding centuries, and this text, the Liber de laudibus civitatis ticinensis, may be seen as a cry for attention, especially to the Church in Rome.²⁹ Its author, Opicinus de Canistris, notes that the term "Roma secunda" is inscribed on some of Pavia's gates, knowing well that Milan had earlier claimed the term for itself. The topics which by now had become fairly usual in a laus urbis are seen here, with perhaps a few noteworthy, local details regarding the streets' drainage and sewage systems, as well as a well-known statue, the Regisole. The fish of its river Ticinus are said to be better and healthier than those of all of Lombardy.

²⁸ For more detail on this, see Hyde 328-29. Cecchetti 384-86 discusses Bonvesin's work in the context of another paradigmatic laus urbis, the Panathenaic oration of Aristides.

²⁹ Liber de laudibus civitatis ticinensis, vol. 11, part 1 of Rerum italicarum scriptores, ed. Giosuè Carducci and Vittorio Fiorini (Bologna: Zanichelli, 1902-) 16-52. Original version ed. Lodovico A. Muratori (Rome, 1751-53). On page 53 is found a complementary text, presumably by the same author, the Descriptio situs Lombardie et omnium regionum eiusdem. It is a one-page, regional geographical treatise covering modern Emilia Romagna northward to the Alps, and apologetic of Lombardy.

The author boasts repeatedly of a large population of learned professionals: "Ibi sunt quasi innumerabiles advocati vel iudices et notarii..." (27), "Notarii et tabelliones in tanta quantitate sunt, quod faciunt magnum collegium et habent pallatium per se" (29), and "Multi sunt in civitate peritissimi medici tam phisici quam cyrugici" (30). Opicinus brags that Pavia sends many of its citizens to the schools of Bologna, a city which in turn supplies Pavia with many doctors of law, theology and medicine. Although Pavia apparently lacked preparatory schools, and its university was founded in 1361, after the writing of the Liber, this text does attest to a strong respect for learning within the city.³⁰

The Liber is remarkable for its highly detailed section "De districtu civitatis ut infra," which describes the city's neighboring lands, noting distances, cultivations, bridges, and the dividing course of rivers:

...se extendit ab oriente in occidentem in longitudine per viginti milia passuum et plura, in latitudine vero ad decem milia passuum et eo amplius cum Mediolanensium et Laudensium finibus terminatur. Ibi sunt agri et nemora, ville et castra ac vinee iuxta civitatem, ubi dicitur Campanea... (20-21)

³⁰ This respect in Pavia for scholarship and for its civic applications is well documented elsewhere. For additional details, see the editor's note 3, page 30.

The character of this writing is that of chorography, or topography, the description of a locale. Chorographical writing had been undertaken since Roman times in the service of military campaigns, and more personally as the journals of pilgrims. Municipal governments sometimes described with considerable care the layout of fields in order to better define ownership. These field terriers essentially served as verbal maps in a time when, surprisingly enough, local mapping was rare.³¹ That a laudatory text such as the Liber should contain a component of more objective information such as chorography should not surprise us; like the statistics provided in Bonvesin's encomium of Milan, it serves to underline the polifacetic nature of the laus urbis genre. Laudation without description would result in a genre closer, perhaps, to the hymn.

A few other texts of the fourteenth century deserve note in closing. The Lombard cleric and politician Benzo d'Alessandria (fl. ca. 1320) wrote a universal history, the ponderous Chronicon, containing a review of many ancient cities. Milan received a section apart, the De Mediolano florentissima civitate, whose critical approach caused J. K. Hyde to label Benzo as "one of the precursors of the

³¹ For more on this topic, see P. D. A. Harvey, The History of Topographical Map: Symbols, Pictures and Surveys (London:

humanists."³² Hyde also suggests that the text's concern with the visible relics of the ancient past align it with the Mirabilia urbis Romae of Benedict.

Two works were written in praise of Florence at practically the same moment, about 1339. One, the Florentie Urbis et Reipublice Descriptio, reviews the attributes of the city rather briefly, though completely. The other, the Florentie Urbis Descriptio, by Giovanni Villani (ca. 1280-1348), provides a great wealth of information on municipal expenditures, a census of buildings, a listing of religious orders and the professions, and statistics on commodities. It is less informative on the physical character of the city than other laudes we have reviewed (such as that on Pavia), but it does reflect the decidedly secular nature of writing on cities in the region where that was done most -- northern Italy -- on the eve of humanism.³³

Non-Italian cities received far less attention from medieval authors. A systematic study has not been made, but Dario Cecchetti cites references to ten laudes of French cities written during the eleventh through the fourteenth

Thames and Hudson, 1980).

³² Hyde 329-30.

³³ See Hyde 337-38 for further comparison of these two Florentine works.

centuries. These honor Metz, Montpellier, Saintes, Laón, Clairvaux, Senlis, Poitiers; Paris was the subject of three encomia. These are mostly Latin texts, written, like their Italian counterparts, in varying lengths and in both verse and prose. Cecchetti notes the need for a more complete census and study of the French laudes urbium, since many of them are unedited or relatively inaccessible.³⁴

Regarding Germany, William Hammer's study revealed that only one city text - a twelfth-century, Latin poem on Bamberg - is known to have been written during the medieval period. His work documents a plethora of later texts, especially toward the end of the fifteenth century and during the sixteenth.

During the fourteenth century the vernacular tongues of Europe saw increasing use in literature and history, and accordingly, praise for cities appears in these languages more commonly. The Villani text, cited above, exemplifies this tendency for Italy, as will the many works from Spain that will be cited in Chapter Five. Elsewhere in Europe several non-Latin languages had already been used to praise places. Paolo Zanna analyzes five of these (as well as a

³⁴ Cecchetti's focus is on the city writings of the French humanist Nicholas de Clamanges (1362-1437), whose work apparently did not circulate among humanists with nearly the impact as that of Clamanges's contemporary, Leonardo Bruni.

single Irish Latin example). Written in Old English, Old Norse and Welsh, these short poems lament or celebrate cities (Durham and Bath), meeting and drinking halls, a community hearth, and a monastery (Bangor). Zanna shows similarities between this group and some Latin city poems with respect to a number of areas: exaltation or lamentation of a place; use of before-and-after comparisons; coverage of both the physical place and the community of people; religious reverence, Christian and not; and expression of the mutability of the earthly world.³⁵

The use of vernacular languages for city encomia would continue during the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries throughout Europe, but by then Latin would have reappeared as a language for praising cities. In light of this eventual return to Latin, one can observe a long-term cycle in European city praise of Latin-to vernacular-to Latin.

Many of the features of the European laus urbis as described in this chapter were shared by the genre in Spain. The development of the genre there, and especially the persistence of a related tendency to praise the entire Iberian Peninsula, will be traced in Chapters Four, Five and Six.

³⁵ Zanna 549-62.

CHAPTER FOUR

THE MEDIEVAL IBERIAN LAUS HISPANIAE AND LAUS URBIS

This chapter is dedicated to a review of those geographical, historiographic and poetic writings that referred favorably to places in the Iberian Peninsula before the fifteenth century. Emphasis will be placed on city writings. This survey and analysis will allow comparisons with the broader, simultaneous current of medieval European praise of place, as described in the previous chapter. In addition, this chapter will serve to identify the Hispanic literary base upon which the later humanist city encomiasts - Alfonso de Palencia, Jeroni Pau, Alonso de Proaza, et al. - composed their own texts in the fifteenth century. We can be sure that these authors would have been especially aware of their own, local tradition when writing the praises of Seville, Barcelona, Valencia and other cities.

Ancient Encomiastic Writing on Iberia

Classical writings on the Iberian Peninsula comprise a fundamental precedent that must inform our discussion of medieval works. Ancient Greek and Latin writers made frequent references to Hispania, with Strabo and Pomponius Mela being the most accurate sources for descriptive information.¹ Full panegyrics are not recorded, but encomiastic passages are common. Justin claims that the Peninsula's climate was neither hot like Africa's nor cold like France's, and sweetened by a continual sea breeze. This perception, as well as others describing a uniform fertility over the Peninsula, were common, and derived from limited experiences of the ancients along the temperate Mediterranean coasts of Iberia. Vegetation and cultivated foods were uniformly noted for their variety and abundance, especially in Pliny's Naturalis historia (e.g. in XIX, 35 and 152) who registers the presence of artichokes, truffles, acorns (for the consumption of both humans and

¹ This and other information on ancient encomia of Iberia is taken from Adolph Schulten's very thorough treatise Hispania (Geografía, Etnología, Historia) trans. Pedro Bosch Gimpera and Miguel Artigas Ferrando (Barcelona: Académica, 1920), pages 50-77. An excellent and more recent complement is La península ibérica en los autores griegos: de Homero a Platón, ed., trans. and comments Elvira Gangutia Elícegui (Madrid: Fundación de Estudios Romanos, 1998).

pigs), olives and oil, grapes and wines, palms and pistachios. Polybius noted the Lusitanian figs. Mela proposed extraordinary harvests of Lusitanian wheat. Linen and sparta grass were also prized. Animals of all sorts were listed - the rabbit was associated with Iberia, such was its abundance² - and the Lusitanian horses in particular were praised for their speed, and said to conceive through the intervention of the southerly wind alone. Fish were cited, as was a major marine export, the Roman garum paste. Mines and metals (especially silver), however, were probably the most consistent source of praise for Iberia. These had been known since earliest times and were a major motivation for the Roman conquest of the Peninsula. The clay of Bética was noted, as well, by Pliny and Vitruvius.³

A number of brief Biblical and Deutero-canonical references to Hispania also testify to an ancient recognition of the natural wealth of the land; these include the notice of "the silver and gold mines there" in 1 Maccabees 8.3.

² Schulten (8) also notes that Hispania was represented as a seated matron on a coin of the reign of the Spanish emperor Hadrian.

³ Respectively, Naturalis historia XXXV, 160-61 and De architectura II, 3.

Several of the ancient authors who hailed from Hispania left small but noteworthy literary passages. A melancholic poem attributed to Seneca, but very possibly apocryphal, suggests a proud, pre-Roman city defeated by Caesar.⁴ In it a number of elements common to the lamentatio vein are present: the city is characterized as a woman; walls, gates and topography - here, the ocean - are mentioned, and an enemy siege is said to lay the city to ruin. Seneca would later be remembered as a native by medieval Iberian historians intent on polishing the reputation of the Peninsula. He was sometimes considered Christian, or nearly so, due to the content of his philosophy, and to an early legend associating him with his contemporary Paul of Tarsus.⁵

Martial's epigrams occasionally refer to Hispania in laudatory tones, as in the casual reference of Epig. VII, 88: "hoc ego maluerim...quam meus Hispano si me Tagus impleat auro." In I, 49 Martial describes the locale of his

⁴ The poem is published in Poetae Latini Minores, ed. P. Burmanno (Leiden: C. Wishoff and D. Goedval, 1731) and attributed therein to Seneca. No other modern source refers to this poem, and appropriate reservations must be had as to its attribution.

⁵ For more on this topic see Karl Alfred Blüher Seneca en España, trans. Juan Conde (Madrid: Gredos, 1983). Ottavio Di Camillo (El humanismo castellano del siglo XV 152) also discusses this issue, noting that Alonso de Cartagena cast doubt upon the link between Seneca and Paul because of their divergent intellectual tendencies.

birthplace, Bilbilis (presentday Calatayud), not only as "equis et armis nobilem," but also as a rural refuge from the annoyances of the patrician class in Rome: "lunata nusquam pellis et nusquam toga / olidaeque vestes murice." In another epigram four Iberian placenames are linked favorably to their famous offspring: "duosque Senecas unicumque Lucanum / facunda loquitur Corduba, / gaudent iocosae Canio suo Gades, / Emerita Deciano meo: / te, Liciniane, gloriabitur nostra / nec me tacebit Bilbilis" (I, 61).⁶ Cordoba is praised in XII, 63 for its olive oil.

Lucan, whose Andalucian origin is attested to in an epitaph appearing in some medieval manuscripts of the Pharsalia or Belli civilis libri X ("Corduba me genuit, rapuit Nero, proelia dixi, / Que gessere pares hinc socer, inde gener"), only mentions Hispania three times in his poem, without any reference to Cordoba.

The Gaul Pacatus Drepanius delivered a panegyric oration to the Hispanic emperor Theodosius in 389. In it he respects the Ciceronian tradition of praising the subject's native land, in this case Hispania. Pacatus follows convention by describing first the geographical position and healthful, moderate climate. To this he adds the topoi

⁶ Martial, Epigrams, ed., trans. D. R. Shackleton Bailey (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1993).

of wondrous cities, gold-laden rivers, fertile fields and rich mines. The author explicitly recognizes that exaggeration is a commonplace among poets, but insists that all famous lands truly must yield to Spain. The poetic quality of Pacatus's own panegyric later became one of the sources for Isidore's influential De laude Spanie, along with Pliny, Claudian, and other writers from the classical period and from Late Antiquity.⁷

The poet Prudentius (ca. 348-405), thought to have been born in or near Zaragoza and to have lived there most of his life, left a set of fourteen Latin poems honoring Christian martyrs of the Roman lands, including Hispania. This work, the Peristephanon, includes brief and favorable mention of the cities associated with Spanish victims of Roman persecution, such as Merida, where Eulalia was buried: "nunc locus Emerita est tumulo. / clara colonia Vettoniae, / quam memorabilis amnis Ana / praeterit et viridante rapax / gurgite moenia pulchra lavit."⁸ As in

⁷ Pacatus, Panegyric to the Emperor Theodosius, trans., intro. C. E. V. Nixon (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1986) 20-21. For more on the transmission of the writings of Pacatus and others to Isidore, see Las historias de los godos, vándalos y suevos de Isidoro de Sevilla, ed., trans., study Cristóbal Rodríguez Alonso (Leon: Centro de Estudios e Investigación "San Isidro," 1975) 113-19.

⁸ "Crowns of Martyrdom," Prudentius, trans. H. J. Thomson, vol. 2 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press) 1995) III.

another poem featuring the eighteen martyrs of Zaragoza, it is the city that is honored with the presence of the saints, rather than the reverse. Written as they were by a native resident of the Peninsula, these early poems suggest a new importance of Christianity for the cities of Hispania in Late Antiquity.

Late-Classical Firsts: Praise of Nation and City

Two texts from the Visigothic era deserve special note. One stands as the first significant laus Hispaniae, due to its extension and polish, and the other is the first laus urbis for an Hispanic city.⁹ Together they attest to the vigor of the rhetorical tradition with respect to praise of place, and to a perceived importance of Hispania at the time of their writing. Their very existence also points to an incipient sense of Hispanic community that would later become patent in the work of native historians.

The first laus Hispaniae was written in approximately the year 410 by the Gaul Claudian as part of his panegyric to Serena, daughter of Honorius and then adoptive daughter

⁹ The poem to Cordoba uncertainly attributed to Seneca is here being discounted as a precedent, given the doubt regarding its authenticity. In addition, the panegyric to Hispania by Pacatus in 389 is not to be diminished here, rather we are recognizing Claudian's work as a rhetorical advance.

of the emperor Theodosius.¹⁰ As mentioned above in the case of Pacatus, rhetorical dictates demanded that the praise of a person be constructed with several elements, including the praise of the subject's patria; accordingly, this poem is divided into a number of sections covering a range of Serena's attributes and life-phases: chastity, ancestors, Iberian homeland, auspicious signs upon her birth, childhood, adolescence in Rome, modesty and high marriage to Stilicho, and loyalty during her husband's absence in war. The section on Spain opens with the rhetorical, second-person question employing the "inexpressibility" topos, "Quid dignum memorare tuis, Hispania, terris / vox humana valet?..." Next, the land is located geographically as one of the two extreme points of the known world, i.e. the light of day is born in far India and dies in the western waters of Spain.¹¹ Claudian then indulges in a three-part description of well-known natural resources from Spain, "dives equis, frugum facilis, pretiosa metallis," quickly leaving them behind to focus on a fourth and rarer

¹⁰ See Poem XXX in Claudian (trans. Maurice Platnauer, Cambridge, MA, 1963), vol. 2, 238-57. The laus Hispaniae covers verses 50-82.

¹¹ This literary convention, much employed by classical and medieval authors to refer to the location of Hispania, is called the "India topos" by E. R. Curtius, European Literature and the Middle Ages, trans. Willard Trask (NY: Harper & Row, 1953) 160-61.

endowment, "principibus fecunda piis." While Egypt and Africa feed the empire, while Gaul sends recruits and Illyria horsemen, only Spain produces emperors: "fruges, aeraria, miles undique conveniunt totoque ex orbe leguntur: haec generat qui cuncta regant." Excellent women are another national resource, according to the poet, who then tells of the special signs heralding the birth of Serena. These several verses comprise a veritable tour of the upper portion of the Iberian Peninsula in which additional natural resources are brought to life via personification, and the beauty of the lands is tied to an original, Edenic landscape peopled with the Nymphs and Nereids of Greek mythology:

Te nascente ferunt per pingua culta tumentem
divitiis undasse Tagum; Callaecia risit
floribus et roseis formosus Duria ripis
vellere purpureo passim mutavit ovile.
Cantaber Oceanus vicino litore gemmas
expuit; effossis nec pallidus Astur oberrat
montibus: oblatum sacris natalibus aurum
vulgo vena vomit, Pyrenaeisque sub antris
ignea flumineae legere ceraunia Nymphae;
quaeque relabentes undas aestumque secutae
in refluos venere palam Nereides amnes
confessae plausu dominam cecinere futuris
auspiciis thalamis... (70-82)

The panegyric then moves on to other aspects of the life of Serena. This work's importance to the present survey is that it may be seen as the first major text to praise Iberia as a unit, rigorously employing the structure and

devices demanded by traditional rhetoric. It would constitute one of several classical voices that would contribute to later medieval praise for Spain, channeled first into Isidore's De laude Spanie along with the work of Pacatus.

The earliest surviving document to praise an Iberian city with any modest extension appears to be the "De laude Pampilone epistola."¹² This laus appears in the Códice de Roda, appended to an early fifth-century (407-409) letter encouraging Pamplonan troops in their defense of Pyrennean passes against the onslaught of Frankish and Germanic forces. Its modern editor, José María Lacarra, considers the laus to be a Visigothic text, given the similarity between its etymologies for Pamplona and those offered for cities by Isidore.¹³ We might add to this reason another, namely, that there is no reference to any Islamic invaders. The phrase barbaras gentes therefore refers more probably to the Basques than to the eighth-century Moors. This interpretation is in fact suggested within the text by the nearby phrase resistat baceis ("resist the Basques").

¹² José María Lacarra, ed., "De laude pampilonensium," Estudios de Edad Media de la Corona de Aragón, 1 (1945): 266-70.

¹³ Lacarra 268.

Although the praise of Pamplona has survived in a much-corrupted Latin, frequently opaque, we can still link it firmly with the early medieval, Christian laus urbis tradition.¹⁴ Regarding the founding of the city, the author states that "Hic locus prouidus factus a Deo." The exposition of the Christian character of the city and the protection afforded by its martyrs is evident in the following passage:

Quam Dominus pro sua misericordia innumera uilium
martirum reliquiarum condidit artem. Quorum
orationibus inter inimicas et barbaras gentes
custoditur inlesam, ex quibus uigiles per multos
martyrum titulos refulget lumen angelicum et
antiquitus sicut per alegoriam dicitur. Si
homines silebant ad uigilia martirum lapides
proclamabant ad uigiles exitandas.¹⁵ His locus
semper uictor et pompa uirtutum. (269-270)

A Christian note is heard at the end, as well, when the poem closes with "Dominus in circuitu populi sui ex hoc nunc et usque in seculum. Amen."

Despite the author's clear association of Pamplona with the Christian tradition, he indulges in a comparison of the city with the riches of Rome: "Quamuis oppulenta Roma prestita sit romanis, Pampilona non destitit prestare suis." Pamplona's ties with classical culture are also

¹⁴ Lacarra suggests authorship by a monk, with subsequent corruptions by copyists.

¹⁵ Lacarra notes three Biblical references, including this one from Luke 19.40.

implied in the spurious etymology "Greco eloquio,
Pampilona, latine porta omnium dicitur."

The physical aspect of Pamplona is described in
several succinct passages. Its walls and towers receive
special attention:

Quuius mororum tures in latitudine LXIII pedum
sita. In altum LXXXIIII pedum surgit immensis.
Circuitu urbis mille ambitus dextris. Turrium
situ numero LXVII.

More details - unfortunately unclear - refer to city gates,
plazas and general layout. The flowers, trees, and winding
river of the surrounding countryside are mentioned, and
followed later by an obscure praise of the local lands:

"Nam cum mirauilis magnaue regio fructifera aliorum
regionum hic rastris effosa terra quas ab amna reducunt.'

While the Pamplona laus lacks organization and has
come down to us in somewhat artless prose, at best, it is
nevertheless identifiable with the very polished, eighth-
century praises that would soon be written for Milan and
Verona. These also celebrated primarily the Christian
character of the city, paid brief homage to a classical
past, and mentioned in quick order the physical aspect of
the city's walls and towers. It is not inconceivable that
the cleric who probably authored the praise of Pamplona had

access to a monastic library containing classical precedents of the laus urbis genre.

The Early Medieval Tradition of Praise and Lamentation of Place

One of the earliest and most influential medieval historians, Paulus Orosius (d. 470), was a Galician. The purpose of his major work, Historiarum adversus paganos (417), was fundamentally linked to the concept of the city. Prompted by Augustine, Orosius took up the vast project in order to show that the decay of Rome was not caused by its Christianization. Instead, he cites other fallen, imperial cities to note their internal weaknesses, among them pride and the ineluctable ebb and flow of fortune.¹⁶ The story of Babylon begins with its praise, including its founding by the giant, Nebrot, and its physical setting and structures:

This city was conspicuous on all sides by level plains; the nature of its site was most delightful, and it was arranged like a camp with equal walls in the form of a square. The strength and size of its walls are scarcely believable in the relating, that is, fifty cubits wide and four times as high... The wall was made of burnt brick with bitumen pressed in between, and a wide

¹⁶ Orosius presented the history of empire (inherited from Jerome) as the succession of four powers, each related to a cardinal point: Babylon (East), Macedon (North), Carthage (South) and Rome (West).

waterway surrounded it in place of a river. In front of the walls were a hundred bronze gates... The houses within, of eight stories, were remarkable for their menacing height. (II, 6)¹⁷

Orosius then notes that Babylon was "now, almost with no delay, conquered, captured, and overthrown." Citing a kind of "law of inheritance" he concludes that "whatever is made by the hand and work of man collapses and is consumed by the passage of time, as the capture of Babylon confirms." This outlook was adopted by later eulogists of cities, as we have seen in the poems on Aquileia, Lindisfarne, and Rome itself.

J. A. Maravall and Cristóbal Rodríguez Alonso identify a few passages in Orosius's history that betray a sense of sympathetic identity with his fellow Iberians.¹⁸ Regarding Roman cruelties Orosius remarks "edat Hispania sententiam suam!" and "quid tunc de suis temporibus sentiebat?" (V, 1, 6; cited in Maravall). Both historians consider this attitude as an early manifestation of a pan-Iberian, Gothic

¹⁷ Paulus Orosius, The Seven Books of History against the Pagans, trans. Roy J. Deferrari (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America, 1964).

¹⁸ For Maravall, see the section "Los orígenes medievales del sentimiento de comunidad hispánica" in El concepto de España en la Edad Media (Madrid: Centro de Estudios Constitucionales, 1981) 17 ff. For Rodríguez Alonso, see "Las historias de Isidoro de Sevilla en el marco de la historiografía altomedieval. Su carácter de historia nacional," in Las historias de los godos 11-20.

sense of community, but one much overshadowed by Orosius's affinity with romanitas.¹⁹ Nonetheless, in the histories of Orosius and his successors, Hydatius (Bishop of Galicia) and John of Biclaro (Bishop of Gerona), a steady progression can be seen toward the embracing of a Christian Germanic nation in Iberia, at the expense of the prior allegiance to the Roman Empire. This tendency would be capped with Isidore's Historia de regibus Gothorum, Vandalorum et Suevorum (ca. 620), the preface to which, De laude Spanie, might be thought of as a kind of literary baptism of the new nation. It would be much imitated and interpreted by later medieval authors - especially in the thirteenth century - who strove to promote the dignity of Hispania as a community that transcended the frontiers of its various internal kingdoms.

In fact, De laude Spanie was nothing less than the first literary expression to be written by a native of Hispania in praise of his patria. Composed in highly poetic prose, it was the first substantial encomium of place by an Iberian author, and incalculably more influential than the

¹⁹ According to Rodríguez Alonso, "La teología política de Orosio no se aviene con una concepción particularista y nacional de la historia" (15).

well-crafted poem by Claudian reviewed earlier.²⁰ Just as the historical work it prefaced was based mostly upon earlier works by Eusebius, Jerome, Orosius, Hydatius, Victor of Tununa, Prosper, and Juan de Biclaro, so the laus itself was also drawn from classical sources, but given a thorough reworking so that there is almost no verbatim textual correspondence. The sources employed by Isidore include Vergil's Georgics (II, 136 ff.; see Chapter Two), as well as elements from Pliny, Strabo, Justin, Solinus, Silius Italicus, Cyprian, Claudian, and other classical Latin and Greek authors.²¹

De laude Spanie begins with a sweeping declaration addressed in the second person to Spain herself: "Omnium terrarum, quaequae sunt ab occiduo usque ad Indos,

²⁰ Claudian, we remember, was a Gaul, and his praise of Hispania was not only couched incidentally within a larger work, but would have enjoyed much less circulation within Iberia than any work of Isidore.

²¹ Most of these sources are cited in P. Madoz, "De laude Spanie. Estudio sobre las fuentes del prólogo isidoriano," Razón y Fe 116 (March 1939): 247 ff.

Stephen Reckert describes Isidore's preface as "a direct graft of Pliny's double panegyric on to the rootstock of Vergil's praise of Italy" (The Matter of Britain and the Praise of Spain (The History of a Panegyric) (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 1967) 22). Reckert also notes an intriguing precedent for the praise and blame of country in that of Gildas for Britain (De excidio Britanniae, sixth century).

Rodríguez Alonso provides a close analysis of Isidore's sources, showing likely correspondences, and indicates the good

pulcherrima es, o sacra semperque felix principum
gentiumque mater Spania...iure tu nunc omnium regina
prouinciarum, a qua non occasus tantum, sed etiam oriens
lumina mutuatur." This reiteration of the topos linking
Spain with India is modified and polished with respect to
the version seen earlier in Claudian. Here, Spain no longer
receives the light beginning in the distant East, but is
the very source of that light. This opening section focuses
Spain as a beautiful fixture for the world ("tu decus atque
ornamentum orbis").

Next, the land's native resources are enumerated in
several series of nominative-ablative pairs, such as
"florulenta campis, montibus frondua, piscosa litoribus."
Other elements listed include grapes, grain, olives, wine,
animals, minerals and streams.²² A correspondence is
immediately evident between Isidore's "metalla pretiosum"
and Claudian's earlier phrase "pretiosa metallis";
Rodríguez Alonso (117-118) adds several other points of

probability that Isidore knew Virgil, and the certainty of his
familiarity with Pliny and other authors listed here.

²² Isidore also describes the physical resources of Spain,
notably the gold-bearing sands, in his Etymologiae, IX, 4; XV, 1;
and XIV, 4. His appreciation of the natural wealth of the land is
also glimpsed in a brief poem in which he refers to "unguenta
varia" and "sacri Hesperidum montes." See Isidori Hispalensis
versus, ed. José María Sánchez Martín (Turnhout: Brepols, 2000),
poems XIX and XXIII.

textual convergence. The climate of Isidore's Hispania is neither cold nor hot, but ideally temperate. Six classical references follow in quick succession - Alpheus, Clitumnus, Etruria, Elea, Molorchus and Tyre - representing five exemplary qualities that are nonetheless surpassed by Spain's natural richness. These associated qualities are, respectively, horses, cattle, pastures, woods, and purple dyestuff. This topos (called "outdoing" by Curtius) again demonstrates Isidore's familiarity with the panegyrical genre.

As is evident, Isidore portrays Spain as a woman throughout this preface, employing terms such as mater, regina, ornamentum, florulenta, etc., as well as parturis with respect to the products of the land. This allegory of a feminine nation is maintained even to the end of the passage, when Isidore recalls that Rome once desired Spain, wedded her, but was replaced by the Goths' nation - "te...rapit et amavit." As we have seen earlier, cities and nations were frequently portrayed as women who were destined for union with a male figure (Christ, another nation, etc.); Isidore's depiction of Spain as a female figure falls into this tradition. Particular sources for this literary image have been identified in the panegyric

of Pacatus to Theodosius and in a work by Cyprian of Carthage on the merits of virgins.²³

As we have suggested, Isidore's tribute to Spain was certainly grounded in a knowledge of the praise of place, both as it had been practiced and as prescribed. Regarding the latter - prescriptions - it is fitting to recall that the first theoretical framework for city praise, by Quintilian, accounts also for praise of country, and that Isidore's deep appreciation of classical authors almost certainly included this one. We find the same city-country reference in Menander, who elaborated upon it to show that both are praised for two elements - their geographical "position" and the "nature" of their resources. Moreover, cities may be amplified through a third element, their human accomplishments. Isidore covers Spain's position and especially dwells on its resources. His coverage of human accomplishments is more limited: Spain is rich in sons and fertile in leaders. In addition, the distinction between *laus urbis* and *laus patriae* was often blurred in many of the encomia of Rome, in which city and empire contributed to a glory common to each. Isidore's prologue further reflects the theoretical writing of Quintilian and Menander

²³ See P. Madoz, "Ecos del saber antiguo en las letras de la España visigoda," *Razón y Fe* 122 (1941): 228 ff.

in the sense that it continually invokes the parameters of "pleasure/beauty" and "utility" as specified by both authors (Inst. Orat. 3.7.26; I, 345.5).

The final phrase of Isidore's laus Hispaniae refers to the wealth of his Gothic Christian nation as "opes largas imperii felicitate securas," but these words would become outdated within less than a century. The loss of Gothic Spain to the invading Muslims in 711 was a singular event that would give rise to an appropriately different form of literary and historic homage to Hispania, the lamentatio or planctus.

The first such text to grieve the loss of the Gothic and Christian nation was written shortly after the invasion. The Crónica Mozárabe de 754 narrates the events of the conquest, juxtaposing wherever possible the prior felicity of the Goths and the actions of their enemies. According to this version, Toledo - referred to as "urbem regiam" (chap. 54)²⁴ - suffered the initial attacks, and the devastation continued

usque ultra Cesaragustam [Zaragoza] antiquissimam
ac florentissimam ciuitatem dudum iam iudicio Dei

²⁴ Chapters cited here refer to Crónica mozárabe de 754, ed. José Eduardo López Pereira (Zaragoza: Anubar, 1980). Sevilla had been the center of Peninsular government, ecclesiastic and secular, until 653. For more on this topic see Peter Linehan's History and the Historians of Medieval Spain (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993) 54.

patenter apertam gladio fame et captiuitate
depopulat, ciuitates decoras igne concremando
precipat, seniores et potentes seculi cruci
adiudicat, iubenes atque lactantes pugionibus
trucidat. (chap. 54)

Cordoba likewise receives both praise and pity: "Adque in
eandem infelicem Spaniam Cordoba in sede dudum Patricia,
que semper extitit preceteras adiacentes ciuitates
opulentissima et regno Uisigothorum primitibas inferebat
delicias, regnum efferum conlocant" (chap. 54). The
author's rhetorical technique in these brief passages is
clear; both Zaragoza and Cordoba are exalted with
superlative adjectives that heighten the tragedy and
humiliation of the atrocities he then describes.²⁵

But relatively few details are provided on the cities
themselves. Chapter 55 of this chronicle contains its major
lamentation, and it is not for the loss of individual
communities but for that of the entire Peninsula. The
hyperbolic language and use of certain topoi seem to
warrant its full quotation here:

Quis enim narrare queat tanta pericula? Quis
dinumerare tam inportuna naufragia? Nam si omnia
menbra uerterentur in linguam, omnino nequaquam

²⁵ Isidore also exalted Zaragoza in very eloquent words:
"Caesaraugusta Terraconensis Hispaniae oppidum a Caesare
praestantius civitatibus Hispaniae cunctis atque inlustrius,
florens sanctorum martyrum sepulturis" (Etymologiarum sive
originum libri XX, ed. W. M. Lindsay, vol. 2 (Oxford: Clarendon,
1966) XV, 66). This passage shows the same concern for a saintly
city that we saw in Prudentius's version of Zaragoza.

Spanie ruinas uel eius toth tantaque mala dicere
 poterit humana natura. Sed ut in brebi cuncta
 legenti remotem pagella, relictis seculi
 innumerabilibus ab Adam usque nunc cladibus, quas
 per infinitis regionibus et ciuitatibus crudelis
 intulit mundus iste immundus, quidquid
 historialiter capta Troia pertulit, quidquit
 Iherosolima predicta per prophetarum eloquia
 baiulabit, quidquid Babilonia per scripturarum
 eloquia substulit, quidquid postremo Roma
 apostolorum nouilitate decorata martirialiter
 confecit, omnia et toth ut Spania condem
 deliciosa et nunc misera effecta tam in honore
 quam etiam in dedecore experibit.

This passage opens with two questions calculated to elicit the pathos of the invasion. The following statement regarding the inexpressibility of the disaster is an ancient topos, as is the allusion to the fallen cities of Troy, Jerusalem and Babylon. Reference to Rome's Christian martyrs creates an implicit link between that city and Hispania, where Christians suffered under the Moslem invaders. This passage, and the earlier ones on Zaragoza and Cordoba, emphasize the destruction wrought upon the civitas or community, rather than the physical urbs. As such it is in keeping with other laments for fallen places, written both in ancient and medieval periods.

The notion of "place" for this author deserves brief comment. He focuses at first on individual cities - Toledo, Zaragoza and Cordoba - and then more passionately on the whole of the Peninsula, "Spanie." That "Spanie" - obviously

much larger than any single city - is nonetheless likened to Troy, Babylon, Jerusalem and Rome, all of which are cities. The difference between city and nation was, in all likelihood, inconsequential for the author, since loss of community was his basic concern, one that could be experienced by city and nation alike. In addition, he surely thought of Troy and the other three cities as the larger entities - city-states - that they were.

Nonetheless, he is careful to defuse this potential dissonance by using the phrase "regionibus et ciuitatibus," thereby knitting together these cities with larger regions and, by simple extension, Spanie as a whole. This treatment of the entire Peninsula as a unit is also in keeping with the pan-Iberian approach of Isidore, whose works this author was very likely to have known.

The Five-Century "Gap" in the Laudes

The Crónica mozárabe can be seen as a fairly natural literary eruption, an immediate reaction to the Muslim invasion. With it, and considering also the Isidorean De laude Spanie, we can pinpoint the definitive introduction of both the praise and lament for Hispania at the mid-eight century. Then, an extended pause in such writing -

encomiastic or plaintive - occurs during the following several hundred years, only to return in the distant thirteenth century.

This phenomenon of the gap in elegy-eulogy texts (the phrase is Stephen Reckert's) must be addressed. Remembering the case of Italy, we have seen that local identity was fairly well expressed during this period (roughly 800-1200) for Milan, Naples, Modena and other Italian cities, typically via saints' lives or bishops' biographies. Frequently these texts carried details of local history, and, following rhetorical precepts, included praise of place as part of the praise of a person. We thus face the challenge of explaining this difference between Italy and Spain.

During this "gap period" in Iberia there was not a lack of literary activity. Chronicles and annals, in particular, continued to be written. However, these were frequently concerned with recording the progress of the Reconquest. They were focused less on the praise of place (or even the lament for its loss) than on the chronological affairs of kings and kingdoms (e.g., the Crónica de Alfonso III, ca. 900, and the Crónica de Sampiro, ca. 1020). In this sense, Spanish historiographic texts of these centuries differ in character from those of Italy. Italian

chronicles were more likely to be concerned with a more limited locale, as compared to those written in Hispania, and were not concerned with a larger religious war, as in Spain. Further, the Italian authors of these chronicles and of the biographies of local saints and bishops were more likely to be familiar with the rhetorical precepts suggesting praise of place, given their advantage of relative stability in clerical education and literary activity.

Addressing a more fundamental factor, the writers of the Iberian chronicles were participants in a Latin culture and heirs to its age-old habit of describing Hispania as a distant outpost of the Roman center. As we have seen, the ancient poets, historians and geographers had imposed a fairly static identity upon the Peninsula, only occasionally individuating (and often confusing) regional differences - such as the speedy mares of Lusitania - and normally ignoring altogether the description or praise of particular cities or locales. For Strabo, Pliny, and other writers (including the Spanish native Martial), Hispania was recommended favorably, but remained of lesser importance, and came to be conjured literarily via catch-phrases that denoted goldbearing rivers, mineral wealth, a temperate climate and fertile soil. Hence there existed a

literary momentum for addressing Hispania as a single sub-unit of the Roman community, and medieval Iberian writers would require innovation - or even a certain daring - to direct praise to regions or cities alone. In fact, this new, more local outlook would take centuries to appear. Seen in this sense, Isidore's laus Hispaniae and the lamentatio Hispaniae of the Crónica mozárabe can be seen as key steps taken away from the earlier, Roman-centered view of Spain, and toward the more particularized appreciation of individual Iberian cities that would only begin to appear in future centuries. In other words, these two texts are nothing less than the earliest literary flashes reflecting a new national or regional identity.

Still other factors can be found for the lack of early medieval Iberian city praise. Iberian cities were in many cases founded several centuries later than their Italian counterparts, and thereby possessed less communal history. Many Iberian cities were smaller and poorer than those in Italy, with less material wealth to boast of. They normally had less noteworthy civic infrastructure, such as high-quality walls, towers, and public and private buildings. In addition, local identities that accumulated in Iberia during Roman times were twice interrupted and redirected, first by the Visigothic invasion and then by that of the

religiously distinct North Africans. The latter invasion then gave rise to the Christian Reconquest, a movement of war, displacement, and resettlement. These were conditions not conducive to the celebration of a local place, but rather to expressions of solidarity with the wider, national enterprise of extending Christian-dominated territory. In light of these particular circumstances it seems logical that authors of this period focused on the national, religious enterprise, rather than on local places. Only in the thirteenth century would these more local texts begin to appear, side by side with the continuation of the laus and lamentatio for the Peninsula, as modeled much earlier by Isidore and the Crónica mozárabe.

Twelfth-Century Writings

The twelfth century witnessed a widening of subject matter in historiographic writing. In addition to kings, now both bishops and warriors were fit material, as exemplified in the Historia compostelana and the Historia Roderici. Despite this widening of subject matter, the role of place in these newer texts was still minimal. It does seem worth noting that in the former text, dedicated to

Santiago's first archbishop Diego Gelmírez, special attention is paid to the building initiatives undertaken by him. This might be seen as evidence of some local pride in the church's physical community.

Another twelfth-century text, the pilgrim's guidebook known as Liber Sancti Jacobi, reflected the internationalization of the northern band of the Peninsula that came with the pilgrimages to Santiago de Compostela. Like the contemporary guidebooks to Rome and Jerusalem, the Liber is especially concerned with place; and like those books, it infrequently produces extensive encomium within a larger rhetorical structure. The Liber first relates the broad pilgrim's itinerary on a town-by-town basis, providing occasional, laudatory details such as "...inde Stella, que pane bono et obtimo vine et piscibus fertilis est, cuntisque felicitatibus plena" (14).²⁶ Following this introductory matter is a chapter titled "De fluminibus bonis et malis...", mostly a warning against many rivers along the route whose waters allegedly cause death to man or beast. The chapter "De nominibus terrarum..." is a lengthy description of topography, natural resources, and local peoples, inspired in part through firsthand

²⁶ The Pilgrim's Guide: A Critical Edition, ed., notes Jeanne Krochalis and Alison Stones, trans. Paula Gerson et al. (London: Harvey Miller, 1998).

experience, in part through history, and in part from the exaggerations of legend and prejudice. It is a vibrant account calculated to inform and entertain. Chapter IX of the Liber, "De qualitate vrbis...", begins with a paragraph situating the city of Santiago topographically between the Sar and Sarela rivers, then names the seven city gates. An ecclesiastical register follows, listing the ten churches of the city. Finally, the chapter closes with an extraordinarily detailed archeological description of the principal church, the basilica of Saint James. Only occasionally laudatory, this chapter, like the book itself, is primarily concerned with description of the sites relevant to pilgrims. Its composition is driven more by the demands of utility rather than by rhetoric.

Foreign Praise of Lisbon: Osberne's De expugnatione
Lyxbonensi

The occasion of the Christian reconquest of Lisbon in 1147 resulted in an eyewitness account of the event, a text which contained a laus urbis of more than passing length. The British monk Osberne was present as one of the many Northern components of a planned crusade to the Holy Land, temporarily diverted to assist with the retaking of the

Portuguese city. His Latin report of the entire episode is noteworthy for its detail on both military and diplomatic aspects of the siege. Osberne's praise of Lisbon is likewise highly descriptive . Although this laus was written by a non-Iberian, it is nonetheless important as the first mature example of the genre for an Iberian city. It is a text that may be seen as a kind of prelude to - or inauguration of - the many laudatory writings of the thirteenth-century.

The De expugnatione Lyxbonensi consists of some six-hundred words arranged according to an evident plan.²⁷ From the Tagus River outside the city we are told of the gold along the banks and of the countless fish within the waters. The outlying lands of Almada and Palmela are noted for their fertility, providing numberless figs, vines and pomegranates. Good hunting and honey are available. Attention is then turned to the city, founded, the author is told, by Ulysses. Osberne describes its hilly physical situation, its hot baths and its opulence. A look is cast west to Sintra, where curative springs are located and where the mares conceive via the fertile west wind. Entering the city proper, the population is estimated at

²⁷ De Expugnatione Lyxbonensi. The Conquest of Lisbon, ed., trans. Charles Wendell David (New York: Columbia University Press, 1936) 90-97.

sixty thousand families; the walls are praised; the quarters of the aristocrats and merchants are briefly described; and the overpopulation is noted and coupled with an overall degeneracy attributed to the city's anarchic Moorish population. The encomium ends as Osberne proceeds with the narrative of the conquest of Lisbon. His plan parallels that of other city encomia, beginning as it does outside the city, registering its location and geographical situation, then proceeding to the city center, praising all the while. The author also reveals very intimate knowledge of classical sources for Lisbon, especially Solinus, and does not spare the use of time-honored topoi for the exaggeration of the virtues of a place (e.g. the mares of Lusitania). Osberne is also in keeping with the Christian tone of the medieval laudes urbium, closing his tour of Lisbon with a remark about the enduring legacy of three early martyrs, Verissimus, Maxima and Julia the Virgin.

Thirteenth-Century Historiography Honoring Hispania and its Cities

The flourishing literature of the thirteenth century included a variety of texts written in praise of Hispania

or of individual cities. These will be considered here in two distinct genres, historiography and poetry.

Two key developments take place with respect to history writing during the thirteenth century. First, Latin historiography matures with the appearance of two major texts, the Chronicon mundi (finished in 1236) of Lucas de Tuy, and, of special importance, the De rebus Hispaniae (ca. 1245) of Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada. Second, through the efforts of the compilers of the Alfonsine histories - here we are especially concerned with the material relevant to Iberia, the Primera crónica general (ca. 1270) - the achievement of the Latin historians is brought into the vernacular, fused with a great variety of additional sources (Biblical books, ballads, Eastern accounts), and thus projected to future centuries with considerable impact.

Each of the three texts mentioned above revives the laus and lamentatio themes that were first fully sounded by Isidore's De laude Spanie and the Crónica mozárabe, and which had lain dormant during nearly five centuries.²⁸ In

²⁸ Not all thirteenth-century chronicles participated in this chain of transmission. For example, the Crónica latina de los reyes de Castilla (ca. 1240) contains very evenhanded, non-panegyric treatment of Iberian and European events. It only approximates the encomiastic mode of discourse for a city in the following, very brief passage describing the riches of Constantinople: "...obtinuerunt civitatem et spolia eius infinita

addition, a fourth text will be considered. Juan Gil de Zamora's De preconiis Hispanie (1278-82) is not strictly historical in nature, but more clearly propagandistic or laudatory. In it we find the generalized praise of not only Hispania, as indicated by the work's title, but also of Gil's native city of Zamora, disguised as Numancia. In discussing the PCG we will also note an important instance of city praise in two chapters.

Lucas de Tuy's Chronicon mundi begins with a preface in which he addresses himself to "los generosos príncipes," advising them to learn from his book in order that they might be more cognizant of the nobility of their position, and of the need to govern in an egalitarian fashion (3).²⁹ To this end the Tudense proceeds immediately to an exaltation of the lands entrusted to those unnamed princes, i.e. Hispania. This laus unfolds more or less systematically, covering several aspects of the country.

diripuerunt: aurum, argentum, lapides preciosos, pannos sericos, diversi generis ornamenta, quibus plus omnibus supra omnes civitates, que in mundo erant, Constantinopolis habundabat" (ed. Luis Charlo Brea (Madrid: Akal, 1999) 46). Many other chronicles of the time, such as the Crónica de la población de Ávila (ca. 1250), lacked rhetorical vision and adhered more closely to the factual narratives of the annals tradition.

²⁹ Quotations here are taken from the medieval Castillian translation of the Latin original, edited by Julio Puyol as Crónica de España (Madrid: Revista de Archivos, Bibliotecas y Museos, 1926).

Its first section, denoted by the author as "temporales bienes," asserts the privileged position of the land and reveals the Tudense's providentialist notion of history:

Esa tierra de los españoles, abundante de propios bienes, tambien merescio ser señalada del Señor por ventaja de muchos preuilegios entre las buenas prouinçias del mundo. Es abondada de salud, de ayre y fartura de la tierra e de animalias y de deleyte de rios y de fuentes y pescados, y de plazenterias de arbores, y conosçer ser abastada muy complidamente poco más o menos de todas las cosas pertenescientes al vso del prouecho y del deleyte de los omes.

Among those "deleytes" are "sirgo, plata y oro muy puro," as well as "aues monteses y caseras, y de cauallos muy fermosos y muy valientes y muy aquexosos por marauillosa ligereza" (4). The debt to Isidore is seen clearly in the basic elements listed - the fertility of the land, animals, birds, rivers, fish, trees, wax, precious metals, horses, and overabundance of all good things.

The next section catalogues three kinds of human resources. The first ("celestiales dones") includes the well-known saints and bishops - Lawrence, Leandro, Domingo, Isidore, Santiago, and many others, including several exemplary female saints, all of whom are said to bring honor to Spain. The second group are the wise men:

Allende desto, resplandesce (en) España por antiguedad de philosophos, porque engendro a

Aristoteles,³⁰ vsado en philosophia y noble pesquiridor de las estrellas, y el muy razonado Seneca, y Luchano, en hestoria e poeta muy claro, entre los quales [es] Ysidoro más claro y glorioso que ninguno... (6-7)

The final category of renowned personalities produced by Spain was that of politicians. The Tudense lists Lucio, Nerva, and Trajan, noting here with a telling concessive clause "aunque por su persecucion persiguieron los christianos." Apparently their quality as illustrious emperors and consul compensated for their actions against the Tudense's Catholic church. The Christian Spanish emperor Theodosius is also praised because he "ennoblescio el pueblo romano con leyes de ygualdad" (7).

In the closing few pages of this preface the author makes ever more patent his debt to Isidore, parsing the name España into a fictitious etymology in which the three syllables mean "sola toda estrella,"³¹ and point significantly to the unique blessings of the nation. Further, he refers to the "muy clara generacion de los

³⁰ The myth of a Spanish-born Aristotle was generalized during the middle-ages in Spain. See Ottavio Di Camillo, El humanismo castellano del siglo XV 118-19. Cited there is an additional reference on this topic: Francisco Rico, "Aristóteles Hispanus: En torno a Gil de Zamora, Petrarca y Juan de Mena," Italia medioevale e umanistica 10 (1967): 143-60.

³¹ Lucas clarifies, somewhat: "is"=solo, "pan"=todo, "ya"=estrella; "porque, más especialmente que todas las otras provincias, [España] es muy abundada de propios bienes..." (8).

godos," following Isidore's definitive establishment of Goth as equivalent to Spaniard. And he explicitly invokes the authority of Isidore's "libros de las coronicas" in closing.

If it is true that the Tudense's praise for Hispania is greatly indebted to Isidore's precedent, it is also worth noting two differences. While he lists the famous men and women of Spain, Isidore simply refers to Spain as "rectoribusque...imperatorum fertilis." He mentions no personalities, thereby adhering more closely to the classical tradition (e.g. the panegyrics of Aristides) in which the praise of a city's luminaries was suppressed in order to more fully honor the populace as a whole. In addition, Bishop Isidore's panegyric to Hispania is peculiarly secular; the nation itself takes on a nearly divine air, but no Christian elements are incorporated. The Tudense's laus Hispaniae reflects a far more Christianized society, incorporating saints and bishops into its assets and reminding his princely readership at every opportunity that God is to be thanked for the privileged position of the nation.³²

³² Stephen Reckert also notes the new Christian element in the laus of the Chronicon mundi (26), calling it an addition to the "arms-and-letter" topos supposedly evident in Isidore's panegyric. In fact, while Isidore does laud the soldiers of Spain, its scholars or writers are not mentioned.

J. A. Maravall has noted that "El t3pico de la lamentaci3n se encuentra de una manera difusa y desordenada todav3a" in the Chronicon mundi of the Tudense. This would not be true for the other historical texts of that century examined here. In them, lamentation would be found intimately linked with the passages praising Spain, producing a fusion that became ultimately a kind of double topos in itself.

The Toledano's De rebus Hispanie begins with the founding of cities, told via the myth of Hercules in Iberia (I, v).³³ This chapter is not truly encomiastic, but reflects the historical tradition of presenting the oldest available information - of any sort - for the establishment of a community's origins. Regarding Seville, we read of remote tribal conflicts there and the arrival of a forceful leader, Hercules, who gives the new community a name, Hispalis. An explanation is given for the name itself, thereby adding substance to the identity of the ancient inhabitants.

Two later chapters of De rebus are especially of interest, as they comprise the successive praise (III, xxi) and lament (III, xxii) of Gothic Spain at the time of the

³³ Rodrigo Jim3nez de Rada, Historia de rebus Hispanie sive historia gothica, ed., study Juan Fern3ndez Valverde (Turnholt: Brepols, 1987).

Islamic conquest. The first of these chapters alludes to the coming lament with a dramatic opening, "Pro dolor! Hic finitur gloria Gothice maiestatis era DCCLII..." The Goths are then lauded as the people who had defeated all others in their long history, even the Romans, but who were nevertheless defeated by the Moslems. From this a warning is sounded to mistrust all that seems good: "...ne diues in diuiciis, ne potens in potentiis, ne fortis in fortitudine, ne sapiis in sapientia, ne sublimis in gloria glorieter." God alone must be served, the same God who favored Hispania out of all other lands in Asia and Europe, causing the Goths to select it as their home. The vast extent of Gothic domains - including Narbonne and North Africa - and its natural gifts causes Jiménez de Rada to call Hispania "quasi paradisus Domini." Its five principal rivers are extolled (others are named later) and there follows a highly poetic foray into the excellences of the land:

Fecunda frugibus, amena fructibus, deliciosa
 piscibus, sapida lacticiniis, clamosa
 uenationibus, gulosa armentis et gregibus,
 superba equis, comoda mulis, priuilegiata
 castris, curiosa uino, deses pane, diues
 metallis, gloriosa sericis, dulcis mellibus,
 copiosa oleo, leta croco, precellens ingenio,
 audax in prelio, agilis exercicio, fidelis
 dominio, facilis studio, pollens eloquio,
 fertilis in omnibus; nulla in fertilitate
 similis, nulla municionibus comparabilis, pauce
 magnitudine equales, in liberalitate precipua,
 fidelitate preciosa, in audacia singularis.

The chapter closes with a doleful reminder that the fall of the Goths in Spain occurred as a result of internal divisions, "patrie gladio in se uerso... Et capte fuerunt omnes Hispanie ciuitates et manibus diripiencium sunt subuerse."

Chapter xxii surveys the condition of the land and of the Goths after the invasion:

...remansit terra populis vacua, sanguine plena, fletu madida, ululatu clamosa, aduenis hospita, civibus peregrina, nudata incolis, orbata filiis, confusa barbaris, infecta sanguine, stupida vulnere, destituta munimine, et suorum solatio desolata.³⁴

Its Biblical tone, echoing especially the plaintive verses of Lamentations, continues with a close paraphrase of Jeremiah 9:1: "Quis dabit capiti meo aquas et fontem oculis lacrimarum...?" Like the Crónica Mozárabe, the Toledano's history invokes fabled, fallen cities - in this case, Babylon, Rome, Jerusalem and Carthage - and concludes that Spain's grief was even greater.³⁵ The chapter concludes with

³⁴ The stylistic example of Isidore's laus Hispaniae likely influenced this lamentatio. Synonymic series used in Isidore are discussed in Cristóbal Rodríguez Alonso, Las historias de los Godos 119.

³⁵ It seems probable that Jiménez de Rada drew from the Crónica Mozárabe for this idea, although medieval writers were in general fully cognizant of the symbolic value of ancient empires. Orosius, we remember, considered four empires linked with the four cardinal points.

blame for the poor example set by Gothic kings for their subjects, who brought civil war and invited the enemy into the Peninsula.

The influence of De rebus Hispanie may be seen most strikingly in the translation made of it in the Alfonsine Primera crónica general. The chapters corresponding to those just seen in the Toledano's work are 558 ("Del loor de Espanna como es complida de todos bienes") and 559 ("Del duello de los godos de Espanna et de la razon porque ella fue destroyda"). The passages below indicate the nearly word-for-word translation made, typical of the Alphonsine historical enterprise in general:

¿Qual mal o qual
tempestad non passo
Espanna? Con los ninnos
chicos de teta dieron a
las paredes, a los moços
mayores desfizieron con
feridas, a los mancebos
grandes metieronlos a
espada, los ancianos et
uieios de dias moriron
en las batallas, et
fueron todos acabados
por Guerra

(Primera crónica
general 559)³⁶

Que Hispaniam non
pretereunt tempestates?
Paruuli alliduntur,
adolescentes cedibus
inuoluuntur, iuuenes
gladiis extinguuntur, uiri
preliis prosternuntur,
senes excidio
consumuntur...³⁷

(De rebus Hispaniae
xxii)

³⁶ Primera crónica general de España, ed. Ramón Menéndez Pidal (Madrid: Gredos, 1955).

³⁷ This passage echoes Isaiah 13.15-16.

A few minor modifications of the Toledano's text do appear. While for Jiménez de Rada it is sufficient to say "diues metallis," the PCG expands upon it in the following way:

...rica de metales, de plomo, de estanno, de argent uiuo, de fierro, de arambre, de plata, de oro, de piedras preciosas, de toda manera de piedra marmol, de sales de mar et de Salinas de tierra et de sal en pennas, et dotros mineros muchos: azul, almagra, greda, alumbre et otros muchos de quantos se fallan en otras tierras.
(558)

The "inexpressibility" topos is also transmitted from the De rebus to the PCG, where it appears as "Ay Espanna! Non a lengua nin engenno que pueda contar tu bien" (558).

The PCG also contains praise of the city. Chapters 1127 ("Capitulo de las noblezas et de los abondamientos de la hueste de Sevilla") and 1128 ("Capitulo de quanto tiempo Ssevilla estudo çercada, et de los apostamientos de las noblezas della") relate respectively the urban qualities of Fernando III's siege encampment outside Seville, and Seville itself. The first consciously aims to convince the reader of the "semeiança de grant çibdat et noble et muy rica," citing specialized streets for the "traperos" and "espeçieros," "carniçeros" and "pescadores." Not only was the encampment provisioned with all it could need as a community, but its apparent permanence (as a result of the

king's vow not to quit it) even brought women and children there as residents, alongside the king's combatants.

The second chapter begins by noting that Fernando surrounded the city for sixteen months, and not without reason, "que es noble çibdat." Its walls are the strongest anywhere, and its Torre de Oro and Torre de Sancta Maria are praised as "sotil" and marvillosa," large and imposing. Crowning the latter are four uncommon "maçanas," the largest of which shines brilliantly in the sun. This ekphrastic praise continues, changing its focus now onto the city as an emporium of merchandise from around the world ("de Taniar, de Çepta, de Tunez, de Bogia, dAlexandria, de Jenua, de Portogal, de Ynglaterra..."), a place rich from its renowned olive oil, and from its "grandes rentas." The writing is rhetoricized, as seen in the overall structure, in the use of topoi (the wealth "seria fuerte cosa de contar a qui por todo pasar quisiese"), and in interrogatives such as "¿Pues commo non puede ser muy buena et muy preciada çibdat tan acabada...?" The final section reminds the reader of the "flor de los acabamientos de todas onrras: la grant lealtad de los buenos vasallos que avie, que rey que en el mundo fuese no los ovo meiores nin tales de su naturaleza..." This pointed conclusion (it continues in the same vein) makes clear the

major point of the chapter: the riches of Seville could not have been won by the king without the efforts and loyalty of the local Christian vassals. Chapter 1128 of the PCG may be seen as a somewhat politicized city encomium, not only a panegyric of the urbs but also an apology of the civitas. The political relationships between Castilian cities and the kingdom were becoming more complex and more intense, a tendency that would be maintained well into the fifteenth century, and this brief chapter offer subtle evidence of that change.

The Tudense, Jiménez de Rada and the PCG were the direct inspirations for the greater part of two intertwined texts by Juan Gil de Zamora (b. 1241). The first of these, De preconiis Hispanie,³⁸ was above all a multifaceted, propagandistic guide to Spanish history, covering the excellences of the land and people of Hispania, after the style of the preface to the Chronicon mundi. Hence it contains chapters on saints, bishops, philosophers, and natural resources. Elsewhere, in treating the episode of the Moslem invasion ("De aliquorum virorum hispanie

³⁸ See Jenaro Costas Rodríguez, ed. and trans., Juan Gil. Alabanzas e historias de Zamora (Zamora: Ayuntamiento de Zamora, 1994). A Castilian translation was found in the library of the Marqués de Santillana and was being transcribed, with apparent difficulty, at the publication date of Costas Rodríguez's edition. See page 15 n. 17.

potentifica...") Juan Gil takes his Latin text verbatim from the most respected source, that of the De rebus Hispanie.

...remansit terra populis uacua, sanguine plena, fletu madida, ululatu clamosa, aduenis hospita, ciuibus peregrina, nudata incolis, orbata filiis, confusa barbaris, infecta sanguine, stupida uulnere, destitute munimine et suorum solatio desolata.

(De rebus Hispanie xxii; De preconiiis Hispanie V)

De preconiiis Hispanie is not simply an encomiastic historical text, but also includes detailed recommendations to princes for the proper governance of their people, for upright personal and professional behavior. As such it may be seen as a hybrid document with scholarly, ethical and didactic aims.

In addition to praise for Hispania, Gil's book focuses on cities, and especially the city of Zamora. Its Chapter VIII opens with a section titled "De locorum Hispanie nominibus immutatis," an excursion through fanciful etymologies and legends covering most of the Iberian Peninsula. It was conceived in contrast to the following section on Zamora, a city whose name was indeed changed during its history, according to the author. The final section of the chapter, "De conditionibus civitatis Zamorensis," covers Zamora's physical aspects, including the following description:

Hec civitas est fundata in rupibus sempiternis. Tria flumina principalia serviunt ei, videlicet: Dorium, Estula et Aratorium. Duplici ponte gaudet... Nullus exercitus potest eidem aquarum abundantiam subtrahere...vallis eximia, vallis campica, vallis regia, vallis aurea, vallis aratoria fecundant eam mirabili ubertate. Distat autem per duas dietas a loco illo ubi lamprede et solia capiuntur. Distat autem a mari versus Portugaliā a Portu, per septem dietas bestie onerate. Distat autem a mari versus Asturias a portu Avilei per quinque vel per sex dietas. Ratione cuius temporibus debitis copiam habet piscium marinarum; pisces fluviales in magna copia, eidem circumadiacentes fluvii subministrant. Fructus habet in mirabili ubertate. Vinum inter spissum et rarum tenet medium, abundans et precipuum et consonum sanitati. (VIII)

If the earlier section of Gil's Chapter VIII narrated the human accomplishments of Zamora (more generally, its origins and subsequent history), this last section attends to the physical location of the city (indicated by exact distances) and its natural surroundings and features (rivers, bridges, waters, fish, fertility of land, and wine). Taken together these two sections may fairly be called a laus urbis, since they fulfill the traditional requirements of the genre.

The second of Juan Gil's texts, De preconiiis civitatis Numantine, is essentially an extraction of the first and larger text just reviewed. The laudatory material on Zamora is practically identical, but the text as a whole was apparently composed with a single purpose in mind that was

not the praise of that city. Rather, Zamora's misfortunes are used in the manner of an exemplum from which lessons for wise governance can be gleaned. Costas Rodríguez indicates that this text was presented by Gil to the Infante don Sancho in the year 1282, a moment of intense power struggles both within the royal family and between the royal family and nobles.³⁹

Our review of thirteenth-century historiography has shown that the laus and lamentatio of nation became a fixture in the most important texts of that period. Additionally, the praise of Zamora and Seville indicate an incipient attention to the encomium of cities. Still, the examples reviewed here from the Tudense, Jiménez de Rada, PCG, and Juan Gil de Zamora are rather short passages that were dependent upon the larger purposes of the texts in which they were inserted. More independence could be seen in the poetry of that century.

³⁹ It appears that Juan Gil did not write much new material for his second text. Instead, he reshuffled various sections from the De preconiiis Hispanie, focusing on Zamora and the lessons it could offer to princes. As example of this textual process we can note that chapter VII of the Numancia text was copied from chapter IX of the author's first text, "De apologiis principum et magnorum et eorum tyrapnide." For an edition of the earlier text see Juan Gil de Zamora, De preconiiis Hi, ed., study Manuel de Castro y Castro (Madrid: Universidad Complutense, 1955).

13th Century Poetry: Roncesvalles, Seville, Castile and Jerusalem

Three poems of the thirteenth century attest to a heightened consciousness of the city at that time in Spain. Two of them are lengthy Latin works celebrating Roncesvalles and Seville, while the third is a Castilian planctus to a recently lost Jerusalem. A fourth composition, the Poema de Fernán González, contains a lamentation of Hispania followed by its encomium. As such, it represents a continuation of the medieval tradition of praise for the Goth-derived nation. Tying it to the city poems is the fact that it betrays a more local pride, briefly glimpsed in a stanza praising Castile.

The presence of these four poems at this time should not be seen as unexpected, given the generalized flowering of Iberian literature during the thirteenth century, as well as the recovery of several cities - including Seville - during the Reconquest. They may also be seen as an intensification of the somewhat tepid tradition by then of praise of place. Looking forward, they were also a collective precedent of sort for the fifteenth-century celebrations of cities.

Roncesvalles. An anonymous poem honoring this city exists in a manuscript copy from approximately the year 1400 at the library of the Colegiata of Roncesvalles, as well as in another, inferior copy from the fourteenth century in the library of Munich. It was published in at least five modern editions, with translations into French and Spanish, during the period from 1884 to 1949.

A more recent edition was published in an article by H. Salvador Martínez, whose major contribution toward the study of this document seems to be on the question of the poem's authorship.⁴⁰ Martínez progresses toward the conclusion that the author was in fact Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, who would have likely written the work between 1210 and 1212, that is, just after his return from Rome, where he had been ordained bishop of Toledo, but before the battle of Las Navas de Tolosa, which goes unmentioned in the poem.⁴¹ Martínez repeats an earlier editor's position that there is a similarity between the Carmen and Jiménez de Rada's major work, De rebus Hispaniae, particularly in a

⁴⁰ See H. Salvador Martínez, "Carmen in honorem Roscidee vallis. Edición crítica y estudio," Études de Philologie Romane et d'Histoire Littéraire offertes à Jules Horrent (Liege: J. M. D'Heur and N. Cherubini, 1980) 279-93.

⁴¹ Martínez notes that the hypothesis of el Toledano's authorship was first proposed by Padre Fidel Fita in 1884, but then rebuilds that conjecture via additional reasoning.

brief passage of the latter describing the hospital of the Real Monasterio de Santa María de las Huelgas, near Burgos.⁴² Neither editor makes explicit the convergences of vocabulary or images, but these can indeed be seen. Examples include, respectively, "opus pietatis" (v. 109) and "opera pietatis," as well as "mollibus lectis et ornatis" (v. 110) and "lecti mirabiles apparatus." Yet convergences like these should not be unexpected in a topic as narrow as that of a charitable hospital. They should be seen as supporting a theory of authorship by Jiménez de Rada, but not as central evidence for such a theory.

Martínez admits the literary merit of the work, which he dubs Carmen in honorem Roscidee vallis, noting that its forty-two cuatrains with a consonantal, monorhythmic scheme seem to bridge the older Latin poetic tradition with the very new mester de clerecía of Gonzalo de Berceo and other vernacular poets of the thirteenth century. Still, he affirms that "no es de altos vuelos poéticos ni de grandes

⁴² The passage speaks of the construction work of Alfonso VIII in this way: "Construxit etiam hospitale iuxta monasterium, aedificiis et domibus mirabiliter decoratum; quod tantis divitiis dilatavit ut omnibus peregrinis, nullo patiente repulsam, omnibus horis diei necessaria ministrentur, et omnibus volentibus pernoctare lecti mirabiles apparatus continue preparentur. Infirmis autem usque ad mortem, vel restitutionem pristinae sanitatis per manus mulierum misericordium et virorum omnia necessaria erogantur, adeo ut opera pietatis in eo in eodem hospitali, quasi in speculo possit quilibet contemplari..." (VII, xxxiiii).

esquisiteces retóricas latinas" (281), and proceeds to the question of the poem's authorship. We might reasonably dwell more fully on the question of rhetoric, asking ourselves whether the Carmen reveals any attention to the established norms for content, structure and style in works praising places.

Regarding content, the Carmen focuses not on the city of Roncesvalles but on its hospital and the charity it offers to the poor. In addition, a chapel and church serving the many pilgrims are described. The result is a poem that praises a community of people and buildings, much after the manner of a conventional laus urbis. Several distinct (but unmarked) sections within the Carmen may be identified, as follows:

- I. Identification of hospital as subject for praise (vv. 1-20)
- II. Origins of the hospital (21-36)
- III. Physical description (37-48)
- IV. Charitable activities (49-112)
- V. Reception of pilgrims, and the chapel and church serving them (113-148)
- VI. Praise of hospital workers and Prior Martin (149-164)
- VII. Closing (165-168)

Section I opens the poem with a lyrical identification of the domus as a beloved place that flowers like a rose ("floret sicut rosa") in the Pyrenees. Using the first person, the poet states his intention to praise this

building. He cautions that only genuine truths will be used, since "Qui vult verum [con]tempnere falsum venerari / Nimis est odibilis celo, terre, mari." Martínez suggests that such a professed concern for accuracy "sale de los límites de las artes retóricas latinas" (286), further supporting the conjecture that the preeminent historian Jiménez de Rada authored this poem. Although such a concern would not at all be inconsistent with the critical approach of the Toledano, it should be noted that ancient *encomia* frequently purported to tell truths while actually delivering great exaggerations. An example of this may be found in the best known of the ancient *laudes urbium*, the *Panathenaic* oration by Aelius Aristides. While the orator claims "...I did not undertake these arguments to entertain but to show truthfully the worth of the city..." (§185), he drapes his speech in superlatives. This first section of the *Carmen* concludes with an image of God spreading his protective wings over the building.

Sections II, III, and IV correspond to the three traditional elements of praise of cities, that is, origins, physical setting, and achievements. In Section II the poet explains that in 1132 the bishop of Pamplona, Sancho de la Rosa (1121-1142), undertook the foundation of the hospital. He was aided by Alfonso el Batallador (1104-1134), who

responded to the guidance of a venerable council of canons at Roncesvalles.

Section III contrasts the rigors of the mountainous surroundings with the fair weather at the domus: "locum in quo situm est rigos yemalis, / Glacies perpetua, nec non nix annalis, / Fere semper agravant, et aer brumalis; / Sola est serenitas domus hospitalis." Likewise, while the lands are "sterilis omnino," many products are found at the hospital, including bread, wine, candles, oil, wool and linen. In a stanza recalling the locus amoenus of Berceo's introduction to the Milagros de nuestra señora (yet unwritten), the poet proposes that "In eodem aliquis vim frigiditatis, / Non sentit pauperiem nec sterilitatis. / Manet enim jugiter hic fons bonitatis / Qui pellit inediam omnis egestatis."

Section IV comprises the principal narrative of the poem. It is a lengthy description of the various charitable services offered at the hospital. Notable features include the following: all people are accepted into the holy space of the hospital, be they pagans, Jews, heretics, lazy or vain; the feet of the poor are washed, and they are given shaves and haircuts; shoeleather is patched; bread is given to the needy, whose requests are not rejected; the domus nourishes many orphans in a maternal way, raising them to

live independently by the labor of their own hands; the sick are cared for and given the fruit of the land for sustenance; women, unsullied by impurity, assist unstintingly in the care of the sick, who reside in men's and women's quarters, where the rooms are adorned with fruits from various parts of the world; the sick enjoy fine clothing and well-furnished rooms, and may stay until fully recovered; lamps in the hospital shine at night like a morning light. Throughout this section a pious air prevails, consistent with the overall tone of the poem. All the laudable services of the hospital are portrayed as evidence of God's guidance and protection. We might recall here that this section corresponds to the part of most laudes urbium in which a city's accomplishments throughout history are recounted, or the excellences of its present activities.

Section V reveals that the hospital serves not only the poor, sick and orphaned, but also the pilgrims enroute to or from Santiago. They are bathed, lodged, asked to join in worship, and allowed to stay for as long as is necessary for their comfort. In the event of a pilgrim's death, a decent burial is given in a local chapel ("Est ibi basilica..."), later known as the Capilla de Sancti Spiritus. In fact, five full stanzas (31-35) are devoted to

a description of the chapel, its central altar and rectangular format, and the spectacle of pilgrims piously paying respect to the tomb of the chapel, bearing gifts for St. James. The earlier mention of cleansing baths (section IV, 115-116) at the hospital quarters finds a metaphorical echo here in the description of the altar as "contagia purgans animarum" (130). The third building of this poem, known as the Iglesia de Santa María, is described in just one stanza as the "ecclesiam peregrinorum" (142), built by "strenuissimus vir, rex Navarrorum" (141), Sancho el Fuerte (r. 1194-1234), who endowed it richly.

Section VI pays homage briefly to the upright men and women who administer the buildings described. It is focused, however, on the figure of the prior, Martín Guerra (1199-1215), who is likened to a great pine spreading its protection over the poor devotees of Christ.

The closing section of the Carmen is a single stanza declaring that the foregoing narrative does not cover all of the good deeds of the domus. It also employs the topos of authorial humility, suggesting that the listener will become bored if the author does not conclude his work.

It is evident that the poem conforms to the conventions of the laus urbis tradition not only with respect to content (origins, physical setting,

achievements), but also regarding the use of standard literary topoi. The latter include a profession to use only truthful information; the locale as a locus amoenus; the providing for all needs, as in "fons bonitatis" (or the "everything needful" theme described by Stephen Reckert); the sheltering of non-local refugees (much practiced by Aristides); the high devotion of local Christian residents; homage to local saints (here Catherine and Marina); and the professed need for "brevitas" upon closing.

Seville. In 1250 a Latin poem to Seville was composed by an apparent participant in the reconquest of the city only two years earlier. This was Guillermo Pérez de la Calzada, a former abbot of the monastery of Sahagún who had fallen from grace before accusations of simony. His poem, the Rithmi de Iulia Romula seu Ispalensi urbe, was composed of 106 stanzas of verse of essentially the same meter as that found in the Carmen on Roncesvalles, and is preceded by a prose dedication to the future king Alfonso X. The prince is asked to include the information contained in the poem in any chronicles, for the sake of posterity, and is instructed to identify the author's name in the acrostic scheme of the composition. The dedication ends with an incipit stating the date and place of composition, and noting the chronological frame of the narrative, that is,

from the city's founding by Julius Caesar to the time of its reconquest by Ferdinand III. The latter information is repeated in the prose explicit following the Rithmi.

The following structure of the poem has been identified by its modern editor, Rocío Carande Herrero.⁴³

1. Panegyric on Seville
2. First catalogue: peoples of Hispania
3. Church and civil government of the city in the Visigothic period
4. Second catalogue: foreign peoples
5. Arab invasion
6. Beginning of the Reconquest: Pelayo, Alfonso VI and Alfonso VIII
7. Transition
8. Fernando III and the conquest of Seville
9. Third catalogue: the king's retinue
10. Transition
11. Advice and warnings
12. Author's lament
13. Closing

Carande Herrero considers the content of the Rithmi to be "fundamentalmente épico," since the poem is concerned especially with the conquest of Seville.⁴⁴ A brief analysis of the relative lengths of each section corroborates that opinion: two major interests of the poet emerge, that of Seville's history (sections 3-5) and its recent conquest

⁴³ Pages 184-185 of Gvillielmi Petri de Calciata. Rithmi de Ivlia Romvla Sev Ispalensi Vrbe, ed. Rocío Carande Herrero, in Chronica Hispana saeculi XIII (Turnholt: Brepols, 1997) 181-209. See also her earlier Spanish translation, Un poema latino a Sevilla. Versos de Julia Rómula o la urbe hispalense de Guillermo Pérez de la Calzada (1250), ed., trans. Rocío Carande Herrero (Seville: Ayuntamiento de Sevilla, 1986).

⁴⁴ Carande Herrero, Gvillielmi Petri 185.

(sections 8-9). Each receives, respectively, a total of 116 and 148 verses, far more than any other topic in the poem. This focus, presented in a highly favorable narrative manner, suggests a clear kinship with epic literature.

Nonetheless, in considering the genre of the poem we should not hesitate to classify it as a panegyric of place, specifically a laus urbis. The Rithmi is far too brief to qualify as traditional epic, and likewise is lacking in depth of characterization for its several protagonists. Regarding its historical content, we might remember that the laudes urbium had always been characterized by a strong emphasis on the history of the community being praised. This aspect of the genre had been institutionalized first in actual practice (especially evident in the Panathenaicus of Aristides, which leans heavily on military history) and later in theory (most notably by Menander, who referred to the praise of a city's praxeis or collective deeds⁴⁵).

In fact, the historical material of the Rithmi, the praxeis of Seville, is simply the third and final section of the traditional, three-part scheme of a city encomium. It seems a logical narrative choice on the part of the

⁴⁵ See his Treatise I, 346, 31. Quintilian and Menander had stipulated that cities be praised both as a person (in Menander, for genos, praxeis, and epitedeuseis) and as country (thesis). See also a discussion of this in Pernot 188.

author to address Seville's history only after the initial two elements were introduced. These earlier two sections are genos (origins) and thesis (territory or physical situation), and are found together in the opening section of the poem, entitled "Panegyric on Seville" by Carande Herrero. Strictly speaking, then, her title is misleading, for the entire poem actually comprises the panegyric. Although her scheme of thirteen sections is certainly useful, revealing as it does the major divisions of content within the poem, it should be complemented with a recognition that the author also incorporated the traditional three-part framework into the structure of his work. This is to say that the author relied upon the tradition of the laus urbis.

Thus we might think of the Rithmi as a city panegyric that contains all the essential elements of its genre, with special development given to the element of the city's actions through history.

Several particular features of the Rithmi deserve mention. Its initial section (vv. 1-39) may be subdivided fairly neatly into the two aforementioned parts (genos, 1-20, and thesis 29-39), as well as a brief intervening section that may be considered the city's accomplishments

(epitedeuseis, 21-28), properly belonging (according to Menander) to the later historical praxeis.

Genos includes an explanation for the dual naming of the city as Julius Romulus and Hispalis (the latter for certain stilts supporting the early city in its swampy foundation). The physical founding of the city is also described:

Late lata, spaciis nimis dilatata,
Et murorum ambitu firmiter firmata,
Pellagis paludibus undique ualata,
Turribus et soliis mire decorata. (13-16)

The epitedeuseis is a brief two stanzas. The city's accomplishments include its status as a religious metropolis, its "Litterarum studiis scola generalis" (23), and its religious devotion, as purified and strengthened by the local luminaries Leander and Isidore.

Thesis is evoked in superlative terms common to the locus amoenus tradition, including "Vernans fuluis floribus, fructibus preclara... Ibi cuncta dulcia, res abest amara" (30 and 32). Foods are abundant:

Vua sat brecanica, ficus et oliua,
Fructuum immensitas, poma successiua,
Pisces et legumina sunt in urbe diua;
Paradisum redolet ciuitas festiua. (33-36)

The following section catalogues the presence of the many Iberian peoples in the city of Seville. As such it could be considered a natural conclusion of the previous

section on the physical aspect of the city. Gifts are brought from everywhere. Wine comes with the townsfolk of Toro, Medina del Campo, etc., while bread comes with the Palencians and fruits from the author's former town of Sahagún.

Pérez de la Calzada briefly narrates the Visigothic history, noting that laws came from not only the Goths but also from the Church. His catalogue of foreigners which follows this section should be considered in the same way as the previous catalogue of Iberians. That is, the peoples enumerated all contributed to the excellence and wealth of the city. The division proposed by Carande Herrero between this section and the next could logically be moved down two stanzas, since the two in question clearly summarize and amplify the international presence within the city.⁴⁶

The following section chronicles the Islamic invasion, drawing heavily upon Jiménez de Rada for content and even textual material. Carande Herrero notes several word-for-word correspondences between the Rithmi and De rebus Hispaniae. We have reviewed the relevant passages of the latter- III, xxi-xxii - earlier in this chapter.

⁴⁶ The first of the two: "Ab his et ab aliis Iulia iuuatur, / Cunctis confluentibus opibus ditatur, / Quam collit Yspania, de qua gloriatur, / Doctrinis et moribus eius illustratur" (101-04).

Pérez de la Calzada becomes less dependent on sources and hence more original in the following very long sections on the history of the Reconquest. The exploits of Pelayo, Alfonso VI, Alfonso VIII and other anonymous kings are successively listed ("Iam ex illo tempore Reges successerunt / Qui paulatim regnum hoc ampliauerunt..." (145-146)); the language is vigorous, despite its formulaic nature.

Such language continues in the following section devoted to the conquest of Seville by Fernando III:

Obstupescit Affrica, pauet Gadicana,
Toniza pertimuit, timet Tingitana,
Omnis Andalusia linquit suburbana,
Capta cum Maritimis cespitat per plana. (201-204)

Likewise, vivid details are provided in the narration of the siege of Seville and the destruction of a key bridge. Following victory, Fernando enters the city and the poet relates the great variety of Iberian nobles who came to take up residence at the palace, hailing from Galicia, Castilla, Logroño, Asturias and Bizcaya. The status of Seville is thus raised within the Peninsula.

Pérez de la Calzada begins to conclude by way of a section addressed to the next king, Alfonso X, who would rise to the throne only two years later. The future leader is advised to be ever vigilant in the protection of his

assets, to prudently consider all options before acting,
and to be always a God-fearing friend of the poor:

Oppressores pauperum opprimat potenter;
Pupillos et uiduas reuet clementer
Sacra loca protegat, honoret decenter;
Deum semper timeat et amet ardentem. (385-388)

Earlier the author had advised Alfonso of the
perishable nature of one's possessions: "Dolens perdis
hodie quod habebas heri" (360). In his final lament he
echoes this sentiment, directing the reader to his own
personal disgrace, saying

Iam mihi detrahitur; quando eras abbas
Facundinus, curias decenter intrabas;
Vultum cum muneribus gratanter donabas;
Sed non est qui porrigat nunc tibi uel fabas.
(405-408)

In closing, the author asks for God's help in
delivering him from his misery, but also requests the
collaboration of the reader in securing help from a secular
authority, Alfonso:

Capitales litteras nota diligenter,
O letor, que continent exprime patenter;
Regis primogenito suggeras audenter
Guillelmum ut reddat auctorem clementer.
(421-424)

Finally, we can note the use of several topoi in the
Rithmi that were common to the laus urbis genre. These
include a claimed inexpressibility of the city's wonders
("Sed quis cuncta promere ualeat ad plenum?" (37)); the

need for brevitas ("...sed foret digressus / Perorare..." (73-74) and "Breviter hec tangimus, satis hec sunt nota" (169)); and the omission of all that is negative with respect to the subject of the encomium ("Que restant potissima in fine ponamus, / Vt, omissis tristibus, leta resumamus" (174-175)). The use of these rhetorical tools, and the overall structure and content of the Rithmi, allow us to consider the poem as an important example of the laus urbis genre, and a clear continuation of this classical literary genre within the context of the Iberian Peninsula.

España/Castilla. Nearly contemporaneous with the Rithmi was the Poema de Fernán González (ca. 1250), in which the growing nation of "España" is praised, along with more specific praise for the kingdom of Castilla. Its anonymous author, a cleric with ties to the monastery of Arlanza, also chose quatrains with single, consonantal rhyme, but used Castilian rather than Latin. Following the example set by Jiménez de Rada's De rebus Hispaniae, the author precedes the laus with a planctus for the loss of the Christian peninsula at the time of the Arab invasion.

The planctus (stanzas 89-108) recreates in Castilian the barbarity of the invaders as found in the Latin of De rebus Hispaniae. From its beginning with "España la gentil fue luego destruida" (89a), the poem then passes to an

evocation of the blasphemies of the "gente descreída"

(89b):

Dentro en las iglesias fazían establiás,
fazi<é>n en los altares muchas fieras follías,
robavan los tesoros de las sacristanías;
lloravan los cristianos las noches e los días.
(90a-d)⁴⁷

This image is not only similar to a passage in De rebus Hispaniae, but also to earlier medieval lamentationes urbium, such as that for Troy by Hugh of Orleans, or Alcuin's on Lindisfarne:

sanctuaría destruuntur, ecclesie diruuntur et que
laudabant in cymbalis, prouocant in blasphemiiis;
lignum salutis a sanctis eicitur, non est qui
aspiciat ut saluetur. (DRH 44-47)

nunc domus est tigris serpentibus hospita diris.
.....
Heu quid agunt bella! preciosa iacent capitella
et Jovis in cella cubat hinc ovis inde capella.
(Urbs erat illustris)

Expoliansque patrum veneranda sepulcra decore,
Necnon foedavit templa dicata dei,
Atque dei Christi mundissima vinea Sorehc
Vulpinis subito dentibus esca fuit.
Et lapides vivi pereunt altaria circum...
(De clade)

It seems very likely that the poet of Arlanza knew the Toledano's work, and that he may have conceivably known of the lament for Troy or Lindisfarne.

⁴⁷ Poema de Fernán González, ed. Miguel Ángel Muro (Logroño: Instituto de Estudios Riojanos, 1994).

Three stanzas are dedicated to the gruesome theme that the enemy boiled the Christian prisoners and psychologically tortured them by insisting that they would be eaten. This tactic spread horror throughout the land, dispersing Christians to the mountains where they died of hunger, or were killed. The destruction of the community of Christians clearly echoes Jiménez de Rada.

The correspondence between the two works continues into the next section of the PFG, in which the theme of Christian guilt is presented. While the Toledano speaks of "ira Dei" against the sins of the corrupt Visigothic kings, the PFG explains the following:

Dezi<é>n los malfadados: "En mal ora nasçimos,
diera nos Dios (a) España, guardar non la
sopimos;
si en <grand> coita somos, nós bien lo
meresçimos:
por nuestro mal sentido en gran<d> yerro caímos.
(98a-d)

The Biblical precedent of the conquered and captive Israelites inspired Jiménez de Rada, as was previously discussed, and permeates also the PFG. The lamentatio for the lost nation of España proceeds now with a parade of ancient Hebrew prophets, all of whom were aided by the Christian God, whose help is requested. Following a brief description of the campaign of Bernardo del Carpio, the poet launches into his praise of Spain.

The laus of Spain extols above all the natural resources of the land, those useful and those delightful. These include those described previously by a series of writers, including Isidore, the Tudense, and Jiménez de Rada. The long list includes the following: a temperate climate, pastures, trees and fruit, livestock, linen, wool, wax, oil, wild game and fish (both fresh and salted), bread and wine, an abundant water supply, salt and minerals, and scarlet dye.

The next subject of praise are the "buenos cavall(er)os," a not unexpected statement in an essentially heroic national poem. Past figures are next invoked. Santiago of Compostela is not honored just as a great saint, but also as a God-given trump against France and England:

Fuerte m<i>ente(e) quiso Dios a España honrar,
quand(o) al santo apóstol quiso (a)y enviar;
d(e) Inglatierra e França quiso la mejorar,
(que) sabet: (que) non yaz(e) apóstol en
en tod(o) aquel lugar. (154)

Fearless virgins, saints and confessors of the past are also described as honors to the nation.

A final two stanzas single out Castilla as the finest region of Spain: "Pero de toda (E)Spaña Casti<e>lla es mejor" (157a). A further specification is made:

Aún Casti<e>lla Vieja, al mi entendimiento,

mejor es que lo ál, por que fue el çimiento,
 ca conquirieron mucho, maguer poco conv<i>ento,
 bien lo podedes ver en el acabamiento. (158)

The PFG is significant in that it reflects not only the centuries-old tradition of the laus Hispaniae, as transmitted especially from Isidore to Jiménez de Rada, but also reflects more local pride, here expressed toward Castilla. As such the poem signals a transition in the tradition of praise of place within the Peninsula. This transition toward local praise - without a cessation of national praise - is confirmed when one takes into account the two city poems just reviewed, those honoring Roncesvalles and Sevilla. As the Reconquest moved forward, expanding Castilian dominion and consolidating a national identity and language, a vernacular literary space was apparently opened that permitted the more localized praise we have been examining.

Jerusalem. At the Second Council of Lyon of 1274 a planctus for the 1244 loss of Jerusalem to Islam was apparently read to the council attendees. This reading, as hypothesized by the poem's modern critic, Eugenio Asensio, was aimed at convincing the audience of the need for another crusade to win back the capital of Christendom.⁴⁸

⁴⁸ An edition of the poem is found in María del Carmen Pescador, "Tres poemas medievales," in Nueva Revista de Filología Hispánica 3-4 (Jul-Dec 1960): 242-250. Asensio's commentary,

The work's given title, "Ay Iherusalem," is taken from the refrain that closes each of the twenty-two stanzas, and suggests the essentially mournful tone of the piece. The choice of the vernacular language should not surprise us, since its composition during the decade of the 1270s coincided with the new currency of Castilian in the age of Alfonso X. In addition, if the poem was indeed preached by Dominicans and Franciscans at this time, as suggested by Asensio, its target audience was a good deal wider than the literate few to whom a Latin missive could be directed.

Indeed, although we might first question the relevance here of a poem whose topic is not a Hispanic city but Jerusalem, its significance lies in the fact that its language of choice is Castilian. Far from being irrelevant, this fact suggests that Hispanic writers were indeed participants in the international current of the planctus for cities, as seen in poems for Troy, Lindisfarne and Aquilea. In addition, it is only reasonable to suppose that the Hispanic tradition of the lament for the loss of the

"¡Ay, Iherusalem! Planto narrativo del siglo XIII," follows on pages 251-70. For a study of the fifteenth-century, Iberian manifestations of this European-wide tradition, see David Hook, The Destruction of Jerusalem. Catalan and Castilian Texts (London: King's College London, Centre for Late Antique & Medieval Studies, 2000).

Peninsula to the Moslems further inspired the composition of "Ay Iherusalem!"

Asensio notes that the genre of the planctus was typically confined to a shorter verse than that of romance or epic, and correspondingly lent itself more to emotional expression than to historical narrative. The verses of "Ay Iherusalem!" are in fact of only six or twelve syllables, but the content of the poem is not just lyrical - grief for the sack of Jerusalem - but also highly narrative. Thus the lyrical planctus tradition is somewhat confounded. Asensio hesitatingly posits the existence of a shadowy "planto narrativo" with few identifiable examples (270).

While Asensio's aim is to resolve the issue of overlapping poetic genres represented by "Ay Iherusalem!", we might address its content more fully, affirming without hesitation that the work belongs to the literary category of the lamentatio urbis. We have already amply established the precedents in this category, all of which are characterized by a combination of lyrical expression and considerable historical narrative of the city's fall. Such a combination of expressive modes appears to be a necessary component for the successful lament for a fallen city.

A few glimpses into the content and language of the poem reveal its kinship with the line of prior laments for

city and nation. Structurally the poem is composed of three sections. The opening four stanzas comprise an exordium that addresses the Council members, establishes the purpose of the work ("Bien querría más convusco plannir, / llorar noches e días, gemir e non dormir, / que contarvos prosas / de nuevas llorosas / de Iherusalem") and abruptly ends with a declaration of the "news" about Jerusalem: "moros lo çercaron / e lo derribaron".

The second and principal section of the poem (stanzas 5-21) relates the situation of the city under siege, the attack of the Moslems, and the subsequent condition of the imprisoned Christians. The following stanzas illustrate the three stages of this content:

Estos moros peros a la casa santa
siete años e medio la tienen çercada;
non dubdan morir
por la conquerir
a Iherusalem. (5)

¡Quánta grand batalla fuera en aquel día!
Con los caualleros es la clerezía,
por tomar pasión
por la defensión
de Iherusalem. (16)

Veen los christianos a sus fijos asar,
veen a sus mugeres biuas destetar;
vanse por los caminos [sic]
cortos pies e manos
en Iherusalem. (20)

An opposition is created between the determined, reviled enemies and the devout Christians, who are later described

as far outnumbered (st. 15: "Pocos son christianos, menos que ovejas. / Muchos son los moros, más que las estrellas"). Stanza 20 repeats a curious and macabre detail found in the earlier Poema de Fernán González, that of the roasting of the Christians by their captors. The same correspondence is found in the image of stanza 21, "del Sepulcro Santo fazían establo." Likewise, general echoes of the Toledano's planctus for Hispania in De rebus Hispaniae are heard, such as "Bienen las donzellas que eran delicadas / en cadenas presas e muy atormentadas" (st. 19). Another example is the assumption of guilt for the disaster, provoked "por nuestros pecados" (st. 14). These and other elements of a similar tone in "Ay Iherusalem!" also derive from Biblical passages, especially in Isaiah and Jeremiah. We are not surprised to find mention of Babylon in stanza 6.

The third section is a single, concluding stanza directed toward the audience:

Quien este canto no quiere oyr,
non tiene mientes de a Dios servir
nin poner vn canto
en el Conçilio santo
de Iherusalem.

This stanza reminds us of the Conciliar context of the poem and its ultimate purpose as propaganda for a Crusade.

The preceding historical and poetic texts, from Lucas de Tuy through the lament for Jerusalem, plainly reflect a heightened consciousness during the thirteenth century of a national identity or pan-Hispanic sense of belonging, as well as a new local pride in region or city. A common inspiration of most of these works was the rising fortune of Castile as the reconquest proceeded under Fernando III and his son. Also manifest in these texts is the more generalized transition in that century from a literatura culta in Latin to one in the vernacular, stimulated in part by the rise of a less literate middle class, and in part by the official practices of the Alfonsine court favoring the use of Castilian. The expanded legal code of that court provided greater visibility and prestige for cities by way of its attention to their rights and obligations. This is evident in the very discussion of the word "cibdat" in the Siete partidas: "Otrosí decimos que dondequiera que sea hallado este nombre: ciudad, que se entienda todo aquel lugar que es cercado por los muros, con los arrabales y los edificios que se tienen con ellos..."⁴⁹

The following century-and-a-half would see the unraveling of the political fabric within the Peninsula.

⁴⁹ Las Siete Partidas. Antología, selection, prol., notes Francisco López Estrada and María Teresa López García-Berdoy (Madrid: Castalia, 1992), 439-40.

Nonetheless, several laudatory texts would be composed for cities and for kingdoms, as well as two reflections on the nature of the ideal city. These writings are the subject of Chapter Five.

CHAPTER FIVE

VERNACULAR PRAISE OF CITY AND KINGDOM, 1300-1460

The survey of the previous chapter shows clearly that a current of praise for Hispania was established early - with Isidore's De laude Spanie - and that it was practiced consistently by future writers, notably those of the thirteenth century. We have seen that this expression of pride in a national, pan-Hispanic identity was motivated in part by the unifying Christian dimension of the reconquest, an enterprise that posed similar goals for the four Catholic kingdoms of the Peninsula and blurred, to an extent, their competitive differences.¹ Praise of a region (for Castile in the Poema de Fernán González) and of a city or town (Roncesvalles and Seville) also appeared more substantially during the thirteenth century. This was most likely due to

¹ Maravall establishes that a sense of national, pan-Hispanic community took root in the Peninsula earlier than elsewhere in Europe, noting France as an example. This broader identity with the people and land of Hispania was maintained, paradoxically, within each of the Iberian kingdoms during their formative periods. "Hispania" came to be a term representing different kingdoms or the traditional sense of the Peninsula as a whole. See Maravall, El concepto de España en la Edad Media 521-22.

the fact that the reconquest had been completed by then, thereby relaxing the perceived need for strictly national praise, and giving vent to an otherwise natural expression of local pride.

The fourteenth and early fifteenth centuries witnessed a continuation in the writing of national and local praise, but with two distinguishing factors. First, these texts now were composed mostly in Catalan or Castilian, as opposed to Latin, and second, the focus on cities was intensified. The most likely explanation for the first change would include the fact that a) vernacular literature by this time followed the examples set in the late thirteenth century by scholars and writers of the Alfonsine court; and b) that the administrative expansion in the kingdoms of Aragon and Castile during the fourteenth century called forth more officials into professional and administrative service, with fewer of them being fully literate in Latin.

As for the second distinguishing feature of the praise of place in this period, there was a noticeably heightened interest in cities. Even as the strength of the laus Hispaniae tradition (as articulated by el Toledano and the Primera crónica general) continued unabated during the 1300s via translations (especially the Crónica geral de 1344), individual cities came to be seen more frequently as

independent literary subjects (e.g. the Valencia of Eiximenis or the Sevilla of Pérez de Guzmán).²

Notwithstanding this increase, it is useful to remember that national and local praise was still a rather sporadic literary-historical theme until the advent of humanist culture toward the mid- and late-fifteenth century.

Prose and poetry will receive separate sections in this chapter; a review of each, however, would not be complete without a prior introduction to a body of related texts that addressed the topic of government.

Late Medieval Attitudes Toward Governance

Iberian writers of the fourteenth century partook in the very broad Western tradition of wisdom literature, a subset of which dealt with the proper governance of society. This literature included Biblical and classical works, medieval Christian theology, and collections of exempla and maxims originating in the East. The purpose of such writings was to show the proper behavior for each person in a well-ordered society, thereby maximizing private and public good. These works addressed virtually all sectors of society, rich

² See Chapter Six for a discussion of the socio-political dimensions of the rise of cities at this time.

and poor, man and woman, child and adult, ruler and ruled. While much of wisdom literature focused on devotion to God and righteous living, such as Proverbs, Ecclesiastes, and the Deuterocanonical Sirach, a considerable portion was concerned more explicitly with the functioning of government and the roles of rulers and their subjects. Naturally, there was much interplay between these spheres of personal behavior and civic responsibility.

By 1300, much wisdom literature from Europe and the East (India, Persia and Arabia) had penetrated Iberia and was already circulating there among the literate in both Latin and vernacular forms. Some works were original, but most derived in large part from ancient sources. The major texts included (in addition to Biblical writings) the Secreta secretorum (a pseudo-Aristotelian collection of the Philosopher's advice to Alexander) and its shorter version Poridad de las poridades, and the Libro de los cien capítulos and its later reworking as Flores de filosofía.³ Other works also contained occasional elements of advice, such as the Libro de Alexandre and the Caballero Zifar. In addition to these traditional works, at least three others were composed by Iberian authors. Isidore's Sententiae

expressed his concern (derived in part from Isaiah and Exodus) that a just society must eliminate the corruption of its judges, and that the poor must not be oppressed by monarchs.⁴ The Disciplina clericalis of Pedro Alfonso (1076?-1140?) cast political advice in the mold of exempla from Talmudic, Persian and Christian scriptures and maxims.⁵ The Chronicon mundi of Lucas de Tuy was prefaced with an explicit appeal to justice: "Puse este prohemio y prefacion en la primera frunte del volumen porque aprendan los generosos principes por sangre e por claros fechos gouernar los reynos a sí subiectos no menos sabia que piadosamente..." (3).

This vein of wisdom literature in Spain would be greatly augmented during the 1300s by an influx of newer works that addressed issues of government quite directly. A short review of these texts - mostly written by Italians - will be necessary before examining their presence and impact in Spain.

³ For a discussion of Spanish wisdom texts see Helen L. Sears, "The Rimado de Palacio and the 'De regimine principum' Tradition of the Middle Ages," Hispanic Review 20 (1952): 1-27.

⁴ Isidore of Seville, Sententiae III, 52-57. For text and commentary see Ursicino Domínguez del Val, Historia de la antigua literatura latina hispano-cristiana, 4 vols. (Madrid: Fundación Universitaria Española, 1998).

⁵ Pedro Alfonso, Disciplina clericalis, intro. Ma. Jesús Lacarra, trans. Esperanza Ducay (Zaragoza: Guara, 1980).

During the mid- and late-1200s many Italian authors wrote treatises that addressed the political issues of the day, notably the question of papal versus state power. Other prominent topics included the proper form of government (with discussions on tyranny, monarchy, oligarchy and republic), the legitimacy of tyrannicide, and the profile of an ideal prince. This flowering of treatises dedicated exclusively to political issues may be seen in part as natural, mature reflections on nearly two-hundred years of experience with republican governments in the Italian comuni. Two early works written at approximately 1250 exemplify this stage of the political treatise. The Oculus pastoralis aimed at showing a city's leader, the podestà, how to best profit from the use of rhetorical technique in political life.⁶ The Liber de regimine civitatum, by Giovanni da Viterbo, is addressed not to the local prince but to the citizens and intellectuals of the city, in order that they might be cognizant of their rights and of the very nature of the contract between the ruler and the ruled. A modern historian of political thought, Antony Black, observes that Viterbo's vocabulary and ideas were taken from

⁶ Medieval treatises on the proper character and behavior of a prince belonged to a genre commonly called speculum principum. One of the earliest in Europe was the Policraticus of John of Salisbury (d. 1180), which popularized the ancient metaphor of the human body as society and government.

Cicero, whose ruminations on the republic of his age - found in De officiis - provided the raw material for a wide range of discussion on civic affairs.⁷

But soon the composition of political treatises would become even more common. Spurring this development was the Latin translation by William of Moerbeke (1215?-1286) of Aristotle's Politics, in about 1260. Capitalizing on this event most immediately was the Florentine Brunetto Latini (1220-1295), who incorporated not only the Politics but also the Nicomachean Ethics and the De regimine of Giovanni da Viterbo into his Li Livres dou Tresor (ca. 1260-66), written in French. The third part of Latini's book provided practical advice for rulers, including the careful use of rhetoric in a variety of circumstances.⁸ At the same time, Thomas Aquinas (1225-74) and two of his students, Ptolemy of Lucca (1236-1327) and Giles of Rome (1243/44-1316), wrote their own guides to rulers for proper governance of a realm, and also reinforced the primacy of Church power. Dante's De monarchia (1310) largely upheld this view, while the

⁷ Antony Black, Political Thought in Europe, 1250-1450 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992) 19-20.

⁸ Latini also incorporated his knowledge of Cicero's De inventione (known then as the Rhetorica nova, in opposition to the "older" one, which was erroneously considered Ciceronian but later shown to be the Rhetorica ad Herennium). He would later translate this treatise into Italian.

Defensor pacis (1324) of Marsilio of Padua (1275-1342) defended the autonomy of state power. Bartolomeo da Sassoferrato (1313-1349) extended this debate in his De tyranno and De regimine civitatum (1355 and 1357).

One of these many works, Giles of Rome's De regimine principum (1277-1280), became the single most popular political treatise of the Middle Ages, seeing many translations and adaptations during the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. In Spain the De regimine principum was well known, either in its original or, more commonly, via a Castilian translation and gloss. The latter was conceived as a guide for the prince Pedro I, and carried out ca. 1345 by the friar Juan García Castrojeriz.⁹ The circulation in Spain of the De regimine principum (or its Spanish version) was the chief vehicle for the propagation there of Italian political ideas emerging from the experiences of the republican comuni. Giles's work also brought with it to Spain a particularly potent ideological underpinning, that is, the Thomistic marriage of Aristotelian ethics on the

⁹ See the modern edition edited by Juan Beneyto Pérez, Glosa castellana al "Regimiento de Príncipes" de Egidio Romano (Madrid, Instituto de Estudios Políticos, 1947) xxiv. The introduction by Beneyto Pérez is the source for the information here on the Spanish circulation of Giles's work. A new critical edition prepared by María Jesús Díez Garretas and others (with an extensive study of related manuscripts) will be published imminently by the University of Valladolid.

polis with Christian morality. This union expressed itself through recommendations that the wise prince always act on behalf of the good of his subjects (the bonum publicum), that he prefer peace to war, that he provide for justice and offer provisions to the needy.

The impact of Giles of Rome's text in Spain was extraordinary. Beneyto Pérez contends that the manuscripts of this work were so numerous that they can be divided into four categories: literal versions, glosses, summaries and adaptations.¹⁰ Two incunabula were printed in Spain, one a 1480 Barcelona edition of the original text and the other a 1494 Seville edition of Castrojeriz's translation and gloss. Even the library of the Marqués de Santillana contained a French translation of the original work, the Livre du gouvernement des rois.

In addition, favorable references to De regimine principum are common among Iberian writers of the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. Juan Manuel recommends the work in his Libro de los estados,¹¹ and its rational attitude toward ruling is evident in his own variant of the speculum

¹⁰ For a modern edition of a related manuscript see Tratado de la comunidad, edited by Frank Anthony Ramírez (London: Tamesis, 1988).

¹¹ See the edition in Biblioteca de Autores Españoles, vol. 51, 268b.

principum tradition, the Libro infinido written for his son. Pero López de Ayala (1332-1407) approvingly mentions Giles and his treatise in his long poem exposing all that is wrong with the government and society of his time, the satirical Rimado de palacio (ca. 1385):

Qual rregimiento deuen los prinçipes tener
Es escripto en los libros que solemos leer;
Egidio el rromano, ome de grant saber,
In rregimine prinçipum lo fue bien conponer.¹²

Although Ayala may have had access to works by Aristotle or Aquinas, according to Helen Sears, it is much more plausible that the views he expresses with regard to royal advisors, flattery, virtue and truthfulness (among other points) are influenced in fact by the source he himself cites, "Egidio el rromano." As Sears notes, Ayala's deeply didactic outlook toward government modified Giles's more scientific, Aristotelian approach, but the influence is clear nonetheless. Not even the Siete Partidas appears to have left as obvious an impact on Ayala, although it is true that he cites the second Partida to make a very particular point.¹³ Another Iberian writer influenced by Giles of Rome

¹² Cited in Helen L. Sears, page 1.

¹³ "Quien del rrey o del rregno entendiere occasion,
Luego le aperçiba e muestre su rrazon;
Segunt ley de Partida, caeria en trayçion
El que lo encubriese vn punto nin sazon." (287)

was Francesc Eiximenis (ca. 1340-ca. 1409), whose theoretical and laudatory writings on cities will be examined in the next section. Diego de Valera (1412-1488?) shows this influence, as well, in his Doctrinal de príncipes (1476), a work inspired by the medieval treatises on virtuous leaders (especially that of Giles) but showing also more modern, pragmatic notions of political behavior.¹⁴

The effect of this treatise was to inject a wealth of political ideas and vocabulary into the literature of the Peninsula. We have seen that these ideas helped stimulate the writings of Ayala and others. They continued to influence writers of the fifteenth century, such as Valera, at a time when the political chaos of the Trastamaran monarchy was giving way to a more complex political centralization that invited more political writing. In

Cited by Sears, 14. She finds other correspondences between the two texts, but attributes them to an inevitable convergence, given the great penetration of the Siete Partidas in the fabric of governmental life in Ayala's Spain.

¹⁴ For correspondences with Giles of Rome, see chapters V and IX of the Doctrinal de príncipes (in Prosistas castellanos del siglo XV (I), ed., intro. Mario Penna, Biblioteca de Autores Españoles, vol. 116 (Madrid: Atlas, 1959) 173-202), in which the medieval writer is cited by Valera. For Valera's similarities with Maquiaveli, see Mario Penna cxxx-cccxvi. For Valera's treatment of the very political question of nobility in fifteenth-century Spain, see Ottavio Di Camillo, "Las teorías de la nobleza en el pensamiento ético de Diego de Valera," Mosén Diego de Valera y su tiempo (Cuenca: Excmo. Ayuntamiento de Cuenca, 1996) 47-81. This article also contains extensive reflections on the nature of early humanism in Spain.

essence, Giles of Rome helped introduce the material of political debate into Spain, thereby facilitating its future development.

A second and more specific effect of this textual tradition is that its content helped legitimize the very political structure of Iberia, i.e. the various monarchies. When considering the introduction of the De regimine principum into Iberia one might expect that the text's overall orientation toward the Italian cities - rather than larger kingdoms, such as those of Iberia - would necessarily negate much of its relevance there. After all, its Aristotelian vision is concerned with the polis. Giles, however, explicitly equates the two political entities, showing them to be a single social structure, thus minimizing their differences. In Part III he asks the question "qué cosa es cibdad," then answers it by reviewing Aristotle's conception of a city; immediately he proceeds to the question "qué cosa es reyno":

...para saber qué cosa es reyno, conviene de notar que el reyno annade sobre la cibdad muchedumbre de nobles omnes e de granados, ca la cibdad es parte del reyno e en el reyno hay mayor muchedumbre de gentes e hay más nobles e más granados que en una cibdad. [...] ...ca vivir bien e virtuosamente es fin e bien en que deve entender cada un cibdadano e cada una cibdad, según que dice el Filósofo; e aquello que es fin de su cibdadano o de una cibdad es fin e bien de todo el reyno, ca el rey, si es bueno, ese mismo bien que quiere en cualquier

cibdadano e en cualquier cibdad, ese mismo deve
querer en todo el reyno suyo. (emphasis mine;
Glosa III, 2, xxxii)

Giles is thus extending the relevance of Aristotle's thoughts on the polis to the kingdom, and does so elsewhere, too. The extraordinarily positive reception of this text in Iberia was surely due in part to this implicit legitimization of the kingdoms there, that is, to its political aptness for Iberia. This validation of kingdoms - as well as cities - could only reinforce the already strong medieval tradition of the laus Hispaniae, as well as invigorate the praise of cities. In fact, praise of both nation and cities increased noticeably during the fifteenth century, as manuscripts and incunabula of the De regimine principum multiplied. Certainly the presence of this text in Iberia was only one of several factors responsible for the growth in the encomia of nation and city during the humanist period, but its impact should not be neglected.

One text neatly illustrates, however briefly, this confluence of political treatises and praise of place. In the decade of the 1340s the Portuguese Franciscan Alvarus Pelagius (Álvaro Pais; 1275/80-1349), Bishop of Silves and for years an influential Iberian presence in Italy, dedicated his ascetic treatise Speculum regum (1349) to prince Pedro of Castile. In the chapter "Quomodo regnum

Castellae praecellit alia," Pais proposes that Castile surpasses all other kingdoms because its ruler is truly devout: "Regnum tuum alia regna habet praecellere, quia tu defensor aliorum regnorum catholicorum Creatorem gentium per consequens ueraciter confiteris."¹⁵ The rest of this chapter (and others after it) develop the Augustinian analogy of the earthly community as the image of the celestial kingdom, and the necessity of governing it in a just, Christian manner.

The preceding pages have been devoted mostly to an assessment of the impact in Spain of the most influential political treatise of medieval Europe, the De regimine principum of Giles of Rome. Though in Spain it was the most important political work, it was not the only one. It should be noted that political works of other Italian authors (e.g. Dante's De monarchia) were also circulating in Spain by the mid-fifteenth century, thereby contributing to a rise of political consciousness among men of letters.

Encomiastic Prose

Chronicles. While the thirteenth-century Castilian histories were remarkable for their literary excellence and

¹⁵ Álvaro Pais, Espelho dos reis, ed., trans. Miguel Pinto de Meneses (Lisbon: Instituto de Alta Cultura, 1955) 22-25; here

tendency toward pan-Hispanic and even universalist coverage, in the fourteenth-century the pre-1200 chronicle tradition was resumed. This represented a reversion to the telling of history in a more or less linear fashion (now in the vernacular), with periods demarcated by the reigns of the kings. Although many chronicles survive from this period,¹⁶ none contain genuinely laudatory passages of Castile or of Castilian cities. An explanation for this absence can be found in what Robert Tate calls "las disensiones internas de los reinos de la Península y, particularmente, las tirantes relaciones entre las principales fuerzas de poder político, el trono, la nobleza y el naciente elemento urbano."¹⁷ This power struggle, combined with the conditions of hunger, the Black Death, and civil and foreign wars that endured throughout the century, make it entirely understandable that praising a city or even the kingdom may have been far from the mind of the fourteenth-century chroniclers. This lack of

22.

¹⁶ Jofré de Loaysa (fl. ca. 1305), of a noble Murcian family of French origin, is considered the author of the first group of these chronicles, a text covering the reigns of Alfonso X, Sancho IV and Fernando IV. This work was originally composed in Castilian but is known today only through its contemporary Latin translation (re-translated to Castilian in a recent edition). An anonymous author wrote the chronicle of Alfonso XI. Pero López de Ayala, chancellor of Castile, composed the chronicles of Pedro I, Enrique II, Juan I, and Enrique III.

¹⁷ "López de Ayala, ¿historiador humanista?", Ensayos 36.

encomium, as well as a relative poverty of historical vision, continued into the reign of Juan II (1406-54). Referring to this later period, one in which humanist currents and an increasingly sophisticated praise of city and kingdom would be seen, Tate writes: "Sólo cuando uno se traslada al reinado de Enrique IV, es consciente de algunos cambios socio-culturales profundos, en particular el rápido aumento en el número de letrados en la cancellería, que se transforma en un torrente bajo los Reyes Católicos."¹⁸

To complete this scenario of Castilian historiography of the fourteenth century, it must be noted that the extensive histories produced under the supervision of Juan Fernández de Heredia (1310-1396) were largely an imitation of the style and content of the Alfonsine histories of the previous century, drawing accordingly on Lucas de Tuy, Jiménez de Rada, Isidore, and the Primera crónica general. Heredia's Grant cronica de Espanya includes near-literal versions of Isidore's De laude Spanie, of Lucas's laudatory preface to the Chronicon mundi, and of the planctus Hispaniae found in De rebus Hispaniae and in the Primera crónica general. These passages are partially stripped of their original poetic and rhetorical nature, surely because

¹⁸ Robert B. Tate, "Los trabajos del cronista cuatrocentista," Studia Historica. Historia Moderna 13 (1995):

of the author's somewhat singleminded, didactic purpose. Heredia's other major work, the Cronica de los conqueridores, reproduces another section of the Primera crónica general containing a laus of Fernando III's siege encampment of Seville, and another praising the city itself (chapters 1127 and 1128 of the PCG). Here again, Heredia has condensed and rearranged somewhat the content, but remains essentially faithful to the narrative, the images and, often, the wording itself.¹⁹

The situation for the Kingdom of Aragon seems to have been the reverse as compared to Castile during the approximate period of 1300 through 1500. Although fifteenth-century historiography in Aragon would be unremarkable, the fourteenth century saw the appearance of four celebrated Catalan chronicles. One of these, the Crónica of Ramón Muntaner, contains a short passage whose intention is clearly to praise Catalonia for its size and wealth, and especially for its harmonious civic-political qualities:

27-46; here page 39.

¹⁹ For these and other Heredian works, see Juan Fernández de Heredia, Concordances and Texts of the Fourteenth-Century Aragonese Manuscripts of Juan Fernández de Heredia [microform], eds. John Nitti and Lloyd Kasten (Madison: Hispanic Seminary of Medieval Studies, 1982). Heredia's grafting of material on the mythic founding of Hispania can be better understood through the comments of Tate in his "Mitología en la historiografía española," Ensayos 13-32. See also Aurora Egido and José María

Nadie se figure que Cataluña es una pequeña provincia, antes quiero que sepa todo el mundo que en Cataluña hay, en general, un pueblo más rico que ningún otro pueblo que yo sepa haya en ninguna otra provincia, aun cuando la mayor parte de gentes del mundo se figuran que son pobres. Es verdad que en Cataluña no existen aquellas riquezas en moneda que ciertos hombres señalados tienen en otras tierras, pero la comunidad de pueblo es el más bien regido del mundo y viven mejor y más acomodadamente en sus casas con sus esposas y sus hijos que ningún otro pueblo que en el mundo exista.²⁰

Muntaner then adduces another attribute to Catalonia, one very seldom employed in the encomia of places, namely the number of people speaking a uniform language:

...que de ningún lenguaje hay tantas gentes que lo hable como de catalanes, pues si queréis buscar castellanos ya veréis que la verdadera Castilla es poca y poco extensa y hay muchas provincias que cada una habla su lenguaje, que son tan diferentes como los catalanes de los aragoneses.

In continuing to elaborate this point, Muntaner shows a certain agility in comparing languages and kingdoms of Europe and Asia. He concludes that if the Catalans counted their size as do the Castilians, "seríamos muchos más que ellos, y os diré que seríamos el doble."

The Moral City of Eiximenis. While the austere and disapproving literary personality of Pero López de Ayala has

Enguita, eds., Juan Fernández de Heredia y su época (Zaragoza: Instituto Fernando el Católico, 1996).

²⁰ Ramón Muntaner, Crónica, ed. Marina Gustà (Barcelona: Edicions 62, 1979). This and following citations are from chapter 68.

come to be seen as something of a paradigmatic reflection of the convulsions felt within Castile during the second half of the fourteenth century, the more optimistic figure of Franscesc Eiximenis (1340?-1409?) presents a very different portrait for the kingdom of Aragon. The writings of Eiximenis evoke an expanding society confident of its future, notwithstanding the internal power struggle between Pere III (r. 1336-87) and the Aragonese nobility, and the ongoing difficulties of the kingdom in maintaining a presence in Sardinia and other Mediterranean lands. There is no paradox in this optimism, for the focus of Eiximenis's thought was precisely that component of Aragonese society that had been propelling - and would continue to propel - Aragon into its status as the leader of the western Mediterranean basin. The object of this focus was precisely the city, the topic which lay at the heart of the "Dotzè," the twelfth book of Eiximenis's encyclopedic work Lo crestià.²¹ The "Dotzè" reveals the author's conception of the ideal city, a community, as we will see below, with religious, political, social and architectural dimensions. A review of the urban theory of Eiximenis is clearly relevant to our study of the laus urbis, particularly in light of the

²¹ The entire work, written mostly during the 1380s, was unfinished, consisting ultimately of only four books, the

exceedingly wide circulation of the author's ideas during the fifteenth century, and the many laudes urbium written at that time. In fact, Eiximenis himself wrote encomia to the cities of Barcelona and Valencia, texts we will take up after addressing his more theoretical side.

Urbanism would only begin to become a science during the second half of the fifteenth century, when Alberti, Filarete, Da Vinci and others developed technical solutions for the problems posed by their changing cities.²² Not surprisingly, a writer such as Francesc Eiximenis, born several generations earlier and trained as a Franciscan priest, invested his proposals for urban perfection with a predominantly moral purpose, rather than a technical outlook. His ultimate goal seems to have been that of bringing about on earth the shadow of the perfect, celestial city. While his focus on the Christian afterlife was characteristically medieval, the modernity of Eiximenis resided in the means he chose to achieve this end. He embraced the intricate realities of social and political relations, and attended as well (if less so) to the material

"Primer," "Segond," "Terç," and "Dotzè."

²² Two general references address this early period of urbanism: Giulio C. Argan, The Renaissance City (New York: Braziller, 1969) and Leonardo Benevolo, trans. Carl Ipsen, The European City (Oxford: Blackwell, 1993), 85 ff.

techniques for building a city.²³ A passage from the "Dotzè" shows this multiple perspective:

...las ciutat deu esser be composta ço es be endreçada e ordenada en tres coses: la primera que sia be arreglada en l'espirtual, la segona que sia governada per bona ley temporal, la terç que sia be edificada en la forma material. (Chap. 98)²⁴

Of these three aspects, it is the second one concerning governance that receives the most attention in the "Dotzè"; the "espirtual" concern, however, is everywhere present, underpinning each of the political points. For example, in considering the historical nature of cities, Eiximenis makes extensive use of the ancient Biblical stories, such as Cain as the founder of Enoch (Genesis 4.17). In Chapter 4 he says "...Es per Déu dad al hó inclinació de viure en comunitat e de edificar o de habitar en ciutat."²⁵ The community he envisions is before all else an ethical cos mística founded

²³ Eiximenis passed along the Eastern belief that a city should be founded only on a date determined to be propitious by an astrologer. For the layout of the city he proposed a rectangular form, based on the example of Hipodamus (ca. 480 BC, Piraeus), Roman military encampments, and more recently founded medieval towns of Spain and France.

²⁴ Francesc Eiximenis, Dotzè llibre del Crestià, eds. Curt Wittlin et al. (Girona: Diputació de Girona, 1986).

²⁵ Soledad Vila cites this in La ciudad de Eiximenis: Un proyecto teórico de urbanismo en el siglo XIV (Valencia: Diputación Provincial de Valencia, 1984) 45. This passage (and many others) shows Eiximenis's interest in Aristotelian ideas, such as the raison d'être of cities (esp. as found in Politics), and also his adaptation of these classical sources to a Christian context.

through a contract between God and the faithful; likewise, a king rules his citizens justly through a similar relationship.²⁶ The terminology employed here is that of the traditional metaphor between a community and a human body, as detailed in the opening chapter of his Regiment de la cosa pública.²⁷

Regarding the political contours of this ideal society, Eiximenis poses three distinct social classes (Regiment, 1). The least privileges go to the workers and poor, who are denied citizenship and receive the author's unbridled scorn. Antonio Antelo Iglesias suggests that Eiximenis had been made aware of worker revolts throughout Europe in the course of his extensive travels in England, France and Italy.²⁸ This would account in part for his relentless attacks against this class, as well as against peasants who, as potential and real immigrants to the cities, posed a danger

²⁶ One of the features of the political reality during the lifetime of Eiximenis was government by pactismo or compact, an arrangement generally favoring the Aragonese cities - and their ruling class of nobles - over the Crown.

²⁷ Francesc Eiximenis, Regiment de la cosa pública, ed. Daniel de Molins de Rei (Barcelona: Els Nostres Classics, 1927). The Regiment was a rather concise and focused document drafted by Eiximenis in 1383, intended to present his principles for good governance to the city council members of Valencia. It was subsequently incorporated into the "Dotzè" as chapters 357 through 395.

²⁸ Antonio Antelo Iglesias, "La ciudad ideal según fray Francesc Eiximenis y Rodrigo Sánchez de Arévalo," En la España Medieval 6 (1985): 19-50.

to his vision of civil order. At the other extreme was the highest of Eiximenis's three estaments, the one composed of aristocratic rulers who should be exemplars of virtue and learning in order to best rule their people.²⁹ Explicit reference is made to the ancient and medieval tradition of the speculum principum, or "breu art e manera de bé regir" ("Dotzè," Chapt. 493). Eiximenis also endorsed the overthrow of any monarch who usurped the public trust. His conception of good government was developed especially for the context of a city, but he extended the general principles to that of a monarchy, as indicated here: "...cosa pública és alguna comunitat de gents ajustades e vivents sots una mateixa llei [...] sia regne, o ciutat, o vila, o castell..." (Regiment, ch. 1).

The bourgeoisie, and especially the merchants, comprise the middle class or mà mitjana, and are considered by Eiximenis to be the linchpin of a successful socio-economic and moral order. This preference is expressed unequivocally in the Regiment, and permeates the rest of the "Dotzè," as well:

Los mercaders [...] deuen ésser favorits sobre tota gent seglar del món, car [...] són vida de la

²⁹ "...Los ricos ciudadanos deben así mismo estudiar y leer en sus casas notables libros que traten del gobierno de la ciudad [...] en guisa de que puedan bien gobernar y aconsejar la cosa pública..." (Regiment, ch. 128).

terra on són, e són tresor de la Cosa pública...
 Sens mercaders, les comunitats caen, los prínceps
 tornen tirans, los jovers se perden, los pobres
 s'en ploren... Nostre Senyor Déu los fa
 misericòrdia especial en mort e en vida...

(Regiment, ch. 34)

For example, Barcelona had always prospered, he contended, because it had sought only moderate wealth, the kind brought through trade. The "honor de mercader és mitjana e temprada"; if the citizens had sought to become "cavallers" or "curials de senyors," "portarien si mateixs e la ciutat a perdicio" ("Dotzè," ch. 24).

Much of the originality of Eiximenis lies in this special status conceded to the merchant class. Just as Aquinas had assimilated the newly recovered thought of Aristotle into Christian doctrine a century earlier, Eiximenis constructed his ideal Christian community with a secular centerpiece, the traders.³⁰ His individuality as a thinker is further seen in his selective use of sources. For example, although Aristotle was a guide for much of the "Dotzè," his opinions against maritime cities for the ills they invited through excessive foreign contacts ran contrary

³⁰ Maravall showed that merchants were hardly rejected as a social class during the Middle Ages in Spain and in Europe as a whole, but it is clear that no writer before Eiximenis had attempted so insistently to establish their centrality to society. See José Antonio Maravall, "Franciscanismo, burguesía y mentalidad precapitalista: la obra de Eiximenis," Estudios de historia del pensamiento español, orig. series (Middle Ages), 3rd ed. (Madrid: Ed. Cultura Hispánica, 1983) 371-83; here page 378.

to a central feature of Eiximenis's thought. The Franciscan nevertheless chose to model his ideal city as a port trading community, in order to better match the real conditions of the Aragonese, coastal cities he so admired. We can therefore see Eiximenis as a social theoretician who wove together classical and Christian traditions, just as Aquinas and many contemporary Italians had done, but whose observations of the considerable success - and greater potential - of his Catalan cities led him to modify tradition and elevate the merchant class to exemplary status.

It is evident, then, that Francesc Eiximenis was a transitional figure. In his writings we see reflected an author with one eye devoutly fixed on the medieval, scholastic tradition and the other on the vigorous civic and merchant life of the precapitalist maritime cities of Catalonia. The vision of an ideal city expressed in the "Dotzè" differs notably from the later utopian cities described by Filarete, More and others. These cities had invented names (such as Sforzinda and Amaurot), thereby distinguishing them from any real city. But the city in Eiximenis's thought was clearly based upon existing cities such as Barcelona and Valencia. Hence the urban program he advocates in the "Dotzè" is less the description an ideal

city than a series of reforms aimed at perfecting certain real ones.

In light of this, it is not surprising that Eiximenis channeled his admiration for the cities he knew into encomia of them. Barcelona is praised in a fashion true to the title of its chapter: "Qui incidentalment ensenya com Barcelona és noble ciutat" ("Dotzè," ch. 24). If incidental, this passage is nonetheless remarkable in that it contrasts the positive features of Barcelona with the negative aspects of neighboring Tarragona, a vernacular laudatio/vituperatio. The attributes include water, winds, health and size of the population, buildings, and wealth. According to Eiximenis, Barcelona is situated with an abundance of water, while Tarragona is found on "roca seca." Barcelona's winds and its Montjuich conspire to bring men and women together for reproduction, but Tarragona's winds bring only "pudors dels marjals." Likewise, Barcelona's well-nourished population grows in number while the people of Tarragona - "simple gent e grossera" - are ever fewer. "Barcelona és mills e pus bellament edificada que ciutat que hom sàpia al món," but Tarragona is "mal edificada." Finally, Tarragona ("pobra e miserable") cannot compare with a rich city like Barcelona, which, adds Eiximenis, "ama lo diner e el sap guardar mills que altra generació del món." This last comment on

Barcelona's financial prosperity leads quite naturally into praise for the city's merchant class. If the modern, precapitalist economy of Barcelona finds favor in Eiximenis, we are reminded of his medieval instincts in the next and last paragraph of the chapter, in which he retells the mythic founding of Barcelona by Hercules and Hispan. Despite the shortness of this chapter as a whole, it seems clear that its author was familiar with the three traditional elements for praising a city; he covers the physical situation, the origins and founding, and the accomplishments of the people (i.e. the city's merchants).

Much lengthier is the praise of Valencia, framed as a letter to the jurats of the city and intended as a preface to the thirty-eight chapters of his Regiment de la cosa pública. It is with this city that Eiximenis is definitively associated. Although born in Gerona and later a resident of Barcelona, he spent approximately his last twenty-five years in Valencia. His praise of Valencia and fervent exhortations toward good governance there attest to his clear affection for it.

The "Lletra" of Eiximenis is composed of two sections. The first (15-22) uses a list of twenty reasons to convince the city's jurats of the seriousness of their job. Their counterparts in other cities of the kingdom have fewer

worries, he claims, citing the "multituds dels negocis," the dangers of a newly-Christian city, "encara quasi morisca," the profligate ways of women ("pomposes e vanaglorioses, així com se són en alteres llocs del món"), and many other reasons. Frequently the jurats are reminded of the religious mission entrusted them ("Senyor [Jesus Christ] qui per salut de la cosa pública morí..."); this concept runs through the second part of the "Lletra," as well, and through the entire contents of the Regiment and the "Dotzè."³¹

The second section, the encomium itself (22-39), begins with such an allusion: "...Senyor Déu quina ciutat e quina terra vos ha comanada." The use of both the word "ciutat" and "terra" is significant; although Eiximenis is clearly addressing an urban body of politicians, and the content of the Regiment itself is most appropriately applied to urban government, it is the "terra" of Valencia that truly receives most attention in the encomium. The structure, though loosely arranged, reveals this emphasis on the land. Of its thirty-two items (plus three unnumbered ones), the first twenty-three concern the "terra" of Valencia. The cityscape is absent. Valencia as a city is evoked only in the last section on politics, and not even exclusively so.

³¹ Chapter 2 of the Regiment is titled accordingly: "Com la llei crestiana és noble e fonament pricipal de la cosa pública, e

As a result, the "Letter" should be considered less the praise of urban Valencia as praise of the kingdom of Valencia.

In considering why the city-oriented Regiment was prefaced with the land-oriented encomium of the "Lletra," we can hypothesize that Eiximenis's intention was to paint a verbal picture of the entire kingdom for the jurats for two reasons: to give them a stirring reminder of the many excellences in the lands that were so strongly influenced by the city they controlled; and to render proper homage to a higher political authority, the kingdom of Valencia, and possibly that of Aragon. An additional reason could be that he chose to imitate Isidore's De laude Spanie, which was also a preface to a political text, and a work he surely knew. His text is much less literary than Isidore's, but it maintains the same emphasis on geography and natural resources.

The following table describes the contents of the encomium:

- I. climatic and geographical features
- II. plants
- III. animals
- IV. people
- V. goods produced
- VI. political aspects

com alguns han tengut lo contrari."

Although Eiximenis provides no real narrative thread, listing his points rather than telling them, he manages to provide some vivid details and engaging digressions. The tone of his language is uniformly encomiastic and patriotic, with Christian devotion often evident. Parts I-III boast of many natural elements: clear air (as not found in France, England or Germany); winds that purge any "corrupció" produced by the abundance of waters;³² extensive land, well-irrigated by four rivers; wines and fruits of all kinds (thirty are listed), such as were not found even in the "terra de promisió"; diverse "licors," including sugar and honey, milk, butter, wine, wax, tar, resin, and curative waters; grains, twenty-one in number; vegetables and exotic Eastern drug plants; thirty kinds of herbs, and "amagatalls"; meats, cheeses, wool for the drap fabric; silk and dyestuff; rosemary for "pa en lo forn"; rare birds and game; and sea and river fish.

Section IV provides only a few descriptions of the Valencian people: they are of excellent character ("gent aguda e apta d'entenment [...] coratjosa e ardent") and not given to greed like other peoples; warlike in battle (since the city's astrological sign, Scorpio, is linked to Mars)

³² The undesirability of the marshy, odorous lands are here minimized by reference to the favorable winds.

and mindful of the military teachings of Aristotle and Valerius Maximus;³³ given to peace ("dolç voler") when not at war; and ennobled by prior martyrs among them, especially the martyr Vincent.³⁴ Item thirty-one summarizes the qualities of the people, adding that they are law-abiding and participate well in the festive and solemn moments of their lives. A final quality certainly associated with the "beneita ciutat" is their language. According to Eiximenis, its sounds and words have been distilled from the best of the surrounding languages, and, what's more, one can learn there "les principals llengues del món, així com son llatí, hebraic e morisc."

Part V contains only three references to manufactured products, or "coses artificials." Ceramic ware, especially that of Manizes ("daurada e maestrívolment pintada") is highly regarded by "lo papa e los cardenals e los prínceps del món." More humble are the exported products derived from sparta grass, but Eiximenis asks the jurats rhetorically, "¿qué faria hom en aquesta terra o en algunes altres sens

³³ Here Eiximenis is referring to the Secreta secretorum and De re militare, both of which were extremely popular throughout Europe in the Middle Ages.

³⁴ Eiximenis, ever conscious of symbols, may have made this reference to Christian martyrs the thirtieth item in his list in order to link it to the thirty pieces of silver for which Christ himself was martyred, as told in Matthew 26.14-16.

gúmenes, cordes, trenelles, cabassos, astores, espartenyas?" He adds that the surrounding foreign lands "fan de aquesta ciutat llur cap e refugi en tot en llurs necessitats."

The concluding section refers to the favored political fortunes of Valencia. Jaume II of Aragon conferred unique laws on the city: "...dotà ací lo braç setglar de lleis e de furs especials que no han altres pobles del regne." While the rest of the kingdom (of Aragon) uses a coin called the "barcelonesa," the kingdom of Valencia uses its own "real de Valencia," said to have "qualque avantatge a la barcelonesa." More recently, Pere III crowned Valencia a royal city, so impressed was he with its loyalty during a campaign against Castile's Pedro I. Here the "Lletra" preceding Eiximenis's "petit tractat" (the Regiment) concludes with a peroration to rule well and maintain the incomparable status of Valencia.

Eiximenis incorporated only two ancient sources - Aristotle and Valerius Maximus - into his praise of Valencia. From the Bible he also quotes only two authorities - Isaiah and Wisdom - but reinforces the Christian, didactic atmosphere with frequent reminders about Valencia's debt to Christ. Although it is very likely that Eiximenis knew of the traditional three elements for the praise of a city or land (especially considering his use of them in the praise

of Barcelona), he does not seem to make an effort to follow them here. For he only attends well to one of the three categories, that of the physical setting. The place's accomplishments over time might only be seen in the laws, special coin, faithfulness to the king, and teaching of languages. Together, however, they form an incoherent group, narrated in a disjointed manner. The third category, origins and founding, might be seen in only one item, and apparently as a second thought. After describing the martyrs and noting the special "gràcies e privilegis" of Valencia, Eiximenis says "presumim que ella [the "terra"] és estada habitada quasi del començament del món." As a whole, the organization of this encomium to Valencia - with its mechanical numbering and lack of narrative transitions - is less successful than the positive overall impression it conveys, the latter thanks to much ekphrastic language.

But if the praise of Valencia bears a likeness to other medieval encomia for its mechanical narrative quality and strong Christian tone, it is also the product of a well-informed and worldly author. Eiximenis uses few classical sources, it is true, and dispenses with the traditional three-part format for praising a city; but he is aware of, and uses to his advantage, several of the familiar topoi for this genre: so fertile is the soil that multiple harvests

take place each year; so many herbs are found in the land ("infinides") that they would be "llongues de comptar"; the Valencians are a hospitable people to visiting foreigners ("bé acullents persones estranyes"); and the beauty of the land enchants all visitors ("sol l'esguard enamora los hòmens que hi vénen d'altres terres"). Eiximenis also shows a somewhat independent, more modern edge in citing "clara experiència" when asserting that Valencia is one of the most noteworthy lands on earth. In fact, his own travels through much of Europe provided him with a recommendation to the jurats, namely that the peasants dig for peat (as is the custom in "Anglaterra") then dry it for later use as a fuel.

It may be reasonable to conclude that this text in praise of the city and kingdom of Valencia, with its old and new elements, is an honest reflection of the author's medieval and modern sensibilities. Eiximenis was, on the one hand, a man comfortable in the Valencia of the zealous Reconquest, and in the intensely didactic Augustinian vision of modelling one's earthly community after the celestial Jerusalem. Yet he was also confident that a harmonious, pious community was facilitated with the prosperity that a city of "mercaders" could bring, regardless of Aristotle's dictate against a maritime city, or of the Christian tradition excluding wealth from good morality.

The praise of Barcelona, reviewed earlier, represents Eiximenis following a literary tradition, but the praise of Valencia seems to emerge more from the author's experiences and beliefs. Both might be thought of as the raw material for his larger theoretical proposals for the perfect precapitalist, Christian city, elaborated, as we have seen, in the "Dotzè" of Lo crestià.

Lamentatio in Santillana. A short and lesser known prose composition of Íñigo López de Mendoza (1398-1458), the "Lamentación de Spaña fecha por el marqués de Santyllana" (1424-1432)³⁵ attests to the continuation of the medieval lamentatio Hispaniae. But in the case of this text, the subject is not the historical conquest of the Peninsula - as recounted in the Crónica mozárabe, De rebus Hispaniae, and the Primera crónica general - but a prophesied, future loss.

The "Lamentación" reflects a variety of literary and philosophical traditions. As a work of didactic prose, its basic structure shares some of the features identified by Ottavio Di Camillo for the didactic poetry of this period, inspired by scholastic dialectic methods. Of these poems, he writes:

³⁵ Íñigo López de Mendoza (Marqués de Santillana), Obras completas, ed., intro., Ángel Gómez Moreno and Maximilian P. A. M. Kerkhof (Barcelona: Planeta, 1988) 410-13.

En ellas, el "prólogo" o "introducción" es seguido de un "comienço", con una o más "comparaciones" y "continuaciones" que plantean el argumento. [...] Finalmente, después de numerosos consejos para todo el mundo, el poeta "pone fin a la obra" [...]³⁶

This structure is substantially evident in Santillana's text, although without the centrality of a debate.

Accordingly, after Santillana opens with the observation that "a la gruesa Spaña terribles e infinitos males se aparejan...", he states: "Açerqua de la consideraçón de los quales mi spiritu affligido contemplando, esta lamentaçión ordené, e comiença assí:" Following the body of the entire text, in which the reasons for Spain's imminent destruction are clearly argued, the work concludes in the manner of a prayer, with a fervent plea to God for his mercy upon Spain. "Amén" closes the work.

The "Lamentaçión" is also informed of the Biblical prophets. Like Isaiah, who cites the degeneracy of Judah and Jerusalem and predicts their fall to a greater power (Isaiah 1), or a similar prophecy against Christ's people in Revelations 21, Santillana addresses Spain with vehement disapproval, revealing his own vision. In fact, vision itself - i.e. the act of seeing - is an ongoing motif in the text. The first section begins with a series of rhetorical

³⁶ Di Camillo, El humanismo castellano 95.

questions addressed to his country: "Muy triste e desaventurada España, [...] ¿qué çeguedat es en ti? E cómo no ves los tan terribles destruymientos et danyos que se te açercan?" In all, the interrogation "non vees..." is employed seven times here in quick succession. Some of the threats that Spain does not see belong to the symbolic category often voiced by Biblical prophets: "los cuatro terribles leones," "los altos pendones que se aparejan para estar sobre los muros de las tus ciudades...", and "tus gentes contra tus gentes." Others point toward the particular conditions of Santillana's time, such as "mares cubiertos de navíos que querrán subjugar las tus riberas e puertos" and the "títulos ytálicos que engendraste en ti." The next section is built around Santillana's own vision of the future destruction of his country. Here, "veo" is used five times, again with both traditional and contemporary references. From the prophetic tradition: "veo antes los mis ojos [...] tus gentes desamparados [...] como ovejas sin pastor"; "veo entrar las tus ciudades e cativan las tus gentes"; "veo algunas de las tus sagradas yglesias establos de los infieles"; and "veo [...] tu abundancia en menguamiento, e tu riqueza en pobredat, e tu gloria en tristeza e terrible planto..." Specific to Santillana's Spain are references to "Mahomat enxalçado" and the "grandes

afflicções" of "la gloriosa situación de Ércules e famosa población de César..." The latter may refer either to Hispania as a whole or, more likely, to Seville.

The "Lamentación" also follows the fifteenth-century vogue of moral philosophy derived from Senecan stoic thought. The theme of life's changing fortunes is evident in the first words of the text: "Segunt los prinçipios de los mundanos demostramientos e varios acaesçimientos por la mudable fortuna comovidos..." It is also seen in the section following the "non vees" and "veo" expositions, in which Santillana provides further reflections on the changing situation of his country.

Esto te aviene porque convertiste tu verdat en
desfallescimiento, e tu fortaleza en enganyo, e tu
largueza en avariçia, e tu castedat en luxuria...
[...] Pluguiera a Dios que nunca fueras en tan
alto nombre, ni passaran por ti los tan grandes
fechos, ni fueras complida de tantas
bienaventuranças.

His recommendation is that his "dolorida Spanya" return to the "antigoas costumbres" in order to recover the grace of God. Sentiments similar to these were common in Santillana's time (included, as well, in other works of his), and were part of a generalized tendency to praise virtue and find

moral lessons from the past.³⁷ This concern is at the heart of Juan de Mena's Laberinto de la fortuna (1444). In Sánchez de Arévalo's Vergel de príncipes (1456) we also find a concern with "variable fortuna" or "temporal fortuna," although his work showed more distance from the medieval, cultural mentality of Santillana.³⁸ An almost literal echo of Santillana's words can be heard in the Doctrinal de príncipes (1476) of Diego de Valera: "¡Pluguiese a Dios que en nuestros días viésemos retornar aquellas antiguas costumbres..."³⁹ As might be expected, however, this work's later date of composition results in a less scholastic and more humanist outlook, informed of the considerable classical sources handled by the author.

Santillana's use of classical references is in keeping with his didactic purposes, and reveal also his patriotic posture. As noted above, Caesar and Hercules connote a more virtuous and heroic time in the life of Iberia, before the corruptions of Rome's civil war and those of the Roman empire. According to Santillana, Spain must look to "Nero e

³⁷ For more on the use of the classics for their exemplary value in Santillana, Villena, and Mena, see Di Camillo, El humanismo castellano 38-50 and 51, among other passages.

³⁸ Prosistas castellanos, prologue, 312.

³⁹ Diego de Valera, Prosistas castellanos, chapter 2, 182-83.

a los otros soberbiosos que en el universal circuytu imperaron e las obras e fines dellos..." This negative legacy had been inherited by the modern Italian powers, but taken over, in turn, by Spain: "...Ytal'ia çesso e tú quedaste, e en las maldades ytálicas tú eres poseedora e heredera." The solution offered is the wisdom of Santillana's classical and (especially) Christian sources, namely "temprança," "humildat," and "discreción." The scornful references to Italy must be taken as an expression of Santillana's nationalism; his deep criticism of Spain in this lamentatio must likewise be seen as an expression of patriotic concern, born of the social and political reality he observed. It is ultimately a lament concerned more with the community of his nation - a national civitas - rather than with its land or physical resources.

"La fortuna" and Merida. In Pedro de Corral's Crónica del rey don Rodrigo (ca. 1430) we find an encomiastic description of Merida inserted as a narrative pause before the conquest of that city by the Muslim invaders. The purpose of this passage, chapter 156, is evident from its title: "De cómo fabla del tamaño de Mérida, e de sus

noblezas, e de las cibdades e villas que le obedecían."⁴⁰

This encomium of Merida is based almost exclusively on the physical size and order of the city, offering these attributes as proof of greatness. Corral proceeds systematically, beginning with the circumference, height and width of the walls, then adding the gates and the large company of officers and footmen linked with each gate. The gates were clustered along the walls around each of the cardinal points, and four fortresses were placed in the gaps between these points. A fifth stood more grandly in the center of the city. Corral then describes the network of underground "caños" or drainage tubes, leading from the center outward, a system by which "no fallarían ninguna de las calles suzia." Once again at the city walls, Corral notes the impressive towers as well as additional tubes bringing water into the city. The physical description ends with the highly symmetrical layout of the churches within the city, their windmills serving as a point of departure for a new topic, the town's food supply. The "buena ordenança" of the city was maintained via deliveries of bread, wheat, barley, wine (red and white), sheep, cows and pigs, all arriving from the city's dependencies. Rents from

⁴⁰ Pedro de Corral, Crónica del rey don Rodrigo (Crónica sarracina), ed., intro. James Donald Fogelquist (Madrid: Clásicos

within Merida also maintained the city. A third and final section of the chapter contemplates the decline of Merida, how quickly its fate turned after its long rise to success: "...llegó a ser tal, e de tan poco valor como la menor villa que tovo por sí..." Corral concludes with a veritable paraphrase of the popular, fifteenth-century concern with the vicissitudes of fortune, as we have just seen in the nearly contemporary "Lamentación" of Santillana:

...digo que ninguno se deve tener por aquel que las gentes le dan la fama hasta que vea su fin si está en igual de su comienço, e aun ay deve poner duda, ca todas las cosas han de aver fin si no es celestial, empero duran más unas que otras.

In the same vein, Ángel Gómez Moreno has noted that "la Crónica es un producto típico del siglo XV en esa preocupación por una posible segunda destrucción de España."⁴¹

Castalia, 2001) part I, 271-73.

⁴¹ Ángel Gómez Moreno, España y la Italia de los humanistas. Primeros ecos (Madrid: Gredos, 1994). See especially chapter XVIII, "Mérida y la 'laus urbis.'" In an appendix he includes the text under discussion here, though the version used proceeds from an excerpted fragment of Corral's Crónica.

Gómez Moreno uses the encomium of Merida as a point of departure to trace the genre's fortune in Europe and in Spain. His references to the crossplay of manuscripts is typically agile and effective, but some amplifications and additions can be made. Mention should be made of the fact that city praise in Spain emerges from a strong medieval tradition of praise for Hispania as a whole, and would always coexist with this current, even in its humanist phase. The medieval Hispanic background cited by Gómez Moreno seems to be limited to certain minor passages on cities and towns from preachers' promptbooks, or the flattering adages and rhymes of juglares and trovadores. In fact, we have

It remains for us to briefly assess this encomium of Merida within the larger tradition of city praise. Gómez Moreno links Corral's many numerical descriptions (for heights, provisions, etc.) with the ancient and medieval texts of its kind, citing especially those written about Rome. He asserts that "la descripción [of Merida] sigue las pautas de las laudes urbium" (284). As we have seen in our review of many texts from the ancient and medieval eras, city praise assumed a variety of features and varied much in length and literary context. It will be useful, then, to affirm that the Merida praise does indeed present similarities with this broad tradition, but gaps, too. Most obviously, it uses ekphrasis to convey the physical setting of the city itself, complementing this extensive data with assessments such as "...Mérida fue muy grande e de grand fama según las cosas que oído havedes." This corresponds with the theoretical prescription (e.g. in Quintilian and Menander) that a city's situation be praised, although it must be noted that topography is entirely absent. Also

seen here in Chapters Four and Five that medieval city praise in Spain was considerably more substantial (e.g. for Seville and Roncesvalles, for Valencia, for the Andalucian cities of Pérez de Guzmán's Loores, etc.). The successful adoption of humanist city praise in Iberia was owed, in part, to the medieval precedents that had been underway in the Peninsula for more than two centuries, and not just to the Italian examples of Bruni, Manetti, Decembrio, et al. For more on this, see Chapter Six.

absent are the other two classically prescribed elements, origins and accomplishments. So only Merida's large size and advanced urban layout serve as the basis for its praise. As such the text is certainly connected to the long tradition of praising cities, as indicated by Gómez Moreno, but in truth it adheres only minimally to the "pautas" or established guidelines. It seems possible to pose a two-part reason for this. First, the text's purpose in the Crónica is not the praise of the city as an historical and living civitas, rather the aggrandizement of the urbs as a military target for Muça and his Muslim invaders. And second, Corral was no doubt only minimally aware of the full dimensions of the laus urbis genre. The result is a transitional work, a city encomium whose context within another text, and its incomplete features, qualify it as a medieval work, but whose exacting description of the physical city link it with the later humanists.⁴²

⁴² Gómez Moreno (284) notes Corral's interest (precocious for the setting of Spain) in measurement systems. This interest would be much developed in the second half of the fifteenth century, when humanists such as Joan Margarit, Jeroni Pau and Antonio de Nebrija came to appreciate Spain's archaeological past by way of Italian antiquarian treatises, such as those of Flavio Biondo.

City Encomia in Cancionero Poetry

Just as prose works praising cities disappeared during the first two-thirds of the fourteenth century, only rebounding later, so was the case with poetry. In fact, no verse praise of cities is recorded during the fourteenth century; only with the fifteenth would it return. As with prose encomia of this period, only the vernacular was used. Latin city encomia would be composed in both verse and in prose after the middle of the century, and in an increasingly humanist mode.

The sonnet for praise and censure. An echo of Santillana's concern with the moral degeneration of Spain as a nation, as seen in his prose "Lamentación," is found in his sonnet XVIII. Here he expresses the theme of changing fortunes, seen especially in the verses "Tu gloria e laude tornó vituperio/e la tu clara fama en escureza." These lines reveal the author's familiarity with the rhetorical modes of laudatio and vituperatio, and their traditional application in ethical judgments.

Santillana also exercises the genre of the vernacular laus urbis in his sonnet XXXII to Seville. The city is likened to Rome: "Roma en el mundo e vos en España,/soys solas çibdades çiertamente,/fermosa Yspalis, sola por

fazaña,/corona de Bética exçelente." The rest of the sonnet celebrates various attributes of Seville, including its "edificios," "clero," "reliquias," "braço militante cavallero," and its "patrones" ("Hércules," "Yspan" and "Julio"). Despite the modern literary form of this composition - the sonnet - its content reflects a solidly medieval concern with urban mythology and the ecclesiastical and noble classes.

The Heroic Cities of Fernán Pérez de Guzmán. Embittered by the political vagaries of his time, Pérez de Guzmán (1377-1460) responded to this crisis through literature, as did many of his contemporaries, who wrote verse compositions and prose tracts of a didactic nature. Like López de Ayala's Rimado de palacio before him and Manrique's Coplas por la muerte de su padre after, many of Pérez de Guzmán's works revolve around the themes of passing glory and the corruption and vanities of powerful men. However, his Loores de los claros varones de España (ca. 1450) constitutes an exception to this critical tone.⁴³ Its 409 octavas of arte menor are rigorously patriotic, and dedicated to a celebration of Spain through its most famous historical

⁴³ The text used here is Fernán Pérez de Guzmán, "Loores de los claros varones de España," Cancionero Castellano del siglo XV, ed. R. Foulché Delbosc, vol. 1 (Madrid: Bailly Bailliére, 1912).

protagonists, as stated in his introduction: "los loores he
 ditado/.../de nuestra patria e nacion" (st. 7) and "...algun
 bien es loar/los principes gloriosos,/e los sabios
 virtuosos" (st. 8). While the entire work can loosely be
 cast within the laus Hispaniae tradition, its focus is
 decentralized and is spread instead on the many components
 of Hispanic greatness, as each is taken up in chronological
 succession. No single praise of the Peninsula as a whole
 appears with any substantial length. In addition to Trajan,
 Hadrian, Fernando III, et al., certain individual cities
 appear as personalities in their own right, or as players,
 perhaps, on Pérez de Guzmán's stage of Hispanic history.
 These are praised in a variety of ways.

"De Zamora" (17-24) relates the heroic history of
 ancient Numancia, long associated with contemporary
 Zamora.⁴⁴ For Pérez de Guzmán Numancia was not so much a
 physical city as a community committed to independence from
 the Romans. In fact, it is praised exclusively for its valor

⁴⁴ Jeremy Lawrance explains that this spurious link, first
 recorded by Florus and then passed on by successive medieval
 authorities into the fifteenth century, would finally be
 disproved by Joan Margarit and Lucio Marineo Sículo. The latter
 correctly identified it with Soria. See Tres opúsculos de Nuño de
 Guzmán y Giannozzo Manetti: un episodio del proto-humanismo
 español, ed., intro. Jeremy N. H. Lawrance, (Salamanca:
 Diputación, 1989) 138-39n. Numancia would remain a fertile
 literary subject, as evidenced in its use by Guevara, Timoneda
 and, more famously, by Cervantes for his "La Numancia."

and love of liberty. In the siege that it endures to the death, Numancia is likened to ancient Carthage and Corinth. Rome, "que faze como pauon/por la gran gloria que toma/de la muerte de Caton" (24), suffers worse, since Numancia's act of civic extinction - "despues de joyas e bienes/en vn gran fuego quemados,/.../por cuchillos son librados" (19) - is followed by Calahorra, Siguenza and Caparra. The Loores is permeated by the medieval conception of a heroic, Gothic Hispania (a notion developed by fifteenth-century humanists, as well),⁴⁵ and the extent of scorn meted out accordingly for all things Roman may be seen in Pérez de Guzmán's dismissal of Virgil: "Vaya Virgilio cantando/su arma virumque cano,/proceso inutil e vano,/.../la poca e pobre substancia/con verbosidad ornando" (47). An exception is made in the case of Caesar, who, as the builder of Sevilla, merits a brief, positive notice.

Cordoba is praised as "otra Athenas" for its intellectuals, Seneca, Lucan, Averroes and "Rabi Moysen" (285-286). But Seville receives a more fully developed encomium, presented first upon its conquest by the Moors as "flor de Leon e Castilla,/Hispalis, despues Seuilla,/magnifica e delectosa" (287). A review of four major

⁴⁵ See Tate's essay "Mitología en la historiografía española," in Ensayos 13-32.

personalities associated with the city - Hercules, Caesar, Leandro and Isidore - and their accomplishments is followed by a series of adjectives directed at Seville: "notable," "cauallerosa," "fertil e abundosa," "dulce e tan delectable" (290). Here Pérez de Guzmán resorts to a topos used by many other encomiasts before him, among them Aelius Aristides for Smyrna. About to describe the reconquest of Seville, he ponders the very nature of speaking, and the proper way to express his praise: "Tres maneras de fablar/me paresce auer fallado/..." (294-295).⁴⁶ After recounting the Christian reconquest of Seville by Fernando III, the poet proceeds to the principle encomium of the city (300-306). These stanzas relate topography ("La su prouincia posee/el gran Oceano mar/..."), eight surrounding cities of note (Cordoua, Murcia, Jaén, etc.), size and climate ("Sesenta leguas allende/contiene la su longura/.../abril e la primavera/relatan su fermosura"), abundance ("Es fertil e populosa/.../lleno de naues su sable;/.../seis mil ombres a cauallo/la fazen tan orgullosa"), natural products ("Azeyte,

⁴⁶ Pérez de Guzmán would not have known Aristides's oration for Smyrna, but clearly participates in the same vein of rhetoric. Aristides's reflections were similarly aimed at exalting his city by questioning the capacity of language itself to convey its grandeur: "For our city speaking must be approached in a different way than for other peoples. [...] our claims would fall short of all the sights which we can provide." It can be noted that this topos is distinct from another related one that calls into question the capacity of the orator himself.

vino e grana,/pan e carne e saluagina/..."), and its seductive nature (a paradoxical virtue: "...conviene a los nouicios/abstener e aver temprança:/ quien sin freno alli se lança/durante las jouentudes,/de las morales virtudes/dubdo que guie la dança").⁴⁷ Seville's Christian devotion is indicated a bit later when Fernando el Santo asks to be buried there: "Señor, que la alma mia/pongas en la compañía/del pueblo que a ti sirvio" (315). In all, the praise of Seville in the Loores covers the traditional three aspects of a city encomium. Physical setting is most fully treated, and spare details are provided for the founder and origins (Hercules and Caesar) and the city's accomplishments (Leander and Isidore, and the historical conquest and reconquest).

The last city praised in the Loores is Valencia. In three stanzas (319-321) two aspects are noted: topography

⁴⁷ For María Rosa Lida de Malkiel, this passage resonates so much with the generally didactic character of Pérez de Guzmán as to make the rest of his encomium to Sevilla insincere: "...pero no la ve en su belleza, sino como sirte peligrosa para los jóvenes. [...] [E]n lo receloso de su elogio aparece su típica actitud moralizante y ascética." However, given the fullness and enthusiastic language of the Seville encomium, it seems more reasonable to suppose that the praise is as genuine as it may be in the rest of the Loores. Pérez de Guzmán's moralistic warning to the youth may well have been inevitable, given his outlook, but it can hardly be read to vitiate several preceding stanzas. See María Rosa Lida de Malkiel, "La ciudad, tema poético de tono juglaresco en el Cancionero de Baena," in Estudios sobre la literatura española del siglo XV (Madrid: Porrúa, n.d.) 333-37; here 335-36.

(...fermosa/e gran cibdad de Valencia/.../que muchas villas abarca/e tiene en su pertenencia") and civic institutions. The latter is fairly complete, and reflects the well-known governmental qualities of Valencia that Eiximenis had incorporated into his ideal city:

...egregia e aspectable
por su colegio honorable
de muy nobles militantes,
e de ricos mercadantes,
decorada e venerable.

Administrada e regida
Con tanta ciuilidad
Como jamas fue cibdad,
Bien ordenada e polida,
De justicia proueida
Quanto cibdad se fallo.

Pérez de Guzmán's praise of Numancia, Cordoba, Seville and Valencia are examples not of independent city encomia, but of city praise used selectively, and effectively, to bolster the overall patriotic purpose of the Loores. It is yet another example of the Hispanic tendency to link praise of city to praise of nation, a natural phenomenon for the political structure of the Iberian kingdoms, but one very different from that seen in the Italian city-states.

Seville as "vergel". Four cantigas honoring Seville, all of them by Alfonso Álvarez de Villasandino (1370-ca.

1424), are found in the Cancionero de Baena (ca. 1430).⁴⁸

All are of the same metrical features - four octavas of arte menor - and each refers to some of the traditional elements of city praise, adapted to the circumstances of Seville. The first (number 28) calls the city "Fuente de grant maravilla,/jardín de dulç olor/morada de emperador"; it praises the beauty and abundance of the four elements, won by "el sancto Rey don Ferrando"; cites Seville as the city "a quien Dios bien quiere e quiso"; and offers general praise of the city's character and aspect ("Claridat e discreçión/.../grant limpieza e loçanía").

Number 29 may be more properly considered a city encomium in miniature, since it contains most of the basic elements: Hercules and Caesar built and populated the city; among the Sevillanos one finds "proeza e muy grant brío/Viçio, e prez e amorío,/lealtança e lindo amor"; its natural resources are incomparable ("de tantos bienes complida;/abondada e guarneçida/de infinitos plazer"); and a final exhortation urges loyalty by the king to his city.

Villasandino's third poem to Sevilla (number 30) rests on an allegory of the city as "señora/de las çibdades de España," peerless even among Barcelona, Valencia, Granada

⁴⁸ These are cited by Lida de Malkiel. For the texts, see Cancionero de Juan Alfonso de Baena, eds. Brian Dutton and

and Lisbon. Her resources include "huertas," "prados" and a "puerto por do enriquesçistes." "Ricosomnes ensalçados" are her progeny, and she is depicted finally in the language of courtly love as "vergel de mu grant folgança,/donde Amor fue coronado/e floresçe su alabança." The beauty of her "dueñas" and "donzellas" complete the paradisiacal scene.

This same allegory is carried further in Villasandino's last cantiga to Seville, number 31. The city is "Paraíso terrenal," "sobre çimiento leal/es fundado vuestro muro."⁴⁹ Here the city's offspring are the lovely ladies and maidens, mentioned twice. A fifth stanza alludes to a missing "flor de grant valía," apparently a personal reference.

One other poem of the Cancionero de Baena belongs to the group of four surveyed above. It is the dezir of Pero Vélez de Guevara, probably composed not long after his 1402 expulsion from the city. His Seville is una "dueña garrida" who suffers from the loss of "su diestro braço," presumably the poet. She is almost speechless before the poet, crying only "... 'Fortuna/assí van las cosas segunt que tú quieres.'" Her pains are like those of a woman in labor, "sus voces agudas con grant apellido/los çielos paresçe que

Joaquín González Cuenca (Madrid: Visor, 1993).

⁴⁹ In the seventeenth century Luis de Góngora would develop a similar allegory, that of a woman as a temple, in his sonnet "De pura honestidad templo sagrado."

ivan rompiendo." The final verse may allude to the poet's own desire to be reinstated; Sevilla says "Non puede grant tiempo durar todo aquesto."

Two other cantigas cited by Lida de Malkiel deserve mention. Number 502, by Diego de Valencia de León, invokes the topos condemning country-life, but without explicitly exalting the city: "De los maleficios/eres grant abrigo,/robos e boliçios,/muy poco castigo." By way of contrast, number 305 by Pero Ferruz praises life in the sierra, not mainly for its ideal qualities but for the valor its hardships induce : "Si de los fríos e lodos/él [Alfonso XI] tomara tan grand ira,/non ganara Algezira." This topos of the country versus the city, rooted in the "beatus ille" of Horace's "Epode II," was also echoed by the Marqués de Santillana in the well known stanzas of his Comedieta de Ponza: "Benditos aquellos que con el açada/sustentan su vida e biven contentos..."⁵⁰ This theme would be revived more completely in Spain during the sixteenth century with works such as the Menosprecio de corte y alabanza de aldea (1539) of Antonio de Guevara.⁵¹

⁵⁰ Íñigo López de Mendoza (Marqués de Santillana), Comedieta de Ponza, sonetos, serranillas y otras obras, ed., intro., prol. Regula Rohland de Langbehn, intro. Vicente Beltrán (Barcelona: Crítica, 1997) 121-44.

⁵¹ For an edition of this work and an essay on the country vs. city theme (including related Iberian and European texts),

Granada in Juan de Mena. The contribution of Juan de Mena (1411-56) to the literature of city encomia is minor. His two décimas to Granada lean entirely on the splendors of the physical city. The poem opens with two topoi, one on the inexpressibility of the subject ("¡Granada, quién la supiesse/bien comparar, pues que cabe!") and the next on the need to see it in order to describe it ("Creo que, si no se viesse,/que dezir no se pudiesse"). The body of the poem is a series of six comparisons between aspects of Granada and those of ancient Troy: "Sanct Fe es el Tenedón/y la Vega, la Simoya,/la ciudad es como Troya/y el Alhambra, el Ilión/..." A celebrated image from the Alhambra's Patio of the Lions closes the composition: "doze leones reales/por sus bocas perenales/toda la ciudad aurizan/..." As is evident, Mena's primary rhetorical tool for ennobling Granada is the comparatio, long used by writers wishing to exalt their cities.

In closing this section, and with it the chapter, we can observe that another cancionero poet associated with the reign of Alfonso V of Aragon, Diego del Castillo, employed the technique of writing a poem in the female voice of his

see Antonio de Guevara, Menosprecio de corte y alabanza de aldea, ed., intro. Francisco Márquez Villanueva (Santander: Universidad de Cantabria, 1998). See also the edition by Asunción Rallo Gruss (Madrid: Cátedra, 1984).

king's royal city, Naples.⁵² Such a use of prosopopoeia also appears (quite briefly) in the romance fronterizo "Abenámar y el rey don Juan," in which Granada, marvelous for its shining castles and unequaled Generalife gardens, speaks as the faithful wife of the city's Moorish ruler. But Castillo's composition is far more elaborate.⁵³ His "Parténope la fulgente" (1458) was composed as an epistolary poem in which the city delivers the news of the death of the Magnánimo to his wife, Maria. The city professes also to grieve the loss of the monarch; she is, by turn, "amarga ciudat cativa" and "ciudat mesquina." Before Alfonso's death, "era tanta mi valía/que qualquiera que me vía/grant

⁵² For this text and very complete commentary, see Diego del Castillo, "Parténope la fulgente. Una elegía epistolar a la muerte del Magnánimo," ed., study Lourdes Simó Goberna, LEMIR, no. 3, 15 Jan. 2002 <<http://parnaseo.uv.es/Lemir/Revista/Revista3/Lourdes/>>.

⁵³ In Western literature the city as woman (princess, wife, widow, lover, etc.) can be seen as early as in some Biblical passages (e.g. Lamentations 1.1-2) and throughout classical and medieval times in works such as Gregory's lament for Rome, Hildebert's De excidio Troiae, and the quattrocento poet Landolfo de Lamberto's poem on Naples, "Napoli, benché 'l mio lamento è indarno." For these references and additional bibliography, see Lourdes Simó Goberna, "Una elegía epistolar a la muerte del Magnánimo." On the female characterization of Rome during the Avignon papacy, see Diana Wood, Clement VI. The Pontificate and Ideas of an Avignon Pope (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989). For the topos as occasionally found in the Hispanic romancero (e.g. "Abenámar"), and for its apparent origins in Arabic literature, see Ramón Menéndez Pidal, "Estudios sobre el Romancero," Obras completas, vol. 11 (Madrid: Espasa-Calpe, 1973) 34-35. For the same topos in the context of Portugal under the Philips, see the many documents cited by Fernando Bouza Álvarez,

princesa me llamava." Parténope (a classical siren associated with Naples) has now lost her strength and defense, the city wall itself: "Yo pierdo tan rico muro/qual jamás podré cobrar." Beyond these brief references to the city, and its very protagonism, the poem relies little upon the realities of Naples as an urbs and a civitas. It stands, nonetheless, as literary testimony to the importance of the Aragonese royal city in the mid-fifteenth century.

By this time several humanist laudes urbium had been written for Italian cities. The cultural and political links between Italy and Spain would subsequently allow for the adaptation of the genre to Spanish cities. This classically-inspired, humanist version of city praise in Italy and Spain will be addressed in Chapter Six.

"Lisboa Sozinha, Quase Viúva. A Cidade e a Mudança da Corte no Portugal dos Filipes," Penelope 13 (1995): 71-93.

CHAPTER SIX

THE EARLY HUMANIST LAUS URBIS AND ITS ADAPTATION IN SPAINCity Praise of the Humanist Era: The State of the
Scholarship

Despite the longstanding absence of critical attention to the literary-historical phenomenon of city praise, during the last thirty-five years a number of useful studies have appeared. These have focused on the early humanist revival of the laus urbis, especially the seminal Laudatio Florentine urbis (1404) of Leonardo Bruni, as well as the legacy engendered by Bruni's work.

The genre's transition between the medieval and humanist periods was treated in three studies. The first, by Joseph R. Berrigan focused on the many city descriptions of Benzo d'Alessandria (written ca. 1320, and attending especially to the foundation of Northern Italian cities).¹ A

¹ Berrigan cites the encyclopedic and universalist nature of Benzo's Chronicon as evidence, among other factors, of its medieval nature. Its approximation to the humanist texts that would appear at the beginning of the next century is seen in

few years later Paul Gerhard Schmidt contrasted the typical strategies employed by medieval and humanist writers in their descriptive and laudatory texts, noting especially a tendency to move from concrete detail toward rhetorical flourish.² In another article, a tentative list of ten medieval French laudes urbium from the eleventh through the fourteenth centuries was compiled by Dario Cecchetti, who observed the generalized lack of modern editions for these works. He cites them as background for the main subject of his article, Nicholas de Clamanges's humanistic city praises of Langres (1398), Nice (1404) and Genoa (1405).³ It appears that, after Clamanges, no other laudes urbium were written for French cities during the fifteenth century.

Benzo's critical eye and judicious use of ancient sources when proposing the founding circumstances of cities. See Joseph R. Berrigan, "Benzo d'Alessandria and the Cities of Northern Italy," Studies in Medieval and Renaissance History, vol. 4, ed. William M. Bowsky (Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press, 1967) 127-92.

² Schmidt showcased the city of Milan. In his view, Bonvesin de la Riva's De magnalibus (1288) was based essentially on descriptio while Decembrio's Panegyricus was shorter on fact but framed fundamentally as declamatio. In several footnotes Schmidt also provides a collection of references to the many Northern European medieval texts containing city praise. See Paul Gerhard Schmidt, "Mittelalterliches und humanistisches Städtelob," Die Rezeption der Antike. Zum Problem der Kontinuität zwischen Mittelalter und Renaissance, ed. August Buck (Hamburg: Hauswedell, 1981) 119-28.

³ Dario Cecchetti, "'Descriptio loci' e 'laudatio urbis'." Persistenza e rinnovamento di strutture retoriche nell'opera di Nicolas de Clamanges, Annali Istituto Universitario Orientale, Napoli, Sezione Romanza 35.2 (July 1993): 381-431.

A 1402 laudatio of Venice by the early humanist Pier Paolo Vergerio was edited by David Robey and John Law, who showed the dependence of this unfinished text on at least four earlier works from the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries (including one by Benzo d'Alessandria).⁴

On Bruni's praise of Florence, recent studies by James Hankins appear to have laid to rest the literary quarrel between Hans Baron and Jerrold Seigel.⁵ Hankins has deftly shown that Baron and Seigel were seeing two sides of the same coin, specifically, that Bruni had indeed sincerely assumed the role of an educated man in service to his society (in keeping with the dictates and example of Cicero), and that this role included some rhetorical exercises that amounted to political propaganda. Hankins proposes that the term "civic humanism" may be of little use, since the very nature of humanist ideology embraced the

⁴ Collectively these texts - Vergerio's and the four earlier ones - are evidence for Robey and Law of the need to conceive of the much vaunted myth of Venice as being forged well before the sixteenth century. See David Robey and John Law, "The Venetian Myth and the 'De Republica Veneta' of Pier Paolo Vergerio," Rinascimento, 2nd series, 15 (1975): 3-57.

⁵ See Hans Baron, The Crisis of the Early Italian Renaissance (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1955); Jerrold E. Seigel, "'Civic Humanism' or Ciceronian Rhetoric? The Culture of Petrarch and Bruni," Past & Present 34 (July 1966): 3-48; and Baron's "A Defense of the View of the Quattrocento First Offered in The Crisis of the Early Italian Renaissance" in his In Search of Florentine Civic Humanism, 2 vols. (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1988).

Ciceronian program of a civically engaged, politicized orator. Seen in context, then, Bruni's personal aspirations to succeed Salutati as Chancellor, and his exaggerations regarding Florence, need not be seen just as evidence of the self-serving behavior of a rising orator (as Seigel would have it), nor as just the fervent commitment of a republican idealist (as Baron saw it). Instead, both views are complementary.⁶

On the sources for Bruni's work itself, the introduction and critical apparatus of the most recent edition indicate the full range of classical, medieval and contemporary citations employed.⁷ Notably, these include the Invectiva in Antonium Luschum Vicentinum, a pro-Florentine

⁶ Hankins's first contribution toward a clear reading of Bruni and his texts (see his Plato in the Italian Renaissance (Leiden: Brill, 1990) 367-78) was to discover with near certainty the proper date - summer of 1404 - for the composition of the Laudatio. This affirmed and refined the date suggested by Baron. Then, in a 2000 essay he explained the complementary nature of rhetoric and civic ideals within the context of fifteenth-century Florence: "...Historians need only recognize that Bruni's culture tolerated greater latitude with the truth in the interests (at least sometimes) of edification" (168-69); "[R]hetoric is simply a tool whereby the humanist may compass his ends, many of them no doubt good and admirable" (169). See "Rhetoric, history, and ideology: the civic panegyrics of Leonardo Bruni," Renaissance Civic Humanism. Reappraisals and Reflections, ed. James Hankins (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000) 143-78.

⁷ Leonardo Bruni, Laudatio Florentine urbis, ed., intro. Stefano U. Baldassarri (Florence: Sismel, 2000).

precedent authored by Bruni's elder and mentor Salutati.⁸ Bruni's openly-stated reliance on the second-century Panathenaicus of Aelius Aristides, and also his innovations on it, were delineated in an article by Antonio Santosuosso, who offered some refinements of Baron's interpretation.⁹ Further modifications of Baron's analysis were made in a study by Robert Buranello, who analyzed the dual nature of Bruni's role (rhetorical and civic), the same topic that Hankins would later take up in a more comprehensive manner, as described above.¹⁰

Other articles in recent years extend their chronological reach into the mid- and late-fifteenth century, often tracing the influence of Bruni's Laudatio upon subsequent texts of the same genre, or of other textual

⁸ With brief introduction, text and Italian translation in Prosatori Latini del Quattrocento, ed. Eugenio Garin (Milan & Naples: Riccardo Ricciardi, 1962) 3-37.

⁹ Antonio Santosuosso, "Leonardo Bruni Revisited: A Reassessment of Hans Baron's Thesis on the Influence of the Classics in the Laudatio Florentinae urbis," Aspects of Late Medieval Government. Essays Presented to J. R. Lander, ed. J. G. Rowe (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1986) 25-51.

¹⁰ Buranello also ventures into a symbolic reading of circles, squares and labyrinths in the Laudatio, although it does not seem clear that such symbolism was intended by Bruni. See Robert Buranello, "The Structure and Strategy of Leonardo Bruni's Laudatio Florentinae Urbis," Quaderni d'Italianistica 16:1 (Spring 1995): 17-31.

interactions.¹¹ Clamanges's carefully wrought verse encomium of Genoa, nearly contemporaneous with Bruni's work, apparently circulated very little and had correspondingly little impact. Regarding the first of the literary offspring of Bruni's Laudatio - the 1435-36 panegyric to Milan by Pier Candido Decembrio - the analysis by Antonio Lanza indicates many points of convergence, as well as elements of originality.¹² Antonio Stäuble likewise reviews Decembrio's text (after passing through those of Bonvesin and Bruni), noting also its influence upon the 1438 laudatory description of Basel by Piccolomini and the latter text's impact upon a 1494 city praise of Brunswick.¹³ A study of the Basel praise by Berthe Widmer demonstrated a close correspondence between Piccolomini's text and Bruni's; the

¹¹ The most comprehensive article available as a guide to humanist city praise is Hermann Goldbrunner, "Laudatio urbis. Zu neueren Untersuchungen über das humanistische Städtelob," Quellen und Forschungen aus italienischen Archiven und Bibliotheken 63 (1983): 313-28. As a tangent to this discussion, Goldbrunner briefly observes that an act of city praise was often a part of the founding of a university during the fourteenth century, citing the cases of Erfurt and Perpignan (326-27).

¹² Antonio Lanza, Firenze contro Milano. Gli intellettuali fiorentini nelle guerre con i Visconti (1390-1440) (Roma: De Rubeis, 1991) 136-53.

¹³ Antonio Stäuble, "Due panegirici di città tra medioevo e rinascimento," Bibliothèque d'Humanisme et Renaissance, vol. 38 (Geneva: Librairie Droz, 1976) 157-64. The laudatio of Brunswick by Thilemann Rasche is apparently only available in the edition Descriptio belli inter Henricos iuniorem et seniore duces Brunsvic et Luneburg civitatemque Brunsvic in Scriptores Brunsvic, vol. 2 (Hannover: G. G. Leibnitius, 1710) 88-91.

latter had in fact been circulated (and copied) at the Council of Basel, where Piccolomini most likely drew from it.¹⁴ The twin panegyrics of Genoa written by Giannozzo Manetti in 1436 and 1437-42, influenced by Bruni on Florence and by Petrarch on Genoa, appear not to have received any additional critical attention since they first appeared in a 1974 edition.¹⁵ An English manifestation of this line of Bruni-inspired city panegyrics, written by Thomas Chaundler ca. 1450-60 for the cities of Bath and Wells, has only been studied in a limited way.¹⁶

Christine Smith, an architectural historian, has studied the genesis and development of the laus urbis in the

¹⁴ Berthe Widmer, "Enea Silvios Lob der Stadt Basel und seine Vorlagen," Basler Zeitschrift für Geschichte und Altertumskunde 58/59 (1959) 111-38. An edition and German translation by Widmer is found in Enea Silvio Piccolomini: Papst Pius II. Ausgewählte Texte aus seinen Schriften (Basel & Stuttgart, 1960) 348-71; another in Basel, intro. Edgar Bonjour (Basel: Holbein, 1951) 35-45. A French translation of a 1434 letter describing Basel, also by Piccolomini, is found in Voyage en Suisse, eds., trans. Claude Reichler and Roland Ruffieux (Paris: Robert Laffont, 1998) 47-53.

¹⁵ Although both texts praise the Genoese people and their recent recovery of self-governance from the Milanese Visconti, the first of the two is largely an historical summary of those recent events, while the second fits the more traditional profile of a laus urbis. See Giannozzo Manetti, Laudatio Ianuensium, ed., trans. Giovanna Petti Balbi (Milan: Marzorati, 1974).

¹⁶ An unpublished, Oxford University undergraduate thesis by Shirley Bridges (ca. 1930) contains the text of this work, the Libellus de laudibus duarum civitatum. Brief reference to this study appears in E. F. Jacobs, "Introduction," Italian Renaissance Studies. A tribute to the late Cecilia M. Ady, ed. E. F. Jacob (London: Faber and Faber, 1960) 40-41.

early Quattrocento as a phenomenon intimately linked to the figure of Manuel Chrysoloras, who brought the Byzantine ekphrastic and encomiastic literary tradition to his students in Florence at the close of the fourteenth century.¹⁷ Specifically, Smith has recognized the importance of the Second Sophistic texts - and not the earlier philosophical works of Greek antiquity, so popular in the Latin West - for the later Byzantine intellectuals such as Chrysoloras. Accordingly, she notes that Bruni's Laudatio depended not only on the well-known model of Aristides's Panathenaicus, but also on his oration to Rome, and to Libanius's praise of Antioch. The latter circulated very widely during the fifteenth century, and impacted also Guarino Veronese, to whom Smith ascribes the first humanist criticism on the very genre of the laus urbis. Smith's attention to the Byzantine and Second Sophistic impact on the genre in Italy includes a translation of Chrysoloras's own Greek city praise of 1411, the Comparison of Old and New Rome. This text, which depicted Rome as the dignified mother

¹⁷ This information is found in Christine Smith, Architecture in the Culture of Early Humanism. Ethics, Aesthetics, and Eloquence, 1400-1470 (New York & Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992). All three sections of the book are relevant to the overall concerns of city praise, but the third ("Eloquence") is especially informative here. See Chapters 7-9, titled "Byzantine Learning and Renaissance Eloquence," "Manuel Chrysoloras's Comparison of Old and New Rome," and "The Recovery of Eloquence and a Problem in Historiography."

of Constantinople, saw a Latin translation in 1444 by Francesco Aleardo.¹⁸

The early humanist city praise as represented by Bruni, Decembrio, Piccolomini and Manetti spanned the years 1404 through 1442. The genre would change considerably in the following decades. Smith observes that after mid-century this model of city praise mutated into a variety of treatises describing architectural treasures or building projects whose glories redounded to the prestige of a particular leader. Examples of these include Antonio Averlino's Sforzinda (1461-64, to Milan's Sforza), Lodrisio Crivelli's In Laudem Pientiae Civitatis (1464), honoring Pius II's reworking of his hometown of Corsignano) and Francesco Corna's Fioretto (1477, to the Verona of the podestà Federico Cornaro).¹⁹ This change may be seen also as a movement away from the praise of a public place - the city itself - and toward the celebration of private, less civic

¹⁸ As cited in Philip Jacks, The Antiquarian and the Myth of Antiquity. The Origins of Rome in Renaissance Thought (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993) 73.

¹⁹ For more on Corna see Rino Avesani, "In laudem civitatis Veronae," Studi Storici Veronesi Luigi Simeoni 26/27 (1976-77): 183-97; especially 187-88. On other Veronese eulogies, see G. P. Marchi, "Forma Veronae. L'immagine della città nella letteratura medioevale e umanistica," Ritratto di Verona. Lineamenti di una storia urbanistica, ed. L. Puppi (Verona, 1978) 1-21.

sites, such as those private homes that form the core of Benedetto Dei's Descrizione di Firenze.²⁰

A concomitant change was that these tracts were increasingly cast in poetry rather than prose, as panegyric was becoming more recognized for its kinship with the kind of imaginative invention typically found in verse. A corollary of this was that prose writing on cities and monuments was now less panegyric in nature; instead, prose was commonly used as a vehicle for the expression of (1) a more neutral and sober ekphrasis (e.g. Piccolomini's Descriptio urbis Viennensis (mid-1450s) and Francesco Bandini's 1476? description of Naples);²¹ (2) a more objective history-writing (e.g. Bruni's own Historiae florentine populi, finished in 1441?); and (3) the new interest in antiquarianism.

Philip Jacks's 1992 book tracks antiquarianism as a central feature of Quattrocento thought, especially as regards Rome and its renewal. A cluster of writings - Flavio Biondo's Roma Instaurata (1446-48), Poggio's De varietate

²⁰ Smith 194.

²¹ For Vienna, see E. S. Piccolomini, Vienna nel '400, dalla Historia Friderici III imperatoris, nel testo latino e l'italiano a fronte, trans., pref. Baccio Ziliotto (Trieste: Zibaldone, 1958). On Naples, see the edition and study in P. O. Kristeller, "An Unpublished Description of Naples by Francesco Bandini," Studies in Renaissance Thought and Letters (Rome, 1969) 395-410.

fortunae (1447-48), Giovanni Tortelli's De orthographia ("Rhoma," 1448-51), and Leon Battista Alberti's Descriptio urbis Romae (ca. 1450) and De re aedificatoria (1452) - testify to the new impulse to locate the physical remains of the ancient city and reimagine its reality, thereby imbuing the present with the greatness of the past.²²

This survey of recent scholarship has shown that Bruni's model for the laus urbis began to fade by the mid-fifteenth century, evolving into (1) the less civic-oriented panegyrics of cities or buildings that were often composed as propaganda for major rulers, and increasingly written in verse; and (2) the more objective treatises on the history, architecture and archaeology of Rome and other cities, aimed at establishing a reliable record of a laudable past, and intended to project current greatness toward the future.

Only one other post-Bruni development in city praise need be discussed to complete the picture of the genre in fifteenth-century Italy. No study appears to have been made of this phenomenon, but the following, brief summary will suffice.

During the fifteenth century poetry became an independent subject of study in the humanist schools, no

²² See especially his chapter "Urbs or Civitas? The Humanists' Debate."

longer a subsection of grammar or rhetoric. The genre of the epigram or short elegy was favored at this time, and among the subjects treated were cities. Especially popular was the theme of the antiquity and ruined state of cities, already seen in medieval lament-poems such as that of Hugh of Orleans on Troy, and fortified in Petrarch's reflections on ancient Rome. Examples are Gianni Vitalis's "De Roma," Jacopo Sannazaro's "Ad ruinas Cumarum, urbis vetustissimae," Piccolomini's "Oblectat me, Roma, tuas spectare ruinas," Cristoforo Landino's "Et cunctis rebus instant sua fata creatis" (for Rome), Giovanni Cotta's "Ad Veronam," and Conrad Celtis's "De antiquitate Treveris, ad cives." Sannazaro also celebrated the Venice of his own day in a widely appreciated epigram, "De mirabili urbe Venetiis." The city-epigram tradition remained vigorous into the sixteenth century, as well.

This survey can close by noting that the scholarship on non-Italian city praise of the fifteenth century is slim. In the first place, one must note that relatively few city encomia appear to have been written outside Italy. After Clamanges in France only one other laus urbis is recorded for a French city, and this was the rather inferior Latin

poem of 1451 by the Italian Antonio Astesano.²³ William Hammer's unpublished dissertation (1937) is the only critical study to focus on the Northern and Central European humanist city praise. The textual tradition there included a few noteworthy laudes which surely deserve additional study, especially with regard to the Italian models: Albrecht von Eyb on Bamberg (1452), the French humanist Robert Gauguin on Heidelberg (1490s), and Conrad Celtis on Nuremberg (1495). During the sixteenth century the humanist laus urbis would appear more frequently in the northern countries.

Our survey of the non-Italian texts will be complete now with a reference to Iberia, where several laudes urbium were written during the second half of the fifteenth century. The literary output of Iberia seems in this respect not dissimilar to that of the Germanic region, although certainly the contacts maintained by Iberian humanists with their Italian counterparts were accompanied by much more intimate political, theological and commercial relationships. The lack of scholarly attention to Iberian city praises of the fifteenth century has, of course, been one of the motivating factors behind the present study. The

²³ Astesano did leave many short and impressionistic poems on the cities of France and Northern Italy, in the tradition of the fourth-century Gaul Ausonius. See Hammer 102-03, 108-10.

few articles by Kagan and Gómez Moreno present quite useful information on the texts in this group, and a few other studies have been made on individual texts. These more specific studies will be listed later in this chapter as each of the texts is introduced. It is hoped that the analysis undertaken here on these Spanish laudes urbium can begin to fill the need for a closer inspection of them, adding to a broader understanding of humanist genres in the Iberian Peninsula.

Defining the Genre: Three Essential Components of the Early Humanist Laus Urbis

The foregoing survey has shown that a number of very useful studies of the fifteenth-century laudes urbium in Europe have been written. Still, no systematic assessment has ever been made of these texts. Critics such as Baron, Seigel, Staubel, Santosuosso, Buranelli, and Cecchetti have commonly spoken of Bruni, Decembrio, Piccolomini and Manetti as being the principal early exponents of this humanist genre (with Bruni, Decembrio and Piccolomini receiving the lion's share of attention), and sometimes provide very close and fruitful readings of literary strategies. Typically this analysis is aimed at showing direct transfer from Aristides

to Bruni, or from Bruni to Decembrio, or Bruni to Piccolomini. Nonetheless, little method has been articulated for identifying a laus urbis as a distinctly humanist work, that is, for declaring the essential components of the genre in humanist times. Although by now no doubt seems to remain that the laudes urbium in question here (for Florence, Milan, Basel and Genoa) are genuinely humanist in nature, the foundation for this certainty has been left unarticulated.

In this section, then, we will take a step toward the development of a more detailed assessment of the humanist laus urbis. A relatively straightforward methodology can be employed. First, we can recognize that critical attention to the four texts described in the pages above (Bruni through Manetti) has established beyond reasonable doubt that all were inspired by humanist principles. Second, upon closer examination, each of these works appears to contain three essential components - traditional content, rhetorical sophistication and political motivation - that are not seen together in prior, medieval texts. These circumstances allow us, therefore, to conclude that these three elements constitute the basic criteria of the humanist city encomium.

In the next sections the three components will be taken up one by one to demonstrate their presence in the four

texts at issue. A collective profile of the laus urbis genre in early humanist times can thus be comfortably established, offering more clarity and specificity than now exists in the many studies cited in the previous section. It should be noted that our brief analysis below could indeed be deepened for each text to provide an even more finely nuanced portrait. But our aim, for the moment, is to arrive at a useful outline of the genre in order that it may be applied in turn to the case of Spain.

Five Spanish texts appear to be candidates for consideration as humanist laudes urbium. These texts - for Cordoba, Seville, Barcelona, Valencia and Alcañiz - have been scrutinized less than the Italian texts of Bruni and his imitators, and are in greater need of assessment and classification. This evaluation will be made later in this chapter. Once complete, that profile can serve in turn as foundation for a future study of the genre as it was practiced in Iberia during the sixteenth century and beginning of the seventeenth.

First Criterion: Traditional Content

Perhaps the most essential feature of the humanist city encomium is its fulfillment of the ancient tendency to

describe and praise a city for its origins, achievements and setting, a tendency that was seen only partially in most medieval city encomia. We remember that Quintilian (Inst. Orat. 3.7.26 ff.) had established that cities could be praised in this way, noting that, like people, they had their origins and accomplishments over time, and that, additionally, their physical setting (topography, climate, etc.) had to be taken into account. This prescription was then applied quite successfully by Aelius Aristides in his encomia of Athens, Smyrna and other cities of Asia Minor, and in that of Antioch by Libanius. The Antiochikos has been qualified by Christine Smith as "the most elaborate panegyric to a city ever written" (157).

Therefore, when we refer now to a criterion of "traditional content" it is to these seminal works that we look. They are the texts that realize most completely the guidelines of Quintilian and those of the late third century by Menander. And not least, they were the texts that Chrysoloras introduced to his Florentine students, one of whom, Bruni, then imitated them. The specific details of origins, accomplishments and setting for each text were previously presented in our Chapter Two.

How is this imitation evident in the Latin adaptations composed by Bruni and his followers? Bruni's own text amply

fulfills the model. It treats extensively the topic of the foundation of Florence (origins), its buildings, virtues in war and constitution (accomplishments), and its geography between mountain and plain, with a mild climate (setting). Santosuosso notes that "the major debt that Bruni's *Laudatio* owes Aristides is in the conceptual structure...", a broad realm that encompasses, first and foremost, its content (44).

The first successor to Bruni's Laudatio was the De laudibus Mediolanensium urbis panegyricus of Pier Candido Decembrio.²⁴ Urged on by Valla, who had been offended by Bruni's non-objective treatment of Florentine history in the Laudatio, and probably wishing to promote Milan's candidacy as the next location for the Council of Basel, Decembrio composed in 1435-36 a response to Bruni, using many of Bruni's own strategies. His content fell neatly within the three-part tradition: Milan was founded by the Celtic prince Belloveso and, contradicting Bruni, he notes that an early connection to republican Rome did not automatically guarantee all such cities lasting fame through history. Milan, nonetheless, has been rightfully called "secunda

²⁴ Pier Candido Decembrio, "Il De laudibus Mediolanensium urbis panegyricus," ed. and intro. Giuseppe Petraglione, Archivio Storico Lombardo, 4th ser., 8 (1907): 5-45.

Roma." The accomplishments of the city include the battlefield exploits against the barbarians, and more recently the naval victory against the Venetian fleet on the Po. Physical setting is fully eulogized as well in claims such as this:

Que si ulla est in toto terrarum orbe egregie condita, ea certe Mediolanensium est civitas. Sic enim in latissimis campis sita, altissimis montibus procul septa est, sic non longe decurrentium fluminum opportunitatem percipit, ut nulla nedum inveniri, sed ne utilius et commodius edificata cogitari ullo modo possit.... (30)

Decembrio digresses on the various climatic zones, asserting that "...summaque Providentia Mediolanensium urbem in ea constitutam" (35).

Piccolomini's presentation of Basel departs somewhat from those of Florence and Milan. Although the city is depicted quite favorably, the text is nonetheless a more objective laus urbis, one which tends more toward ekphrasis and leans less on the oratorical showmanship of the Second Sophistic models. Topography or setting is therefore well attended to. Piccolomini artfully guides his reader toward Basel via the course of the Rhine, indicating the noteworthy cities found along the way, such as Cologne, Speier, Worms and Mainz. Hills and river fish are described, and throughout the following sections the cold and snowy climate is an obvious concern of the author. Basel is found neither

in the undesirable extremes of high mountains, nor in the troublesome flat plains; instead it enjoys the "medium inter extrema" (40),²⁵ a passage that Berthe Widmer has shown to be taken directly from Bruni.²⁶ Piccolomini would undertake several other descriptions of geographical regions, including an account of Vienna whose high objectivity renders it a descriptio rather than a laudatio.²⁷ Regarding the origins of Basel, the author is sparing, making reference only to the succession of power from the Romans to the Church bishopric, and the subsequent rule of law enjoyed by the citizens. Governmental structure (the dual assemblies, the magistrates, etc.) comprises a major portion of the text, and may be fairly considered here as part of the city's accomplishments. Another such element would be the local buildings, which Piccolomini describe with obvious pleasure, reveling as he does in details such as the ceramic-clad stoves, glass windows and songbirds.

If Piccolomini's eulogy of Basel was given especially to physical descriptions of the river, mountains and

²⁵ Basel text is used here. See note 14.

²⁶ Widmer 123-24n.

²⁷ For a discussion of these related modes in Piccolomini, see Pio II e la cultura del suo tempo. Atti del I convegno internazionale, 1989, ed. Luisa Rotondi Secchi Tarugi (Milan: Guerini, 1991).

buildings of that city, Giannozzo Manetti's twin panegyrics of Genoa (1436 and 1437-42) should be seen for the opposite. They were written to exalt the Genoese people, rather than their city, and as such might be more properly termed laudes civitatum than laudes urbium.²⁸ However, the second of the two, addressed to the Genoese doge Tommaso Campofregoso, was made after Manetti had actually visited Genoa, and it contains certain eyewitness memories that fill out the physical dimension of the city. The latter encomium therefore matches more completely the profile of the humanist laus urbis, and we will refer to it here. In this text, Manetti lingers at some length on the topic of the founders of Genoa, comparing various classical authors and their theories, and offering his opinions on the etymology of the toponym. On the setting of the city he says "Huiusmodi igitur tam vetuste urbis admirabilis quidam situs est, quippe iuxta mare sita quedam nostri orbis ianua esse videtur, ut nonnulli egregii auctores scribunt..." (96). The climate produces strong and healthy men, comparable, says Manetti, to what is said of the Athenians. The traditional content of a city panegyric included also the city's accomplishments, and in Manetti's treatise this is covered

²⁸ The same might be said of Decembrio's encomium of Milan, which depends much more on history than physical description.

by way of an extensive review of the historical facts supporting the author's central claim that the Genoese are truly the heirs to republican Rome. These mostly military feats dominate the text, just as they did the Panathenaicus of Aristides.²⁹ Manetti also considers the aesthetic aspect of the city as an achievement, noting its built environment of walls, aqueducts, and splendid homes of alternating black and white marble.

Second Criterion: Rhetorical Sophistication

Medieval authors throughout Europe never lost contact with the basic classical precepts governing rhetoric. Aristotle's three-part division of speech into deliberative, judicial and epideictic branches were transmitted via the Rhetorica ad Herennium and Cicero's De inventione. So were Aristotle's five steps for speechmaking (inventio, dispositio, elocutio, memoria, and actio), along with the Ciceronian structure of a speech (exordium,

²⁹ It may be added that the first of Manetti's Genoese panegyrics contains explicit acknowledgement of ancient praise of peoples ("...non alienum visum est eorum utpote fortissimorum virorum laudes litteris mandare, quod veteres Grecos et Latinos sapientissimos viros sepenumero fecisse manifestum est..." (56)), and that his good relations with Leonardo Bruni in Florence make it plausible that he undertook his own panegyrics in full knowledge of literary precedents and of the choices available to him.

narratio/argumentatio, and peroratio). Early medieval transmission of these and other rhetorical concepts came through Cassiodorus, Isidore, and other much-copied authorities, and although public rhetoric itself was rarely practiced, the rhetorical forms were retained and applied in written documents. By the eleventh and twelfth centuries the importance of classical rhetorical strategies (e.g. the captatio benevolentiae) is evident in their application to the artes dictaminis, the stylebooks for lawyers, notaries and scribes, as well as in the artes praedicandi and artes poetriae.

Despite the well known lack of public oratory in the middle ages,³⁰ intriguing testimony of its practice has come down to us in Brunetto Latini's Le livre du tresor (1260-66), in which he recognizes the importance of rhetoric for any successful leader and for the harmonious advance of society. Recalling explicitly the instructions of Menander Rhetor for leaders arriving at a city, Latini describes speechmaking in such a circumstance as a necessary act, and even invokes the ancient topos of "inexpressibility":

If the land is at peace, he can speak in this way:
'[...] If I wish to base the substance of my
speech on the praise of such a noble city as this
one, and refer to the good sense, and the power,

³⁰ For sources, see Curtius 76.

and the honor, and the other works of yours and of your ancestors, indeed I could not finish the task, for there is so much to tell concerning both the noble leaders and free people of this city...' (§82)

The shrewd politician will speak to his citizens "in a way he thinks will be most agreeable to them." Latini advises that

the wise speaker must very carefully observe the customs and the state and the condition of the city, so that he can change these words and use other ones according to the place and the time. (§82)

Latini also refers to the practice of speechmaking by visiting nobles, men who would cement local political relationships by praising the foreign city, its citizens and its outgoing leader. The focus here on public discourse reflects a generalized reemergence of this activity by Latini's lifetime, as witnessed by the creation of ars arengandi manuals for public speaking. Kristeller has noted not only that secular oratory had become re-institutionalized in Italy by the thirteenth century, but also that it often took the form of the vernacular.³¹ We could add that Brunetto himself betrayed the rhetorical

³¹ He also points out that the popular Rhetorica novissima of Boncompagno was a guide to oratory, rather than (as commonly believed) to letterwriting. Paul Oskar Kristeller, "Rhetoric in Medieval and Renaissance Culture," Renaissance Eloquence. Studies in the Theory and Practice of Renaissance Rhetoric, ed. James J. Murphy (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1983) 1-19.

sophistication of his time, being familiar enough with Cicero's De inventione to translate it several years after writing the Tresor.

We return now to the more general reestablishment of ancient rhetoric. With the recovery of most of Cicero's orations, letters and oratorical tracts by the early fifteenth century, and the outright adoption of his style by most humanists, additional details came to be seen as integral to good rhetoric, which for this reason was cultivated assiduously.³² The Ciceronian program for prosewriting and oratory came to include many elements, among them the use of harmonious, balanced periods in the compositio; traditional tropes (metaphor, allegory, etc.); figures of speech (anaphora, chiasmus, tricolon, etc.); metrical clauses (cretic+spondee, double spondee, etc.); and judicious quotations from recognized authorities.

As would be expected, Leonardo Bruni applied his Ciceronian style toward the composition of the Laudatio Florentine urbis. Speaking of the undesirable effects of certain topographies, he employs the figure of an ascending tricolon, with anaphora: "...nec rursus in immensa vasta que

³² For more on the growth of Ciceronianism and its backlash, see Izora Scott, Controversies Over the Imitation of Cicero (New York: Teachers College, 1910).

planitie absque uditate soli, absque impuritate aeris, absque caligine nebularum" (§5.9-10). Rhetorical questions and exclamations are everywhere (e.g. "Quid est in toto orbe tam splendidum aut tam magnificum: quod cum edificiis huius sit comparandum?" (§10.4-5)), in imitation not only of Cicero but of those Second Sophistic orators whose panegyrics were also styled upon the emotional delivery customary of epideixis. The Smyrnaean Oration of Aristides, a text Bruni probably knew, demonstrates this tone, as when discussing the city's harmony: "Is not all this superior to what any painting or sculpture can imitate?" (§12). A favorite clausula of Cicero can be seen in §30.13, "...convenisse videantur!" His trimember periods are recalled in "Sin autem vera erunt que loquar, et in his ipsis dicendis moderationem quandam servabo, ne illi michi irascantur" (§49.12-14). Authoritative sources are quoted liberally; in order of frequency they are Aristides, Salutati, Cicero, Vergil, Suetonius, Sallust, Menander, followed by many others.³³

Decembrio's panegyric on Milan adheres also to the norms of Ciceronian rhetoric, though less fully than does Bruni's on Florence. Cicero himself ("elegantie principe")

³³ See Baldassarri's table of sources, 43-44.

is mentioned, and some limited references are made to classical authorities, including Homer, Plato, Aristotle, Livy and Jerome. Evidence of Decembrio's attention to tropes and figures is visible, as found, for example, in the anaphora "...tante opes, tante copie, tanta denique omnium rerum facultas sit..." (33) and "Quam multa videas, quam preclara, quam magnifica!" (34). In the Panegyricus Decembrio appears to favor a periodic style, also resorting frequently to interrogatives and exclamations, as "Unde igitur dicere exordiar?" (36). The latter is also a topos, as is the locus amoenus conjured in the description of the city's natural resources: "Adde his fontium perhennes liquores, cursus amnium lucidissimos, pratorum viriditates atque camporum, tum volucrum copiam ac ferarum, quarum studio venandi incole mira afficiuntur voluptate" (30).³⁴

In the encomium of Basel the use of rhetoric is also less exuberant than in Bruni. Piccolomini's prose is composed of fewer lengthy, multilimbed periods, tending instead toward a succession of modest sentences with occasionally ellipsed verbs, as in "Forma hominum mediocris. Mores vti mortalium varii" (44). The tone does break into

³⁴ For a discussion on the curious use of idealized natural surroundings - amoenitas - as evidence of urban excellence, see Dario Cecchetti 403-04.

rhetorical outbursts, however: "Quid de Moguncia? Quam pulchre fluuio dominatur!" (35). The only classical references are rather incidental mentions of the Spartans and Athenians, although it is possible to see Platonic influence in the exaltation of Basel for its ideal placement between the extremes of topography. In terms of composition, Piccolomini appears to have followed the Ciceronian divisions of proem (statement of Basel as a suitable site for the Church council), narration/argument (the favorable description of the city), and conclusion (restatement of the need to choose Basel as the host city). His humanist inclinations are also manifested in such phrases as "...fluuius quidem tam libris historicorum quam versibus poetarum illustris..." (35) and the candid "Nulla hic studia gentilium literarum. Poeticam oratoriamque prorsus ignorant; grammaticae tantum ac dyalectice operam adhibent" (44).

Manetti's panegyric on Genoa is highly rhetoricized. Its structure is that of an oration addressed to the Genoese leader, and structured according to the classical norm. Its preface serves as the proem, for example, stating the purpose of the work and containing several instances of the captatio benevolentiae (such as "Ianuenses quippe Romanos imitati non inertia, non otio, non desidia domi torpescunt..." (92)). He uses the rhetorical expressiveness

that we have seen to be customary in these texts, such as "Quid dicam de villarum pulchritudine...?" (98). The topos of humilitas and a request for protection from the addressee of a literary work is seen at the end of the preface:

"Accipe igitur obsecro, illustrissime princeps, hoc parvum ad te munusculum..." (94). Manetti makes evident his erudition in frequent citations of Livy, Valerius, Pliny, and other classical writers; however, the bulk of this panegyric - covering the medieval history of Genoa - relies upon a single source, the Genoese annalist Giorgio Stella, whose Annales contained a copy of a Petrarchan passage on Genoa that clearly inspired Manetti.³⁵

Third Criterion: Political Motivation

By general critical consensus, this third measure clearly is another essential component of the humanist laus urbis. Yet this component has long been at the core of an ongoing, larger debate for modern critics, that of the nature of "civic humanism." Hans Baron's seminal work in the 1950s and 1960s defined Leonardo Bruni as nothing less than a revolutionary figure who wrote humanist works in part to

³⁵ From Petrarch's Itinerarium Siriaticum, as noted by Petti Balbi 28.

further worthy republican aims in Florence. Since then (and as described in this chapter's first section), Bruni's liberal civic engagement as a writer has been shown to be less novel and clearcut than Baron proposed.

As a result of these complexities, it seems necessary to provide here a brief excursus on late-medieval political thought in order to explain just why Bruni's laudatio of Florence was perhaps a smaller step forward, politically speaking, than was assumed by Baron and others. By extension, the civic nature of other humanist laudes urbium can likewise be seen as less of a rupture with medieval city praise and more of a natural progression. The genuine contributions of Bruni et al. toward a more politicized laus urbis will be clearer after we establish their medieval precedents.

At the mid-thirteenth century, Aristotle's Politics had been translated into Latin by William of Moerbeke, and with the writings of Thomas Aquinas a partial reconciliation of Christian theology with ancient philosophy was underway. The question of how to achieve the bonum publicum for a society was ever more frequently a practical issue, and not based wholly on theological dogma. Moral tracts (by John of Salisbury, Aquinas, Marsilius of Padua, Bartolomeo da Sassoferrato, et al.) emerged with ever more reasoned

conclusions for resolving the debate between the power of kings and popes; political tracts (by Aquinas, Giovanni da Viterbo, Brunetto Latini, et al.) were issued to offer practical advice to the podestà of the Italian city-states.

We have already seen the rhetorical - and implicitly political - nature of Latini's work, testifying as it does to a consciousness of the need to incorporate speechmaking in political strategy. Regarding city praise, this political nature of the Tresor is perhaps even more noteworthy than its rhetorical nature. For although it does not prescribe in detail the structure for a laus urbis, what it adds - the political relevance for the act of praising a city - is highly significant. In linking speechmaking and government, Latini and other writers of his era constituted a collective voice that inherently suggested the possibility (and advisability) of composing a laus urbis with truly political aims. This overtly strategic and political aspect of the laus urbis had been largely lacking since Late Antiquity, but, as we have seen, it would become an essential feature of the genre by the early fifteenth century.

Additional information supporting this view comes from James Hankins, who writes in Renaissance Civic Humanism that

It is now well established that the republican ideas Baron claimed had emerged around 1400 in the writings of Italian humanists had, in fact, a long

prehistory in the medieval scholastic and rhetorical traditions. (8)

In the same book, James M. Blythe's article "'Civic Humanism' and Medieval Political Thought," convincingly proves this assertion. Blythe shows that several of Baron's arguments claiming a major break toward republicanism and the use of rhetoric at about 1400 are unsupported, that in fact there was a plurality of political and rhetorical outlook since at least as early as the time of Aquinas. Among Blythe's paradigmatic figures are Ptolemy of Lucca (ca. 1236-1327), Marsilius of Padua (1275-1342), and Nicole Oresme (ca. 1320-1382).

Writing before Blythe, Lauro Martines concurred, asserting that "The late fourteenth and early fifteenth centuries, which saw the full emergence of humanism, record nothing dramatic enough for ['a shock of events']. A civic culture had been in the making for more than 200 years."³⁶ Another scholar of medieval Italian political life, Gina Fasoli, showed that the city encomia of the twelfth through fourteenth centuries, though incomplete by humanist standards, reflected civic pride that may be taken as evidence of a contemporary political awareness.

³⁶ Lauro Martines, Power and Imagination. City-states in Renaissance Italy (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1979) 203.

Another earlier critic, J. K. Hyde, also minimized the jump between a medieval work like the De magnalibus Mediolani of Bonvesin de la Riva (1288) and the Laudatio of Bruni, noting that the absence of outright political discussion in the Milanese work is attributable to circumspection on the part of Bonvesin, who opposed the new Visconti regime (328-29). Another city encomium we have reviewed in Chapter Three, the Liber Pergaminus, contains a discussion of municipal government that Hyde calls "the first reflection of the rise of the communes in descriptive literature" (319).

It seems safe to conclude, then, that the political element of a laus urbis was generally lacking during medieval times but certainly was ripe for inclusion. When one takes into account the variety of medieval thought and activity in politics, as indicated in Latini's Le livre du tresor and in the evidence presented by Blythe, Hyde and others, the eventual emergence of a politically-inspired laus urbis in the hands of the humanists seems almost inevitable.

What, then, was the political contribution of the early humanists toward the laus urbis? It appears that their main innovation was to compose these texts as responses to quite particular and often intense political conflicts. Their

encomia were consciously written to serve an interest within a context involving one or more cities, as opposed to the circumstances of the medieval encomia, which were more often politically neutral, and sometimes emerged as part of a devotional work (like the early medieval hagiographic work on the Neapolitan Saint Athanasius) or within an encyclopedic work (such as Benzo d'Alessandria's fourteenth-century Chronicon).

Baron believed that Bruni's laudatio had been inspired in just such a moment of crisis, but in fact we have seen that this was not true. Subsequent laudes would indeed emerge from identifiable moments of civic tension, but Bruni's political contribution was of a different sort, a generalized politicization of content.

This comes as no surprise. The Ciceronian ideal adopted by Bruni and other humanists presupposed that they were civically engaged political actors, rather than (to take a common medieval example) erudite clerics living distant monastic lives. Their commitment to the ancient conception of the orator - a man who combined wisdom and eloquence in service to the state - was reinforced with the medieval inheritance we have described above, that of a growing current of political activity. Hence we would expect to find

in the humanist city encomia a concern with political matters, an embracing of government, of law, of the civitas.

In fact we do. Bruni returns to the Second Sophistic model for Athens, the Panathenaicus, to sound similar themes regarding the justice and freedom inherent in the city's political system. And as Antonio Santosuosso has noted, the topic of the Florentine constitution occupies an impressive fifteen percent of the entire oration, far more than in Aristides's panegyric (42). Another political feature of the Laudatio is its portrayal of Florence as a virtuous colony of Republican Rome, and therefore unpolluted by the emperors who followed, and ready to claim its rightful position as heir.³⁷ Together, these factors imbue the Laudatio with a decidedly political tone, so that, while the text was not born of a pressing crisis, it did establish a new, politicized standard for the genre of the city encomium.

Turning to Decembrio's panegyric, we see that the circumstances of its composition included a rivalry among several cities for the right to host the next phase of the Church Council. A few years earlier Bruni had returned his Laudatio into circulation at Basel, in anticipation of the

³⁷ "Quamobrem ad vos quoque, viri florentini, dominium orbis terrarum iure quodam hereditario ceu paternarum rerum possessio pertinet" (§31.17-19).

eventual competition among his city and others. Apart from this motivation, and the indignant urgings of Valla, the political circumstances of the Panegyricus include a considerable number of references made to the Visconti. The work is addressed to Filippo Maria Galeazzo ("Ad illustrissimum principem"), and his father Gian Galeazzo is described as "incliti ac victoriosissimi ducis pater...". Decembrio considers Plato's five options for government (including aristocracy) and prefers Milan's own, timocracy.³⁸ Hence it is evident that the Panegyric carries out a modest political agenda, that of praising the monarch, and is informed of its humanist author's considerable familiarity with Greek sources.

Piccolomini's political intent is clear from the beginning of his work on Basel ("Basilea, sicut michi videtur, aut Christianitatis centrum aut ei proxima est..." (35)) and is reiterated at the end, when he makes a final plea for the consideration of the city as the site of the next Church council. Apart from this fundamentally political purpose for the work, much of it is given over to a detailed

³⁸ In the Republic (§548) Plato describes timocracy as a society inspired by the search for honor through military conquests and material acquisitions. Although it was considered mixed, containing both good and bad elements, Decembrio clearly seeks to associate the power and opulence of the Platonic timocracy with the Sforza state of his time.

report of Basel's governmental and judicial system, emphasizing the freedom of the citizens and their honest, pious nature. Perhaps the most innovative aspect of Piccolomini's praise of Basel is that it employs a captivating, entertaining description to nudge the reader to favor its political goal.

The political circumstances of Manetti's panegyric to the Genoese and their city are essential to the very text itself. Manetti claimed to have written the oration because it became evident to him that the Genoese were truly the heirs to the republican-era Romans: "...egregius hic populus Romanis persimilis pre ceteris gentibus nostri temporis videretur..." (90). Only a few years earlier the Genoese had thrown off the yoke of domination by the Visconti, and helped defeat the Aragonese in the naval battle of Ponza. Manetti's own diplomatic stay in Genoa to help cement the recent alliance among Genoese, Venetians and Florentines had convinced him that the example of that city's determination to defend republican ideals should be propagated and praised. In addition, Petti Balbi has pointed out Manetti's circumspection in omitting mention of the French domination in Genoa (1396-1409) and his reference to Lombardy as "Gallia Cisalpina," a more remote, non-Roman connotation for the enemy lands (30, 32). In attempting an overall

evaluation of the two panegyrics to Genoa, Petti Balbi notes the inevitable influence of Bruni's Laudatio Florentine urbis, but seems to find Manetti more sincere in his apparent devotion to republican ideals. She notes certain circumstances to support this attitude. Her portrait of Manetti, then, is nearly that of a successor to Bruni whose actions and writings during politically pregnant years were irreproachable. Although Petti Balbi never explicitly takes up the comparison between the two humanists, the last words of her introduction betray a belief that Manetti had fulfilled the civic duties of a humanist as fully as one could wish:

I fatti di Genova, il soggiorno degli ambasciatori genovesi a Firenze, la successiva legazione a Genova sono quindi le circostanze occasionali che inducono il Manetti a scrivere le prime opere che testimoniano il suo impegno civile, ma i veri ed intimi motivi ispiratori sono le sue idealità repubblicane e il suo amore per la libertà. (37)

Additional biographical and textual study of Manetti may eventually confirm or modify this outlook. Regardless, the similarity of both humanists, and the circumstances and republican defense of their respective city encomia, suggest the need for a closer comparative analysis of these works.

We will now turn our attention to the adaptation of the early humanist city encomium in Italy to the conditions in Spain. This second half of the chapter will begin with a

short profile of the Spanish city during the early fifteenth century, providing social, political and economic context for the subsequent presentations of the five city panegyrics that were written during the second half of that century and in the first years of the next.

The City as Protagonist in Fifteenth-Century Spain

The era of Felipe II has long been seen as the historical moment in which the cities of Spain came into full visibility within a Peninsular perspective, most emblematically, perhaps, in the royally mandated compilation known as the Relaciones topográficas.³⁹ Nonetheless, within the kingdom of Aragon the principal cities had enjoyed considerable autonomy, both perceived and actual, since their early growth as commercial hubs in the thirteenth century.

Similarly, in Castile the political importance of the city had been intensifying since the mid-fourteenth century, as wool output and other economic activity increased, trading and ferias expanded, and competition for municipal power intensified between the monarch and the nobility.

³⁹ Relaciones topográficas de Felipe II, coord. Alfredo Alvar Ezquerro, 4 vols. (Madrid: Comunidad de Madrid, 1993).

Alfonso XI's Ordenamiento de Alcalá of 1348 formalized the structure of town councils throughout Castile and effectively narrowed the possibilities for popular, local participation in them. In addition, the ordinance instituted the position of corregidor, or royal representative, in each council. The nobility reacted to these measures by forging so-called linajes de bando or extended, extra-familial oligarchies aimed at consolidating control of local administration. The highest stratum of nobility, the large landowning families in any locale, sought successfully to intervene in the affairs of a town council, orchestrating alliances not only with the urban oligarchy but sometimes with the king's own representative, as well. In this way, the fortunes of the Castilian nobility rose steadily during the last half of the fourteenth century and through the first half of the fifteenth, with a weak monarchy only aiding their cause.⁴⁰

⁴⁰ Sources for this brief overview of the late-medieval city include Manuel F. Ladero Quesada, Las ciudades de la Corona de Castilla en la Baja Edad Media (siglos XIII al XV) (Madrid: Arco, 1996) and Orígenes de la monarquía hispánica: propaganda y legitimación (ca. 1400-1520), dir. José Manuel Nieto Soria (Madrid: Dykinson, 1999). The latter contains valuable contextual information for the remaining pages of this chapter. For a complementary, panoramic study of social class struggle in Europe at this time, see M. Mollat and P. Wolff, Uñas azules, Jaques y Ciompi. Las revoluciones populares en Europa en los siglos XIV y XV (Madrid: Siglo XXI, 1979).

Adeline Rucquoi has noted the striking importance during the fifteenth century not only of the noble class within Castile, but of the very concept of nobility.⁴¹ In this sense she observes that "La jouissance d'un titre, d'une bannière et d'armes sont des attributs caractéristiques de la noblesse" (205), adding to this list the additional component of genealogy or familial history. Most relevant to our study here is the fact that these outward manifestations of noble rank, so contested in this period, were mimicked by cities. Rucquoi demonstrates the increasing use of adjectives in official documents to qualify a city's worth (noble, muy noble, etc.), as well as the vying to be classified as ciudad and not villa. Likewise, banners, heraldry and local history were seen ever more frequently, all in an attempt to secure the perceived and actual advantages that might accrue from noble rank.

Town and city "genealogies" begin to appear within the guise of the urban chronicle just before the fifteenth

⁴¹ Adeline Rucquoi, "Des villes nobles pour le Roi," Realidad e imágenes del poder. España a fines de la Edad Media (Madrid, 1988) 195-214. A complementary study is that of Juan A. Bonachía Hernando, "Más honrada que ciudad de mis reinos...": la nobleza y el honor en el imaginario urbano (Burgos en la baja edad media)" in La ciudad medieval. Aspectos de la vida urbana en la Castilla bajomedieval (Valladolid: Universidad de Valladolid, 1996), which finds evidence of the importance of urban "honra" and "ornato" in the governmental documents of fifteenth-century Burgos.

century. These works include the traditional founders of the city, such as Hercules, Hyspan, et al., as established for multiple cities in the Alfonsine Primera crónica general. Also featured was the Catholic monarch related to the reconquest of each city (e.g. Fernando III for Seville). Rucquoi lists several of the principle urban chronicles (all of them in the vernacular) for Avila (ca. 1390?), Cordoba (1433), Valladolid (ca. 1450) and Santiago (1468).⁴² Richard L. Kagan provides two others, for Seville and Barcelona, both from about mid-century.⁴³ It was this new strain of local history that would flourish especially after the mid-sixteenth century, as Kagan has illustrated so convincingly.⁴⁴

⁴² For Ávila, Crónica de la población de Ávila, ed. Amparo Hernández Segura (Valencia, 1966). For Cordoba, Derek W. Lomax, "El Cronicón Cordubense de Fernando de Salmerón," En la España Medieval, 2 (1982): 595-642. For Valladolid, Cronicón de Valladolid, ed. Pedro Saínz de Baranda, CODOIN, 13 (Madrid, 1848): 5-228.

⁴³ For Barcelona, Joan Francesc Bosca, Memorial històric, ed. J. Sobreques i Callico (Barcelona, 1977). For Seville, Los anales de Garci Sánchez, jurado de Sevilla, ed. J. de Mata Carriazo, Anales de la universidad hispalense 14 (1953) 3-363. See Richard L. Kagan, "La corografía en la Castilla moderna. Género, historia, nación," Studia Historica. Historia Moderna 13 (1995): 47-59.

⁴⁴ See also his "Clio and the Crown: Writing History in Habsburg Spain," Spain, Europe and the Atlantic World. Essays in Honour of John H. Elliott, eds. Richard L. Kagan and Geoffrey Parker (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995) 73-99.

These local or regional chronicles were not the products of humanists. But Spanish humanists, like these vernacular historians, also reflected the growing attention paid to cities in Spain, and they benefited from their experiences abroad, especially in the Italian cities. Florence, Rome and other former comuni enjoyed relatively more prominence within their respective kingdoms (smaller than those of Iberia) and boasted of a more vigorous, continuous tradition for praising cities. Hence Alfonso de Cartagena, at the Council of Basel, includes a discussion of "nobleça civil" in his speech advancing the Conciliar rights of the Spanish delegation over those of the English, extending his argument to the variety of legal privileges enjoyed by cities.⁴⁵

Rodrigo Sánchez de Arevalo (1404-70) produced the best known Iberian reflection on cities during the fifteenth century, the Suma de la política (ca. 1455). The two parts of this theoretical text represent a compilation of ancient and medieval sources - but especially Aristotle - dealing with "cómo deven ser fundadas y edificadas las cibdades e villas" and with the "buen regimiento y recta polecía que

⁴⁵ Alfonso de Cartagena, Discurso...sobre la precedencia del rey católico sobre el de Inglaterra en el Concilio de Basilea, ed. Mario Penna, Prosistas castellanos del siglo XV (I)

deve aver todo reino o cibdad."⁴⁶ Diego de Valera wrote a brief, untitled treatise on the origins of Troy and Rome in which he demonstrates extraordinary depth of knowledge on the mythical-literary foundings of those cities.⁴⁷

Among the major prose contributions of the fifteenth-century humanists were their national histories and antiquarian or geographical compendia. All were relevant to cities. The compendia (Margarit's Paralipomenon Hispaniae (by ca. 1480), Palencia's Compendiolum (1482) and lost commentary on Roman cities, Pau's De fluminibus et montibus Hispaniarum (ca. 1485), Nebrija's Muestra de la historia de las antigüedades de España (1499) and Lucio Marineo Sículo's De laudibus Hispaniae (ca. 1497)) were inspired in part by the Boccaccian geographical dictionary De montibus and aimed normally at the localization of ancient Iberian placenames from Ptolemy, Strabo, or other recently recovered classical sources. Sículo's De laudibus was overtly panegyric, conceived as an encomium for Hispania, but constructed also

(Biblioteca de autores españoles) vol. 116 (Madrid: Atlas, 1959) 205-33; here 208.

⁴⁶ Rodrigo Sánchez de Arévalo, Suma de la política, ed. Mario Penna, Prosistas castellanos del siglo XV (I) (Biblioteca de autores españoles) vol. 116 (Madrid: Atlas, 1959) 249-309.

⁴⁷ Diego de Valera, Origen de Troya y Roma, ed. Mario Penna, Prosistas castellanos del siglo XV (I) (Biblioteca de autores españoles) vol. 116 (Madrid: Atlas, 1959) 155-59.

of brief, humanist-style city panegyrics, such as for Barcelona.

The humanist histories normally focused on one kingdom or another: For Castile we have Cartagena's Anacephaleosis (1435-36) and Sánchez de Arévalo's Historia Hispanica (1470; essentially panegyrical, like Sículo's work); for the reign of the Catholic Kings, Pulgar's vernacular Crónica de los reyes católicos (1492) and its subsequent Latin translation as Nebrija's Decadas. For Aragon: Gonzalo García de Santa María's somewhat later biographical history of the times of Juan II of Aragon (1515), Sículo's Crónica de Aragón (1524) and Pere Miquel Carbonell's De viris illustribus catalanis suae tempestatis (before 1517). These works were generally designed with an explicit purpose, one that can perhaps be characterized as royal propaganda destined for overseas consumption. As such they fit neatly into the larger European trend toward the growth of national historical accounts, described rather concisely by Robert B. Tate.⁴⁸ Those histories completed under the sponsorship of Ferdinand and Isabel after the 1474 union of Castile and Aragon were the forerunners of an increasingly nationalistic and

⁴⁸ Robert B. Tate, "Los trabajos del cronista cuatrocentista," Studia Historica. Historia Moderna 13 (1995): 27-46.

imperial historiography. They must be seen as double-edged: while enriched by the wealth of recently established classical texts and by antiquarian knowledge, they were committed to the exaltation of the monarchy. "En tal sentido," observes José González Vázquez, "los autores de panegíricos pueden con todo derecho ser catalogados de auténticos ideólogos, ya que contribuyen a conformar el modo de pensar y la visión del mundo que tenga la sociedad."⁴⁹ The propagandistic zeal of this moment is well illustrated in the immediate embrace given to the forgeries propagated by Giovanni Nanni (Annius) of Viterbo (1432?-1502) in his 1498 Comentaria, designed to provide data that would confirm a more ancient, pre-Roman past in Iberia, and dedicated to the Catholic Kings.⁵⁰ These convenient falsehoods were absorbed by Nebrija, who edited some of them as Opúscula (Burgos, 1512), and also by Alonso de Proaza, the author of one of the city encomia reviewed below.⁵¹

⁴⁹ José González Vázquez. "Consideraciones en torno a algunos panegíricos de los Reyes Católicos," Humanismo y pervivencia del mundo clásico. II. Homenaje al profesor Luis Gil, eds. José María Maestre Maestre, et al. (Cádiz: Gobierno de Aragón, et al., 1997) 1413-19; here 1416. For more on the panegyric of fifteenth-century monarchs see Nieto Soria, Orígenes de la monarquía hispana.

⁵⁰ Anthony Grafton studies Viterbo in Forgers and Critics. Creativity and Duplicity in Western Scholarship (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1990).

⁵¹ For Nebrija and Annus, see Tate, Ensayos 190.

Clearly, a cronista real such as Palencia or García de Santa María was obliged to fulfil the role of ideologue when taking pen to paper.⁵² Still, the concept of national Spanish unity was quite new, and as shown by I. A. A. Thompson, even the kingdom of Castile was a vague and abstract concept for most of the constituent communities within its borders.⁵³ It should not surprise us, then, that while some Spanish humanists were engaged in projecting an idealized national image to Europe, others were writing encomia of Spanish cities.

Specifically, five Latin encomia were written between ca. 1455 and 1506.⁵⁴ Each of these panegyrics appears to fit the profile of the early Italian humanist laus urbis, and

⁵² Palencia's active political positions (including the effort to depose Enrique IV) and his unusually candid historical vision, made him less of an ideological instrument, perhaps, than his contemporaries.

⁵³ I. A. A. Thompson, "Castile, Spain and the Monarchy: The Political Community from patria natural to patria nacional," Spain, Europe and the Atlantic World. Essays in Honour of John H. Elliott, eds. Richard L. Kagan and Geoffrey Parker (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995) 125-59.

⁵⁴ A sixth candidate for inclusion among these Spanish laudes is of an uncertain date. The anonymous In Burgensis civitatis laudem Joanni de Velasco Castellae Comiti stabili dicata oratio (BNM ms. 18729/19) has been dated by Richard L. Kagan as ca. 1512 ("Clio and the Crown: Writing History in Habsburg Spain" 87), but a late sixteenth-century date for it still appears be possible, given the work's internal chronology. Because I have been unable to resolve this remaining doubt, the text is left out of the main group of Spanish humanist laudes urbium studied here.

some were likely modeled after those compositions by Bruni, Chrysoloras (via the Latin translation), Decembrio, Manetti, Piccolomini, and perhaps other less well-circulated Italian works. After all, models for the city encomia were readily available for Spanish humanists to see in Italy, along with examples of many other humanist genres practiced there. One Italian humanist, Giannozzo Manetti, had even provided an example for the laus urbis of a Spanish city in his Laudatio Agnetis Numantinae (1440).⁵⁵

In the sections below, each of these Spanish city encomia will be examined. The three criteria of a city's origins, site and achievements, as earlier defined for the Italian laudes, will be applied in each case. The final city encomium for Alcañiz (1506) will not be dealt with here in exhaustive detail, since a thorough study of this work is available with the recent edition of it.⁵⁶

⁵⁵ This panegyric of the mother of Spanish humanist Nuño de Guzmán was consciously styled on Ciceronian precepts for the praise of a person. As such, it included a passage (§12-32) on the virtues of the subject's patria, in this case Numancia (Zamora). See Tres opúsculos de Nuño de Guzmán y Giannozzo Manetti: un episodio del proto-humanismo español, ed., intro. Jeremy N. H. Lawrance (Salamanca: Diputación, 1989).

⁵⁶ Juan Sobrarias, Alabanzas de Alcañiz. Discurso del alcañizano Juan Sobrarias, ed., study, trans. José María Maestre Maestre (Cádiz/Alcañiz: Instituto de Estudios Humanísticos, 2000). Ángel Gómez Moreno briefly reviews the other four Spanish laudes in his chapter "Mérida y la 'laus urbis,'" 282-95. This

Alfonso de Palencia's "Florentissima Ispali"

By his own rather modest admission, Alfonso de Palencia's enviable rise out of the "fetore" of his native city and into the heart of the Spanish and Italian humanist circles of the 1440s and 50s was brought about by the impersonal vagaries of "fortuna."⁵⁷ But upon his arrival from Florence to Seville in 1453 it is no less true that he carried with him a wealth of experiences gained in travel, diplomacy and scholarship that caused him to engage fate, rather than await it. Palencia would have an active and highly partisan career negotiating, most typically, against the avarice, ignorance and corruption of nobles and royalty.

It was perhaps this outlook that led Palencia to compose a letter to the Archdeacon of Carrión in Palencia,

section of his book offers very useful information on the interactions between Italian and Spanish humanists (and their writings), complementing the analysis which follows here for the five city texts.

⁵⁷ Page 40 of the text to be treated here: Alfonso de Palencia, De laudibus Ispalis ad Reverendum Dominum Archidiaconum de Carrione Alfonsi Palentini epistola, Epístolas latinas, ed., intro., trans. Robert B. Tate and Rafael Alemany Ferrer (Barcelona: Universidad Autónoma de Barcelona, 1982). This letter is also examined in Tate's "The Civic Humanism of Alfonso de Palencia," Renaissance and Modern Studies 23 ((1979): 25-44. For the date and circumstances of this letter, and other biographical and bibliographical details on Palencia, see the introduction to Alfonso de Palencia's Decadas, the Gesta Hispaniensia ex annalibus suorum dierum collecta, ed., study, notes, Spanish trans. Brian Tate and Jeremy Lawrance, 2 vols. (Madrid: Real Academia de la Historia, 1998) vol. 1, xxxv-lxix.

ca. 1455, requesting that he watch over Alfonso's interests there, protecting them from any encroaching "viperas" of his hometown. This purpose, however, is only stated at the close of the letter, and tersely so. The epistola itself is framed as a laus urbis of the Archdeacon's native Seville, and as such must be construed as a small gift to the recipient in light of the favor being requested of him by the author. The following comments reveal Palencia's "De laude Ispali" to be a kindred work of the Bruni-inspired line of city encomia, a literary genre that he surely encountered while in Florence.

One indication of Palencia's familiarity with the laus urbis genre is the precision with which he articulates the three traditional components of content, namely, origins, site and achievements. Following a proemio he enters directly into the question of origins: "Ispalis hec civitas est nomini cuius diversi diversas causas assignant; earum tamen est poctior:..." (34). Combining the subjects of etymology and the founders by way of the story of Hercules and Caesar, he freely and quite successfully mixes mythology with history. Mythology, of course, had its rightful place in the panegyrical mode of an encomium, and history lent a supporting role, heightening the apparent veritas of the story being told. This reveals one of Palencia's more interesting features as an author, that is to say, that he

was capable of appreciating distinct modes of discourse for the value each represented.⁵⁸ And regarding the inventive fictions of mythology, we remember that only a few years later Palencia would adapt the Greek, mock-heroic style of the pseudo-Homeric Batrachomyomachia in writing his Batalla campal de los perros contra los lobos (1457).⁵⁹ In the "Florentissima Ispali," the founding story is finally amplified quite fittingly with a brief encomium of each of the two founders, especially Caesar. Palencia is quick to add that he remained an ideal emperor, "non affectus tiramride" (36), a more than casual comment, perhaps, given the author's sensitivity to the abuses of political power.

A clear transition is then made to the subject of Seville's site, lauded first for its healthful, temperate climate, better than any found on earth. The rest of this section is skillfully arranged to take the reader on a tour of the surrounding hills and plains, into the river and onto

⁵⁸ Lorenzo Valla had been outraged to learn of the excesses, as he saw them, in Bruni's laudatio of Florence, unable or unwilling to view the text as epideixis instead of as a more objective history. It seems an irony that classical authorities from Cicero forward had actually considered history as part of epideixis, and was owed, therefore, the embellishments of that oratorical category. For more on this topic see Carmen Codoñer, "Un modelo imitativo: la historiografía latina," Studia historica. Historia moderna 13 (1995): 15-26

⁵⁹ See comments by Tate and Lawrance in their edition of Palencia's Decadas, vol. 1, lvii.

its banks, without ever losing sight of the city as his primary focus. The outstanding natural resources include abundant fish and game, fruit and olive trees, wine and limitless firewood.

As for the city's noteworthy achievements, no historical review is made. Rather, the city's physical structures and imposing position as a commercial hub are vaunted. Seville is described as circular in form, boasting high, crenellated walls and towers, and that "Intra muros sacratissima tenpla edificiaque maxima sunt Dedalica arte constructa..." (39). The reference to Daedalus might be seen as both praise and censure, connoting not only high artistry but also excessive pride on the part of the citizenry. In fact, it is followed by two oblique comments suggesting a life of certain laziness and excessive pleasure for some of the residents. Palencia offers the figure of 150,000 for the total population, an exaggeration typical in city encomia.⁶⁰ The city's markets are described as abundant enough to supply three Italian cities, and thronged by traders from the world over, a veritable Babel.

⁶⁰ Thirty thousand would be a closer estimate. See Manuel F. Ladero Quesada, Las ciudades de la Corona de Castilla en la Baja Edad Media (siglos XIII al XV) (Madrid: Arcos, 1996), 13.

The following, final section constitutes a peroratio in which Palencia meditates upon his great fortune at being able to live in Seville under the protection of Alfonso de Velasco.

The humanist skills and sensibilities acquired by Alfonso de Palencia while living first under the tutelage of Alfonso de Cartagena, and then within the Roman sphere of Cardinal Bessarion are well documented by Tate and Lawrance.⁶¹ It will now be useful for us to note how Palencia applied his knowledge of humanist rhetoric to the genre under discussion.

In a letter to his friend George of Trebizond, Palencia complains of the rhetorical missteps of his contemporaries, lamenting their abandonment of Ciceronian guidelines: "Id non incurrerent vitium si Ciceroniana precepta...perspicerent" (59).⁶² Cicero is indeed a guide for Palencia in the "De laude Ispali." The recommended divisions for speeches are applied in Palencia's epistle as dictated by medieval handbooks that adapted the oratorical mode to more functionally oriented letters. Moreover, he uses these divisions with precision and acute consciousness of their sequence. Two transitional phrases indicate this

⁶¹ See the introduction to Decadas.

awareness: "De aeris salubri temperie cum sit oportune dicendum..." (36) and "Jam de esternis dicto partibus urbis, ipsa munimenta dispositionemque civilem aggrediar..." (38). Palencia indulges in a number of topoi, including the claim to veracity ("preposita veritatis observancia" (34)); his profession of humilitas ("non eleganter..." (34)); the auspicious signs presaging a city's founding ("siderum influencias...propicias esse rescivit" (35)); and "inexpressibility" ("...si diversa nomina formasque conplecti callamo vellem, cartas centum aut plures ocuparem" (38)).

Palencia weaves his deep knowledge of classical authorities into the narrative on Seville. Besides his use of Hercules, Caesar and Daedalus, as seen above, he also invokes Plutarch's Life of Sertorius when claiming the superiority of Seville's climate to even that of the Fortunate Isles. From Aristotle's Rhetoric (which he had no doubt read, given his association with Trebizond) he may have become sensitive to the theme of felicitas, a subject he touches upon in the letter. In light of Palencia's fundamental interest in the physical spaces of cities, he was surely acquainted with the Politics (either through a

⁶² A Jorge de Trebizond, Epístolas latinas 57-63.

Latin translation or via the Suma de la política of Sánchez de Arévalo). In fact, his description of Seville's placement and its self-sufficiency is in keeping with that tract. We might even hazard to say that, consciously or not, Palencia extended Aristotle's notion that climate directly affects a populace, for in the letter to Trebizond cited above he proposes that a city's built environment also produces varying effects upon the citizenry. Rome's decay dulls the Romans, while the beauty of Florence edifies its inhabitants.⁶³

Was Palencia's laus urbis politically inspired? As we have seen, the purpose of this work appears to be personal, i.e. composed as a kind of literary gift to accompany the request to watch over Palencia's affairs at home. Whatever difficulties the author may actually have had in Palencia

⁶³ Reference to this letter is Tate's, as is his observation of Palencia's general concern with architecture. See Robert B. Tate, "The Civic Humanism of Alfonso de Palencia" 30. Another letter mentioned in this article, and edited in Epístolas latinas (IX), was that of Donato Acciaiuoli and Vespasiano da Bisticci to Palencia, in which the Florence of their time is praised for its new building projects, literature, painting and sculpture. Apart from Palencia's Florentine sources and personal experiences in Italy, another potential influence upon his writing (previously unnoted, as far as I know) could have been the letter of Pliny the Younger describing his villa near Ostia. His highly ekphrastic language coincides quite neatly with that of Palencia's in the latter's description of the "morada de la Discreción." See Tratado de la perfección del triunfo militar, ed. Mario Penna, Prosistas castellanos del siglo XV (I) (Biblioteca de autores españoles) vol. 116 (Madrid: Atlas, 1959); here 360-62.

could indeed have been minor and not political in nature. This letter would therefore be a mere opportunity to exercise the laus urbis within a humanist mode of discourse, the epistle.

Yet we know that Palencia was already showing a critical attitude toward the excesses and incompetencies of the wealthy, for his impatience is poorly veiled even in a celebratory text like the "De laude Ispali." We also know that this critical posture earned him enemies.⁶⁴ It therefore seems reasonable to interpret this epistle in praise of Seville in a broader sense, that is, as a document that demonstrates Palencia's intellectual fascination with cities and, more significantly, reflects his burgeoning involvement with civic affairs, both on a municipal level (in Seville) and nationally. Although this laus urbis is not directed by a single political issue (such as the republican propaganda of Bruni's Laudatio), the work does emerge very logically from the circumstances of Palencia's life, that of a politically active humanist.

We can find other evidence that his literary treatment of cities was motivated by genuine political concerns, especially the search for more ethical governance. In the

⁶⁴ Queen Isabel, for example, consistently favored Palencia's friend and rival Fernando del Pulgar.

Tratado de la perfección del triunfo militar (1457-59)

Palencia takes up Florence and Rome as paradigms of good and bad civil structure, as we have noted. Barcelona is also described briefly, at first favorably but then with reserve, thereby conveying Palencia's view that the prosperity of that city had led to a complacent, self-interested, and corrosive attitude on the part of the dominant class. This is the same vein of criticism we see (much more lightly) in the "De laude Ispalis." It seems no exaggeration to assert that the city was one of the central axes around which Palencia's life and literary works turned during his several decades of high-level political activity and humanistic writing.

Ekphrastic Praise of Cordoba

Filled as they were with civil strife and political intrigue, the two decades following the composition of Palencia's laudatio of Seville witnessed no additional encomia of cities in Aragon or Castile. In this respect the period spanning the 1450s through the 70s recalls much of the tumultuous fourteenth century, when praise of city (and nation) was nearly absent in Iberia.

Cordoba would be the focus of the next laus urbis to appear in the Peninsula. The author of the Cordubae descriptio refers to himself only as "Geronimo," a person tenuously identified as canon of the Real Colegiata de San Hipólito in Cordoba. If this identification is to be trusted, the date of the unique manuscript can be fixed at approximately 1480 and considered an original, rather than a later copy. A modern edition, transcription and Spanish translation was made in 1975 by Manuel Nieto Cumplido, whose brief introduction will be complemented by the following analysis.⁶⁵

True to its title, Geronimo's Descriptio contains very little historical material. We find only sparing references to the origins of the city. Some are indeed made. He calls Cordoba "sedis antique regnorum" and "barbarorum antiquum," and mentions the Arab king Almanzor, who extended the Mezquita, when reviewing the city's architectural legacy. However, an effort is clearly made by the author to link Cordoba to other very ancient and celebrated cities or monuments (the Egyptian pyramids, the walls of Babylon, Athens, etc.), thus imbuing the city with their dignity. The antiquity of Cordoba is also implicitly asserted in the

⁶⁵ Manuel Nieto Cumplido, Córdoba en el siglo XV (Cordoba: Excma. Diputación Provincial, 1973).

author's attempt to offer an etymological explanation for the toponym, "Cordium Basis."⁶⁶

As for the city's principal accomplishments over time, military conquests are absent because of the ahistorical approach of the author. Instead its pre-Christian constructions - the Mezquita, Alcázar (with its walls and towers) and a "theatrum magnum et spaciosum" - are praised. Each is described in great detail, as evident in this portion of the passage on the Mezquita:

Habet enim capellam totam undique deauratam in qua corpora regum condita requiescunt et aliam capellam marmoream cuius tectum sola cloquea tornatili concluditur lapidea, hostium vero duabus colupnis decoratur jaspideis cuius frontispicium opus musaicum artificiosi emblematis mirificat et componit. In cuius conclauis tronus eburneus regis quondam Almancoris opere laqueario tarsiatus in perpetuam viubrum seruatur memoriam. (51)

The civic nature of the city is briefly indicated - but with obvious enthusiasm and pride - within the description of the "theatrum," meaning the public square. It is clearly central to the life of the city, a place where "judices ad consistoria conueniunt causas ciuiles exacturi" and where youths practice military games.

⁶⁶ The origin of the term remains unclear, although it has been suggested that the Latin Corduba originated from the Phoenician karta-tuba, or "large town."

But most of the Descriptio is given over to an exuberant review of the third traditional component of content, that is, the physical setting of the city and its outlying region. The relevant sections are the Guadalquivir River, the Campiña agricultural zone, the Sierra (preceded by a lengthy exposition on celebrated Biblical mountains), the sunlight's impact on the city, the temperate climate's effect on the citizens, a defense of the climate vis a vis those of other regions, and the graceful horses found in Cordoba. Through these sections Geronimo establishes the amoenitas of the region, seen in this passage on the riverbanks:

Cuius lictorum arboreitas et humencia crepidinis
arundineta, scirpus, calamus et colunbus tanto
viore perfusa nitescunt quod innumeras promiscui
generis cohortes palustrum volucrum de remotis
partibus ducunt ad sui amenitatem. (45)

Geronimo maintains a remarkably poetic tone, often rapturous and occasionally exceeding the licit exaggerations of encomiastic writing. More than once he describes the land at daybreak; this allows him to depict the dampness of the dew, and soften the harsh image of the Andalusian sun. The dazzling brilliance of the sun at dawn, shining upon the city walls, also lends natural grace to the splendors of the built, monumental city:

Ibi ventura dies non premitit diluculum set mox
 oriri ceperit lanpadem suam vibrans fulgor
 ostendit gaudentem respicit phebun, propia illic
 luminis claritate resplendet ut ipsam magis solis
 putetur esse patriam. (49)

The author's awareness of the subtle beauties of the land dominates the entire text, lending a measure of sincerity to his claims that Cordoba is nothing short of an earthly paradise, a "terre promissionis," "alia Palestina."

A further examination of style in the Descriptio reveals an author with considerable exposure to rhetorical norms and to classical sources in general, but with only average talent and limited practice in literary composition. The text of his encomium opens with sixteen somewhat imperfect hexameters meant to identify the author. It continues with an exordium, followed by a central narrative or argumentative body, and ends in a spirited peroratio. While the syntax often resembles more a medieval than a classical Latin, as in "Habuerunt honorem qui precesserunt..." (51), Geronimo makes effective and frequent use of rhetorical questions, adding opinionated asides that personalize the narrative and prevent it from becoming overly formulaic or rigid. He employs topoi appropriately, claiming, for example, to know of the ancient mines in the area by firsthand experience ("nemine referente set visuali probatione percepi") and suggesting that the

"situm...gloriosum" of Cordoba was foretold by an oracle. Sensitivity to the language is also evident in Geronimo's selective use of the related terms urbs and civitas. In one lengthy sentence we find the former word linked with murorum, the latter with gentis animose.

In the first words of the text - "Corduba me genuit, Italia redegit adultum" - Geronimo claims to have been educated or trained in Italy, and echoes a well known couplet associated in medieval times with the first-century Cordoban Lucan.⁶⁷ However, overt evidence of his erudition is rather weak, but suggested nevertheless in his use of Betis for "Guadalquivir," in the repetition of Febo, and in his references to well known ancient geographers when speaking of the mineral wealth of Cordoba.⁶⁸ More telling are two passages revealing Geronimo's familiarity with Aristotelian and Platonic concerns. Citing as example the pure air of Athens and the resultant wisdom of the Athenians, he expounds the Aristotelian theme linking the environmental conditions of a place with its inhabitants:

Aere quodque viget saluberrimo qua de causa
homines redit sensibus liberiores quia temperies
cuncta moderatur. Patria siquidem feruens lues

⁶⁷ As cited in Chapter Two: "Corduba me genuit, rapuit Nero: prelia dixi, / Que gessere pares, hinc socer, inde gener."

⁶⁸ For example, Pliny, Naturalis historia XXXIV, 4, on Cordoban copper.

eficit et acutos, frigida tardos subdolos et
ignaros, sola temperata est que mores hominibus
sua qualitate conponit. (49)

The recently renewed currency of Platonic thought in the
fifteenth century would seem to inspire the following
reflection on a waterwheel:

Set quis in vespertino silentio sonoros axis eius
stridores audiens non delectatur cum reuocent ad
memoriam pollorum artici et antarthici cum
sp(h)eris cellorum armonie representationem? (45).

Geronimo possesses considerable familiarity with the Hebrew
scriptures, as is obvious in his litany of renowned ancient
mountains and their associated cities (Hebron, Lebanon,
Galaad, etc.). This list is ultimately used to show us the
superiority of the Sierra of Cordoba to even these
celebrated Biblical sites.

Geronimo's stated motive for composing the Cordubae
descriptio is found in his verse preface: "Ut clarent regie
metropole prerrogatiua / Prosayce dignum duxi propalare
decorem" (43). A few verses later we learn that he had been
unjustly expelled from Cordoba (as from his home by a
stepmother), and that he expects his honest praise of the
city to be followed by an invitation to return: "Sis, ergo,
michi pia GERONIMO deposco benigna." Elsewhere he attempts
to encourage other Cordobans to realize the great gifts of
their city, in a spirit of civic gratitude: "Hec siquidem

omnia congesci ut urbs gloriosa a suis deinceps non ignoretur habitatoribus ut demum per consequens agita carior habeatur" (52). These clues provide few concrete details, but lead us to suppose that the author fell afoul of municipal or ecclesiastical authorities in Cordoba, and was writing from exile, perhaps in a surrounding city. Unfortunately we have no other hints. His troubles may have been political or personal in nature, but it is clear from his plea to the city for mercy - "Sis, ergo, michi pia..." - that the composition represents a formalized, literary response to his banishment, and a request for action.

Considering all three criteria as discussed above (content, rhetoric, and motivations) we can see the outlines of the laus urbis genre in Geronimo's Cordubae descriptio. While not nearly as historical as the Italian versions, nor as rhetorically refined nor politically sensitive, it nonetheless reflects certain influence gained, undoubtedly, during the author's claimed stay in Italy. Additionally, we can speculate that his professed experiences in the Byzantine sphere of the Mediterranean ("Insullas per transfectum grecorum pariterque prouincias / Pleras orthodoxorum urbes...") may have allowed him to acquire a certain appreciation for the ekphrastic tradition for architecture that was more fully developed there than in

Italy, an appreciation he exercises in his description of the Mezquita and Alcázar of Cordoba. Additional archival research in Cordoba could yield useful information on Geronimo, and lead to a better understanding of his text.

Jeroni Pau's Antiquarian Barcelona

Sometime before his definitive return to Barcelona in 1492, the Catalan humanist Jeroni Pau (ca. 1458-1497) finished a Latin description of his native city. Addressed to his close Roman friend Paolo Pompilio, the Barcino is considerably longer than either of the two works just reviewed here, and decidedly influenced by its author's philological and antiquarian passions. Much of Pau's brief life was spent in Rome in the employ of the Vatican Curia, exercising the largely Italian education he had received in the fields of canon and civil law. Pau cultivated many humanist genres, including poetry (epigrammatic, elegiac and epic), epistolography, geography and history.⁶⁹ The modern

⁶⁹ Pau is especially known for the art of his Latin poetry. Among his epigrams is "Ad Barcinonem urbem," which contradicts the popular belief in Hercules as the founder of the city:

Iactitet Herculeam quamuis te uulgu Iberum,
Barcinon, Poeno de duce nomen habes

(136-37; reference in next note)

editor of his works, Mariàngela Vilallonga, has underscored the intensely classicizing tone that informs his writing in all of these genres: "La seva obra no té entitat per si sola, ni es pot entendre si no és a través del coneixement dels clàssics."⁷⁰ The Barcino is no exception. The following analysis shows not only its dependence upon ancient sources, but also its resemblance as a whole to the Italian humanist laus urbis.

In fact, Pau's encomium of Barcelona fully covers the three-part content cultivated by the Second Sophistic orators and the Italian humanists. In his proemio he indicates his desire to transmit all he has read "de urbe mea eiusque agro et principatu, incolis et situ, deque eorum rebus praeclare magnificeque gestis apud priscos auctores...addita perstrictim usque ad nostra tempora historia" (294). Pau first debates the name of the city and the founder, discarding the mythological Hercules ("opinio in uulgu sparsa, fouente iactantia" (296)) in favor of the

Pau asserts here, as in Barcino, that Barcelona was founded by Hamilcar Barca, for whom it would have been named. Pau's writing of this city epigram is evidence that this sub-genre, discussed in its Italian context earlier in this chapter, had been adapted in Iberia.

⁷⁰ Mariàngela Vilallonga, La literatura Llatina a Catalunya al segle XV: repertori bio-bibliogràfic (Barcelona: Curial, 1993) 187. The edition of Barcino cited here is Jeroni Pau, Obres, ed., notes, intro., trans. Mariàngela Vilallonga, 2 vols. (Barcelona: Curial, 1986) I: 290-347.

Carthaginian Hamilcar Barca, whose name was adapted to Barcelona. This is a sign of Pau's relative independence from the inherited corpus of legendary founders in the Peninsula. He then provides a review of the illustrious citizens of Roman Barcelona, leaning heavily upon lapidary inscriptions, and crediting the antiquarian Ciriaco d'Ancona for some of them. The "sanctissimis uiris" follow, including early bishops and martyrs such as Eulàlia and Cugat. In discussing the Goths, Pau does not embrace the longheld, nationalistic notion that the modern Hispanic kings descend in an unbroken line from the Goths (who were deemed by Cartagena, Sánchez de Arévalo and Nebrija to have pre-Roman origins); instead he simply notes favorably the growth of the city at the time of its Gothic rulers. Pau passes quickly over the medieval centuries, noting in a rather abrupt concluding remark "Item religionis et iusticiae obseruantia; ad hoc publicae rei priuataeque cura; laudabili adiuncta parsimonia et conseruatrice imperii concordia..." (322). The historical expansion of Barcelona into a powerful trading center, having been traced by Pau from the city's earliest origins into its fifteenth-century present, was only a part of its laudable achievements. Betraying his juridical experience, Pau then explains the history of laws in Barcelona, adding political and administrative details.

His pride in municipal governance echoes that expressed by Muntaner on Catalonia and Eiximenis on Barcelona and Valencia. Like them, he is impressed by the commercial class of the city and describes its financial institutions ("Habet urbs insigne publicam mensam depositariam fidei..." (336)). The presence of Jews and Muslims is noted and harshly denounced.

The last component of content covered by Pau is the physical situation of the city and its surroundings. He notes with a certain scientific precision the ancient city walls, the growth from four to nine city gates, the territorial expansion into the early suburbs, and the overall shape of the city in the form of a letter "C" that opens onto the sea. Ancient buildings are described and the modern streets are praised, and the women of Barcelona are noted as an embellishing feature. Montjuich ("monte Iouis") is noted for its prominence, and the water supply is singled out ("Nec fontibus caret limpidissimis..." (328)). Pau provides some distances relevant to the topography and surveys the fertility of the land, referring also to many of the approximately four hundred villages and cities he counts in the region of Catalonia. Barcelona's exports to the world, including painted glass rivaling that of Venice, are cited. He notes the vestiges of Roman-era mines and suggests

that the city revive them, bringing additional bullion to the republic via the forced labor of current prisoners and galley oarsmen.

Finally, it should be noted that approximately the last half of Barcino is somewhat less organized than the first. Pau jumps from territorial survey to urban administrative features and back again to the countryside, ending with the rather singular proposal for the mines as a measure useful to the state. Notwithstanding this occasional meandering, all of the traditional content areas are very fully treated, more so, in fact, than any of the other four Spanish laudes urbium written during this period.

Pau incorporates a wide range of the rhetorical elements established in classical antiquity. Barcino is structured as a personalized treatise, a kind of epistolary discourse, addressed as it is to Paolo Pompilio. The exordium sums up the purpose for the composition, as well as the content which the reader may expect to find therein. Throughout the body of the narration, several passages confirm Pau's sense of purpose as a narrator: "Sed iam ad temporum seriem reuertamur" (310); "ad urbem duntaxat nostram redeamus" (318); and the transitions "...ad iuridicae gubernationis formam transeuntes" (322) and "Quare ad situm urbis transeundum est" (324). Pau concludes the

narration with a peroratio addressed appropriately to Pompilio, in which he praises his own father and lineage, and asks that Pompilio see fit to return the favor of the Barcino with an encomium of Rome, addressed to Pau.

In several passages Pau shows that he was consciously writing within the rhetorical bounds of the laus urbis. After the exordium he makes an overt transition to the topic of the city's founder: "Igitur, ut a conditore ordiamur..." (294). Later, after summarizing Barcelona's medieval centuries in a cursory manner, he notes his intention to revisit the subject in a later work of history (never finished). This remark shows that he recognized the distinction between the genre of history and that of encomium; in the latter, historical content shares the focus with other subjects, especially topography. In another passage Pau proudly notes the concessions won by Barcelona from the monarchy: "Auxerunt nomen, facultates, nauigatio et libertas, senatui populoque ab regibus ob ingentia merita concessa" (322). This comment - though historically accurate - was another of the many rhetorical gestures essential to a laus urbis (and certainly should not be interpreted literally as evidence of an anti-monarchist posture in Pau).

Although the narrative tone of the Barcino is considerably more restrained than the Cordubae descriptio or

"De laude Ispali," its subtlety is not without strategy. Pau uses the literary figure of evidentia in suggesting that he will attempt to bring the city before the eyes of the reader ("praesens mente paulisper collustrare" (294)). He makes frequent use of literary topoi, some of which are listed here:

- Pau, occupied in professional affairs, writes at the insistence of a friend (292);
- Excess was the downfall of formerly great cities: "luxus et ciuium discordiae...quibus opulentissimae urbes periere" (324);
- amoenitas: "Vrbs amoeno magis quam fertili loco posita est" (332);
- Barcelona "outdoes" Florence: "Huius sane situm praestantior omnino esse propter littus et caeli apricitatem nemo inficiabitur" (334);
- humilitas: Pompilio's description of Rome will be even better than Pau's of Barcelona (346).

In addition, Pau occasionally attributes to unnamed "others" an opinion he himself would clearly like to assert, as in his condemnation of Barcelona's Jews: "Necnon et hoc a compluribus laudari uidimus, quod urbem nostram Iudaeis habitare nequaquam licet..." (336). This technique was no doubt sharpened through the author's legal training and experience.

Pau's humanist learning and philological skills carry him forward at every step in Barcino, and are applied not

just in the first section on the founders and history of the city, but also when describing the origin of the city's laws, its first buildings, the Roman mines, etc. Ancient textual sources are never far from Pau's mind in order to prove a point or amplify a claim. He quotes easily and liberally (but not verbatim) from Seneca, Sallust, Mela, Martial, and many other authorities. Pau also quotes from the epitaph of one of Barcelona's Roman "antiquissimos." A single paragraph near the end of Barcino (342) bears enough similarity to Isidore's De laude Spanie to suggest the latter as a source:

Est enim Hispania cum multarum rerum prouentibus felix, tum uel maxime omnium metallorum paene ubique ditissima. Testes fuere olim Poeni et deinde Romani, qui intimis atque supernis Iberiae opibus praecipue adiuti uidelicet metallis, frubigus, materia, lino, sparto, uino, oleo, lana, sale, salsamentariis, corio et equus et pugnacibus denique ac uere uiris diuturna atque ingentia bella per orbem confecere.

Pau's purpose here is certainly more restricted to a single point - the mineral wealth of Spain, a point he follows in the next paragraph - but his use of "Hispania...felix" and the succession of earlier colonizers ("Poeni et deinde Romani") curiously echoes Isidore's words ("felix...Spania") and his own Romans and Goths. Pau extends here his original interest in metals to many other natural products, and finally to the Iberians themselves, whose exploits include

"bella per orbem." Isidore also lists natural resources of Iberia, and finishes in a similar way: "...multiplices in orbe uictorias..."⁷¹ Pau had no doubt read Isidore's text, and may have used it, consciously or not.

It is highly conceivable that Pau undertook the encomium of Barcelona not only to satisfy Pompilio's apparent request for such a text - for this was a literary topos, as well - but also in order to help bring the city into higher favor within the educated diplomatic and ecclesiastical circles of Europe. Barcelona had not only led a resistance to the Aragonese monarchy during a ten-year civil war, but had also lost that war. Zurita's Annales attest to the negative view held by some foreigners toward the city for years after the defeat.⁷² Pau would have perceived such criticism of his native city from the cosmopolitan vantage point of Rome. Though a scant fourteen years old upon the surrender of Barcelona, he would take up residence in the Vatican only three years later, and ultimately stay there for most of his remaining years. An additional point of speculation concerns his protector in

⁷¹ See the edition of Isidore's Gothic histories by Cristóbal Rodríguez Alonso, 168-171.

⁷² Jerónimo Zurita, Annales XVIII, 44. Cited in J. N. Hillgarth, The Spanish Kingdoms, 1250-1516, 2 vols. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1978) 2: 297.

Rome, the fellow Aragonese Roderic de Borja, later Pope Alexander VI. While no documentation seems to indicate pressure on the part of Borja or others in the Vatican to repair the reputation or dignity of Barcelona after its war and capitulation, it seems reasonable to bear in mind that such a motive may have prompted Pau to write and publish the Barcino. Closer inspection of archival sources could clarify this possibility. Certainly it is true that Pau took care to frame his brief references to the disastrous and still-recent Catalan civil war in optimistic terms, asserting his faith in the current monarch, Ferdinand, to revive the city. His explanations for the city's decline are equally brief.⁷³ The minimizing of Barcelona's embarrassing civil war would have contributed to any political rehabilitation of the city intended by Pau; it was also essential to the encomiastic genre.

⁷³ A variety of explanations are given, including "luxus et ciuium discordiae," "licencia principis" (324) and "Creditum est hanc popularem admissionem initia ruinae urbis nostrae peperisse" (334). The last is a reference to the inclusion of a more popular class into the membership of the municipal Consell. Commoners were deemed by Pau to be "apta magis gubernari quam regere" (334).

Alonso de Proaza's "Oratio luculenta" for Valencia

Relatively little is known about the life of Alonso de Proaza (ca. 1445 - ca. 1519). According to the information assembled by D. W. McPheeters, a tentative (but still inadequate) biography is possible.⁷⁴ It is possible that Proaza moved from his native Asturias to Salamanca, where he could have followed a career as corrector of galleys, work that would have led to his participation in the 1500 edition of La Celestina. There or in Zaragoza he may have made the acquaintance of his future patron Guillén Ramón de Moncada, Bishop of Tarazona, and of his future printer Leonardo Hutz. It was perhaps through the influence of one or the other that Proaza came to Valencia, where he appears rather suddenly as a professor of rhetoric at the Estudi General of Valencia in the fall of 1504. One year later he delivered a Latin panegyric of Valencia before a crowd of municipal officials gathered at the Estudi. It was in all likelihood an address marking the opening of the academic year for the recently chartered university, and was apparently well received.⁷⁵ Some two months later the speech was printed by

⁷⁴ D. W. McPheeters, El humanista español Alonso de Proaza (Madrid: Castalia, 1961).

⁷⁵ McPheeters cites a municipal record indicating that the jurats "loen e aprouen la hobra que ha fet lo reuerent alonso de

Hutz under the title Oratio luculenta de laudibus Valentie, and remains to this day the only edition of the work.⁷⁶

McPheeters's book on Proaza includes detailed and useful analysis of the Oratio, though done mostly without a view toward the larger genre of the city encomium. Nonetheless, his observations, and the additional comments we can make here, allow us to establish the Oratio as belonging to the laus urbis genre as we have defined it in this study.

McPheeters identifies and reviews the structure that Proaza himself announces at the outset of the speech. Six elements are included:

1. Antiquitas urbis
2. De situ et benignitate coeli
3. De feracitate
4. De urbis ampliacione
5. De praestantia ciuium
6. De ciuili gubernatione

The fifteen folios of the Oratio make it approximately the same length as Barcino, or perhaps a bit longer. The progression of these topics, above, makes it clear that Proaza proceeded according to the typical plan of a humanist laus urbis, describing first the origins of the city (1),

proaza..." (138-39, n.5). For more on the university's history, see Marc Baldó i Lacomba, La Universitat de Valencia (Valencia: Institució Alfons el Magnànim, 1986).

⁷⁶ The copy consulted here is from the Biblioteca Nacional, Madrid.

then the site (2 and 3), and finally the achievements that betray the essential excellence of the human inhabitants (4 through 6). Livy, Ptolemy, Pliny, Strabo, Eusebius, Jerome and others are referenced for their ancient testimonies regarding the origins and site of Valencia. The most notable authority here is Proaza's contemporary Giovanni Nanni of Viterbo, whose forged Commentaria on Berosus allowed Proaza to claim even a pre-Hercules founding for Valencia. Vergil and Ovid are granted direct quotes. Proaza boasts of Valencia's oil, honey, wax, hemp, linen, sparta grass, and many other natural products, most notably water. The final sections on the city itself - its expansion, its citizens and its government - are considerably longer than the first two, occupying fully half of the speech. Sacred and secular buildings are praised, including a monastery prison for female offenders, the lonja or administrative hall, the university (considered by some to be better than those of Paris, Bologna or Salamanca), and thermal baths. The Valencians are an ideal people: "Est etiam valentina gens natura alacris et festivissima, affabilis, perquam eloquens, munifica, frugi, pia admodum, clementissima, et perhumana" (14r). Rounding out the section, and with it the entire oration, is a review of Valencia's martyrs, kings, wars, its inquisitorial office, and the similarities that cause one to

identify it with Rome (e.g. "Nam quos Roma senatores; Valentia iuratos" (17v)).

Proaza's Oratio follows classical rhetorical precepts so obsessively that, as McPheeters notes, his prose sometimes becomes somewhat abstruse (142-43). Structurally we see the usual divisions of exordium, narratio and peroratio, although the content is divided over six sections, as noted above. Various topoi are employed, including humilitas (2r and 17v-18r), and the locus amoenus (5v-6r). The figure of occupatio is used in "Non dicam regiam in suburbano domus..." and "Tacebo numerosissimam assidue conglomerantem..." (13r). Proaza plays with words of similar sound in "...publicasque vias perinde spaciosas ac speciosas conspicies" (13v). Rhetorical questions are mined constantly as a resource. It has already been noted that Proaza depends greatly on classical references in his text; Cicero is invoked a number of times, as well, although in a cursory and almost perfunctory way. Despite Proaza's humanist cultivation of latinitas via this oration, he was also a participant in the vernacular literature of his time. Evidence of this is the inclusion of a Castilian ballad to Valencia at the end of the Oratio. The "Romance heroyco del mesmo Alonso de Proaza en lengua Castellana sacado dela ya dicha Latina oracion" consists of forty pairs of verses in

a-a rhyme, covering substantially the same topics as the Oratio. It is clearly a literary advance over the vernacular laudes of Pérez de Guzmán's Loores, since it is more focused and more descriptive, and reproduces more consciously the characteristics of the humanist, Latin laus urbis. This romance to Valencia would be republished in the 1511 Cancionero general, along with a villancico by Proaza requesting divine vigilance over Valencia.

Proaza's oration was a highly political act because it was the exaltation of a city, pronounced at one of its public institutions before an assembly of its officials. The printed version could be considered even more political, given its greater diffusion. We have already noted the inherently political nature of most panegyric at this time in Spain; just as the encomium of Hispania or of a monarch was an act of propaganda, likewise was that of a city, particularly an Aragonese city of some independence, such as Valencia. Evidence of the political nature of the Oratio is also seen in the somewhat exaggerated length of the section boasting of the citizenry. In fact, the proemio to the Oratio is preceded by a list of sixteen, prominent local officials, a circumspect gesture on the part of a rhetor whose university contract was reviewed annually (and in fact

would last only another two years).⁷⁷ Another propagandistic component of the work is its portrayal of a pre-Roman and even pre-Herculean foundation for the city, based on a source (Viterbo's Commentaria) that must have given some pause. Finally, with the firm establishment of the state-run office of the Castilian Inquisition in the last years of the fifteenth-century, and its reemergence in Aragon, the religious content of public life in Spain had come under more scrutiny. It is not surprising that Proaza's oration is permeated with an overtly Christian tone, stronger than that of any of the city encomia just surveyed, and much removed in this sense from the early Italian models. Part of the Oratio's preliminary apparatus includes a page of two Latin poems dedicated to Valencia's patron saints Vincent the martyr and Vincent Ferrer. The pious villancico, noted above, appears on the final page of the work.

The Oration of Juan Sobrarias to Alcañiz

In D. W. McPheeter's chapter attending to Alonso de Proaza's encomium of Valencia he also discusses a 1506 encomium of Alcañiz - Oratio de laudibus Alcagnicii - by the

⁷⁷ McPheeters 24-25.

humanist Juan Sobrarias, a native of that town.⁷⁸ McPheeters noted the more cosmopolitan personality of Sobrarias, as compared to Proaza, and the likelihood that the second text was in some measure a response to the first (although neither author mentions the other). Sobrarias was in fact much younger (about thirty at that time) and had spent three years in Bologna just prior to composing his laus urbis. His Latin was not muddled by dense and occasionally forced metaphors, as was Proaza's; his tone was confident and his content far less bound to religion. Sobrarias enjoyed the protection of a close friendship with the highly-placed Lucio Marineo Sículo, whose praise of Sobrarias graces one of the opening pages of the text.

An edition of the encomium of Alcañiz was published in 2000, featuring a Castilian translation, facsimile, notes and introduction by José María Maestre Maestre.⁷⁹ This edition exposes the full range of content, the rhetorical tools used by Sobrarias (who indicated many of them in the margins), and the political circumstances (remarkably like those of Proaza).⁸⁰ Because of the similarity between both

⁷⁸ See McPheeters 140-43.

⁷⁹ See note 56.

⁸⁰ The marginal guides may be an indication that this work was intended by Sobrarias to serve as a rhetorical textbook for his own students.

texts, and because Maestre Maestre's edition provides considerable analysis, only one further aspect of the encomium of Alcañiz need be addressed here.

The most innovative aspect of Sobrarias's oration is his decision to subdivide its central portion into the three-part scheme for describing people, as recommended by Aristotle. These were the bona fortunae, bona corporis and bona animi, each of which is given the logical attributes for a city: site, climate and natural resources; buildings and public works; and character of the citizens. Sobrarias takes an obvious delight in explaining this arrangement to his audience or readers as he moves along, and in fact it functions extremely well as a structural solution to the content he needed to present. It also has the advantage of overtly communicating the notion that his city was very much like an illustrious person. The only irregularity of this innovative framework is that Sobrarias was forced to present the historical content, including ancient origins, as an excursus before engaging the reader in the three, successive bona, since history fits in none of them (26). His concept of history, it may be added, was similar to Pau's in that he explicitly recognized the difference between the limited history offered in an encomiastic oration and the genre of history writing itself. As he digresses on a topic which,

curiously, also relates to history (i.e. the habit of ancient Greeks to mix history with mythology), he recognizes the need to be brief: "Libentissime utrosque in certamen adducerem, ni uiderer historiam magis quam orationem describere" (58).

Epilogue: The Spanish Laus Urbis Beyond Early Humanism

In the first part of this chapter it became evident that the early Italian laus urbis, cultivated first by Leonardo Bruni and imitated by Decembrio, Manetti, Piccolomini, and others, was essentially a literary-historical phenomenon of the first half of the fifteenth century. It was noted that the unbridled praise typical of the encomiastic mode since its inception in ancient Greece came to be seen by Valla and others as exaggerations that were unseemly in prose writing. Under such criticism, prose became the vehicle for more objective or methodologically concerned works, such as antiquarian accounts or the historical narratives of Bruni and Biondo. Poetry became the preferred mode for the praise of cities, as seen, for example, in the remarkable expansion of the city epigram. The later fifteenth century also saw an expansion of propaganda in general, as city praise and other panegyrical

texts came to be linked ever more to the exaltation of a ruler. An additional change to the early Latin laus urbis modeled by Bruni was that it was adapted for the vernacular.

In Spain similar changes took place, though the rhythm of such change was accelerated. Spanish humanists, as we have seen, adopted the laus urbis approximately a half-century after its initial appearance in Italy, at a time when it was already mutating there in the ways described above. Simultaneous with this process of adoption (and adaptation) around the mid-fifteenth century there was a considerable increase in contacts between Italian and Spanish humanists. Hence, as the Brunian form of the Italian city praise found expression in Spain during the second half of the fifteenth century, it was already becoming an obsolete mode.

We must look to the literary landscape at this moment in order to chart the changing course of the laus urbis in Spain beyond the first years of the sixteenth century. Richard L. Kagan has succinctly indicated the dual strains of "la laudatio humanística [i.e. the laus urbis] y la crónica urbana" evident around 1500.⁸¹ He has shown that these two currents are seen to merge in the texts for

⁸¹ Kagan, "La corografía..." 51.

Salamanca and Ávila (1512 and 1519), and that by the mid-1500s they had given rise to a flourishing vernacular genre of local, municipal history that was panegyrical in tone. This is a distinct and significant chapter in the evolution of the Spanish, humanist laus urbis.

Another step in the evolution of the genre in Spain was the change from prose to poetry. We have just noted the tendency of the laus urbis in Italy to give up prose for poetry, and it is this same transition we see in Iberia. Although one still finds an occasional Latin, prose city praise beyond this period - the case of Damião de Góis's Descriptio urbis Olisiponis (1554) is exemplary - the verse texts dominate into the seventeenth century. Major examples include Nebrija's "De Emerita restituita" (for Merida), Proaza's aforementioned "Romance historyco..." (Valencia), Cristóbal de Castillejo on Vienna, Enrique Cock for Madrid and Zafra, Amador Arrais for Coimbra, Francisco de Quevedo for Cordoba, and the many city encomia of Rodrigo Caro. The verse of the Spanish comedia also reflects this tendency, as seen in the praise of Lisbon in Tirso de Molina's El burlador de Sevilla. On the whole, conditions in Spain were, like those in Italy, less conducive to epideictic prose, fostering instead the use of verse.

If Latin prose encomia of cities had nearly disappeared in Spain, they did give rise to the insertion of encomiastic descriptions of cities in the vernacular literature. As Joseph L. Laurenti has shown, this became a much-cultivated aspect in the picaresque novels of the seventeenth century, and constitutes a final step in the evolution of the humanistic laus urbis in the Iberian Peninsula.⁸²

⁸² Joseph L. Laurenti, "La fórmula laudis como motivo clásico en la topografía picaresca peninsular," Caminería hispánica. Actas del II congreso internacional de caminería hispánica, tomo III (Madrid, 1996) 219-32. Examples are found in Mateo Aleman's Guzmán de Alfarache, Luis Vélez de Guevara's El diablo cojuelo, and in Castillo Solórzano's La Garduña de Sevilla, among others.

CONCLUSIONS

From antiquity through the medieval and Renaissance periods, cities never ceased to be praised for their mythical founding, their venerable leaders, their wars heroically won or unjustly lost, their defensive walls, or their more accidental fortunes of rivers, hills or soil.

We have surveyed a wide variety of tributes to cities and, where relevant, to nations, too. Among them were Thucydides's funeral oration to Athens (in the mouth of Pericles), Statius's silva to Naples, the panegyrics of Aristides on the virtues of both Athens and Rome, the geographical treatises of Strabo and Pausanias, Ausonius's poems to various urbes of the Roman empire, Isidore's glowing survey of the Iberian Peninsula, the anonymous Carolingian verses honoring Verona and Milan, William Fitzstephens's eleventh-century encomium of London, the fourteenth-century encomium of Pavia by Opicinus de Canistris, the Catalan texts of Francesc Eiximenis exalting Barcelona and Valencia, and, lastly, a cluster of humanist writings idealizing several Italian and Iberian cities.

Our first chapter revealed an essential unity among the several theoretical writings that prescribed guidelines for

the praise of cities. Quintilian, the progymnasmata writers, Pseudo-Dionysius, Menander and even the anonymous author of De laudibus urbium all suggested quite similar elements, although they organized their works differently. But these authors hardly invented the genre of city praise; rather they codified the longstanding practice of panegyrics on behalf of cities, especially those for Athens by Thucydides and Isocrates. Menander's double treatises offered the most detail for form and content. His works would circulate continuously during Byzantine times, and find their way into Italian humanist circles of the fifteenth century, eventually being printed in 1508.

The ancient encomiastic writings for cities and nations, normally occurring somewhat incidentally in works of a wider scope, functioned as models for later medieval and humanist authors. The most complete examples featured three areas of content: the founding and origins of the city (sometimes with a discussion of placename etymologies); the noteworthy achievements of the city over time (military triumphs, laws, architecture, arts and sciences, dignity in social relations); and the physical situation (topography, advantageous climate, fertility). The first two derived from the norms used for praising human beings; the third was specific to places. The development of this typical, three-

part standard for content was accompanied by the development of literary standards, such as the topoi of the locus amoenus, and the application of rhetorical structure and figures of speech. In addition, these panegyric texts were usually cast within identifiable political circumstances, such as the oration of Aristides praising three cities of Asia Minor in order to foster peace among them.

Early medieval city encomia were commonly written in Latin verse. Although classical references were often retained, these works were infused with Christian elements and devotional purpose. At this time we see the appearance of the lamentatio urbis (e.g. upon Attila's invasion of Aquileia, in the poem by Paulinus) in which a city is praised for its former greatness. In the twelfth century a slow but noticeable secularization of city encomia was begun, as pilgrim guidebooks included descriptions of famous classical buildings (especially in Rome). In the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries the newer prose works became more ekphrastic and concerned with the political economy of the local government, and with the history of military exploits (e.g. Bonvesin's De magnalibus Mediolani and Villani's Florentie urbis descriptio). These reflected the experience of the comuni, which by then had already given way to political entities of a larger and less local scope.

Ancient authors tended to write about Iberia as a unit - Hispania - rather than to focus on regions or cities. Hence the establishment of the early laus Hispaniae tradition in the short and longer passages of Pliny, Solinus, Claudian, Pacatus Drepanius and Prudentius. The commonplaces of a temperate climate, gold-bearing rivers, mineral wealth and natural fertility were passed on to Isidore, whose De laude Spanie would influence the much later thirteenth-century encomia of Hispania as written by Lucas of Tuy, Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada, and the Alfonsine Primera crónica general. These later texts also incorporated the glorification of the Hispano-Gothic heritage and abundant scriptural references, especially in their lamentationes of a lost Hispania. This extended topos was first applied to the Iberian situation in the eighth-century, post-conquest Crónica mozárabe.

The thirteenth-century city encomia written for Roncesvalles and Seville, and other similar texts of that century, announced a growing tendency in the Peninsula to mark the dignity and history of a local community, and not just Hispania as a wider entity. The political and social struggles of the fourteenth century caused a pause in the writing of regional or city encomia, but at this time the Italian treatises on government began to circulate within

the Peninsula. This laid the foundation for a number of Aristotelian-inspired writings on government and princely conduct by Cartagena, Sánchez de Arévalo, Diego de Valera, and others. A related concern for the nobility of cities became visible in the works of Eiximenis. Fifteenth century vernacular laudes and lamentatio for cities (by Pérez de Guzmán, Santillana, Corral, and some cancionero poets) were composed in Castilian. Although these verse and prose compositions reflected the growing importance of Castilian and Aragonese cities in the fifteenth century, they still lacked the longer extension of the classical panegyrics, as well as other rhetorical and political components of those early works. In other words, it is evident that these non-humanist writings were textual participants in the centuries-old tradition of praising places - being heirs to the line of laudes in Hispania that stretched back to Isidore and his classical sources - but that they were not designed in conscious mimicry of Aristides and other original sources. Such sources, in fact, were unavailable to these Spanish authors.

A return to the Second Sophistic, oratorical model for a city encomium was effected in Spain by way of the Italian humanist example. Bruni's classicizing laus urbis of Florence, and the subsequent imitations of it on behalf of

Milan, Basel and Genoa, had been made possible because of Brunni's exposure to Greek and Byzantine works brought to Florence by Manuel Chrysoloras. The subsequent contact between Spanish humanists - Palencia, Pau, and others - and their Italian counterparts allowed for the transfer of the Brunian laus urbis to the Iberian Peninsula. In order to better illustrate this transfer, we analyzed the Italian model, then showed its presence (in terms of content, rhetoric, and politics) in five Iberian texts. As could be expected, the latter were not servile copies of the imported Italian laudes, but instead showed sensitive adaptation to the local circumstances of Seville, Cordoba, and the other cities praised. This sensitivity derived in part from an awareness of the medieval Hispanic line of encomiastic writing for cities, including the use of such topoi as the dual founders of Seville, Hercules and Caesar.

It is curious to note, finally, that Iberian humanists, once exposed to the laus urbis, seemed to show a special fondness for it. Alfonso de Palencia wrote the De laude Ispali almost immediately after arriving in Seville from Florence and Rome. Likewise, Jeroni Pau had no sooner returned from Rome to Barcelona than he published his tribute to the latter (already in manuscript form) as Barcino. Juan Sobrarias undertook his praise of Alcañiz

within two to three years of his homecoming to that city after a period of study in Bologna. The same would be true later in the century, when Damião de Góis wrote his 1554 panegyric to Lisbon after returning there from Flanders and years of earlier study in Padua. These humanists surely recognized the logic of applying their newly acquired rhetorical expertise toward the praise of their Iberian cities, especially at a time of political expansion within the Peninsula.

As was true earlier for the Italian cities, the laus urbis in Iberia was rooted in native, medieval precedents, but was provoked into existence by the reception of foreign influences. And in both Peninsulas, the genre found expression only briefly, coming at a time in which the exaltation of cities in a classical, oratorical style was not completely inconsistent with the political needs and literary conventions of the day.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Throughout this dissertation it has been shown that Spanish authors of city encomia normally took advantage of diverse literary-historical traditions, whether Peninsular or foreign, and that this tendency intensified during the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries as contacts with Italy deepened. Because of this interactivity of textual traditions, seen most plainly in the humanist laudes of our Chapter Six, Spanish and non-Spanish sources are grouped together in the following bibliography.

Three chronological sections have been established, each of which includes both primary and secondary sources:

- 1) Ancient/Late Antiquity
- 2) Middle Ages
- 3) Humanist/Early Modern

These divisions are occasionally artificial or imperfect, as in the case of Priscian, or of the Marqués de Santillana. With regard to reference works, those spanning more than one period are placed according to their greatest utility for this study, or to reflect the way they have been used here.

It is hoped that this bibliographical arrangement will prove useful to others with research interests in Spanish city encomia, or the broader tradition of praise for city and nation as it was practiced in Europe from ancient times through the Renaissance.

Antiquity and Late Antiquity: Primary and Secondary Sources

Aeschylus. The Persians. Trans. Herbert Weir Smyth.
Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1988.

Ammianus Marcellinus. History. Ed. William Stearns Davis.
Readings in Ancient History: Illustrative Extracts from
the Sources. 2 Vols. Boston: Allyn and Bacon, 1912-13.
Vol. 2. Rome and the West. 224 ff. Text modernized by
J. S. Arkenberg for internet version. 29 Sep. 2000
<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/ancient/ammianus-history14.html>>.

---. Trans. John C. Rolfe. Vol. 1. Cambridge, MA: Harvard
University Press, 1982.

Anaximenis. Ars Rhetorica. Ed. Manfred Fuhrmann. Leipzig:
Teubner, 1966.

Aristides, Aelius. The Complete Works, Ed., trans. Charles
A. Behr. 2 vols. Leiden: Brill, 1986.

Aristophanes. Wasps. Ed., trans. Jeffrey Henderson.
Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1998.

Aristotle. Politics. Trans. H. Rackham. Cambridge, MA:
Harvard University Press, 1967.

---. Rhetoric. Trans. W. Rhys Roberts. Oxford: Oxford
University Press, 1971.

Ausonius. Trans. Hugh G. Evelyn White. Vol. 1. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1988.

Basil, Saint. In Gordium. Trans. J. M. Campbell. The Influence of the Second Sophistic on the Style of the Sermons of St. Basil the Great. By Campbell. Washington: Catholic University of America, 1922. 147.

Burgess, Theodore C. "Epideictic Literature." Studies in Classical Philology 3 (1902): 89-261.

Casevitz, M. "La cité et le citoyen d'après et selon Pausanias." Kolaios 3 (1994): 53-58.

Catullus. Trans. Francis Warre Cornish. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1988.

Cicero. De inventione. Trans. H. M. Hubbell. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1960.

---. De re publica. Trans. Clinton Walker Keyes. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1957-89.

---. Partitiones oratoriae. Trans. H. Rackham. Vol. 2. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1960.

---. The Verrine Orations. Trans. L. H. G. Greenwood (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1988.

Classen, Carl Joachim. Die Stadt im Spiegel der 'Descriptiones' und 'Laudes urbium' in der antiken und mittelalterlichen Literatur bis zum Ende des zwölften Jahrhunderts. NY/Hildesheim/Zurich: Georg Olms Verlag, 1986.

Claudian. Trans. Maurice Platnauer. Vol. 2. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1963.

Codoñer, Carmen. "Un modelo imitativo: la historiografía latina." Studia historica. Historia moderna 13 (1995): 15-26.

Dio, Chrysostom. Speeches. Trans. J. W. Cohoon and H. Lamar Crosby. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1971-93.

Dionysius of Halicarnassus, The Roman Antiquities. Trans. Earnest Cary. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1990.

- Euripides. Hecuba. Ed., trans. David Kovacs. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1995.
- Florus, Lucius Annaeus. Epitome of Roman History. Trans. E. S. Forster. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1995.
- Frick, Frank Smith. "The City in the Old Testament." Diss. Princeton U, 1970.
- Frontinus, Sextus Julius. The Aqueducts of Rome. Ed. Mary B. McElwain. Trans. Charles E. Bennett and Clemens Herschel. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1997.
- Gascó, Fernando. "Modelos del pasado entre los griegos del s. II d.C.: el ejemplo de Atenas." Polis 5 (1993): 139-49.
- The Greek Anthology. Trans. W. R. Paton. Vol. 3. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1998.
- 'Hermogenes'. Progymnasmata. Trans. Charles Sears Baldwin. Medieval Rhetoric and Poetic (to 1400). Gloucester, MA: Peter Smith, 1959. 22-38.
- Homer. Odyssey. Trans. Richmond Lattimore. NY: Harper, 1967.
- Horace. "Ars poetica." Horace. Satires, Epistles and Ars Poetica. Trans. H. Rushton Fairclough. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1961.
- . The Secular Hymn. Ed. William Stearns Davis. Readings in Ancient History: Illustrative Extracts from the Sources. 2 vols. Boston: Allyn and Bacon, 1912-13. Vol. 2. Rome and the West 174-179. Text modernized by J. S. Arkenberg for internet version. 29 Sep. 2000
<<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/ancient/augustanencomions.html>>.
- Isocrates. Panegyricus. Trans. George Norlin. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1998.
- Josephus, Flavius. The Jewish War. Trans. H. St. J. Thackeray. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1998.

- Libanius. "Libanius' Oration in Praise of Antioch (Oration XI)." Trans., intro., commentary Glanville Downey. Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society 103.5 (1959): 652-86.
- Livy. History of Rome. Trans. B. O. Foster. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1919-59.
- Lucian. Trans. K. Kilburn. Vol. 1. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1959.
- Martial. Epigrams. Ed., trans. D. R. Shackleton Bailey. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1993.
- Menander Rhetor. Eds., intro. D. A. Russell and N. G. Wilson. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1981.
- Moore, F. G. "Urbs aeterna and urbs sacra." Transactions of the American Philological Association 25 (1894): 34-60.
- The New Oxford Annotated Bible with the Apocrypha. Ed. Herbert G. May and Bruce M. Metzger. NY: Oxford University Press, 1977.
- Orosius, Paulus. The Seven Books of History against the Pagans. Trans. Roy J. Deferrari. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America, 1964.
- Ovid. Fasti. Trans. James George Frazer. Rev. G. P. Goold. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1989.
- Pacatus, Drepanius. Panegyric to the Emperor Theodosius. Trans., intro. C. E. V. Nixon. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1986.
- La península ibérica en los autores griegos: de Homero a Platón. Ed., trans. and comments Elvira Gangutia Elícegui. Madrid: Fundación de Estudios Romanos, 1998.
- Pernot, Laurent. La rhétorique de l'éloge dans le monde gréco-romain. 2 vols. Paris: Institut d'Études Augustiniennes, 1993.
- Plato. Critias. Trans. R. G. Bury. Vol. 9. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1984-96.
- . Laws. Trans. R. G. Bury. Vols. 10 and 11. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1984-96.

- . Menexenus. Trans. R. G. Bury. Vol. 9. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1984-96.
- . The Republic. Trans. Paul Shorey. Vols. 5 and 6. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1984-96.
- Pliny the Elder. Natural History. Trans. H. Rackham. Vol. 10. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1986-97.
- Priscian. Opuscula. Ed. Marina Passalacqua. Vol. I. Rome: Ed. di Storia e Letteratura, 1987.
- Procopius. Buildings. Trans. H. B. Dewing and Glanville Downey. Vol. 7. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1996.
- Propertius. Elegies. Ed., trans. G. P. Goold. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1990.
- Prudentius. Trans. H. J. Thomson. Vol. 2. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1995.
- Quintilian, Marcus Fabius. Institutio oratoria. Trans. H. E. Butler. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1998.
- Rhetorica ad Alexandrum. Ed., trans. E. S. Forster. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1971.
- Robertson, Noel. Festivals and Legends: The Formation of Greek Cities in the Light of Public Ritual. Toronto/Buffalo: University of Toronto Press, 1992.
- Rutilius Numatianus. On His Return. Ed. William Stearns Davis. Readings in Ancient History: Illustrative Extracts from the Sources. 2 Vols. Boston: Allyn and Bacon, 1912-13. Vol. 2. Rome and the West. 318-319. Text modernized by J. S. Arkenberg for internet version. 29 Sep. 2000 <<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/ancient/413rutilius.html> >.
- Schulten, Adolph. Hispania (Geografía, Etnología, Historia). Trans. Pedro Bosch Gimpera and Miguel Artigas Ferrando. Barcelona: Académica, 1920.
- Silius Italicus. Punica. Trans. J. D. Duff. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1989-96.

Sophocles. Oedipus at Colonus. Trans. Hugh Lloyd Jones. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1994.

Sozomen. Ecclesiastical History. Ed. William Stearns Davis. Readings in Ancient History: Illustrative Extracts from the Sources. 2 vols. Boston: Allyn and Bacon, 1912-13. Vol. 2. Rome and the West. 295-96. Text modernized by J. S. Arkenberg for internet version. 29 Sep. 2000 <<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/ancient/sozomen-constantinople1.html>>.

Statius. Trans. J. H. Mozley. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1982.

Strabo. Geography. Trans. Horace Leonard Jones. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1988.

Thucydides. The History of the Peloponnesian War. Trans. Charles Forster Smith. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1988-96.

Utopia. The Search for the Ideal Society in the Western World. Ed. Roland Schaer, Gregory Claeys and Lyman Tower Sargent. New York/Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.

Virgilius Maro, Publius. The Aeneid. Trans., intro. W. F. Jackson Knight. NY: Penguin, 1985.

---. Georgics. Trans. H. Rushton Fairclough. Rev. G. P. Goold. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1999-2000.

Xenophon. Memorabilia. Trans. E. C. Marchant. Vol. 4. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1980-97.

Middle Ages: Primary and Secondary Sources

Alcuin. The Bishops, Kings and Saints of York. Ed., trans. Peter Godman. Oxford: Clarendon, 1982.

- Alfonso, Pedro. Disciplina clericalis. Intro. Ma. Jesús Lacarra. Trans. Esperanza Ducay. Zaragoza: Guara, 1980.
- "Los anales de Garci Sánchez, jurado de Sevilla." Ed. J. de Mata Carriazo. Anales de la universidad hispálense 14 (1953): 3-363.
- Antelo Iglesias, Antonio. "La ciudad ideal según fray Francesc Eiximenis y Rodrigo Sánchez de Arévalo." En la España Medieval 6 (1985): 19-50.
- Asensio, Eugenio. "¡Ay, Iherusalem! Planto narrativo del siglo XIII." Nueva Revista de Filología Hispánica 3-4 (Jul-Dec 1960): 251-70.
- Baldwin, Charles Sears. Medieval Rhetoric and Poetic (to 1400). Gloucester, MA: Peter Smith, 1959.
- Benedict. The Marvels of Rome. Trans., ed. Francis Morgan Nichols. NY: Italica Press, 1986.
- Beneyto Pérez, Juan. Glosa castellana al "Regimiento de Príncipes" de Egidio Romano. Madrid, Instituto de Estudios Políticos, 1947.
- Berrigan, Joseph R. "Benzo d'Alessandria and the Cities of Northern Italy." Studies in Medieval and Renaissance History. Vol. 4. Ed. William M. Bowsky. Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press, 1967. 127-192.
- Black, Antony. Political Thought in Europe, 1250-1450. Cambridge: Cambridge U. Press, 1992.
- Blüher, Karl Alfred. Seneca en España. Trans. Juan Conde. Madrid: Gredos, 1983.
- Bonachía Hernando, Juan A. "'Más honrada que ciudad de mis reinos...': la nobleza y el honor en el imaginario urbano (Burgos en la baja edad media)." La ciudad medieval. Aspectos de la vida urbana en la Castilla bajomedieval. Valladolid: Universidad de Valladolid, 1996.
- Bosca, Joan Francesc. Memorial històric. Ed. J. Sobreques i Callico. Barcelona: n. p., 1977.
- Cancionero de Juan Alfonso de Baena. Eds. Brian Dutton and Joaquín González Cuenca. Madrid: Visor, 1993.

- Carmen in honorem Roscidee vallis. Ed., study H. Salvador Martínez. Études de Philologie Romane et d'Histoire Littéraire offertes à Jules Horrent. Liege: J. M. d'Heur and N. Cherubini, 1980. 279-93.
- Chronica parva Ferrariensis. Ed. Lodovico A. Muratori. Vol. 8. Rerum italicarum scriptores. Rome, 1751-53. 469-87.
- Chronicon Astense. Ed. Lodovico A. Muratori. Vol. 11. Rerum italicarum scriptores. 140-52. Rome, 1751-53.
- Corral, Pedro de. Crónica del rey don Rodrigo (Crónica sarracina). Ed., intro. James Donald Fogelquist. Madrid: Clásicos Castalia, 2001.
- Crónica de la población de Ávila. Ed. Amparo Hernández Segura. Valencia: Anubar, 1966.
- Crónica latina de los reyes de Castilla. Ed. Luis Charlo Brea. Madrid: Akal, 1999.
- Crónica mozárabe de 754. Ed. José Eduardo López Pereira. Zaragoza: Anubar, 1980.
- Cronicón de Valladolid. Ed. Pedro Saínz de Baranda. CODOIN 13 (Madrid, 1848): 5-228.
- Curtius, Ernst R. European Literature and the Middle Ages. Trans. Willard Trask. NY: Harper & Row, 1953.
- De Expugnatione Lyxbonensi. The Conquest of Lisbon. Ed., trans. Charles Wendell David. New York: Columbia University Press, 1936.
- De laude pampilonensium. Ed. José María Lacarra. Estudios de Edad Media de la Corona de Aragon 1 (1945): 266-70.
- De laudibus urbium. Ed. C. Halm. Rhetores Latini Minores. Leipzig, 1863. Frankfurt: n.p., 1964. 587.
- Eiximenis, Francesc. Dotzè llibre del Crestià. Ed. Curt Wittlin et al. Girona: Diputació de Girona, 1986.
- . Regiment de la cosa pública. Ed. Daniel de Molins de Rei. Barcelona: Els Nostres Classics, 1927.
- Faral, Edmond. Les arts poétiques du XIIe et du XIIIe siècle. Paris: Champion, 1924.

- Fasoli, Gina. "La coscienza civica nelle 'Laudes civitatum.'" Scritti di storia medievale. Ed. F. Bocchi, et al. Bologna: Emiliana, 1974. 293-318.
- Faulhaber, Charles. Latin Rhetorical Theory in Thirteenth and Fourteenth Century Castile. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1972.
- Fernández de Heredia, Juan. Concordances and Texts of the Fourteenth-Century Aragonese Manuscripts of Juan Fernández de Heredia [microform]. Eds. John Nitti and Lloyd Kasten. Madison: Hispanic Seminary of Medieval Studies, 1982.
- Fitzstephen, William. Norman London. Trans. H. E. Butler. Intro. F. Donald Logan. Essay Frank Stenton. NY: Italica Press, 1990.
- Frugoni, Chiara. A Distant City: Images of Urban Experience in the Medieval World. Trans. William McCuaig. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1991. 54-81.
- Gil de Zamora, Juan. De preconiis Hispanie. Ed., study Manuel de Castro y Castro. Madrid: Universidad Complutense, 1955.
- . Alabanzas e historias de Zamora. Ed., trans. Jenaro Costas Rodríguez. Zamora: Ayuntamiento de Zamora, 1994.
- Gorni, G. "Il Liber Pergaminus di Mosè di Brolo." Studi medievali 11.1 (1970): 409-60.
- Harvey, P. D. A. The History of Topographical Maps: Symbols, Pictures and Surveys. London: Thames and Hudson, 1980.
- Hillgarth, J. N. The Spanish Kingdoms, 1250-1516. 2 vols. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1978.
- Hook, David. The Destruction of Jerusalem. Catalan and Castilian Texts. London: King's College London, Centre for Late Antique & Medieval Studies, 2000.
- Hyde, J. K. "Medieval Descriptions of Cities" Bulletin of the John Rylands Library 48.2 (1966): 308-40.
- Isidore. Etymologiarum sive originum libri XX. Ed. W. M. Lindsay. Vol. 2. Oxford: Clarendon, 1966.

- . Isidori Hispalensis versus. Ed. José María Sánchez Martín. Turnhout: Brepols, 2000.
- . Las historias de los godos, vándalos y suevos de Isidoro de Sevilla. Ed., trans., study Cristóbal Rodríguez Alonso. Leon: Centro de Estudios e Investigación "San Isidro", 1975.
- . Sententiae. Ed. Ursicino Domínguez del Val. Historia de la antigua literatura latina hispano-cristiana. 4 vols. Madrid: Fundación Universitaria Española, 1998.
- Jiménez de Rada, Rodrigo. Historia de rebus Hispanie sive historia gothica. Ed., study Juan Fernández Valverde. Turnholt: Brepols, 1987.
- Kennedy, George A. Classical Rhetoric and Its Christian and Secular Tradition from Ancient to Modern Times. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1980.
- Ladero Quesada, Manuel F. Las ciudades de la Corona de Castilla en la Baja Edad Media (siglos XIII al XV). Madrid: Arco, 1996.
- Latini, Brunetto. The Book of the Treasure. Trans. Paul Barrette and Spurgeon Baldwin. NY: Garland, 1993.
- Liber de laudibus civitatis ticinensis. Vol. 11, part 1. Rerum italicarum scriptores. 16-52. Ed. Giosuè Carducci and Vittorio Fiorini. Bologna: Zanichelli, 1902-. Original version ed. Lodovico A. Muratori. Rome, 1751-53.
- Lida de Malkiel, María Rosa. "La ciudad, tema poético de tono juglaresco en el Cancionero de Baena." Estudios sobre la literatura española del siglo XV. Madrid: Porrúa, 1978. 333-37.
- Linehan, Peter. History and the Historians of Medieval Spain. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993.
- Lomax, Derek W. "El Cronicón Cordubense de Fernando de Salmerón." En la España Medieval 2 (1982): 595-642.
- López de Mendoza, Íñigo (Marqués de Santillana). Comedieta de Ponza, sonetos, serranillas y otras obras. Ed., intro., prol. Regula Rohland de Langbehn. Intro. Vicente Beltrán. Barcelona: Crítica, 1997.

- López de Mendoza, Íñigo (Marqués de Santillana). Obras completas. Ed., intro. Ángel Gómez Moreno and Maximilian P. A. M. Kerkhof. Barcelona: Planeta, 1988.
- Lucas de Tuy. Crónica de España. Ed. Julio Puyol. Madrid: Rev. de Archivos, Bibliotecas y Museos, 1926.
- Lucian [12th cent.]. Liber Luciani de laude Cestrie. Ed. M. V. Taylor. London: The Record Society, 1912.
- Madoz, P. "De laude Spanie. Estudio sobre las fuentes del prólogo isidoriano." Razón y Fe 116 (March 1939): 247 ff.
- . "Ecos del saber antiguo en las letras de la España visigoda." Razón y Fe 122 (1941): 228 ff.
- Manuel, Juan. Libro de los estados. Ed., intro, notes R. B. Tate and I. R. Macpherson. Oxford: Clarendon, 1974.
- Maravall, José Antonio. "Franciscanismo, burguesía y mentalidad precapitalista: la obra de Eiximenis." Estudios de historia del pensamiento español. Orig. series (Middle Ages). 3rd ed. Madrid: Ed. Cultura Hispánica, 1983. 371-83.
- . "Los orígenes medievales del sentimiento de comunidad hispánica" in El concepto de España en la Edad Media. Madrid: Centro de Estudios Constitucionales, 1981.
- Menéndez Pidal, Ramón. "Estudios sobre el Romancero." Obras completas. Vol. 11. Madrid: Espasa-Calpe, 1973.
- Mollat, M. and P. Wolff. Uñas azules, Jaques y Ciompi. Las revoluciones populares en Europa en los siglos XIV y XV. Madrid: Siglo XXI, 1979.
- More Latin Lyrics, from Virgil to Milton. Trans. Helen Waddell. Ed. and intro. Felicitas Corrigan. London: Gollancz, 1971.
- Muntaner, Ramón. Crónica. Ed. Marina Gustà. Barcelona: Edicions 62, 1979.
- Pais, Álvaro. Espelho dos reis. Ed., trans. Miguel Pinto de Meneses. Lisbon: Instituto de Alta Cultura, 1955.

Pérez de Guzmán, Fernán. "Loores de los claros varones de España." Cancionero Castellano del siglo XV. Ed. R. Foulché Delbosc. Vol. 1. Madrid: Bailly Baillié, 1912.

Pérez de la Calzada, Guillermo. "Guillelmi Petri de Calciata. Rithmi de Iulia Romula seu Ispalensi Urbe (a. 1250)." Ed. Diego Catalán and Juan Gil. Anuario de estudios medievales. Instituto de historia medieval de España 5 (1968): 549-58.

---. Gvillelmi Petri de Calciata. Rithmi de Ivlia Romvla Sev Ispalensi Vrbe. Ed. Rocío Carande Herrero. Chronica Hispana saeculi XIII. Turnholt: Brepols, 1997. 181-209.

---. Un poema latino a Sevilla. Versos de Julia Rómula o la urbe hispalense de Guillermo Pérez de la Calzada (1250). Ed., trans. Rocío Carande Herrero. Seville: Ayuntamiento de Sevilla, 1986.

Pescador, María del Carmen. "Tres poemas medievales." Nueva Revista de Filología Hispánica 3-4 (Jul-Dec 1960): 242-50.

The Pilgrim's Guide: A Critical Edition. Ed., notes Jeanne Krochalis and Alison Stones. Trans. Paula Gerson et al. London: Harvey Miller, 1998.

Poema de Fernán González. Ed. Miguel Ángel Muro. Logroño: Instituto de Estudios Riojanos, 1994.

Poetae Latini Minores. Ed. P. Burmanno. Leiden: C. Wishoff and D. Goedval, 1731.

Poetarum latinorum medii aevi. Ed. E. Duemmler. Vol. 4, part II-1. Mon. Germ. Hist. Berlin: Weidmann, 1914.

Primera crónica general de España. Ed. Ramón Menéndez Pidal. 2 vols. Madrid: Gredos, 1955.

Reckert, Stephen. The Matter of Britain and the Praise of Spain (The History of a Panegyric). Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 1967.

Rico, Francisco. "Aristóteles Hispanus: En torno a Gil de Zamora, Petrarca y Juan de Mena." Italia medioevale e umanistica 10 (1967): 143-60.

Riva, Bonvesin de la. De Magnalibus Mediolani. Meraviglie di Milano. Ed., trans., notes Paolo Chiesa. Milan: Scheiwiller, 1998.

Rucquoi, Adeline. "Des villes nobles pour le Roi." Realidad e imágenes del poder. España a fines de la Edad Media. Madrid: Ámbito, 1988. 195-214.

Sears, Helen L. "The Rimado de Palaçio and the 'De regimine principum' Tradition of the Middle Ages." Hispanic Review 20 (1952): 1-27.

Las Siete Partidas. Antología. Selection, prol., notes Francisco López Estrada and María Teresa López García-Berdoy. Madrid: Castalia, 1992.

Theoderich [Theodericus of Wurzburg]. Guide to the Holy Land. Notes, bibliog. Ronald G. Musto. Trans. Aubrey Stewart. NY: Italica Press, 1986.

Tratado de la comunidad. Ed. Frank Anthony Ramírez. London: Tamesis, 1988.

Versus de Verona, Versum de Mediolano civitate. Ed. G. B. Pighi. Studi Pubblicati dell'Istituto di Filologia Classica 7. Bologna: n. p., 1960.

Vila, Soledad. La ciudad de Eiximenis: Un proyecto teórico de urbanismo en el siglo XIV. Valencia: Diputación Provincial de Valencia, 1984.

Vita sancti Athanasii episcopi Neapolitani. Ed. Lodovico A. Muratori. Vol. 2, part 2. 1051-64. Rerum italicarum scriptores. Rome, 1751-53.

Wood, Diana. Clement VI. The Pontificate and Ideas of an Avignon Pope. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989.

Zanna, Paolo. "'Descriptiones urbium' and Elegy in Latin and Vernaculars in the Early Middle Ages." Studi Medievali 3rd ser. 32.2 (1991): 523-96.

Humanist/Early Modern: Primary and Secondary Sources

Argan, Giulio C. The Renaissance City. New York: Braziller, 1969.

Avesani, Rino. "In laudem civitatis Veronae." Studi Storici Veronesi Luigi Simeoni 26/27 (1976-77): 183-97.

Baldó i Lacomba, Marc. La Universitat de Valencia. Valencia: Institució Alfons el Magnànim, 1986.

Baron, Hans. "A Defense of the View of the Quattrocento First Offered in The Crisis of the Early Italian Renaissance." In Search of Florentine Civic Humanism. By Baron. 2 vols. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1988.

---. The Crisis of the Early Italian Renaissance. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1955.

Benevolo, Leonardo. Trans. Carl Ipsen. The European City. Oxford: Blackwell, 1993.

Bouza Álvarez, Fernando. "Lisboa Sozinha, Quase Viúva. A Cidade e a Mudança da Corte no Portugal dos Filipes." Penelope 13 (1995): 71-93.

Bruni, Leonardo. Laudatio Florentine urbis. Ed., intro. Stefano U. Baldassarri. Florence: Sismel, 2000.

Buranello, Robert. "The Structure and Strategy of Leonardo Bruni's Laudatio Florentinae Urbis." Quaderni d'Italianistica 16:1 (Spring 1995): 17-31.

Cartagena, Alfonso de. Discurso...sobre la precedencia del rey católico sobre el de Inglaterra en el Concilio de Basilea. Ed. Mario Penna. Prosistas castellanos del siglo XV. Biblioteca de autores españoles. Vol. 116. Madrid: Atlas, 1959. 205-33.

Castillo, Diego del. "Parténope la fulgente. Una elegía epistolar a la muerte del Magnánimo." Ed., study Lourdes Simó Goberna. LEMIR 3. 15 Jan. 2002 <<http://parnaseo.uv.es/Lemir/Revista/Revista3/Lourdes/>>.

- Cecchetti, Dario. "'Descriptio loci' e 'laudatio urbis'." Persistenza e rinnovamento di strutture retoriche nell'opera di Nicolas de Clamanges. Annali Istituto Universitario Orientale, Napoli, Sezione Romanza 35.2 (July 1993): 381-431.
- Chrysoloras, Manuel. Comparison of Old and New Rome. Ed., trans. Christine Smith. Architecture in the Culture of Early Humanism. Ethics, Aesthetics, and Eloquence, 1400-1470. New York & Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992. Chapter 8 (study) and Appendix (text).
- The City-State in Five Cultures. Eds., intro. Robert Griffeth and Carol G. Thomas. Oxford: ABC-Clio, 1981.
- Cordoba en el siglo XV. Ed., intro., trans. Manuel Nieto Cumplido. Cordoba: Excm. Diputación Provincial, 1973.
- Decembrio, Pier Candido. "Il De laudibus Mediolanensium urbis panegyricus." Ed., intro. Giuseppe Petraglione. Archivio Storico Lombardo (4th ser.) 8 (1907): 5-45.
- Di Camillo, Ottavio. "Humanism in Spain." Renaissance Humanism. Ed. Albert Rabil, Jr. 3 vols. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1988. 2:55-108.
- . "Las teorías de la nobleza en el pensamiento ético de Diego de Valera." Mosén Diego de Valera y su tiempo. Cuenca: Excmo. Ayuntamiento de Cuenca, 1996. 47-81.
- . El humanismo castellano del siglo XV. Trans. Manuel Lloris. Valencia: Fernando Torres, 1976.
- . Encyclopedia of the Renaissance. New York: Macmillan/Scribners, 1999. 218-20.
- . "Interpretations of Humanism in Recent Spanish Renaissance Studies." Renaissance Quarterly 50.4 (Winter 1997): 1190-1201.
- The Earthly Republic. Italian Humanists on Government and Society. Eds., trans. Benjamin G. Kohl, Ronald G. Witt and Elizabeth B. Welles. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania P, 1978.

Elorriaga del Hierro, Casilda. "La descriptio en las retóricas españolas de 1500-1565. Bases para su estudio." Diss. University Complutense de Madrid, 1991.

Goldbrunner, Hermann. "Laudatio urbis. Zu neueren Untersuchungen über das humanistische Städtelob." Quellen und Forschungen aus italienischen Archiven und Bibliotheken 63 (1983): 313-28.

Gómez Moreno, Ángel. España y la Italia de los humanistas. Primeros ecos. Madrid: Gredos, 1994.

González Vázquez, José. "Consideraciones en torno a algunos panegíricos de los Reyes Católicos." Humanismo y pervivencia del mundo clásico. II. Homenaje al profesor Luis Gil. Eds. José María Maestre Maestre, et al. Cádiz: Gobierno de Aragón, et al., 1997. 1413-19.

Grafton, Anthony. Forgers and Critics. Creativity and Duplicity in Western Scholarship. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1990.

Guevara, Antonio de. Menosprecio de corte y alabanza de aldea. Ed., intro. Francisco Márquez Villanueva. Santander: Universidad de Cantabria, 1998.

Hammer, William. "Encomia of Cities from Antiquity to Humanism." Diss. University of Chicago, 1938.

Hankins, James. "Rhetoric, History, and Ideology: The Civic Panegyrics of Leonardo Bruni." Renaissance Civic Humanism. Reappraisals and Reflections. Ed. James Hankins. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000. 143-78.

Hankins, James. Plato in the Italian Renaissance. 2 vols. Leiden: Brill, 1990.

Hardison, O. B., Jr. The Enduring Monument. A Study of the Idea of Praise in Renaissance Literary Theory and Practice. Westport, CN: Greenwood Press, 1973.

In Burgensis civitatis laudem Joanni de Velasco Castellae Comiti stabili dicata oratio (BNM ms. 18729/19).

Italian Renaissance Studies. A tribute to the late Cecilia M. Ady. Ed., intro. E. F. Jacob. London: Faber and Faber, 1960. 40-41.

Jacks, Philip. The Antiquarian and the Myth of Antiquity. The Origins of Rome in Renaissance Thought. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993.

Kagan, Richard L. "Clio and the Crown: Writing History in Habsburg Spain." Spain, Europe and the Atlantic World. Essays in Honour of John H. Elliott. Eds. Richard L. Kagan and Geoffrey Parker. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1995. 73-99.

---. "La corografía en la Castilla moderna. Género, historia, nación." Studia Historica. Historia Moderna 13 (1995): 47-59.

---. "Urbs and Civitas in Sixteenth- and Seventeenth-Century Spain." Profiling the City: Six Studies in Urban Cartography. Ed. David Buisseret. Chicago: University of Chicago P, 1998. 75-108.

---. Urban Images of the Hispanic World, 1493-1793. Collab. Fernando Marías. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2000.

Kristeller, Paul Oskar. "An Unpublished Description of Naples by Francesco Bandini." Studies in Renaissance Thought and Letters. Rome: Edizioni di storia e letteratura, 1969. 395-410.

---. "Rhetoric in Medieval and Renaissance Culture." Renaissance Eloquence. Studies in the Theory and Practice of Renaissance Rhetoric. Ed. James J. Murphy. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1983. 1-19.

---. Renaissance Thought and Its Sources. Ed. Michael Mooney. New York: Columbia University Press, 1979.

Lanza, Antonio. Firenze contro Milano. Gli intellettuali fiorentini nelle guerre con i Visconti (1390-1440). Roma: De Rubeis, 1991. 136-53.

.

Laurenti, Joseph L. "La fórmula laudis como motivo clásico en la topografía picaresca peninsular." Caminería hispánica. Actas del II congreso internacional de caminería hispánica. Vol. 3. Madrid: Patronato Arcipreste de Hita, 1996. 219-32.

Manetti, Giannozzo. Laudatio Ianuensium. Ed., trans. Giovanna Petti Balbi. Milan: Marzorati, 1974.

Marchi, G. P. "Forma Veronae. L'immagine della città nella letteratura medievale e umanistica." Ritratto di Verona. Lineamenti di una storia urbanistica. Ed. L. Puppi. Verona: n. p., 1978. 1-21.

Marineo Sículo, Lucio. Crónica d'Aragón. Barcelona: El Albir, 1974.

Martines, Lauro. Power and Imagination. City-states in Renaissance Italy. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1979.

McPheeters, D. W. El humanista español Alonso de Proaza. Valencia: Castalia, 1961.

Muñoz y Romero, Tomás. Diccionario bibliográfico-histórico de los antiguos reinos, provincias, ciudades, villas, iglesias y santuarios de España. Madrid: Rivadeneyra, 1858.

Orígenes de la monarquía hispánica: propaganda y legitimación (ca. 1400-1520). Dir. José Manuel Nieto Soria. Madrid: Dykinson, 1999.

Palencia, Alfonso de. A Jorge de Trebizond. Epístolas latinas. Ed., intro., trans. Robert B. Tate and Rafael Alemany Ferrer. Barcelona: Universidad Autónoma de Barcelona, 1982. 57-63.

---. De laudibus Ispalis ad Reverendum Dominum Archidiaconum de Carrione Alfonsi Palentini epistola. Epístolas latinas. Ed., intro., trans. Robert B. Tate and Rafael Alemany Ferrer. Barcelona: Universidad Autónoma de Barcelona, 1982.

---. Gesta Hispaniensia ex annalibus suorum dierum collecta. Ed., study, notes, trans. Brian Tate and Jeremy Lawrance. 2 vols. Madrid: Real Academia de la Historia, 1998.

- . Tratado de la perfección del triunfo militar. Ed. Mario Penna. Prosistas castellanos del siglo XV. Biblioteca de autores españoles. Vol. 116. Madrid: Atlas, 1959. 360-62.
- Pau, Jeroni. Barcino. Ed., notes, intro., trans. Mariàngela Vilallonga. Vol. 1 of Obres. Barcelona: Curial, 1986. 290-347.
- Pio II e la cultura del suo tempo. Atti del I convegno internazionale, 1989. Ed. Luisa Rotondi Secchi Tarugi. Milan: Guerini, 1991.
- Pius II. Basel. Intro. Edgar Bonjour. Basel: Holbein, 1951. 35-45.
- . Enea Silvio Piccolomini: Papst Pius II. Ausgewählte Texte aus seinen Schriften. Ed., trans. Berthe Widmer. Basel & Stuttgart, 1960. 348-71
- . Vienna nel'400, dalla Historia Friderici III imperatoris, nel testo latino e l'italiano a fronte. Trans., pref. Baccio Ziliotto. Trieste: Zibaldone, 1958.
- . Voyage en Suisse. Eds., trans. Claude Reichler and Roland Ruffieux. Paris: Robert Laffont, 1998. 47-53.
- Proaza, Alonso de. Oratio luculenta de laudibus Valentiae. Valencia: Leonardo Hutz, 1505.
- Rainolde, Richard. The Foundation of Rhetorike. Ed., intro. Francis R. Johnson. New York: Scholars' Facsimiles & Reprints, 1945.
- Rasche, Thilemann. Descriptio belli inter Henricos iuniorem et seniore duces Brunsvic et Luneburg civitatemque Brunsvic. Vol. 2. Scriptores Brunsvic. Hannover: G. G. Leibnitius, 1710. 88-91.
- Relaciones topográficas de Felipe II. Coord. Alfredo Alvar Ezquerro. 4 vols. Madrid: Comunidad de Madrid, 1993.
- Robey, David and John Law. "The Venetian Myth and the 'De Republica Veneta' of Pier Paolo Vergerio." Rinascimento (2nd series) 15 (1975): 3-57.

- Salutati, Coluccio. Invectiva in Antonium Luschum Vicentinum. Prosatori Latini del Quattrocento. Ed. Eugenio Garin. Milan & Naples: Riccardo Ricciardi, 1962. 3-37.
- Sánchez de Arévalo, Rodrigo. Suma de la política. Ed. Mario Penna. Prosistas castellanos del siglo XV. Biblioteca de autores españoles. Vol. 116. Madrid: Atlas, 1959. 249-309.
- Santosuosso, Antonio. "Leonardo Bruni Revisited: A Reassessment of Hans Baron's Thesis on the Influence of the Classics in the Laudatio Florentinae urbis." Aspects of Late Medieval Government. Essays Presented to J. R. Lander. Ed. J. G. Rowe. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1986. 25-51.
- Schmidt, Paul Gerhard. "Mittelalterliches und humanistisches Städtelob." Die Rezeption der Antike. Zum Problem der Kontinuität zwischen Mittelalter und Renaissance. Ed. August Buck. Hamburg: Hauswedell, 1981. 119-28.
- Scott, Izora. Controversies Over the Imitation of Cicero. New York: Teachers College, 1910.
- Seigel, Jerrold E. "'Civic Humanism' or Ciceronian Rhetoric? The Culture of Petrarch and Bruni." Past & Present 34 (July 1966): 3-48.
- Smith, Christine. Architecture in the Culture of Early Humanism. Ethics, Aesthetics, and Eloquence, 1400-1470. New York & Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992.
- Sobrarias, Juan. Alabanzas de Alcañiz. Discurso del alcañizano Juan Sobrarias. Ed., study, trans. José María Maestre Maestre. Cádiz/Alcañiz: Instituto de Estudios Humanísticos, 2000.
- Stäuble, Antonio. "Due panegirici di città tra medioevo e rinascimento." Bibliothèque d'Humanisme et Renaissance. Vol. 38. Geneva: Librairie Droz, 1976. 157-64.
- Tate, Robert B. "The Civic Humanism of Alfonso de Palencia." Renaissance and Modern Studies 23 (1979): 25-44.
- . Ensayos sobre la historiografía peninsular del siglo XV. Trans. Jesús Díaz. Madrid: Gredos, 1970.

- . "Los trabajos del cronista cuatrocentista." Studia Historica. Historia Moderna 13 (1995): 27-46.
- . and Anscari M. Mundó. "The compendiolum of Alfonso de Palencia: A Humanist Treatise on the Geography of the Iberian Peninsula." The Journal of Medieval and Renaissance Studies 5.2 (Fall 1975): 253-78.
- . "La geografía humanística y los historiadores españoles del siglo XV." Belfast Spanish and Portuguese Papers. Eds. P. S. N. Russell-Gebbett et al. Belfast: n. p., 1979. 237-42.
- Thompson, I. A. A. "Castile, Spain and the Monarchy: The Political Community from patria natural to patria nacional." Spain, Europe and the Atlantic World. Essays in Honour of John H. Elliott. Eds. Richard L. Kagan and Geoffrey Parker. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1995. 125-59.
- Tres opúsculos de Nuño de Guzmán y Giannozzo Manetti: un episodio del proto-humanismo español. Ed., intro. Jeremy N. H. Lawrance. Salamanca: Diputación, 1989.
- Vagad, Gauberto Fabricio de. Corónica de Aragón. Intro. María del Carmen Orcástegui Gros. Zaragoza: Cortes de Aragón, 1996.
- Valera, Diego de. Doctrinal de príncipes. Ed. Mario Penna. Prosistas castellanos del siglo XV. Biblioteca de Autores Españoles. Vol. 116. Madrid: Atlas, 1959. 173-202.
- . Origen de Troya y Roma. Ed. Mario Penna. Prosistas castellanos del siglo XV. Biblioteca de autores españoles. Vol. 116. Madrid: Atlas, 1959. 155-59.
- Vilallonga, Mariàngela. La literatura Llatina a Catalunya al segle XV: repertori bio-bibliogràfic. Barcelona: Curial, 1993.
- Widmer, Berthe. "Enea Silvios Lob der Stadt Basel und seine Vorlagen." Basler Zeitschrift für Geschichte und Altertumskunde 58/59 (1959): 111-38.