GOING MOBILE: THE BODY AT WORK IN BLACK AND WHITE WOMEN'S TRAVEL NARRATIVES, 1841-1857

by

CHERYL J. FISH

A dissertation submitted to the Graduate Faculty in English in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy, The City University of New York.

1996

This manuscript has been read and accepted for the Graduate Faculty in English in satisfaction of the dissertation requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

6 January 1996
Date

Jane Marcus
Chair of Examining Committee

3 January 1996
Date

Executive Officer

Barbara Bowen

David S. Reynolds

Neal Tolchin

Supervisory Committee

THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

ABSTRACT

Going Mobile: The Body at Work in Black and White Women's Travel Narratives, 1841-1857

Nancy Prince, Mary Seacole and Margaret Fuller published narrative accounts of their travels as forms of social critique in the 1840s and 50s, positioning themselves as public intellectuals and benevolent workers whose mobility enabled them to address debates on emigration, emancipation and the rights of women and people of color.[1] Through what I am calling a "mobile subjectivity," a fluid and provisional epistemology that depends on shifting relationship to persons, forms of labor, institutions, and locations, these women used the vehicle of the travelogue to call for expanded notions of enlightenment democracy and citizenship. Nancy Prince and Mary Seacole, free-born black women from Boston and Jamaica whose journeys took them to Europe and the Americas, sometimes found themselves strategically aligned with colonial policies as they trespassed at sites of empire and war. Prince and Seacole's travels were connected to forms of labor that centered on healing and uplifting various black and white

---

[1] Nancy Prince, The West Indies, Being A Description of the Islands, Progress of Christianity, Education and Liberty Among the Colored Population Generally (Boston: Dow & Jackson, 1841) and A Narrative of the Life and Travels of Mrs. Nancy Prince, Written by Herself, (Boston: William A. Hall, Printer, 1850). Mary Seacole, Wonderful Adventures of Mrs. Seacole in Many Lands (London: James Blackwood, 1857). Margaret Fuller, Summer on the Lakes, in 1843 (Boston: Charles C. Little and James Brown, 1844).

populations; Prince was a seamstress, educator, philanthropist, and missionary in Russia and Jamaica, and Seacole was a hotel proprietor and "doctress" in Panama and at the Crimean War front. Their works, when read in dialogue with slave and spiritual narratives, with which they share generic commonality and difference, change the way we frame canonical debates on black women's agency and lead us to rethink the dialectic between slavery and freedom.

Margaret Fuller, like Nancy Prince, was a New Englander who had assumed responsibility for her siblings before escaping home; however, as one of the leading thinkers of the Transcendentalist movement, Fuller's travelogue Summer on the Lakes, in 1843, presents us with Romantic aesthetics and theories of racial hierarchies as the keys to understanding her ambivalence about America as a hybrid nation. She hoped a rigid, patriarchal European past would evolve into a visionary, expansive American form of genius that would tolerate gender and some forms of racial difference.

Cultural restraints that would silence and/or dismiss white and black women as speakers and writers account for the interesting contradictions we find in each woman's travel texts, expressed through strategies of veiling and exposing their vulnerable bodies at work on colonial frontiers. This study, which extends Paul Gilroy's Black Atlantic paradigm to include black women, underscores the fact that there is no essential woman traveller's or black woman writer's resistant

voice--cultural and familial background, class position, and age need to be taken into account, as well as how factors such as race affected the mechanics and physical repercussions of each woman's journey. Prince, Seacole and Fuller often displaced their bodies through the use of synecdoche, or metaphor, to divert the reader from the real political threat their critique signified; each incorporated other, dialogic voices in order to authenticate her place as an ethical, resistant truth teller. Prince relies on biblical allegory and language that draws on the style of the African-American preacher to call for secular, political action in the U.S. and Jamaica; her arms become symbols of her empowered vigilance and corporeal weakness. Mary Seacole adapts the voice of a picara, a kind of rogue heroine, to parody Englishness. She pays excessive homage to English values in order to convince readers to support her right to heal the wounded in the Crimea after Florence Nightingale had refused her services; her soft heart and maternal breast are figured as pillows for English soldiers. Margaret Fuller interrupts her own narrative with authoritative texts by other travellers, and she displaces the headaches from which she suffered on to stories of hybrid, grotesque foreign women who share commonalities with herself and the defeated Native Americans and frontier women she met in Michigan, Illinois and Wisconsin.

Hardly any critical attention has been given to the two black women's texts until recently, but the linguistic

strategies, survival tactics and recasting of the quest motif by Prince, Seacole, and Fuller advance our complex understandings of the construction of race and gender as they intersect with conceptions of nation. When placed in dialogue with writing by ex-slaves, the mobility and agency of free-born blacks who wrote and travelled by choice demand that we re-envision notions of African-American subjectivity, homeplace and mothering; in studying travel and travel writing, we must historically refine the dialectic of slavery with the kind of options that mobile, free-born blacks were able to seize upon, despite hardships and dangers. By juxtaposing travelogues written by black and white women in the same period, I am presenting three different, complex strategies in which a hybrid travel narrative is the chosen vehicle for visions of personal and social transformation.

####

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This page is one of the easiest to write, but undoubtedly I will leave someone out. My advisor, Jane Marcus, provided me with support, guidance and emotional sustenance throughout the research and writing process, providing me with books, contacts, stories, and lunch. She showed me how to become a scholar who goes directly to the archives. Barbara Bowen did not hesitate to ask tough questions, but did so in such a gracious and supportive manner. The other members of my committee, Neal Tolchin and David Reynolds, kept me conscious of the importance of clarifying the meaning of my research, and mediating between theory and history. My parents and friends put up with years of hearing about my anxieties, struggles, obscure literary pursuits, and the need for quiet time. Thank you all for your support and confidence in me.

I would like to thank all of the people who read parts of this dissertation in earlier stages. Particularly Sandy Flitterman-Lewis, Page Delano, Shuang Shen, Donna Kessler-Eng, David Wolf, Dorothy Helly, Marc Bousquet and Sharon Lerner. Thanks to Mitch Firestone for his help and responsiveness to my questions about computers and software.

The Northeast Seminar on Black Religion provided me with an important forum in which to present and develop my work on Nancy Prince. I want to also thank the members of the Women's Studies Faculty Seminar at Nassau Community College for their responses to my presentation on Nancy Prince. Sharon Leder's

comments were especially helpful. Stacy Spenser was generous in sharing her thoughts on Margaret Fuller and women's travel with me.

Research Fellowships from The Henry Francis du Pont Winterthur Museum and The Library Company of Philadelphia nurtured my intellectual development, giving me material support and access to wonderful archives in which much of the contextual research for this dissertation was conducted. The support of the staffs at both places was impeccable. I am especially grateful to Phil Lapansky at The Library Company for his assistance. The Belle Zeller Fellowship from The CUNY Graduate School was particularly timely. Manuscript material from the Margaret Fuller Ossoli papers, shelfmark MS AM 1086 vol. V, p. 41-79 and vol. X, p 10, have been quoted by permission of the Houghton Library, Harvard University. I thank Leslie A. Morris, the Curator of Manuscripts.

GOING MOBILE: THE BODY AT WORK
IN BLACK AND WHITE WOMEN'S TRAVEL NARRATIVES, 1841-1857
BY CHERYL J. FISH

TABLE OF CONTENTS PAGE #

Cheryl Fish

INTRODUCTION

Going Mobile: The Body at Work in Black and White Women's Travel Narratives, 1841-1857

As members of a highly mobile culture in which we may board a plane at night and wake up on another continent as the sun rises, we are both casual and contemplative about the journeys we make in search of pleasure and transformation. In the early nineteenth century, technology and the desire for new opportunities made it possible for large numbers of Americans and Europeans to travel as tourists, visitors, and emigrants. The idea of the liberating power of movement through particular geographical spaces led me to explore the meaning of travel for three women of the Americas: Nancy Prince, Mary Seacole and Margaret Fuller. Each woman published an account or accounts of her travels as a form of social critique in the 1840s and 50s and positioned herself as what we would now call a self-made public intellectual. [1] For all three, travel provided an escape from domestic obligations, but it was not undertaken for the sake of mere

---

[1] Nancy Prince, The West Indies, Being A Description of the Islands, Progress of Christianity, Education and Liberty Among the Colored Population Generally (Boston: Dow & Jackson, 1841) and A Narrative of the Life and Travels of Mrs. Nancy Prince, Written by Herself, (Boston: William A. Hall, Printer, 1850). Mary Seacole, Wonderful Adventures of Mrs. Seacole in Many Lands (London: James Blackwood, 1857). Margaret Fuller, Summer on the Lakes, in 1843 (Boston: Charles C. Little and James Brown, 1844).

adventure or education; each combined her desire for action by finding a "field of usefulness" (Prince, 43) through which to explore the wider world.

In order to justify the desire to participate meaningfully in the public sphere and to envision more just public policies, these women journeyed to outposts of conflict and imperial expansion. They trespassed at sites of empire and war, and showed up at nationalistic crossroads where emancipation and emigration were creating mobile, racially hybrid populations. Because of limited opportunities available to free black women, Nancy Prince's and Mary Seacole's travels were connected to forms of labor that were physically and emotionally benevolent, and at least took the interests of empire into account; Prince was a seamstress, philanthropist, teacher, and missionary in Russia and Jamaica, while Seacole was a "doctress," hotel proprietor and surrogate mother to English soldiers in the Crimean War. On the other hand, Margaret Fuller, one of the leading thinkers of the New England Transcendentalist movement, was a belligerent tourist and would-be ethnographer in the American Midwest in 1843, searching for a proper field of action from which to perform her work as a public intellectual and writer. Influenced by Romantic aesthetics and emerging theories of biological fitness and racial hierarchy, Fuller's concerns about intellectual life and the body were expressed through her analysis of the hardships faced by frontier women and a

concern for the Native Americans who had already been driven away.

Cultural restraints that would silence and/or dismiss white women and black women and men as speakers and writers account for the anxieties we find, expressed consciously and unconsciously, in these travel texts. Faith in the ultimate righteousness of Enlightenment democracy and reason caused all three women to mediate outrage at the hypocrisy they encountered with belief in a more just future; comparing cultures literally broadened their minds, as travel is always supposed to do, and contributed to the authority they claimed in pointing out racial or gender biases. Even the utopian aspects of their thought, however, were tempered by an undercurrent of ambivalence, which was partially expressed in the way they veiled and exposed their own physically engaged and yet vulnerable women's bodies.

Here, I want to locate my own point of departure. As an American Jewish woman aware of certain historical diasporas, I am driven by an interest in the border and water crossings that are made as people emigrate, meet, and mingle in history and in national spaces. I have found that this work defies simplistic notions or categories--context and contestation seem more and more important as I acknowledge the limits of my own reading across and through race and class, and the desire to illuminate this extremely complex material. For instance, the lack of concrete information on Nancy Prince and her own

condensed and elliptical writing style requires that any student of Prince's thought must acknowledge the part that speculation plays in our analysis. The theories of racial and scientific hierarchies that fascinated people in the antebellum nineteenth century leave their imprint, sometimes more overtly than others, in the works of Prince, Seacole and Fuller; my aim is to read their narratives historically, pointing out the contradictions such theories bring forth in each text. This study underscores the fact that there is no essential woman traveller's voice or black woman writer's resistant voice--each woman's cultural and familial background, her class position, and her age need to be taken into account, as well as how factors such as race and gender affect the mechanics and physical repercussions of her journey (for instance, because of her race, Nancy Prince was not allowed to stay in a cabin on board ship, but forced to remain on deck where she became ill). My intention is not to make any sweeping generalizations for women as travellers, for I suspect that there are commonalities as well as differences they share with particular male travellers. In addition, there were other women who travelled and wrote social critiques in the same period, but the three I have chosen have allowed me to illustrate overlapping and yet distinct strategies for deployment of what I am calling a mobile subjectivity--a fluid and provisional epistemology and subject position that depends upon one's relationship to specific persons, incidents,

locations, and space. These women assigned specific and often contradictory characteristics to their mobile bodies as they engaged in benevolent work and critical thinking, creating forms of agency and resistance which they documented in writing. Thus, I compare three women's travelogues with specific accounts by other travellers, many of whom were men travelling to similar places in the same time frame, in order to contextualize the women's approaches to narrative and to understand their exceptionality and common ground. I pay special attention to the way Prince, Seacole and Fuller formulated or engaged with theories of racial hybridity and the possibility of transcultural alliances as they physically and intellectually criss-crossed the black and white Atlantic.

As many scholars have observed, at the heart of the Western journey is the encounter with the other who becomes the mirror through which the speaking subject assesses or compares his or her experience of known with unknown. Often this leads to a subject/object divide or an "us" versus "them" mindset, with the Westerner's superiority assumed. At times, the women in this study adhere to this paradigm, but through a mobile subjectivity, they often avoid binary oppositions by positioning themselves as marginalized foreigners or as objects of another's gaze, and they allow a chorus of dialogic voices to interrupt and commingle with their own narration, decentering, valorizing, or opposing their views. That their

texts, with their fascinating linguistic strategies, survival tactics, and visionary insights have failed to be acknowledged or integrated within an ongoing recuperative project in global transcultural studies as its practitioners attempt to posit a more complex understanding of race and national identities, is a form of silencing that must be challenged. For example, Paul Gilroy included no in-depth analysis of black women's transcultural reconceptualizations of the meaning of race and nationality in his important book The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double Consciousness. And Karen Lawrence's recent study of women as travellers and wanderers, Penelope Voyages: Women and Travel in the British Literary Tradition examines the ways in which white women serve as ambiguous mediators of race and gender on the imperial frontier, but her study of diverse genres and periods ignores the writing of women of color such as Mary Seacole, thus continuing to marginalize the voices of black women and eliminating their strategic revisions of the journey.

My approach to women's travel writing comes out of interdisciplinary pursuits and training in American and English literature, feminist theories, and African-American and Cultural Studies. It follows logically from thinking about the history of women's locations away from traditional domestic spaces, and from following in women's footsteps via the records of their particular voyages. My work is grounded in feminist materialism, the study of genres, and the reading

of literature in an American Studies context. Archival research has enabled me to carefully historicize the women travellers in this study, while psychoanalytic theory has led me to investigate subconscious processes as signified in language and in textual gaps. My reading has had me accompanying many travellers to the Caribbean and Russia, as well as taking me into the fields of folklore, ethnography, philosophy, religion, and the history of science. The importance of acknowledging positionality as part of critical practice, and the necessity of analyzing the politics of location as lived by specific bodies moving through time and space has been conveyed to me in the work of Adrienne Rich, Audre Lorde and Donna Haraway. The writing and teaching of Gayatri Spivak, Jane Marcus, bell hooks, Barbara Bowen and others have reminded me to use theory as a tool to examine the intersections of gender, race and class, and to refuse simplistic formulations that would either celebrate or condemn a writer for her opinions and strategies of authentication. These mentors constantly remind me that a sense of humor and perseverance as an activist ground a feminist critic in her community and help her to survive. The postmodern travellers' tales that I encountered in the works of Paul Gilroy, James Clifford, Homi Bhabha, Trinh T. Min-ha and Robert J.C. Young have inspired me to work as interdisciplinarily as possible and to be both local and global in my thinking about race and nation. M.M. Bakhtin's writings have proven insightful in so

many ways--his theories on the grotesque and on dialogism and heteroglossia have paved the way for me to explain how narrative strategies used by Prince, Seacole and Fuller created hybrid, multi-voiced travelogues. My work on Nancy Prince has benefited from groundbreaking studies on the writings of free-born African American women by Francis Smith Foster and Carla Peterson. Many studies on Jamaican history, religion and folklife enabled me to navigate Prince and Seacole's complicated and differing relationship to Caribbean culture, as well as how it intersected with their respective American and British identifications. Ziggi Alexander and Audrey Dewjee's significant research on Mary Seacole, in which they locate her as a subject with Jamaican and British cultural origins and a strong English identity, has helped to illuminate Seacole's portrayal of Americans by thinking about her desire to appeal to English readers. I read Seacole, however, as a woman of the Americas and claim her as a subject whose work should be seen as significant on both sides of the Atlantic. The outpouring of books on travel and travel writing has created valuable interdisciplinary resources; from Mary Louise Pratt's Imperial Eyes, I learned a method of reading the politics of exchange in the "contact zone"; Sara Mills' Discourses of Difference took up the question of gender in more depth than Pratt had, and analyzed selected English women's travels and the politics of travel writing with a powerful Foucauldian argument. Carol Boyce Davies' Black

Women, Writing and Identity: Migrations of the Subject extended the paradigm to look at black women's subjectivities in a migratory, boundary breaking context. In Margaret Fuller studies, Charles Capper's biography, Christina Zwarg's insightful work, Bell Chevigny's generous and wide-ranging attention to all things Fuller, and Robert Hudspeth's wonderful edition of the letters have been indispensable guides.

****

Every traveller confronts difference, and I have chosen to place it at the center, not the margins of this study. In writing about Nancy Prince, Mary Seacole and Margaret Fuller, the focus is on how each woman's race, gender, and personal history led her to interrogate transnational connections between the Americas and Europe through a process that I am calling "resistant truth telling." In doing so, these women offered insights as to how racism, sexism and narrow definitions of citizenship or patriotism veered away from Enlightenment ideals of freedom and equal opportunity, and therefore needed to be reconfigured, expanded, or evolved. They performed their critiques in a nexus that included physical and mental work, observing others, such as natives they encountered, and by finding a voice in which to articulate discovery and outrage. Through movement, temporary dwelling, and locally engaged work, these women became what James Clifford calls "participant observers," (98) deeply

involved in the causes and conflicts they witnessed. They brought extensive knowledge to their analysis based on the politics of their home cultures and experience as teachers, healers, daughters, and domestic managers. Therefore, I pay particular attention to representations of each woman's body in motion and in stasis, engaged in various forms of labor and her own version of heroic action. Travel in all three cases was connected to benevolent work, uplift, and the desire to improve the quality of life for oppressed and wounded peoples as well as to open up possibilities for the traveller herself. Each of these women had her plans for travel thwarted, delayed or cut short by circumstances such as domestic responsibility, being denied a place, and political violence, yet each managed to remain hopeful, using allegories of the past and the future as frames for envisioning opportunities beyond her limited reality. It is not surprising that these writers shaped the travelogue to reflect particular ambivalences about presenting and veiling the self; each woman also sought to authenticate her public voice in a manner that took into account her intended readership, whose support was psychically and financially necessary. Through a mobile subjectivity, they externalized the liminality of physical motion to create standpoints from which to observe and speak. Nancy Prince, Mary Seacole and Margaret Fuller confronted limitations and pointed out hypocrisy and deceit; I examine the often contradictory ways they figured their relationships to

institutional powers and the hegemonic discourse on race, gender and nationality, as well as how they represented native populations and other travellers in Central America and the Caribbean, Russia, and the Midwestern United States.

Until recently, the political context and radical critique present in women's travelogues has been ignored or minimized by scholars; this is especially true for the two black women in this study, whose book-length narratives, A Narrative of the Life and Travels of Mrs. Nancy Prince (1850) and Wonderful Adventures of Mrs. Seacole in Many Lands (1857) received little or no attention or reviews when they were published, and even today have been left out of the emerging cultural studies project focused on hybridity, emigration, and racial and national identities. Those working in the fields of transnational travel and theoretical journeying need to recognize and include contributions by women of color and to complicate relationships across race, gender, and nation. As a hybrid and dialogic genre, the travelogue should figure more significantly in literary studies as it incorporates and serves as the model for many epics, novels, poems and dramas. With the rise of interdisciplinary fields such as Women's Studies, Cultural Studies, and African-American Studies, travel writing and tourism have spurred an outpouring of provocative scholarship. When we include travel writing by free-born African American and Afro-Jamaican women to a canon that until recently focused on the slave narrative as the

dominant genre of antebellum writing by black men and women, we rethink black women's historical narrative voice and agency. While it is true that the slave narrative and spiritual narrative in many ways provide generically significant models and themes for the travelogue, these connections and differences have not yet made, as far as I can tell, significant inroads into discussion of how we construct the canon of antebellum and African American literature. Nancy Prince and Mary Seacole used their mobile subjectivity to recreate the notion of homeplace for women, and their narratives contain significant critiques, warnings and sassy visionary agendas on issues such as slavery, emigration, education, women's rights, medical practices, imperialism and how family is constituted. Nancy Prince relied on the authority of God and the text of the bible as her guide as she attempted to forge transnational links between the U.S. and Caribbean anti-slavery and emigration movements; Mary Seacole blurred her West Indian and English identities with the texts of soldiers she healed in Panama and the Crimean War in order to valorize her presence as a doctress and sutler at the front.

When we read travel accounts by Prince and Seacole in dialogue with Margaret Fuller's Summer on the Lakes, in 1843, the significance of race, age, education and class in the discourse of the journey becomes clearer, as does the relationship between the body in motion and varying modes of

labor. As one of the earliest feminists of the nineteenth century who attempted to link gender and racial oppression, Fuller presents us with the opportunity to study the contradictions that an elite Eurocentric education and grounding in Romantic aesthetics brought to bear on her radicalism. Fuller creates what she calls a "transitional state" a process through which America is developing its own original ideas as it distances itself from Europe and awaits a more complete infusion of "new blood from other stocks" (Papers on Art and Literature, 122-5); for her this transitional stage is a way of recognizing the limits and utopian possibilities for social change while also reflecting ambivalence about racial amalgamation and her place as a public intellectual. Interestingly, both Fuller and Nancy Prince share New England backgrounds, grounding them respectively in liberal Unitarianism and evangelical Christianity, two strands that developed distinctly but nevertheless in reaction to the Calvinism of the Puritans. Prince was involved in the abolition movement, but seemed disturbed when the movement split in the late 1830s over "the woman question." On the other hand, Fuller supported the abolition platform but abhorred what she considered to be the movement's too didactic approach. When the "woman question" heated up, Fuller's interest was piqued. Prince and Fuller's opposite reactions illustrate a difference in priority, and point to the challenges in reconciling the anti-slavery and

women's rights agendas in antebellum America; splits like this one still haunt the civil rights and women's rights movements. But while Fuller would publicly criticize the abolitionists, Prince encoded her critique of the movement in biblical allegory, and displaced it textually onto a dispute she had with missionaries in Jamaica. Nancy Prince, Harriet Jacobs, and Harriet Wilson all pointed out Northern racism and hypocrisy in their narratives; however, it was Frederick Douglass whose break from Garrison more explicitly exposed some of the movement's limitations and particular problems for African-Americans involved in the struggle. What that tells us is that black women encoded their critiques within the frame of a personal struggle, and that since all three texts were not given the authority their authors sought, they were excluded from public debate.

****

We may not know the exact process through which a traveller transcribes her physical journey into a travelogue (except in the case of Margaret Fuller, whose comments on aspects of this process are documented in her journals and letters), but the body's traces and marks present us with significant textual hieroglyphs. The body performs as a self-moving machine (Grosz, 6) in time and space, documenting through language the existence of real, specific material life. Body and history are bound together; we must chart the routes of specific forms of symbolization from the (repressed)

female imaginary as the writer finds words from which to move from body to language (Easton, "The Body as History," 56-7). In the cases of Prince, Seacole and Fuller, we find attempts to reduce their mobile bodies to a synecdoche, metaphor, or decorporealized voice, in order to divert the reader's attention away from the real political threat their critique signified. Deemphasizing the body might also be an attempt to deflect the history of women's bodily existence as one that is commonly the object of another's gaze. Although voice is an extension of the body, in writing it becomes the means of conveying language and thought in both the Lacanian symbolic order and what Julia Kristeva calls the semiotic, or language of the unconscious that remains pre-social. Voice is both corporeal and decorporealizing, and in writing it can be used to draw attention away from other parts of the body associated with female sexuality (although voice has stood for women's sexual power--let us recall that Odysseus covered his ears so he could not hear the Sirens' haunting, alluring wails). In Margaret Fuller's case, Summer on the Lakes, in 1843, reflects her training in and ambivalence towards her Eurocentric education, as she gestures towards what I call a poetics of ethnography in writing about her short tour of the American West. She blends the discourses and tropes of picturesque Romanticism and the supernatural with scientific and racial theories centered on the notion of who would be most "fit" to be the fathers and mothers of the new "race" of Americans,

spawned at the intersection of emigration and amalgamation. Fuller's expresses her anxiety about being an Eastern public intellectual by interrupting her own narrative voice with the authoritative texts of other writers, as well by displacing her own body with the digressive accounts of three hybrid, grotesque foreign women whom she both admires and fears.

On the other hand, Nancy Prince's short pamphlet on Jamaica and A Narrative of the Life and Travels of Mrs. Nancy Prince relies on rhetoric that is closer to oral discourse of an African-American preacher, grounded as she is in the Christian tradition that goes back to the travels and preaching of the apostle Paul, and in her own time, the itinerant ministries of African Americans like Jarena Lee and Zilpha Elaw. Another probable model was Maria Stewart (who was influenced by radical Bostonian pamphleteer, David Walker), whose speeches drew on biblical allegory to call for political action among African Americans, especially women. Her presence in Boston just missed coinciding with Prince's return from St. Petersburg. And Mary Seacole wisely adapts the voice of a picara, a kind of rogue heroine, to parody Englishness and pay excessive homage in order to convince her English readers to support her right to heal the wounded and be a proprietor in the Crimea, even though Florence Nightingale had refused her request to be an official nurse there.

The bodies of women travellers-in-motion are exposed and out of bounds, emerging from domestic "hiding places" and

landing on foreign shores where they seek refuge in provisional homespaces from which to carry out their work. In addition to the presentation of the self through a particular narrative voice, each woman turned to the use of synecdoches or symbols to signify her physical and emotional strengths and limitations, part of a strategy of authentication. Physically enacting the trope of "uplift," Nancy Prince's powerful arms pulled her sister from a brothel and led a rock-throwing attack against a slavecatcher; Mary Seacole's "soft heart" and maternal breast were figured as nurturing pillows for soldiers, which paved the way for her medical and entrepreneurial interventions; Margaret Fuller's chronic headaches, signifying her anxiety about writing and living the intellectual life, were displaced onto portraits of excessive women, "invalids" who were too transgressive to be accepted in Victorian America. In the process of journeying, each traveller encountered resistance, violence, stereotyping, loneliness and estrangement, as the liminality of travel removed her from the familiar and brought her in contact with the meaning of risk and otherness. Is it any wonder they displaced and articulated pain in a contradictory fashion in the bodies of their texts? In different ways, Prince, Seacole and Fuller created a dialectic between physical, masculinized strength and infirm or feminized bodies which revealed an ambivalence about the need to maintain "feminine" propriety while circumstances and hard, physical work demanded

otherwise. In each case, internalized ideology about women's proper place and hegemonic racial and class hierarchies influenced how the narrator figured her own body and those of foreign others she comes in contact with. Prince reacted very differently to the Russians she met while serving in the more privileged position as wife of a palace guard for the Tsar than she did as she travelled alone among freed Afro-Jamaicans whose cause she championed. Mary Seacole came in contact with a very mixed population in Panama, a crossroads for travellers enroute to the California gold rush; in the Crimea, she was mostly concerned with the welfare of her British "sons." Nevertheless, she embraced certain ethnic and racial stereotypes in order to relate to her readers and to carve out her place as "the yellow woman from Jamaica with the cholera medicine" (Seacole, 27). And Margaret Fuller claims to want to judge the new landscape and people by their own standards, but she can't help but compare Native Americans she encounters in Illinois, Michigan and Wisconsin to either fallen Greek warriors or versions of the grotesque.

****

Just how were the visionary agendas of these three women received in their own time? Not surprisingly, as a white woman with connections to the New England literary establishment, Margaret Fuller's work was reviewed and taken seriously, although her own brother Arthur bowdlerized Summer on the Lakes after her death in 1850, removing the "digressions" that

included the "case studies" of Mariana and the Seeress of Prevorst, which I believe are the centerpieces of Fuller's narrative and integral to understanding her journey as an encounter with hybridity. The transgressive women may be linked to her discussion of the defeated Native Americans and the unhappy lot of frontier women. The abridged version was the definitive one into the 1960s, as Perry Miller called the original "an intolerable monstrosity" (116), thus justifying Fuller's fears that the complex and often uncategorizable visions of a powerful, eclectic woman thinker would be threatening, misunderstood and possibly dismissed. Extensive searches in the mainstream and abolitionist press failed to uncover contemporary reviews of Prince's or Seacole's narratives, which indicates the kind of marginality black women often faced (neither had aligned herself so clearly with white-dominated women's rights movement, as had Sojourner Truth). Seacole was celebrated briefly during and after the Crimean War for her service and personality, but her narrative was not discussed publicly until the death of her sister, in 1905, when a slew of letters came to the Kingston Gleaner, sparking a resurgence of interest and reminiscences. Similarly, in the 1894 periodical of African-American women's clubs, The Woman's Era, Thomas P. Hilton reminisced about Nancy Prince's heroic protection of a fugitive slave and her leadership role in a rock-throwing attack on a slave catcher. He mentioned, but didn't give the full name, of her

travelogue. In 1964, a brief mention was made of Prince's Narrative by Vernon Loggins to authenticate it as a work by an African American writer. But he dismissed it as "a naive description of the impressions received by an American Negro woman during a sojourn...in Russia...It also contains an account of a visit to Jamaica" (The Negro Author, 229). In the 1970s and 1980s, African-American historians, literary critics and feminists began the recuperative process, in which the works of black women such as Prince and Seacole began to be examined and read in a complex, historical fashion. The publication of both women's travel narratives in The Oxford/Schomburg Library of Nineteenth Century Black Women Writers has meant renewed exposure and interest; editions of Seacole's Wonderful Adventures have been published in England (in 1984, with Alexander's and Dewjee's introduction) and Canada as well. Thus, the recovery of these texts promises to continue to produce scholarship that will change the way we think about black women's travels and life writing in the antebellum era and in the present, and enable us to take stock of the transcultural interventions they were forging between the Americas and Europe at significant colonial crossroads.

####

Cheryl Fish
Chapter One

Journeys and Warnings: Nancy Prince's Resistant Working Body in New England, Russia, and Jamaica

When Nancy Gardner Prince stood on the deck of the Romulus, leaving Boston for Russia in 1824, feeling the presence of all that was divine and terrible as she looked out to sea, she added another dimension to long-entrenched notions of journeying, the representation of such travel, and American literature. As a free-born African American woman travelling to Russia and Jamaica in the first half of the nineteenth century, her travels do not fit the working man's paradigm of sailor, exemplified in fiction by Melville's whaler Ishmael and in non-fiction by freed slave Olaudah Equiano. Nor is Prince's example consistent with the antebellum image of a slave mother who might throw herself overboard because her baby has been sold, like Lucy in Uncle Tom's Cabin. Prince did not find the need to don a disguise, as did Ellen Craft, who dressed as a man in order to flee slavery with her husband William. Nancy Prince may not have been a slave, but she did not share race and class privilege or the absolute sense of security exhibited by another young New Englander, Sophia Peabody, exhilarated by the freedom and the sea air on board The Newcastle. Peabody wrote that she felt "like queen of the Atlantic...I cannot even conceive how it would feel to be

afraid" as she travelled to Cuba in 1833 to improve her health.[1] If all these models fail to account for Nancy Prince's rationale for travelling, we must examine what was at stake for her as she journeyed out of New England. For Prince was free to travel away from her home but did so within limited parameters relating to acceptable roles for black women--first as a wife accompanying her husband to Russia where he was to assume his duties as a guard for the Tsar, and then as a widow travelling to Jamaica to do missionary work, helping to educate and uplift emancipated Afro-Jamaicans and raise funds for a manual labor school for orphans she had planned to establish in Kingston. Of her desire to leave New England in 1840, she wrote:

> My mind, after the emancipation in the West Indies, was bent upon going to Jamaica. A field of usefulness seemed spread out before me...I hoped that I might aid, in some small degree, to raise up and encourage the emancipated inhabitants, and teach the young children to read and work, to fear God, and put their trust in the Saviour (43, 45).

Although humble about her own contributions and virtually ignored by her abolitionist peers, I shall claim that Nancy Prince as a traveller could foresee possible alliances emerging out of the work of "usefulness" or uplift, alliances that might disrupt certain discourses of racial stereotyping, colonial power, and the mechanisms of slavery. If we gender Paul Gilroy's black Atlantic to include women as cultural

---

[1] Sophia Peabody Hawthorne, Letters From Cuba Vol. 1, 1833-4, December 20, 1833. Berg Collection, NYPL.

agents, Nancy Prince's significant border and water crossings between the Americans and Europe are an attempt to disrupt ethnic particularisms from a number of provisional homespaces. Her evangelical New England voice registers outrage from the scenes of empire and emancipation in Russia and then Jamaica, taking to task those who fail to live up to her sense of Christian ethics or the ideals of the American Declaration of Independence.

Based on contextual research and the accounts Nancy Prince has written, The West Indies. Being A Description of the Islands, Progress of Christianity, Education and Liberty Among the Colored Population Generally (Boston, 1841) and three editions of A Narrative of The Life and Travels of Mrs. Nancy Prince, [2] my reading begins with a brief biographical sketch, meant to be partial and subjective and to corporealize Prince, as I know of no existing pictures. What strikes me about Nancy Prince and what attracted me to write about her is the outspoken defiance and unshaken faith she displays in the face of all kinds of danger; she was a survivor who took public action to try to create more just communities at home and abroad. I picture her as tall and strong, with a dark mahogany complexion and alert, wide eyes, the daughter of

---

[2] All references to Prince's writing are from the 1853 edition of A Narrative of the Life and Travels of Mrs. Nancy Prince, as reprinted in the Oxford/Schomburg Library edition (1988). Citations from her pamphlet will be identified as West Indies, or WI.

first generation Massachusetts-born African Americans.[3] Her father died when she was but three months old, and her mother remarried twice and bore many children, so at the age of eight Nancy was forced to leave home, and all through her youth worked as a servant for some of the most prominent New England families[4]. She wrote that her family was "scattered all about" (9), but Nancy kept track of their whereabouts, finding suitable homes and domestic positions for her siblings.

Out of necessity, she became a maternal figure as a young girl but did not receive the comforts she longed for; she and her older sister Silvia had been abused by their stepfather. Nancy looked older than her years and learned to be practical and self sufficient. With her brother George she gathered fruit in the summer and sold it to support their mother and her children. Accustomed to hard physical work, and aware of the value of her labor, at the age of 14 Nancy travelled by

---

[3] The references Nancy Prince makes to her skin color come only in turning herself into an object of another's (racist) gaze: In Jamaica she meets with Mr. Horton, a minister who "had much to say about my color and showed much commiseration for my misfortune at being so black" (The West Indies, 15).

[4] That includes the house of Captain Fitz William Sargent of Gloucester, in whose employ her stepfather Money Vose had also worked for 12 years as a sailor (Prince, 7). Fitz William was the younger brother of Winthrop Sargent, who was the first territorial governor of Mississippi. Nancy Prince also lived in the Rev. Dr. Bolle's family in Salem (Prince, 19). Lucius Bolles was minister of the First Baptist Church of Salem and Secretary of the Foreign Missionary Board from 1826-44. He also actively raised funds for a benevolent society in Salem for female orphans (Discourse Delivered Before the Members of the Salem Female Charitable Society, pamphlet, Salem, 1810). Nancy Prince was later engaged in similar benevolent causes.

herself from Gloucester to Salem to find a higher paying domestic situation--but she ended up in a family that worked her so hard "in three months my health and strength were gone" (11). We know that Nancy was physically strong and had a will to match. She could use her body as an active barrier, physically separating other bodies from wrongdoing and harm. At 17 she traveled from Salem to remove her sister Silvia from a Boston brothel; when she was 48 years old, she apprehended a slavecatcher who attempted to kidnap and return a former slave to the South. With another black woman, she "dragged him to the door and thrust him out of the house," and Mrs. Prince told the women and children who had gathered at the scene to "pelt him with stones and anything you can get a hold of" (Hilton, "Reminiscences" 4). This incident, however, was not reported by Nancy Prince or included in her narrative; such active resistance to the Fugitive Slave Law could have resulted in danger for herself and her friends, and would have created a self-portrait of a physical and mental resistance that contradicted the image of a physically frail but spiritually empowered Nancy Prince the reader is left with at her narrative's end. Furthermore, Prince was asking for her reader's patronage as a form of financial support.[5]

Prince's tight grip on a horse's leg saved her from

---

[5] Anthony Barthelemy claims "Prince doubtless had to weigh the effect of the story of Smith Court on the marketplace...for a black woman to beat a white man and incite other blacks to riot was too much even for the outspoken abolitionists" (Introduction to Schomburg edition, Narrative of The Life and Travels, xxxviii).

drowning in a pit during a flood in St. Petersburg, Russia; but harsh conditions, such as prolonged exposure on the decks of ships, laboring as a tailoress, and an accidental fall contributed to a a constant stream of physical ailments. In the preface to the third edition of A Narrative of the Life and Travels of Mrs. Nancy Prince, she writes that she has lost the use of her arms, but provides no explicit details as to how this has happened.

Nancy Prince's body, as a black woman's body engaged in work, mobility, and struggle is both a presence and an absence in her text. Her writing voice often seems disembodied but empowered by a spiritual and moral force which enables her to resist oppression and "talk back". At age 20, she became an evangelical Baptist, converted by Thomas Paul, the founder of the first independent African-American church in the North and an important leader and missionary who had travelled to Haiti in 1823.[6] Her happy memories include religious instruction and guidance from her maternal grandfather. It is her faith in God that drives her, brings her comfort, and authorizes her defiant voice. She concludes the second and third edition of

---

[6] As a leader of the African Baptist Church on Belknap Street, Paul was heavily involved in activities that connected the black community, and no doubt had an influence on Nancy Prince. Paul was a chaplain of the Masonic African Grand Lodge No. 459, of which Nancy Prince's husband Nero Prince was also a member and commander. See Enclyclopedia of African-American Religion, ed. Larry G. Murphy et al, New York: Garland, 1993; William McLoughlin, Note 48, page 766 New England Dissent, 1660-1883 Vol. 2, Cambridge:Harvard UP, 1971; J. Marcus Mitchell, "The Paul Family," Old Time New England Winter, 1973.

her narrative with a poem, "The Hiding Place," in which the material world and all her journeys lead to a heavenly hiding place.

Nancy Prince began her career as a public figure by speaking about her nine-year residence in Russia in a voice that captivated her public; she would expect a responsive interaction with her audience, comprised mostly of friends and neighbors from Boston's black community, who found her to be an "entertaining speaker." In another tone of voice, this time with a deeper, more heated pitch, I hear her confronting those hypocrites who have let themselves be ruled by greed or rudeness, no matter what their race or gender.

After returning from Jamaica, she was moved to express her indignation and desire for justice for African Americans and Afro Jamaicans by writing letters to the abolitionist press and publishing her travel narratives. Her writing voice emerges out familiarity with oral discourses, including preaching, political oratory, and travelling evangelicalism; John Bunyan's Pilgrim's Progress, one of the most popular spiritual guidebooks of the time, was most certainly a schematic model upon which she based the account of her physical and spiritual journey. Intellectually, although her formal education was limited, she moved in abolitionist and reformist circles with blacks and whites, and she was a member of the First African Baptist Church, a center for education, benevolence, and political activism in the black community.

The interplay of the sacred and secular, as practiced by black preachers and members of the community, was also a tradition in many African cultures and no doubt was an important syncretic influence on African Americans (Bonnie J. Barthold, 27). Nancy Prince's travel texts are significant additions to the African American literary tradition in that they incorporate generic elements from slave and spiritual narratives and the oral tradition, yet drawing on the popular form of the travelogue, create a hybrid form that uses mobility and outrage in order to chart a course for an alternative social vision.

Travel and "Resistant Truth Telling"

In the remainder of this chapter, I shall illustrate how Nancy Prince shaped the flexible genre of travelogue to create a form of social criticism that I am calling resistant truth telling. Her works constitute a tradition that draws on but often diverges from the travelogues written by white men and a few white women who travelled to the same locations. Her gender, race, and identity as a free-born African American Christian from New England are all important factors for Prince in constructing her narratives. The 1841 pamphlet and Life and Travels affirm Prince's place in the lineage of African American and African Caribbean women who were educators, abolitionists, and outspoken social critics.[7]

[7] For theorizing on and laying out the development of this tradition, See Foster's Written By Herself. Carla L. Peterson's Doers of the Word: African-American Women Reformers in the North

Prince relies on displacement, in terms of content and style, often decorporealizing the body [6] while empowering the spirit, although bodies appear as synecdoches that signify internalized emotional states, liminality, disruptions and contradictions that are not always articulated in more direct terms. She creates what I am calling a "mobile subjectivity" to describe her moves from place to place and to advocate individualism within a context of collectivity or intersubjectivity[7] especially as it relates to being a productive, ethical citizen. I will therefore look at the body in its relationship to mobility and stasis, to the unknown and the normative, to the spiritual and the material, concentrating on the construction of the black woman's body

---

and Moira Ferguson's work on the Hart sisters of Antigua, in Colonialism and Gender Relations from Mary Wollstonecraft to Jamaica Kincaid (New York: Columbia University Press, 1993) and The Hart Sisters: Early African Caribbean Writers, Evangelicals and Radicals (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1993). Earlier groundwork was done by Dorothy Sterling in We Are Your Sisters: Black Women in the Nineteenth Century (New York: W.W. Norton, 1984).

[6] I use decorporealizing to suggest a Christian context that correlates the body with mortality and the soul with immortality, as well as a Cartesian distinction associating the body with nature and the mind with knowledge and scientific formulations (Grosz, 5-6).

[7] I am borrowing the term from Jessica Benjamin, who uses intersubjectivity to refer to a space of mutual recognition of subjects, replacing the subject/object divide with a form of tension between contradictory forces. In intersubjectivity, the need for recognition and independence is simultaneous; the "other" is outside our control, and yet we need him (220-221).

engaged in work and heroic action.[10]

An important factor to consider when assessing Nancy Prince's work is how she discursively negotiates with a particular readership--one that cut across race and gender, a literate public of black New Englanders and committed white abolitionists.[11] Unlike most other writers of travelogues in the antebellum period, she anticipates and expresses the anxieties that signify the complex realities of her black readers' lives as free subjects who have great advantages over their enslaved breathren, yet as Americans experience racism, discrimination, mob violence, and under certain conditions, the possibility of being enslaved. Like Harriet Wilson's 1859 fictional third-person autobiography, Our Nig, Prince addresses the hyprocrisy of Northern whites in their treatment of blacks, but does so less overtly by incorporating it into larger cautionary tales and by using biblical allegory. Prince's travel writing becomes more significant when

---

[10] I am using the term "heroic action" as put forth by Hannah Arendt, and analyzed by Nancy Hartsock, in which the individual's action in a public, political context moves away from an competition for dominance and toward action with others with whom one shares a common life and common concerns (Hartsock, Money, Sex, and Power, 217). My discussion of the body has been influenced and informed by the brilliant work of Helena Michie and Elizabeth Grosz.

[11] The black population of Boston in 1850 totalled approximately 2,000; the 1850 census reported that only 14 percent of the city's black adults were unable to read and write, and that number dropped to 8 percent by 1860. Massachusetts-born blacks had a high rate of literacy because of strong public education within the state, but literacy in some cases referred to a rudimentary knowledge of reading and writing (Horton & Horton, Black Bostonians, 2, 12-13).

considering that the African-American slave narrative, often written under the direction of white sponsors to move white Northern readers to action (Peterson, 5), has been the dominant genre of African-American writing studied and canonized in the past ten years, and has come to be synonymous with the African American's journey. With that in mind, Nancy Prince's pamphlet, narrative, and letters to the abolitionist press based on her travels as a free Northern subject can be read as important vehicles to convey other African-American experiences and to recognize that other stories were being produced and read. We might say that they are Nancy Prince's accounts are cautionary allegories for blacks and examples of misuse of power that their white allies in the struggle needed to note. Prince puts black readers on alert, pointing to mistakes, exaggerated promises, and faulty historiography created by missionaries and colonial administrators in their dealings with freed Afro-Jamaicans as well as emigrants, and in doing so engages in the discourse about emigration, one of the border crossings that marks the black Atlantic. Nancy Prince encouraged black readers to stay in America, even though she found travel a liberating, albeit dangerous experience that enabled her to perform active philanthropy between stints as a needlewoman.[12] Her travels emphasize the

---

[12]. Since domestic service, needle work and philanthropy represent three of the limited work options open to women, and could be said to represent advancement from more to less physical labor, I am interested in the travelling body and the representation of labor in each location.

significant but contingent nature of freedom, as a free black in antebellum America could be enslaved, depending upon his or her geographic location, perceived threat to the dominant order, and visibility. For example, in returning from the West Indies, Nancy Prince's ship was unexpectedly detained in Key West and near New Orleans; from the ship's deck, she watched "...the awful sight, which was the vessel of slaves laying at the side of our ship! The deck was full of young men, girls and children, bound to Texas for sale" (80). She had to stay on board to avoid her own possible beating and/or enslavement, but was constantly taunted and threatened by whites from the shore.

Moreover, her travels point to the need for building community, an "over ground" railroad of support, in transnational and U.S. locations, cutting across race, class, and gender. These friends help the traveller survive and provide material aid to counter the deception, cruelty, and racism she faces.

In representing her travels, Prince mixes elements of the itinerant preacher and colonial missionary, both of whom emphasize enlightened self-improvement and civilizing through Christianity, with the discourse of the adventurer/explorer. She includes accounts of dangerous journeys, incidents of deceit, and remarkable escape and survival; surprising events are put in a religious framework which invests them with meaning, placing Nancy Prince's writing in what J. Paul Hunter

calls the "Providence tradition."[13] These varying strands are juxtaposed, and they weave stories of personal stability and instability, sin and virtue, chaos and order, in a text which harkens back to the Bible and at times, reads like a black woman traveller's version of Pilgrim's Progress or a narrative version of Thomas Cole's famous series of paintings, "The Voyage of Life," a fixture in many homes in the increasingly religious milieu of the Jacksonian era.

Point(s) of Departure

Prince's pamphlet on Jamaica and Life and Travels may strike the modern reader as disjointed, as the texts shift suddenly from point to point without smooth transitions, and with informational gaps; Mina Curtiss has described Prince's style in visual terms, as combining elements from chromo-lithographs popular in the mid-nineteenth century, and "the primitivism of a Grandma Moses depicting historical scenes"("Some American Negroes in Russia," 272). Yet Prince's discourse has a fascinating kind of motion that goes beyond a visual vocabulary, intertwining and juxtaposing descriptions, political commentary, the authority of God as conveyed by her own agency, and voices of those she meets in her travels. Displacement links or bridges gaps in time, space and

---

[13] According to Hunter, providence literature reflects the pattern of Christian experience central to the Puritan myth and organizes experience into a teleological narrative based on a historical cycle (The Reluctant Pilgrim, 73). Puritans believed that history revealed God's providence by rewarding the chosen and punishing those who were evil (Murdock, 74).

emotional connections through metonymies, synecdoches and ellipses.[14] I shall speculate what these rhetorical devices signify in the context of their location, psychic implication, and historical frame and as part of what Frances Smith Foster calls an interstice or nexus (Written by Herself, 15) in dialogue with other narrative traditions and precursors, including slave narratives and spiritual narratives, both subgenres of autobiography produced by African-Americans. In addition, Prince's works include themes that mark what David S. Reynolds calls "popular subversive fiction"--featuring deceitful authority figures and oppressed characters (Reynolds, 361). For Prince's narratives are hybrid accounts that draw on the conventions of these genres in addition to travelogues, blurring sacred and secular genres. As other scholars of hybrid texts by African Americans have noted, drawing on the work of Victor Turner, in liminality, betwixt and between normative positions or categories, the marginalized person can imagine and is often forced to articulate alternative realities. Travel, with its disorienting liberation, is a free passage into the liminal state, allowing one to escape the everyday self and be

---

[14] In Freudian terms, an unconscious impulse need not have arisen at the point where it makes an appearance; it may have originally applied to other persons and connections, and the mechanism through which it attracts our attention is displacement (70). In terms based on African concepts of time, uncertain flux can characterize the passage from cyclical time or myth to linear time and history (Barthold, 34). Nancy Prince's use of biblical text with history and personal experience creates a syncretic blend that emerges in rupture and continguity.

transformed into an(other). Through her use of displacement, rupture, and textual gaps, Nancy Prince creates a liminal text that can induce a state of transition for her reader as well. [15] Here, we are reminded of the many black hymns that are about moving spirit and body, grounded in African tribal movement and American slave songs, such as the popular spiritual "Meet me, Jesus, meet me/Meet me in the middle of the air/If my wings should fail me Lord/I want to meet me with another pair" (Brathwaite, Appendix VI).

For free-born blacks, the emphasis on mobility is present in a different, yet inherently linked relationship to the slave's journey. An important precursor who intertwines topoi of travel and mobility, slavery and freedom is Olaudah Equiano in The Interesting Narrative of the Life of Olaudah Equiano, or Gustavus Vassa, the African (1789).[16] Equiano's best-selling account combined an attack on the institution of slavery, in part by describing his experience, including his kidnapping from Africa, with the often treacherous treatment he received as a free black man who could again be enslaved.

---

[15] Susan M. Marren explores the liminal as space to create a "transgressive self" for Olaudah Equiano. ("Between Slavery and Freedom: The Transgressive Self in Olaudah Equiano's Autobiography," PMLA Jan. 1993, 94-105. Carla Peterson suggests that black women entered public civic debate by entering the state of liminality "consciously adopting a self-marginalization that became superimposed upon the already ascribed oppressions of race and gender and that paradoxically allowed empowerment"(17).

[16] According to Henry Louis Gates, Jr., Equiano's Narrative became the prototype of the nineteenth century slave narrative, and his strategies of self-presentation influenced black narrative before 1865 (Gates, 1987, xiv).

In his tales of life aboard ship and in various communities around the world, he assumes varying identities as he comes to find salvation through literacy and conversion to Calvinism. If Equiano's narrative is a tale of personal economic and moral survival (Edwards, "Introduction," xv) he also links the future prosperity of Great Britain to the abolition of slavery, as Africa "lays open an endless field of commerce to the British manufacturers and merchant adventurers" (in Gates, 176). This logic appeals to the colonizing and commercial interests of his British readers in order to persuade them to end slavery.

The most-often discussed authors of American slave narratives, Frederick Douglass and Harriet Jacobs strive to convey the moral character, intelligence and honesty of the escaped slave to a white Northern readership; literacy, something the slave has to be lucky enough to wrangle from his or her master or acquire elsewhere, enables Douglass to grasp the possibility of freedom and also to read about abolitionist support in the North. As Henry Louis Gates, Jr. points out, learning to read and write was a decisive political act mentioned in the slave's narrative; writing was a principle sign of reason, and in order to signify as full members of Western humanity, blacks had to prove it through their writings (Figures in Black, 4-6). Nevertheless, narratives by Douglass and Jacobs featured authenticating prefaces by white abolitionists to testify on behalf of and introduce the former

slave to his or her readers.[17]

In contrast, Nancy Prince is a free agent who passes on literacy and religious instruction to other blacks. This serves as proof of her own ability and qualifies her to judge the character of the Afro-Jamaicans and the economic conditions in Jamaica since emancipation. Nancy Prince claims authority from God, the basis for the spiritual autobiographer to write as witness, but she also believes she is writing as a "duty to myself" (5) consistent with the individualistic Western autobiographical tradition.[18] Her stance testifies to the amount of confidence she had developed as a traveller who survived adversity and the commanding impression she made on figures such as the Tsar and Empress of Russia, English and American missionaries, and a variety of Afro-Jamaicans. I believe these affirmations and her grounding in a utilitarian, benevolent African-American tradition contributed to her ability to talk back and point out deceit wherever

---

[17] Prince seeks the patronage of friends in the preface to the second and third editions of Life and Travels as well as acknowledging their part in revising her narrative; however, she mentions no specific names in her preface. Prince does not appeal directly for the abolition of slavery in the same way the slave narrative directly states that goal, usually by inciting readers to take action. That is not to say that her narrative does not offer a scathing critique of slavery and its many paradoxes and repercussions. The generic conventions point to the way travelogues and spiritual narratives provide other outlets for the critique of slavery, from those whose freedom and mobility has permitted them to see and compare, and to judge.

[18] John Bunyan, in "The Author's Apology for His Book" writes "...I only thought to make/I knew not what, nor did I undertake/Thereby to please my neighbor; no not I/I did it mine own self to gratify"(The Pilgrim's Progress, 31).

encountered. In addition, as one who risked death and survived (as she travelled), she would have a right and duty to act in public life. As to why Prince's narratives were not mentioned and acknowledged in the public debates on emigration, I speculate that the title of her pamphlet, The West Indies: Being A Description, etc. does not hint at some of its real purpose: to be used as a vehicle to raise funds for her school, and to warn readers about emigration schemes and corrupt colonial policies [19]. Similarly, A Narrative of the Life and Travels could have been classified by readers as autobiographical and therefore perceived as insignificant as a political tract that engaged with current debates.[20] In

---

[19] The connection between her fundraising appeals and the sale of the pamphlet are made evident in an advertisement in The Liberator, addressed "To the Benevolent." Donations in money, children's books or clothing were solicited from the "benevolent and the liberal" were to be left at Miss Ray's house, or the offices of the newspaper, where "may be found a pamphlet on the present state of Jamaica, written by Mrs. Prince" (Nov. 12, 1841).

[20] The three editions of A Narrative of the Life and Travels of Mrs. Nancy Prince were not reviewed or mentioned publicly by those who were generally supportive, like Garrison, or leading African Americans of Boston, although one account claimed Life of Mrs. Prince was "found in the houses of many of the old residents of Boston, as well as other places all over Massachusetts" ("Reminiscences" Woman's Era, July 1894). The first edition was advertised in The Liberator at the same time Narrative of Sojourner Truth was, but Garrison added an endorsement for Truth: "This is a most interesting Narrative of a most remarkable and highly meritorious woman, the sale of which is to be for her exclusive benefit. We commend it to all the friends of the colored population"(May 10, 1850). No such note was written for Prince, whose ad appears in the same column as Truth's, although she had too had published it as a means of support. It may have been that Prince was already familiar to the community, while Truth was not; Prince's narrative was sold at the offices of The Liberator, as well as at her house and at the New England Anti-Slavery Convention, which indicates she was part of the network. While the

addition, Nancy Prince did not appear to try to promote herself nor did she associate regularly with white women activists, as did Sojourner Truth, although Prince did speak briefly at the 1854 National Women's Rights Convention in Philadelphia.

For free-born African-American women in the 1830s and 40s, the most acceptable modes of public social criticism came in the form of speeches, most likely to promiscuous audiences, or in writing the autobiographical subgenre of the religious conversion narrative. According to Sue E. Houchins, women such as Maria W. Stewart and Jarena Lee "seized authority to depict their religious conversions and manumission from the bondage of sin, entering into both a spiritual and political discourse, using a discursive form suited to extend their vocation to teach, pray publicly and testify" (Intro, Spiritual Narratives, xxix-xxx).[21] Nancy Prince's pamphlet

---

topics covered in Nancy Prince's pamphlet, and in the Jamaica section of Life and Travels are clearly engaging with debates on questions of emigration, Prince's writings are not cited nor is she mentioned as a contributor--Carla Peterson has documented the difficulty of Mary Shadd Cary faced as a black woman taking an active part in emigration debates(117). Lydia Maria Child, who must have known Prince from Boston abolitionist circles, does not cite her narratives in The Right Way the Safe Way (New York, 1862), a pamphlet calling for immediate emancipation of American slaves, based on the example of the West Indies. Child quotes from many narratives written on the West Indies and Jamaica,including David Ingraham, the reverend who "recruited" Nancy Prince to go to Jamaica; according to Carolyn Karcher, the pamphlet was written for Southern readers, which would account for why Child did not cite any published accounts by black writers.

[21] Nancy Prince would have at least heard of Maria Stewart, whose "Fairwell Address to Her Friends in the City of Boston" took place in the Belknap Street School less than two months before

and Narrative would build on this model; however, her religious conversion and faith become the means, not the end, to justify her authority to become a resistant truth teller. Typically, in spiritual autobiographies, the narrator indicates that before conversion, he or she had been inclined to indulge in socializing or "the ways of the flesh" (Foster, 61-62); in Prince's Life and Travels, the paradigm is different, as Nancy always portrays herself as serious and hardworking while her mother and sister represent bodily indulgence and succumbing to sexual temptation. Decorporealizing her own body makes sense as a strategy for negotiating her public exposure as writer, and it allows her to shift the focus to her mission of racial uplift, away from the stereotyped sexualization of the black female body (Peterson, Other American Traditions 192), one of the products of slavery, and in her own case, the memories of a stepfather's unkind blows. As Stephanie A. Smith argues, in the case of Frederick Douglass, Aunt Hester's beating signifies the feminized, vulnerable body that must be transcended--corporeal transcendence makes way for the triumph

---

Prince returned from Russia in October, 1833. Stewart's activities in Boston during 1831-34 included publishing a political pamphlet, a collection of religious meditations, and giving four public lectures to "promiscuous audiences" comprised of men and women (Richardson, xiv). Stewart's denouncement of the colonization movement and its scheme to send some blacks to West Africa and her reliance on biblical allusion and faith reveal overlaps in style and substance with Nancy Prince. It is possible that Stewart was an important role model; both Stewart and Prince worshipped at the First African Baptist Church under the leadership of Thomas Paul (Peterson, 19).

of manly spirit, but manhood brings the possibility of courting death ("Heart Attacks," 195), which as Paul Gilroy has argued, the slave conceived of as a form of agency (Black Atlantic, 63). Nancy Prince's attempt to decorporealize and transcend the body in order to emphasize a spirituality that could be said to exhibit both "masculine" and "feminine" qualities is only partially successful. References to the body emerge, suggesting its materiality and fallibility, creating a dialetic between empowered corporeality and the infirm body. There are several literal falls into pits, or into holes in the ground, which may be read as a revision of forms of "backsliding" into vehicles for Christian repentance and deliverance, as if the corporeality of the body suddenly thrust into an "underworld" serves as a signifier for the return of unexpressed fears and temptations. Her ability to survive these falls and accidents becomes proof of God's greater design.

In relationship to work, Prince would have to negotiate with the white cult of true womanhood, which denied the corporeality of woman's work to idealize the home and woman's domestic role while also emphasizing the ethical value of industriousness (Gillian Brown, Domestic Individualism, 80). Yet women who travelled or worked outside the home were associated with sexuality and therefore in representing the working body, Prince ran the risk of reinforcing Victorian perceptions about working-class and black women. The idea of

true womanhood for an African American was culturally problematic, since whites depended on black women to work for them, but as a traveller, Nancy Prince's mobile body could continually recreate its relation to the concept of laboring and labor, but always somewhat defensively, distancing herself from and yet marking the figure of the prostitute.[22] She would represent the working bodies of the emancipated slaves as sovereign individuals in terms out of republican political theory, linking their virtue and independence with productive labor (Smith-Rosenberg, "Domesticating 'Virtue'" 63-4). The desire of the former Jamaican slaves to buy land, work on it, and build houses of their own becomes proof of a desire for ethical citizenship, as well as an example of her use of black Caribbean subjects to illustrate bourgeois American ideals ("To the Public" letter, Anti-Slavery Standard, May 25, 1843).

Anti-Orientalist Representation

In addition to connecting the freed Afro-Jamaicans (and arguing, by inference, that the same would be true of American slaves) to classic republican ideology on possessing the self and the desire to work the land, Nancy Prince's pamphlet and narrative include examples of anti-Orientalist representation.

---

[22] Hazel Carby has persuasively shown how true womanhood drew its ideological boundaries by excluding black women and associating them with illicit sexuality. In gaining their public presence as writers, black women responded by defining a discourse of black womanhood which not only addressed their exclusion from the ideology of true womanhood, but developed an alternative set of definitions of womanhood and motherhood (Chapters two and three, Reconstructing Womanhood). For the connection between working-class women and prostitution, see Michie, and Helsinger, Vol. 2.

Earlier, Mary Prince's The History of Mary Prince, A West Indian Slave (1831), "related by herself," authorized the "subaltern" to be representative and insists that her experience is more valid than the white Westerner's appropriation of it. [23] Mary Prince (no relation to Nancy), a Bermuda-born slave, declared herself a more reliable authority on slavery than any white person, and in speaking for herself and other slaves, "provides the first claim in the Afro-American autobiographical tradition for the black woman as singularly authorized to represent all black people, regardless of gender, in Western discourse about 'what slaves feel' about the morality of slavery" (William Andrews, quoted in Gates, xvi).

After writing that the emancipated slaves are "enterprising and quick in their perceptions, determined to possess themselves and property besides," Nancy Prince includes a dialogue to demonstrate why she adopts the ethnographic gaze to examine and question them, and specifies

---

[23] According to Edward Said's definition, Western Orientalists typically represent and speak for others, usually under the guise of superior knowledge and objectivity. Speaking for others, a form of domination discussed at length by feminist critics such as Gayatri Spivak, Adrienne Rich, Chandra Mohanty and Linda Alcoff, has historically gone unacknowledged in travel writing. Carla Peterson claims that Nancy Prince often positions the Jamaicans as subalterns "whose consciousness she must retrieve and for whom she must speak, as her cultural enterprise transforms them into native Others in need of racial uplift" (92). In terms of religion, literacy, and education, Nancy Prince wishes to pass on her own values and constructs them as enabling; however, in my opinion, she never fails to respect the values, intelligence, industriousness and spirit of community among the Jamaicans.

her aim as one who will then represent their interests in the U.S.:

> They wished to know why I was so inquisitive about them. I told them we have heard in America that you are lazy, and that emancipation has been no benefit to you; I wish to inform myself of the truth respecting you and give a true representation of you on my return (West Indies, 11)

Previously, on the second page of her pamphlet, she included the words of an elderly black woman, a former slave, defiantly offering the woman as an example of righteousness that must be heard loudly and clearly by white New Englanders. The woman's comments foreground Prince's discussion of Jamaica's colonial history and topography, described often in apocalyptic, allegorical terms. The old woman had just survived a violent storm in which houses had been destroyed and families separated:

> Not so bad now as in the time of slavery, then God spoke very loud to Bucker (the white people) [sic] to let us go. Thank God, ever since that, they give us up, we go pray and we have it not so bad as before (West Indies, 4).

Prince follows with a sassy antislavery comment in the midst of her descriptions of Jamaican landscape:

> I would recommend this poor woman's remark to the fair sons and daughters of America, the land of the pilgrims. 'Then God spoke very loud.' May these words be engraved on the post of every door; in this land of New England God speaks very loud, and while his judgments are in the earth, may the inhabitants learn righteousness! The mountains that intersect this island seem composed of rocks thrown up by frequent earthquakes or volcanoes (WI, 4-5).

Nancy Prince not only quotes the black woman but authorizes her words about Buckra as the ones that should be

engraved on every door. She is simultaneously making a narrative space for a transgressive ex-slave voice and yet coopting this voice from her ethnographic perspective. That God speaks loudly in New England is a comment on racism and hyprocrisy in the North. Letting this woman speak also shows readers that the former slaves are pious, decent people who seek a chance; freedom to them is sweet. The comment also emphasizes the twisted logic of proslavery forces in the U.S., who often claim slaves were better taken care of in bondage than as free men and women.

Gendering Mobility

In the passage quoted above, Nancy Prince establishes the validity of a black woman's voice to forge transatlantic links in the black Atlantic, and to connect two of the three locations in what R.J.M. Blackett calls the "triangle of the black experience"--black America, the Caribbean and Africa (139). Neither Gilroy nor Blackett examine the interventions made by particular black women in this transatlantic network[24]; I read Nancy Prince's (and in the next chapter, Mary Seacole's) travelogues as attempts to cross boundaries and unfix categories in the tradition that Carole Boyce Davies describes as black women's dialogics, traversing geographical and national borders, reworking identities while also relying on them for recognition (4). Through the elderly Jamaican

[24] Blackett includes Ellen Craft in a chapter on William and Ellen Craft's journey to freedom.

woman's words, Nancy Prince indicts white New England's history and complicity in the slave trade and valorizes her own critique of American slavery. In her pamphlet, Prince puts off her personal narrative until the end, as she claims it is of "least consequence" (15) in her presentation of Jamaican colonial history and post-emancipation life. However, in her 1850 Narrative , whose title indicates emphasis on "Life" and "Travels," she uses another strategy for presenting her own story: connecting Africans in the diaspora with slavery while establishing a claim to American selfhood.

The discourse of relocation and mobility in A Narrative of the Life and Travel begins with scenes of youth in a familial context. Attention to forced and chosen uprootings connects her personally to commercial deportation of slaves, signifying involuntary transport of human beings (Baker, Blues,24). I also read this most confessional section of Prince's work as a gendering of the discourse of mobility, setting up a shift from what Joanne Braxton calls the trope of the outraged mother--one that dominates black women's autobiographical narratives (Braxton, 1) --to the trope of the outraged daughter.

Family members and friends of Prince's youth appear and disappear as shadowy presences in her narrative, yet as Frances Smith Foster points out, as in many African American families, a strong identity was somehow maintained ("Early

American Self-Portraitures," 33). However, family identity is mediated in this case through separation and Nancy's power comes through the management of bodies engaged in productive work. In the opening four pages alone, Prince uses the words "stolen," "captive," "escape," "voyage," "missing," "drowned," "scattered" to convey the history of African Americans being uprooted against their will and the particular circumstances of Prince's family. Her maternal grandfather, Tobias Wornton, "or backus, so called" was both a slave and a soldier in the Revolutionary Army, serving at the battle of Bunker Hill (5)[25] and an unnamed maternal grandmother who is described as, "an Indian of this country; she became a captive to the English, or their descendants" (5). Mobility here incorporates forced relocations and body snatchings, conveyed to Nancy in stories her grandfather told her about "how he was stolen from his native land" (5). Her origins are both native and foreign, and contain the American paradox of captivity and escape, slavery and freedom, interracial mixing and a genealogy from which to base her claim to American citizenship. Nancy Prince's articulated identity as an enlightenment subject, a

---

[25] Although there is no Tobias Wornton listed in the list of black servicemen from the Revolutionary War records, there is a "Boston, Bachus" who served as a Private in the Massachusetts Third Regiment. There are also men listed with names like "Boston, Ceasar," and "Boston, Negro," which seems to indicate that because many black soldiers were slaves, they were not listed by their full Christian names. List of Black Servicemen, Compiled from War Department Collection of the Revolutionary War Records, Compiled by Debra L. Newman. Washington: National Archives and Records Service, General Services Administration, 1974.

granddaughter of the American Revolution, is connected to the men in her family who heroically fight and survive. Her mother's third husband, nicknamed Money Vose, "succeeded in making his escape from his captors by swimming ashore" (6) after being stolen from Africa, while the boat was docked in what turned out to be a free state. He eventually became a sailor; "his name may be found on the Custom House books in Gloucester" (7). Money Vose is a heroic figure and the only one of her mother's husbands who "by industry" provides a home for his wife and small children; however, he was also abusive.

Travel is racialized and gendered through the figure of the ship going to sea; it is both a threat and a blessing -- emblem of the slave ship, and yet passage to freedom. Black men found particular empowerment and steady employment as seamen.[26] Nancy Prince's experiences on ships as a passenger rather than as a sailor would expose her to a repressive social order and racial discrimination, but early on, ships and the sea offer increased options for the men in her family. She and her brother George both desire to work hard to make their mother comfortable; he frequently goes to sea, while Nancy works as a domestic. During George's absence, she finds families in which to board or employ brothers and sisters; there is no one to help her with this enormous responsibility.

---

[26] See W. Jeffrey Bolster, "To Feel Like a Man: Black Seamen in the Northern States, 1800-1860." Journal of American History. V. 76, n. 4, March 1990, 1173-1199.

Prince's mother and older sister Silvia are the prime sources of the early "trials" Nancy faces, and both are associated with another kind of mobility. It is a nomadic wandering, linked to indiscrete sexuality, excess, sin, childbirth, and death. Her mother had several husbands and many children; Nancy shows sympathy for the predicament her mother was in after Money Vose died: "She was young, inexperienced, with no hope in God...Her grief, poverty and responsibilities were too much for her; she was never again the mother she had been before" (7-8). Later, Prince uses dashes to textually connect her own oppression to her mother's wandering, which forces Nancy to assume the maternal role and look to God for her comfort and hope: "Care after oppressed me -- my mother wandered about like a Jew --the young children who were in families were dissatisfied; all hope but in God was lost" (17).

Karen Lawrence points out that in travel writing the wanderer is usually opposed to the pilgrim, who engages in a purposeful quest (16). The classical figure of the wandering Jew is one of permanent displacement, of someone who can never find a home or community in which he is safe. The home for Nancy Prince, and for many black women, is removed from romantic notions of family, and is a place "of movement, difficulty, pain, learning and love in complex ways" (Boyce Davies, 21). Nancy Prince valorizes and practices a kind of mobility connected to usefulness and productive work--for

example in Russia, she sets up her own business as a seamstress. This would be in opposition to the wandering of the Jew, the uncontrollable meanderings and urges of her mentally ill mother, or the forced passage of the abducted slave.

Nancy's mother's labors have been engaged excessively in biological reproduction, which renders her laboring body as suffering and hysterical, necessarily removed from wage labor. Nancy's anger at her mother bubbles beneath the narrative's surface, occasionally rising, but it is bound up with the daughterly need to sympathize and protect: "I could not see my mother suffer, therefore I left my place and went to Salem to watch over her ...and lived in the Rev Dr. Bolle's family" (19). In Oedipal terms, Paul Zweig claims the male traveller represses his longing for the mother's body and must separate from it, only to rencounter the feminine threat in caves and dragon figures (Zweig, quoted in Lawrence, 5). In her travels, Nancy Prince seems to be searching for maternal figures but more often marks with pathos the separation of children from mothers; she also expresses anger at women she finds morally inadequate or licentious.

Her older sister Silvia is "deluded away" from domestic work into prostitution (12). The themes of deceit along with that of body snatching, are present here, as is a mesmerizing power that hystericizes Silvia's body, transforming it from one that labors to a commodity. Nancy takes a heroic quest to

save her fallen sister from sin, travelling from Salem to a Boston house of ill repute; in the process of describing this journey, she not only secures her sister but also exposes abuses committed by her stepfather.[27]

She refuses to protect him by staying silent about his abusiveness even as she writes of his heroism. Removing Silvia from prostitution and retelling the story become forms of confession and absolution; the recovery of both sisters' bodies from their shared prior abuse and allows them--especially Nancy--to move on. When Nancy was informed of Silvia's whereabouts, she wrote "to have heard of her death would not have so painful to me, as we loved each other very much, and more particularly, as our step-father was not very kind to us. When little girls, she used to cry about it, and we used to say, when we were large enough we would go away" (12).

Nancy's travels fulfill the sisters' desire to flee from oppression and physical abuse, as she reclaims their bodies from vice. One of Prince's first detailed journeys is to save her sister. "It was very cold; but notwithstanding, I was so distressed about my sister that I started the next morning for Boston, on foot" (13). She also acknowledges God's agency is working through her, although she has not yet narrated her conversion. "'In wisdom he chooses the weak things of the

---

[27] We see the theme of the "fallen sister" or fallen friend of the heroine in novels such as Charlotte Tonna's Helen Fleetwood and The Wrongs of Women and Louisa May Alcott's Work.

earth.' Without his aid, how could I ever have rescued my lost sister?" (13). Aid comes in the form of a Mr. Brown, an old friend she runs into, who finds the house where Silvia resides, and defends Nancy. He uses the cane to ward off the madame as she and Nancy struggle over Silvia's body. "The old woman seized her to drag her down into the kitchen; I held on to her, while Mr. Brown at my side used his great cane" (14).

The passage about Silvia's rescue is a unique dislocation in the narrative because Prince draws attention to herself in the present tense as a writer. "Now while I write I am near the spot that was then the hold of all foul and unclean things" (14). Then she quotes scripture (Proverbs, 5.3): "The lips of a strange woman drop as an honey comb, and her mouth is smoother than oil; there she has slain her thousands; her end is bitter as wormwood, sharp as a two-edged sword, and lieth in wait at every corner..." Although the scripture describes a "fallen" woman's deviousness, at this point, Nancy once again interrupts her narrative of the past with facts from the present, acknowledging Silvia's death. "I cannot refrain [sic] my feelings although death has long separated us...she was very dear to me; she was five years older than myself, and often protected me from the blows of an unkind step-father" (15).

Her rage is expressed through this sentimentalized acknowledgment of gendered power relations and limited options for black women. She is angry at her abusive stepfather and at

her mother for marrying him and then another husband, and for having so many children. She displaces this rage onto the figure of the loose woman--replacing the traditional male figure of the seduction plot with "a mother of harlots" who has a devious, smooth mouth, and who "deliberately creates a perverse family" (Foster, 86). In Nancy's evangelical outlook, the breakup of that perverse family is an important triumph of good over evil, and it transforms the outraged daughter into heroic sister, paving the way for other interventions. It also links Nancy's later philanthropic ventures, and her plans to open schools for orphans of color and indigent girls, first in Boston, and then in Jamaica, with her desire to establish alternative, safe homes for young women away from the temptation of illicit sexuality.[28]

Nancy Prince's difficult relationship with her mother and with mothering is significant for breaking with the paradigm

---

[28] Prince's plans to start a Free Labor School for poor colored girls in Kingston was the kind of institution most urgently needed in Jamaica, according to John Candler, a Quaker from England. "The condition of the girls in particular is said to be often wretched, and that many of them, at an early age, leave their homes and rush into vice. There was the same state of things some years ago at St. John's in Antigua, but some good Methodist women undertook to form a girls' orphan school...Such a school, if established at Kingston and rightly managed would prove a blessing to the whole community; but who among our friends would be willing to expatriate themselves and engage in the good work of forming and superintending such an institution?...Here is an open field of labour of the most useful description, and no class of Christians ready to enter into it on their own responsibility" (Candler, Part II, 11). Candler is referring to sisters Anne Hart Gilbert and Elizabeth Hart Thwaites, who in 1816 founded a society in Antigua for the orphans and children of "fallen and depraved relatives" (Moira Ferguson, 20).

of biological motherhood as woman's primary avenue to identity. Nancy Prince does not become a biological mother and therefore offers a different relationship to the concept of family. Her commitment to forms of what Patricia Hill Collins and Stanlie M. James call othermothering, or taking responsibility for nonbiological children whose parents were unable or unwilling to meet their needs (James, 44) is illustrated first in her caring for and finding appropriate homes for her siblings, then in her plans to establish asylums for poor and orphaned children. And near the conclusion of her narrative, enroute from Jamaica to New York, she writes of seeing a shipful of slaves bound for Texas and having a mind to buy a child. "One dear little girl that was taken from her mother in Virginia, I should have taken with me, if I had had the money (81). Her bond with her biological sister and connection to the slave experience creates the idea of sisterhood linking black women's history and struggle (Rosezelle, in Lugones,"Sisterhood and Friendship as Feminist Models," 409).

"I Made Up My Mind to Leave my Country"

Prince's reaction to and understanding of oppression and abuse based on gender, race and class position provide a frame for reading her departure from New England. The conditions under which Nancy Gardner weds Mr. Prince are a striking reversal of the conventional romance plot in popular novels. If we take into account that her mother's latest remarriage

"was like death to us all," (18) it's not surprising that Nancy Prince's own marriage and subsequent journey to Russia come as an ellipsis in a block paragraph describing numerous interruptions and tasks. Her mother "in one of her spells of insanity" shows up at Nancy's place of employment; she must take her mother and sister in a chaise from Boston to Salem; and she quits domestic work to learn a trade (sewing), which is a sign of her continuing striving for economic as well as geographical mobility. Leaving the U.S. is presented as resulting from a "determination to do something for myself" in the context of utilitarian escape, rather than in terms of romance or pleasure. Carla Peterson suggests that Prince's ambivalence about placing individual welfare over family is what motivates the suppression of details about Mr. Prince and marriage (95), but I believe her ambivalence about marriage, sexuality and childbirth based on her mother's plight, and her desire to subsume a conventional plot with her own pilgrimage would also account for this omission. In addition, as in the tradition of the spiritual narrative, husbands tend to play minimal roles compared to the narrator's relationship to God.

Since the reasons for leaving one's home for foreign shores is a crucial moment in defining the meaning and material conditions of a journey and in antebellum America home was defined as woman's sanctioned place[29], it is telling

---

[29] For excellent discussions of the importance of home, and its crucial marker connecting gender and travel, see the Introduction of Frederick and Mcleod's Women and the Journey: The Female Travel

that Nancy Prince's decision to leave is determined by her flight from domesticity. The opportunity arises when she marries Mr. Prince, a friend of the family's who had worked as a cook and was about to become a palace guard for the Tsar in St. Petersburg.

Nancy Prince refigures the honeymoon journey by writing of her decision to leave first, then mentioning, without fanfare or detail, her marriage. "...after seven years of anxiety and toil, I made up my mind to leave my country. September 1st, 1823, Mr. Prince arrived from Russia. February 14, 1824, we were married. April 14, we embarked on board the Romulus...bound for Russia"(20-21).[30]

Even though the descriptions that follow, without any transition, of brief stops at Denmark and then of landing at

Experience, and Karen Lawrence's "Hermes/Penelope" in Penelope Voyages.

[30] Critics such as Barthelemy and Walters have noted with frustration the lack of details about Nero Prince and his relationship with Nancy. We know that Nero Prince had been elected the second grand master of the African Grand Lodge of the Masons in 1808, after its first grand master, Prince Hall, had died. Prince had been one of the organizers of the African Lodge when it was founded in 1791. According to Allison Blakely, a highly improbable story about Nero Prince identified him as a native of Russia, a Jew who identified with colored people. Charles Wesley, in his study of Prince Hall, claims that Nero Prince was the black servant of Edward Tuckerman, a baker, from whom he learned the art of cookery (Wesley, 22) According to Nancy Prince, in 1812, Captain Stanwood took Mr. Prince with him to Russia when he went to place his son in a school in St. Petersburg. "When the captain sailed for home, Mr. Prince went to serve the Princess Purtossof, one of the noble ladies of the court (22). Nancy Prince's account makes no mention of Mr. Prince's first wife, Nabby Bradish, who had married him in 1803 and went with him to Russia in 1810, when he served as a butler in the royal family (Wesley, 22).

St. Petersburg move into the realm of the court's pageantry, opulence and lack of prejudice against black people, Nancy Prince is careful to uphold her image of propriety and piousness; at parties, her friends dance and play dice, but Prince refrains, "by the help of God" (22). In the narrative, pleasure comes from observing new locales and encountering otherness, as opposed to participating in forms of play; in her struggle with recording details of the private and public aspects of her travels, social and moral implications take center stage.

Her marriage and nine year residence in St. Petersburg textually displaces the acknowledgment of the deaths of her mother, Silvia (although alluded to earlier) and Reverend Paul, as well as the death of Mr. Prince, who was to have acquired some property in Russia before returning to the U.S., but never made it. As such, the narrative of homecoming becomes a return of the repressed. Although she lived in Boston for seven years before embarking for Jamaica, she provides very little information on her work and her life in this period, using it as a bridge between much longer sections on travels to Russia and Jamaica.

Russia: Negotiated Positionality

In St.Petersburg, the domestic is refigured with more exotic and satisfying parameters than the one she left at home. I shall read this section in order to foreground Nancy Prince's travels, and work in Jamaica, and to raise the

question of how she negotiated her subject positionality in Russia.

More than in any other section, Prince turns here to observation in the tradition of Western travel writing. She manages to maintain an awkward kind of distance, struggling it seems, to keep from making generalizations in favor of simply highlighting the exotic for her readers, such as elaborate holiday celebrations, burial practices, and feasts. But because she lives and works for an extended period in St. Petersburg, the ethnographic term participant/observor is appropriate. [31] Laboring and dwelling in a homeplace separates Prince from most of the male narrators of travelogues to Russia from the period, who position themselves as _flaneurs_, observing as they roam the countryside, dining out and encountering others. Nancy Prince's affiliation with the court puts her in a position where she is able to assume a life that appears more middle class, a striking change from her domestic situations in Boston before and after her travels abroad.[32]

---

[31] Carla Peterson, following James Clifford's ethnographic description, also uses this terms to describe Prince's insider/outsider subject position.

[32] She only hints at the misfortunes she faced back in Boston after returning from Jamaica, but does not provide details. "Three times I had been broken up in business, embarrassed and obliged to move, when not able to wait upon myself. This has been my lot" (85). Materials outside of Prince's narrative give us a better idea of the difficulties she may have faced. Although her work as a tailoress is not mentioned in the three editions of _Life and Travels_, Prince took out an ad in _The Liberator_ announcing that she "would repectfully inform her friends, that she...will attend to

She took in two child boarders and employed a servant (26); her clothing-making business was so successful, she employed a journeywoman and apprentices (39)[33]. The Empress purchased Prince's garments "for herself and her children, handsomely wrought in French and English styles, and many of the nobility also followed her example" (39). Early on, Prince makes the claim that "there was no prejudice against color"(23) and if blacks were viewed by Russians as "rare and exotic, yet useful and ornamental" (Parry, intro to Blakely) Prince relays no such overt feeling and she gives little information on Mr. Prince's service in the Tsar's guard, except to say they go to court in the morning, "taking their station in the halls, for the purpose of opening the

---

dress and cloak-making, pantaloon-making & c. Also, special attention paid to boys clothes" (Oct. 27, Nov. 3, 1843). Most likely, Prince's customers would have been blacks, who may have not been been able to pay very much, or whites, who might have been able to pay more. Demand would most likely be sporatic rather than full time (Jones, Labor of Love, 143) While sewing was considered an acceptable and "genteel" profession for black women, it was known to among the worst paying jobs, regardless of race. Alexander Penny, an early advocate of apprenticed training and better job opportunities for women, wrote "our hearts sicken within us as we read the prices paid needlewomen. The trifling renumberation and wasted health of most needlewomen is a bitter reflection on those who employ them" (308).

[33] Here, my reading differs slightly from Carla Peterson's. She claims Prince "openly acknowledges herself to be a commoner who observes and comments upon the customs of the Russian elite, in particular the imperial court" (95-6). While she is a "commoner" in relation to the status and power of the imperial court and in distancing herself from their customs, her affiliation with the court through her husband's employ, and having others working for her puts her in a relatively privileged position.

doors...when the Emperor and Empress pass" (24).[34]

Outside of her mother and sister, the Empress Alexandra is the woman to whom Prince devotes the most attention. She provides an example of a white woman of privilege and power, duty and warmth, characteristics Prince admired. The Empress takes an interest in Nancy, not only by supporting her business but by having her children's matron encourage Prince to distribute bibles to the poor.

In the case of Empress Alexandra, Prince is willing to make an exception from her usual association of amusement with sin, to accept the Empress as skillfully employing the contradictions of privilege and humility. Prince uses the synecdoche of "her countenance" to represent the Empress's power. She is not a gentle, dependent, true woman, but an

---

[34] A vexing absence in Nancy Prince's Russian narrative is any reference to Alexander Pushkin, the Russian mulatto writer whom Langston Hughes called "Pride of the Negroes" ("Negroes in Moscow," International Literature, No. 4, 1933). He came to fame during the years Prince was in St. Petersburg, but had been living away from there and Moscow during much of the 1820s. Pushkin was suspected of being involved in the Decembrist Revolt that Prince describes as originating "under the pretence of a Free Mason's Lodge" (32). Freemasonry had attracted many Decembrists in Russia, who favored internationalism and the eradication of prejudices (Mazour,48) and during the rule of Alexander I, also founded religious organizations such as the Bible Society, later outlawed as a revolutionary club. Nancy Prince's husband Nero and other prominent black Bostonians, such as David Walker and John T. Hilton, were Masons in the U.S.; according to one account, Nero Prince had been involved in the Russian resistance to Napoleon in 1812, setting fires that made it impossible for the French army to remain (Grimshaw, Official History of Freemasonry, 98) and was rewarded with the post of life guard to the Emperor. For the connection between the Decembrist revolt and freemasonry, see Anatole Mazour, The First Russian Revolution (Stanford, 1961) and Marc Raeff, The Decembrist Movement (Englewood Cliffs, 1966).

ideal mother--strong, self-reliant, protective, an efficient caretaker in relation to children (Smith-Rosenberg, 199). She can adapt easily to be with commoners, yet she assumes the proper decorum for her place:

> She carries power and dignity in her countenance, and is well adopted to her station. And after her late amusements at night, she would be out at any early hour in the morning, visiting the abodes of the distressed, dressed in common apparel as any one here, either walking or riding in a common sleigh. At her return she would call for her children, to take them in her arms and talk to them. "She riseth while it is yet night and giveth meat to her household...she stretcheth out her hands to the poor..she is not afraid of snow, for all her household are clothed in scarlet (35).

To emphasize her point Prince quotes from Proverbs (31:15, 20 and 21), a passage describing the virtues of a good wife, which Lemuel, King of Massa, learned from his mother who cautioned him: "Give not your strength to women, your ways to those who destroy kings" (Proverbs, 31:3). This is a striking contrast from the scripture, also from Proverbs, quoted earlier about the devious woman. Yet advice in this section of scripture is given by a mother to a son, warning against a certain kind of destructive woman, who would give him strong drink. Thus Nancy Prince quotes selectively from this text and replaces the corrupt women with an industrious "supermother." Interestingly, Prince does not quote the lines from this verse that I feel are fitting descriptions of her own work and mindset: "She makes linen garments and sells them...strength and dignity are her clothing..charm is deceitful, and beauty is vain, but a woman who fears the Lord

is to be praised" (Proverbs, 31:24,25, 30).

Nancy Prince's admiration is increased by the Empress's dedication to the poor, a cause Prince herself was deeply involved in at home and abroad. She presents the Empress as an idealized maternal figure but does not quote her words directly, as she does with the some of the Jamaicans. She is the longed for mother as angel in the house, with imperial duties that prevent her love from becoming stifling. For Nancy Prince, the Empress could also be a projection of her own desire for power and respect, as she appears impressed by the way the Empress can give orders and have them obeyed. While free African American women did not have the power or wealth of an empress, they too assumed complex, multiple roles in their families and communities as wage earners, nurturers and as purveyors of racial and spiritual uplift. Her admiration for the Empress is both acknowledgement for being treated with respect by a white woman-- and a form of displacing acknowledgement for herself and other black women for their strength and courage. The encounters between a former servant and Empress suggest the kinds of unlikely alliances and attraction to otherness that result from Prince's mobile subjectivity. In the sanctity of her role within an aristocratic monarchy, the Empress seems to present Prince and her readers with a comforting and seductive model, in contrast to the corrupt colonial administrators that Prince will rail against in Jamaica. Prince appeared more secure of

her own position in Russia than in Jamaica.

Serfs and Slaves

As to the cause of the Russian peasantry, while compelling, it did not stir in Prince the same passion as American slavery.

While alluding to comparisons between the two, and noting the plight of the serfs, she never develops a thorough analysis or makes connections between the different parts of her narrative as the questions of slavery and emancipation arise in each location. Nor does she compare slavery in the West Indies with that type of bondage she witnessed in Russia. In the first edition of Life and Travels, before incorporating the material from her Jamaica pamphlet, she notes that she might have compared it to Russian geography and products, diversifying "my book with more extended descriptions of Jamaica, with its tropical climate and productions, and contrasted it with Northern Russia. I hope my readers will not think that I am unmoved by all the wonders and beauties of nature" (58). She does, however, make a statement that gets at the heart of the tragedy of slavery in America, and it is connected to her own concern with forced relocations, divided and broken families, and the trading of human beings as commodities. In Russia, the peasants "...till the land, most of them are slaves and are very degraded. The rich own the poor, but they are not suffered to separate families or sell them off the soil. All are subject to the Emperor, and no

nobleman can leave without his permission" (38). Thus, she does point out that a major difference between Russian peasants and American slaves is the that Russian peasants stay together in one place, although no one, not even a nobleman, can have free mobility without the Emperor's consent. Thus, mobility is limited in each class, regulated by the Czar. In that sense, the serfs can at least develop a community identity and solidarity with others of their class.[35] Moreover, families can remain together; the separation of families is one of the most tragic aspects of American slavery, especially the parting of mothers and children.

Before and during the time Nancy Prince published her narrative, it was not unusual to see comparisons of American slavery with slavery in Russia, published in both the popular press and abolitionist press.[36] In one account, the fact that

---

[35] As Peter Kolchin explains, the significant differences between American slavery and Russia serfdom were that American slaves were "aliens," taken from their homes in Africa against their will, and that they were of a different nationality, race and cultural background from their masters. Russian serfs were generally of the same nationality as their masters, although in some regions, there might be religious or ethnic difference. But Russian peasants were the lowest level of society, rather than outsiders, and while they did not own any property, most received from their owners allotments of land that they used to support themselves (43-45). Kolchin concludes that American slaves generally had a higher standard of living than their Russian or Latin American counterparts, but they also "suffered from much greater day-to-day interference....the serfs were usually subject to less regulation and were therefore freer to lead their lives as they wished" (156).

[36] Mary Turner notes the parallels between Jamaican slaves' and Russians serfs' methods of bargaining with and petitioning absentee owners and managing agents in presenting labor grievances (27). See "Chattel Slaves into Wages Slaves" in Labour in the Caribbean

Russian slaves were white, not black, seemed to make that form of slavery "the very worst kind " that prevails in the "largest empire in Europe...These forty-two millions of white people are in a state of the most abject slavery. They are taught in the schools to be slaves--their catechism teaches them to worship the emperor as their first duty, and the entire nation bows under his despotic power" (Eliza Cook's Journal, reprinted in Ladies Repository, Vol. 14, Sept.,1854,p. 403) John Lloyd Stephens also foregrounds the race question in his comparison of slavery in the two countries, and uses the example of the degradation of Russian serfs to refute any examples of so-called intrinsic white superiority:

> I was forcibly struck with a parallel between the white serfs of the north of Europe and African bondmen at home. The Russian poor, generally wanting the comforts which are supplied to the negro on our best ordered plantations, appeared to me, not less degraded in intellect, character, and personal bearing, indeed, the marks of physical and personal degradation were so strong, that I was insensibly compelled to abandon certain theories not uncommon among my countrymen at home, in regard to the intrinsic superiority of the white race over all others. Perhaps, too, this impression was aided by my having previously met with Africans of intelligence and capacity, standing upon a footing of perfect equality as soldiers and officers in th Greek army and the Sultan's. The serfs in Russia differ from slaves with us in the important particular that they belong to the soil, and cannot be sold except with the estate; they may change masters, but cannot be torn from their connections or their birthplace.--Liberator, May 3, 1839

From Emancipation to Independence ed. by Malcolm Cross and Gad Heuman. London: Macmillan, 1988.

Perhaps Nancy Prince wanted to avoid questions of which slavery was the "worst" kind; she was committed to the issue of abolition of the African-American slaves, and felt passionate about proving that the emancipated slaves of Jamaica were intelligent, industrious, and God-fearing people. She may have felt it was not within her power to take up the cause of the Russian peasantry, or she may have felt it would have diluted her later arguments and the cause of abolition to which her readers were most committed. Or, because of her position at the court of the Emperor, she may have hesitated to go too deeply into a historical analysis of the exploitation of the Russian serfs. In Russia, her color marks her as exotic, but she seems impressed with not only what she considers to be racial tolerance, but writes of religious toleration and opportunity for children of all classes to be educated.[37]

---

[37] Prince does not note the exclusion of Jews from many aspects of Russian life, nor does she make anti-Semitic comments that are commonplace in Russian travel accounts, for instance John L. Stephens, who writes that "no man can bear a worse character than the Russian Jews," while also noting "Peter the Great refused their application to be within the territory of old Russia" (Incidents of Travel in Greece, Turkey, Russia and Poland, 15-16). In Russia and in Jamaica, other writers would note the "bastard" quality of both Jews and mulattos; John Bigelow wrote with horror of the Kingston "Jews of color": "My imagination could never have combined the sharp and cunning features of Issac with the thick-lipped, careless, unthinking countenance of Cudjo" (Jamaica in 1850, 15). For comparisons of Jews and blacks in the nineteenth century, see Sander Gilman, Sexuality: An illustrated History (NY: John Wiley & Sons, 1989).

In the Russia section, she continues to note women's public roles and the effect such participation has on their lives. She writes that the plot to overthrow Nicholas was "so deep...both males and females were engaged in it." When the plot was foiled, Prince seemed surprised that "even princesses and ladies of rank were imprisoned and flogged...those that survived their punishment were banished to Siberia. The mode of banishment is...very heart rending, severing them from all dear relatives and friends, for they are never permitted to take their children" (32-33). Here again, the emphasis is on the separation of mothers and children.

That she relates in some way to Nicholas as a heroic survivor is accounted for in a kind of syllogism: by providential design, both Nicholas and Nancy Prince live through situations where many others die. Amidst the mob that had gathered to overthrow him, cannons went off; Nicholas "was wonderfully preserved, while both his friends and their horses were killed." It is hard to tell if she intends irony here. During the St. Petersburg flood where many perished, Prince fell into a pit, but grabbed onto the leg of a horse that had been drowned "through the providence of God, I escaped the flood and pit" (28).

In some way, her experience as an American black woman living in the orbit of Eastern European royalty gives her an unusual transnational identity that transcends racial categories, with the suggestion of immunity from white

supremacist American law. At one point during her nightmare voyage home from Jamaica, the ship unexpectedly docks in New Orleans and she faces the possibility of being imprisoned as a black woman in a slave state, but she has a document of "protection" from the Russian government (79) that seems to make an impact on authorities. However, Prince feels an even greater protection from God, as she quotes Revelations: "the Lord will take care of me" (78).

Russia/Boston/Jamaica

One of the most frustrating aspects of analysing Prince's texts has to do with weighing information that has been left out. In Russia, she was concerned with proving that she remained busy at all times; details of her body engaged in work, prayer and philanthropy are juxtaposed with descriptions of holidays, the marketplace, and mention of "licentiousness" as common (40). In contrast, Nancy Prince's resistant truth telling is most overt when she represents her travels to Jamaica, which forms the longest part of her narrative, incorporating her 1841 pamphlet and adding a lot more. Rhetorically, she moves from emphasizing her own industriousness in Russia to proving that the emancipated slaves are decent, hardworking, community-minded and intelligent people.

Race and racialized identities become key in the Jamaica section, whereas in Russia racial difference was minimized. Moreover, the Jamaica section contains overt warnings to

African American readers and challenges colonial administrators and plantation proprietors with emigration schemes. In the black Atlantic, Nancy Prince's journeys between the U.S. and the Caribbean point out possible alliances and interventions, but also illustrate hypocrisy, deceit and finally thwarted attempts to organize transnationally.

Here I want to mention the textual bridge between the Russia and Jamaican sections is a brief--only a few paragraphs in length--but intriguing description of her return to Boston. Prince did not depart for Jamaica until seven years had passed; what she only hints at is her involvement in the abolition movement and bitter divides that were taking place. Since the narrative emphasizes travel, she did not dwell on her life at home. But by reading her comments about the contentions in the movement and including some information that she left out, I hope to explore her ambivalence about the women's movement as it relates to questions of race and what I perceive as her uneasiness with aligning with factions or organizations.[38] Today, she might be considered "politically incorrect."

---

[38] Another example of her ambivalence towards the women's movement comes in the choice of words used at the 1854 Women's Rights Convention in Philadelphia. After invoking the blessing of God, Prince is reported to have said she understood "woman's wrongs better than woman's rights," and gave some of her own experiences (based on watching slave cargoes while shipwrecked near New Orleans) to illustrate the degradation of her sex in slavery (Stanton, 384).

To my mind, it is telling that she left for Jamaica, claiming "a field of usefulness seemed spread out before me" just when the debates over women's participation in the abolition movement were heating up, and questions were being raised about the need to go abroad when there was much one could do locally for the free black community. The words "usefulness spread out" are appropriate because Nancy Prince did spread out in Jamaica, moving from location to location and engaging in philanthropic ventures, educational enterprises, and religious proselytizing.

"A Contention Broke Out Among Themselves"

Nancy Prince never mentions that she was a member of the biracial Boston Female Anti-Slavery Society during the 1830s. When she returned from Russia:

> There had been an Anti-Slavery Society established by W.L. Garrison, Knapp and other philanthropists...these meetings I attended with much pleasure until a contention broke out among themselves; there has been a great change in some things but much remains to be done; possibly I may not see so clearly as some, for the weight of prejudice has again oppressed me, and were it not for the promises of God, one's heart would fail, for He made man in his own image, in the image of God, created he him, male and female, that they should have dominion over the fish of the sea...This power did God give man, that thus far he go and no farther, but man has disobeyed...and become vain in his imagination and their foolish hearts are darkened...The sins of my beloved country are not hid from his notice...(42-43).

This passage is compressed and enigmatic. The biblical quotations signify her displeasure with the internal contention regarding gender and the way it possibly

interrupted the important antislavery work that remained to be done. What she leaves out is that by the fall of 1839, The Boston Female Antislavery Society (BFASS) had divided into two factions over the "woman question," one which sided with Garrison and his followers in the Massachusetts Anti-Slavery Society and the other, which sided with the more conservative clerics--led by Amos Phelps, Lewis Tappan and others. The clerical faction used the argument that sexual integration and the full participation of women as speakers would distract abolitionists from their original goal (Hansen, 54).

Part of the competition between the two sides was to secure the support of African-American members, although they were generally not in leadership roles within BFASS. According to Debra Hansen, the African Americans were more interested in developing programs that directly assisted the black community than in debating policy issues that consumed the white women (46). This would account for Nancy Prince's anger at the disruptiveness of the split.

African Americans who sided with the clerical group were called "colored peelers"; several women whose husbands were black ministers aligned with the proclerical forces.[39] Another reason some blacks broke with Garrison was his adherence to a

---

[39]. Mrs. J.C. Beman, Julia Williams (who would marry Rev. Henry Highland Garnet)C. Barbadoes, probably either Catherine or Chloe, related to James G. Barbadoes, prominent Boston abolitionist, and Chloe Lee, are thought to have aligned themselves with the Massachusetts Female Emancipation Society. See Hansen, 59 and Yee, 103.

policy of nonresistance, which emphasized using only nonviolent means to overthrow slavery; some blacks were not averse to the notion that violence might be necessary to end slavery. Although Nancy Prince was in the same circle as these "peelers" and their husbands (for instance, she gave a talk on her Russian travels at Rev. Beman's church in March, 1839), her actions document support for the faction aligned with Garrison, Lydia M. Child and Maria Weston Chapman, advocating women's public participation in anti-slavery work.[40]

Nancy Prince was one of the 78 members of BFASS, and one of at least seven black women (Yee, 102) who signed a letter declaring invalid the election of pro-cleric Mary Parker as president of the BFASS because of a miscounted vote (The Liberator, November 15, 1839, 183). After this dispute, Parker's faction formed the Massachusetts Female Emancipaton Society, and Chapman's faction regouped to to reconstitute the BFASS. By all accounts, the organization never regained its prominence after the split.

---

[40] "Despite disagreements, Garrison and most black Garrisonians were able to accommodate their differences and maintain their alliance" (Horton and Horton, "The Affirmation of Manhood," in Courage and Conscience, 140). Nancy Prince was converted to African Baptism by the Rev. Thomas Paul, who along with his daughter Susan, were staunch supporters of Garrison. However, several years later, when Nancy Prince returned from Jamaica, after a grueling journey that included a detour to the slave South, it was to Lewis Tappan, the New York City leader of the "opposition" American and Foreign Anti-Slavery Society, that she turned for money she needed to redeem her luggage. This shows that rather than being loyal to any particular "camp," Nancy Prince's relationship to a person or organization depended on the particular context; she was pragmatic and refused to let narrow definitions rule the day.

One of the first results of the split was the organization of two separate antislavery fairs for the year 1839. These fairs, which began in 1834, were the major fund-raising events for antislavery and benevolent causes crystallizing "as a desideraturm of Boston's social season and lucrative moneymaker that raised up to five thousand dollars a year for the abolitionist cause" (Chambers-Schiller, 250). In October, 1839, Chapman and the Garrisonian faction organized a fair that pre-empted the usual Christmas one. Nancy Prince is listed in the acknowledgments as an individual donor to that fair, contributing $7 (Liberator Nov. 22, 1839).[41]

To analyze Nancy Prince's support of women's public participation and the way she alludes to a patronizing form of racism within the movment, I return to the above mentioned quote. As Hazel Carby has noted, Prince's comment about not seeing so clearly as others since she has been oppressed by prejudice is ironic (42), since her experience with racism had sensitized her to its very manifestations. Prince then uses a passage from Genesis that forms the basis of one of Sarah Grimke's arguments in her Letters on the Equality of the Sexes

---

[41] Although it was held at an "unseasonable period," this fair raised $1,500, while the December fair held by the "orthodox" majority members, raised only $700 (Liberator January 10, 1840; Melder, 104).

and the Condition of Women. [42]

The gist of Grimke's argument is that "in all this sublime description of the creation of man (which is a generic term including man and woman), there is not one particle of difference intimated as existing between them. They were both made in the image of God; dominion was given to both over every other creature, but not over each other" (32). In repeating the Bible passage "created he him, male and female," Prince also emphasizes that man has no natural dominion over female; she would certainly have known of Grimke's letters, and perhaps heard the Grimke sisters speak during their Massachusetts lecture tour in 1838.[43] Furthermore, Prince implies that by enslaving humans, man has wickedly surpassed a God-given dominion over animals. She particularly singles out the sins of "my beloved country," which are noticed by God, who will repay the hypocritical American

---

[42] The letters were initially addressed to Mary S. Parker, President of the Boston Female Anti-Slavery Society in 1837, before the official split in the society took place. Printed in the BFASS annual reports and in The Liberator, they were intended as a response to the pastoral letter and clerical appeal, demonstrating a scriptural basis for the equality of the sexes, to counter the clerics' use of scripture to keep women submissive and label those who participated in the public sphere as travelers, lecturers, teachers and guides as bold, arrogant, rude and indelicate (Rev. Hubbard Winslow, quoted in Right and Wrong in Boston, 1847, p. 53).

[43] Maria Stewart quoted from this section of Genesis to make the point that there was nothing in scripture to justify racial inequality and domination. In her lecture on "Religion and the Pure Principles of Morality," Stewart, who was a defender of women's rights, left out the gender reference: "He hath made you to have dominion over the beasts of the field, the fowls of the air..." (Essays and Speeches, 29).

sinners on the day of judgment. Although she supported the right of women to speak and stand as men's equals in the abolition movement, she expresses her dissatisfaction with the split, by noting the "contention" and that "much remains to be done" for the cause of the slave. This shows a concern that the gender question could preempt, or divert attention, from antislavery work. Since her next passage introduces her determination to go to Jamaica to be useful, I read the biblical quotation and her subsequent remarks about vanity as working on a second level, as a putdown of the Boston abolitionists and their bitter divides, and part of a justification for going abroad to work for the cause of racial uplift there.

Another tension among the Boston women was centered around the question of where one could do the most significant reform work, locally or abroad. In the 1840 Annual Report of the reconstituted BFASS, Maria Chapman tried to give the impression of a healthy organization as she wrote:

> Meanwhile, to the repentant and the undeceived, the old platform stands where it did...We sympathize with the self-denying labors of a Wilson or an Ingraham. But we need not go to Canada or Jamaica for a field of benevolent effort among the free colored people. They are among ourselves--a suffering remnant, in the grasp of a despotic people, whose hearts are hardened towards them (Seventh Annual Report of the BFASS, 30-31).

There is no way of knowing for sure if Chapman is referring to Nancy Prince's plans to go to Jamaica, but it is possible she is one of those Chapman had in mind, as Prince was recruited by David Ingraham. Chapman sets up an

interesting paradox. Yet her metonymic term for free blacks, "suffering remnant," does not reflect the vitality and activism within Boston's free black community; this tone of patronizing victimization may have contributed to Nancy Prince's distaste for the changes she had seen. At any rate, by travelling away from Boston and displacing her dispute with American women, Nancy Prince voices her difference with their approach and develops a larger, transnational position that includes negotiating among a variety of ideologies and value systems. She may also have consciously or subconsciously left Boston for Jamaica precisely because she could feel a sense of self-importance which was denied because of rigid hierarchies at home, and while free blacks in America were second class citizens, in Jamaica, they could be valued for their experience and accomplishments. In Jamaica, Nancy Prince's independent thinking and her refusal to be absolutely aligned with one particular faction would serve her as an observer and fuel her anger at the oppression and deceit among the missionaries.

Refusal to "Yield Obediance"

It is telling that one of the first incidents that Nancy Prince narrates of her travels to Jamaica involves a dispute with a female class leader in Rev. Abbott's missionary station in St. Ann's Harbor and involves a power struggle.[44] The

[44] This incident is not in the 1841 pamphlet on Jamaica, although there are references in it to the Baptist class-leader system and the practice of charging church members for baptism,

dispute is over the method of religious teaching and Nancy Prince refuses to "yield obedience" to this female class leader.

> As I lodged in the house of one of the class-leaders I attended her class a few times, and when I learned the method I stopped. She then commenced her authority and gave me to understand that if I did not comply I would not have pay from that society. I spoke to her of the necessity of being born of the spirit of God before we become members of the church of Christ, and told her I was sorry to see the people blinded...She was very angry with me and soon accomplished her end by complaining of me to the minister; and I soon found I was to be dismissed unless I would yield obedience ...I told the minister that I did not come there to be guided by a poor foolish woman (46).

In this instance, her anger is directly expressed at a "poor foolish" black woman rather than at the white English clergyman himself. When Prince tells Rev. Abbott about her dispute, he says she should not express herself except to him, which is a form of silencing her she does not directly acknowledge. Then Abbott comments "I do not approve of women's societies; they destroy the world's convention; the American women have too many of them" (47).[45] Part of the tension comes from the difference between American

---

classes, and burial (8).

[45] By "destroying the world's convention," he most likely means the World Anti-Slavery Convention, often referred to simply as the World's Convention, held in London in June of 1840, just months before Nancy Prince departed for Jamaica. At this convention, seven American women representing Massachusetts and Pennsylvania as delegates were refused seats, because the participation of women went against the traditions of the British anti-slavery movement. The British organizers also sided with the "New Organization" or anti-Garrison faction, but did not exclude Garrison or other male delegates from the convention (Kish Sklar, 306).

abolitionists of the Garrisonian variety and the more traditional English abolitionist/missionaries. As a widowed African American travelling alone, Prince was atypical; she was not a missionary's or magistrate's wife or daughter, and yet she had the audacity to question the authority and morality of the English Baptist sytem. She gave away bibles, "not knowing I was hurting the minister's sale" (47). On one level, Nancy Prince seems to threaten Abbott and stands for the disruptive American woman; on another, she is so marginal as to be easily dismissed, and she gives up teaching there and moves on to another part of the island.

In challenging the class leader's moral conduct, Nancy Prince displays her own ambivalence about women's leadership in the context of a religious tradition outside her own New England Calvinist brand of Christianity--that of Afro-Jamaican myalism. For the class leaders were "spiritual guides similar to those in myal groups. Individual rebels could be expelled...to an applicant who did not fully accept the leader's authority"(Bakan, Ideology and Class Conflicts in Jamaica, 53). Nancy Prince may have found the method too full of "superstitions" as the idea of spirit was elevated above written gospel, which was dear to Prince. She does not mention the race of the class leader, but almost certainly she is black; Abbott's congregation was composed almost exclusively of black workers (Gurney, 101). At another point, she goes into more detail about the Baptist class leader and

ticket system, suggesting a lack of piety and commodification:

> They have men and women deacons and deaconesses in these churches; some of these can read, and some cannot. Such are the persons...who urge the people to come to class, and after they come in twice or three times, they are considered candidates for baptism. Some pay fifty cents, and some more for being baptized; they receive a ticket as a passport into the church...(73).[46]

In these descriptions, Nancy Prince's anger at the class leader and her refusal to "yield obedience" is narrated as a moment of defiance against a system she finds coercive. It is also a way to validate her own moral superiority in almost physical terms, the will and body in conjoined agency, refusing to submit.[47] At the time Nancy Prince travelled to Jamaica, Christain and Myal elements were being blurred: "the elements of Christianity became stronger in myal practice--preaching, Christian hymns, Christian phraselogy, "prophesying" in the name of the Christian God, but the basic African elements were also retained"(Curtain, 170). Such

---

[46] According to Robert J. Stewart, the class-leader and ticket system was actually the invention of the John Wesley and the Wesleyans in England, but in Jamaica "in a more limited and tightly controlled way than that employed by the Baptists"(7). In the Baptist system, missionaries set up a class house in areas where church members lived and appointed a black member of the community as leader. The leaders might be former slaves, and literacy was not a requirement for leadership. A critique of the Baptist leader system conveyed by other non-Baptist missionaries had to do with a fear that these leaders were "half-pagan" and therefore corrupting real Christianity (Stewart, 8; 124). That was because the Baptists tended to have greater toleration for African religious practices, which became blended with Christian worship (Curtain, 164).

[47] Elsewhere, Prince connects any deluded or impertinent behavior on behalf of former slaves as the fruits of slavery, which "...makes masters and slaves knaves"(62). I read Prince's gaze in relation to the Afro-Jamaicans as judgmental and corrective like a church elder's.

"blurring" could also make their differences more confusing. A ceremony for dying church members Nancy Prince describes without judging reveals this blend of Myalism and Christianity, although Prince does not name it as such. Her tone indicates distance, but she seems to want to minimalize the degree of otherness she feels as an African American reading Afro-Jamaican culture:

> ...as soon as the news is spread that one is dying, all the class, with their leader, assemble at the place and join in singing hymns; this they say, is to help the spirit up to glory; this exercise sometimes continues all night in so loud a strain, that it is seldom any of the people in the neighborhood are lost in sleep (74).

Myalism, a creole synthesis of evangelical Christianity and African religious experience, could be seen as a form of resistance and black identity in a so-called free society (Stewart, 144). However, Nancy Prince did not express familiarity with myalism, or obeah, the belief that spirits from the dead may be used to harm the living (Beckwith, 104). She would want to downplay these Afro-Jamaican practices in order to emphasize qualities about the former slaves that would meet with the greatest approval by an American readership. In addition. both myalism and obeah were illegal (Curtain, 169).

In part, I read Nancy Prince's anger at the class leader as a displaced critique of the white English missionaries, and the colonial practices of using blacks in order to raise money and gain power. She may have felt this was not entirely unlike practices employed by white women in Boston, although

the parameters were different. In addition, Prince would later express frustration at the lack of adequate support from English missionaries in establishing her manual labor school for girls (Anti-Slavery Standard, May 25, 1843). As she describes charitable giving in Kingston, where she went next, "the colored people give more readily, and are less suspicious of imposition, if one from themselves recommends the measure; this the missionaries understand very well, and know how to take advantage of it" (49).[48] Although Prince writes about attending a meeting held by "colored Baptists" with eighteeen colored and mulatto ministers present, she doesn't specifically name them as Native Baptists, an Afro-Jamaican form of Christianity founded by George Leile, an itinerant preacher orginally a slave from Savannah, Ga. who came to

---

[48] Prince's emphasis on coercion and exposing abuse of power is markedly different from accounts by most other travellers and missionaries, who report that blacks raise money and support religious institutions, but don't reveal whether or not they are pressured or bribed into doing so. And other narratives by missionaries from the same period stress, in the words of Joseph John Gurney, an English Quaker, the "general influence of these pious men [Baptist Missionaries] in promoting both the temporal and spiritual welfare of all classes of the community. The Baptist missionaries in Jamaica...have been the unflincing, untiring, friends of the negro" (Gurney, 98). Stephen Bourne, a stipendiary Magistrate in Jamaica during and after the apprenticeship period, wrote of the Christian ministers that "if they had not made all the bad good, they had restrained, checked and, in most instances, improved the bad. There is not now the same need, as in America, to expose or shame those who were once bad..." (Uncle Toms and St. Clares, 5). Bourne was referring to Harriet Beecher Stowe's expose of slavery in Uncle Tom's Cabin .

Kingston in the 1780s.[49]

Maroonage as Veiled Resistance

While Nancy Prince does not detail the resistant Africanized forms of religion, she draws the reader's attention to the Maroons, descendants of fugitives who had escaped from their Spanish masters at the time of the British conquest of Jamaica. They had lived hidden in the mountains, sometimes attacking whites and kidnapping slaves. Their use of veiling and hiding as a forms of resistance would appeal to Prince, who employs her own rhetorical version of these tactics. By describing the way they beat whites, as retaliation for enslavement and brutality, she is naming opposition without directly advocating violence or becoming a threat herself.[50] She also returns to a theme that dominates the Jamaica section: how the Maroons were "subdued" through use of deceit, physically removed by the English from the place of their birth. Nancy Prince notes that in June, 1841, when she was in Jamaica, a number of the old Maroons who had

---

[49] One of Leile's early followers, Moses Baker, was also an American and former slave, who had a parish in St. James. Eventually, many of their parishes were absorbed by English Baptists, but some remained more independent; in 1838 in Kingston alone, there were six or seven Native Baptist ministers, chiefly ordained by Leile (Stewart, 128). According to John Candler, the number of Native Baptists, "under the teaching of black and coloured men...is said to be 8,000, assembling at twenty-five different stations, the ministers fourteen" (Candler, Part II, 18).

[50] When Missionary Hope Waddall described the Maroons, he did not mention that they had physically beaten whites, but talks in much more abstract terms: "after inflicting severe loss on the military...they were subdued and banished" (Waddell, 18).

been banished from the island and removed in 1795 to Nova Scotia and then Sierra Leone, returned.[51]

> They were some of the original natives who inhabited the mountains, and were determined to destroy the whites. These Maroons would secrete themselves in trees and arrest the whites as they passed along; they would pretend to guide them, when they would beat and abuse them as the whites did their slaves; the English, finding themselves defeated in their plans to subdue them, proposed to take them by craft. They made a feast in a large tavern in Kingston, and invited them to come...they were invited on board three ships of war ready to set sail for Sierra Leone; many of them were infants in their mother's arms, they were well taken care of by the English and instructed;... they are bright and intelligent. I saw and conversed with them...Their numbers were few, but their power was great; they say the is, of right, belongs to them (59-60).

She later contrasts the Maroons' view of rightfully claiming the island with an innkeeper she meets outside of Kingston, an Englishman with "a large family of mulatto children" who expressed anger and fear that the "negroes will have the is in spite of the d-----." She mourns the racialized tragedy of the mulatto children of white fathers, who "were allowed great power over their slave mothers and her slave children; my heart grieved to see their conduct to their poor old grandparents" (58). The question of who has a right to , to power, to citizenship, and the contestation of national identity connects to her black readers' anxieties

---

[51]. A brig carrying voluntary African emigrants, including 64 Jamaican Maroons who had been living in Sierra Leone, arrived in Port Royal, Jamaica, on May 21, 1841. See Mary Elizabeth Thomas, Jamaica and Voluntary Laborers from Africa, 1840-65, p. 33.

about their status as American citizens.[52] At the time Prince first published her pamphlet on Jamaica, advertisements and letters appeared in the abolition press by blacks and whites expressing both advantages or disadvantages to be derived from emigrating to the West Indies. Questions were being raised even before the Fugitive Slave Law about free blacks and what would happen should slavery end. Was it most prudent to leave New England or stay put? Where was the greater economic and educational opportunity? Would there be more respect for blacks in a country with a black majority, such as Jamaica, instead of racist treatment? Colonization schemes, limited employment opportunities, and the possibility of mob violence and kidnapping were realities in the lives of free blacks.[53] During the 1850s, when Prince published her three editions of Life and Travels, the nationalist-emigrationalist debates were heating up (Floyd Miller, ix). When the Fugitive Slave Law was passed in 1850, Martin R. Delany advocated emigration

---

[52] Other travellers to the West Indies in the post-emancipation period reported that the freed slaves were industrious, and the whole country was better off since emancipation, but they did not address or anticipate the wide array of concerns black readers might have had about their own status.

[53] The intersections between racial oppression, homeplace and travel leads Carla Peterson to ask the provocative question: Is the African American not always already a colored tourist? (Doers of the Word, 88-89) She quotes a letter from John N. Still in the 1855 Provincial Freeman as proposing a newspaper column "Incidents, Interviews and Observations" which will include a collection of materials "useful to the public in general and the travelling portion in particular," signed by a Colored Tourist. I have also found occasional comments and small articles on the abuse and mistreatment encountered by "Colored Travellers" in The Liberator such as one appearing August 13, 1847.

to places like Central and South America as part of a black nationalist movement removed from U.S. slavery and the perpetual threat of recapture and reenslavement (Ripley, 20).

Emigration Schemes

In 1840, Nathaniel Peck and Thomas S. Price received the largest number of votes of " a large and respectable number of the free colored population of the city of Baltimore," (Report, 1) to go to British Guiana and Trinidad, to determine if there were advantages in relocating to one of those places. They concluded that in both countries, particularly Guiana, there were "many advantages over the United States for the industrious man of colour" (23). A letter by an unsigned writer, published in The Colored American, and reprinted in The Liberator, accused Peck and Price of being "simple-minded" and taken in by the planters, "whose interest it is to import emigrants to these colonies to produce wealth for them, and who therefore flatter them" (Liberator, November 13, 1840).

After slavery ended, planters and magistrates were anxious to import immigrant laborers to the West Indian islands to work on plantations, since emancipated Afro-Jamaicans were determined to be free of former masters. John Candler, an English Quaker who travelled to the West Indies a year before Prince did, notes the desire of an agent-general of Jamaica to induce laborers to come to Jamaica, but he claims, "There is in fact no need of immigration: the population is fast increasing by birth, and will supply the

labor market as fast as capital is ready to give labour its profitable direction" (Candler, Part II, 37). However, an act had been passed in April, 1840, to encourage immigrants to come to Jamaica. Alexander Barclay, Commissioner of Emigration, promised free passage, constant and steady employment, and "...comforts enjoyed by the laboring classes...exceeded by none in the world" (8).[54]

Here is an example of a notice in The Liberator that African American readers would have seen, offering employment opportunities and free passage to Jamaica:

> The undersigned, having been appointed Agent under the Immigration Act of the island of Jamaica, hereby gives notice, that he will provide with a free passage to Jamaica, such persons as may be disposed to avail themselves of the advantages offered by emigrating to that island, where ample employment is to be found for mechanics, agricultural and other laborers, and provision made for their support on their arrival. Many other and peculiar inducements exist for the colored emigrant. Further information may be obtained by personal application to the Agent.
>
> Edmund A. Grattan, H.B.M. Vice-Consul
> No 5 Lewis's wharf, Boston
> (Liberator, August 27, 1841)

Nancy Prince seemed particularly sensitive to the exaggerated promises and empty rhetoric that attempts to lure blacks to Jamaica. Prince's description of the realities in Jamaica offer a striking contrast:

---

[54] Rather than focusing on wages, which were probably higher in New England than in Jamaica, Barclay emphasized that free colored people would enjoy rights and privileges of free men denied to them in the U.S. (Thomas, 19-20). Barclay was also instrumental in bringing indentured laborers from Sierra Leone and St. Helena to Jamaica in 1841 (Schuler, 11).

> ...on arriving here, strangers, poor and unacclimated, the debt for passage money is hard and unexpected; it is remarkable that wherever they come from, whether fresh from Africa, from the other islands, from the South or from New England, they all feel deceived on this point. I called on many Americans and found them poor and discontented, ruing the day they left their country, where, notwithstanding many obstacles, their parents had lived and died, which they had helped to conquer with their toil and blood, 'Now shall their children stay abroad and starve in foreign lands'"(12).

This passage suggests a practical and more deeply rooted rationale for staying home: for African-American families, there is a particular irony in having sacrificed their lives in slavery, hoping it would be better for their children, in the country where they had been enslaved. To leave your country, only to starve abroad, would be particularly bitter. Prince suggests that the sacrifices made with African blood and toil helped contribute to the prosperity of America, and give African-Americans a particular right to call that country their home; as an abolitionist, she would also want free blacks to stay home to support the cause of their brethren still in bondage (Thomas, 22).[55]

---

[55] In cautioning readers against emigrating, Prince was most likely influenced by Northern free blacks' opposition to a movement that had emerged in 1816, under the auspices of the American Colonization Society, leading proponent of colonizing free blacks and emancipated slaves in Africa. By the late 1820s, Northern black abolitionists had spoken out against a return to Africa by affirming their American identity (Ripley, 2-3). By the 1830s, the major goal of the American Colonization Society appeared to be to send free blacks, not slaves, back to Africa; in 1831, a committee in the Massachusetts senate issued a report favoring a plan to send free blacks back to Africa gradually (Jacobs, dissertation, 91). The argument went as follows: "It will not only be the removal of a class of people from among us, which have an injurious influence upon the morals and peace of society, but enabling them to become a free, independent, civilized, and Christian nation, in the land

Prince focuses on the economic difficulties of the emigrants, while commenting elsewhere on the self-sufficiency and industriousness of her "injured brethren in Jamaica." "They have bought land and built houses. They raise all kinds of vegetables...They have no need to let themselves on plantations. They are extremely kind to each other, and have shown an excellent capacity to take care of themselves" (Anti-Slavery Standard, May 25, 1843). She suggests it is prudent to work the land in your own nation; self reliance and national identity comes through hard work and the claim to land, as well as through kindness and mutual, communal support.

In keeping with her theme of black workers engaged in productive labor, Prince notes how colored women work in the market, tending the vegetable and poultry stalls--she counts the number of stalls, exceeding 200, to convey the scope and to emphasize the organizational and managerial skills of the Afro-Jamaicans. She italicizes the words "surely we see industry" to emphasize "thus it may be hoped they are not the stupid set of beings they have been called"(50).[46] The

---

of their forefathers" (Liberator, April 23, 1831, as quoted in Jacobs, 91).

[46] Anthony Trollope, for example, claimed the negro in Jamaica has "no desire strong enough to induce him to labor for that which he wants. In order that he may eat-today and be clothed tomarrow, he will work a little; as for anything beyond that, he is content to lie in the sun..to recede from civilization and become again savage--has been to his taste..."(The West Indies, 62).

equivalent work for African-Americans of Northern cities was in small businesses and trades, supporting each other although economic survival in a climate of intense racism was difficult.[57]

Prince cautioned black readers against emigration schemes in her narratives while William Lloyd Garrison and his supporters used the pages of The Liberator and Pennsylvania Freeman, embedding warnings in obituaries.[58] Thus, both must be credited with creating obstacles to Barclay's efforts to attract free blacks to Jamaica and in keeping African American labor at home (Thomas, 22). For instance, a notice on the death of James G. Barbadoes, one of the leading black abolitionists in the Boston community, stated

> contrary to the advice of his friends, he emigrated with his wife and family to Jamaica...They soon sickened with the fever of the country, and two of his children died. And now the last intelligence from there informs us of his own decease by the same malady" (Pennsylvania Freeman reprinted in The Liberator, August 20, 1841). Mr. Barbadoes was among the emigrants who went from this section of the country last year to... Jamaica, hoping to better his condition; but in common with them, he soon found that he had been duped by flattering representations that had been held out by persons in the pay of the West Indian proprietors (The Liberator, Aug. 6, 1841).

The tone of the obituary also reveals somewhat of a

---

[57] In Philadelphia, "after 1840, it was admitted that no career was open to the negro, and that he had little chance to rise" (Edward R. Turner, The Negro In Pennsylvania, 148) Between 1829 and 1850, there were six major race riots in Philadelphia, with blacks killed and beaten. Segregation was common in schools, churches and on public transporation (Blackett, 148).

[58] Nancy Prince's pamphlet was on sale in November of that year, a few months after notices of Barbadoes' death. (Liberator, Nov. 12, 1841).

patronizing, paternal voice on the part of Garrison and friends in cautioning the African-American community; Prince's tone is one of surprise. She calls the emigration policy a "mistake" then notes with irony the reality facing those who have relocated.

Prince follows her warning against emigrating with a description of her own tumultuous journey to Jamaica from Massachusetts in 1840, with severe storms and a near run-in with pirates. It leads her to thank God for preservation and to state her purpose for visiting Jamaica after cautioning others not to. "I hoped that I might aid (in some small degree) to raise up and encourage the emancipated inhabitants, and teach the young children to read and work, to fear God, and put their trust in their Savior,"(13). Thus, she clearly distinguishes her purpose from that of her fellow African-Americans, which appear to be economically motivated, and links her purpose to a higher, uplifting enterprise that gives her authority to speak as a servant of God.

In the third edition of her narrative, she jars her reader by suddenly mentioning her brother and Mr. Barbadoes in connection with her arrival in Jamaica:

> I went in the last boat, to see my brother and family off, and to my astonishment, there stood Mr. Barbatose (sic) and family, on the landing, not permitted to go to the Station on account of a difficulty that took place at the dinner table(46). [9]

---

[9] James G. Barbadoes was a barber from Boston, one of three black signers of the the Declaration of Sentiments when the American Anti-Slavery Society was created in 1833, and a speaker at

Therefore, the arrival scene is intertwined with persons familiar to her, although no details are provided as to which of her brothers was there and why, and no mention made of how she knew Barbadoes and family and of their deaths on the island. This dislocation temporarily disrupts Nancy Prince's position as a solitary traveller, since she finds kin and community while away from home--but these connections are fleeting and unstable. The quarrel she includes between Barbadoes and the ship's mate that "caused them to lose their situation" is another opportunity to reveal the power whites exercised over blacks in forcing them out; in this case, a quarrel at the ship's dining table will have repercussions for Barbadoes and his family on land. It also foreshadows her own anxiety about "losing her place" and being forced to submit body and spirit to class leaders, missionaries, ship captains and other authority figures. By the 1850s when Prince published the first edition of Life and Travels, Northern blacks also had to live in fear at home because under the

---

the 1834 New England Anti-Slavery Society (Hall, in Courage and Conscience, 82) In Jamaica, he was a member of the "Whitmarsh Expedition" which had to do with the cultivation and manufacture of silk (Barbados obit, Liberator, August 20, 1841), most likely led by Samuel Whitmarsh, author of a book on the cultivation of the mulberry tree and silk worm, who promoted the industry to farmers and poor families in New England. Prince does not identify Barbadoes or Whitmarsh, which leads me to speculate she believed her readers would know of them, or she was careless in revising her narrative. The incident at the dinner table between Barbadoes and the ship's mate, with the mate asking Barbadoes' son to leave the table so "a man" could sit there, seems to be a case of racial bias.

Fugitive Slave Bill both escaped slaves and free blacks could be kidnapped. Every African-American was a fugitive and potential slave in the United States; Nancy Prince couldn't help but be shaken when she saw a leading African American abolitionist treated with such indignity in Jamaica.

The remainder of Nancy Prince's narrative shifts back and forth between Jamaica and the U.S., as Prince returns to the States to raise money for her Free Labor School. In passing, she mentions that Lucretia Mott was enthusiastic about her plan, and that Prince raised money in New York, Philadelphia and Boston (55), then returns to Jamaica, only to find it too dangerous. She comes up just short, in terms of funds and of the stability needed to undertake such a venture. Therefore, the remainder of the narrative is concerned with loss, confusion, dislocation, theft, and danger that takes place during her voyage home, which is contrasted with final redemption, acceptance, community and safety.

The Body in Pain

In the final third of the narrative, the danger and bodily harm threatened or inflicted upon Prince becomes more central, as does psychic pain, for the journey home includes unexpectedly witnessing slaves as they are being transported. The dreadful homecoming leads to her conclusion, "fearful indeed is this world's pilgrimage" without refuge in God, her most comforting "hiding place" (87,89). Thus, her narrative falls within the cycle of Christian experience central to the

Puritan myth of fall and recovery, and concludes with a spiritual, if not material "victory." As she journeys from Jamaica back to the U.S., Prince exhibits her most powerful resistant truth telling and confrontations with those who enforce white supremacy and brutality, but back in Boston she "has been broken up in business, embarrassed and obliged to move, when not able to wait on myself" (85).[60] She compares herself to Paul when cast among wild beasts, and her liminality in this mode finds her symbollically "stripped" of normal clothing, left naked or in rags (Smith-Rosenberg, 152).

Chaos and disorder in Jamaica force Nancy Prince to abandon her philanthropic project. She returns to Kingston in May, 1842, to find

> everything different from what it was when I left; the people were in a state of agitation, several were hanged, and the insurrection was so great that it was found necessary to increase the army to quell it...On this occasion there was an outrage committed by those who were in power. What little the poor colored people had gathered during their four years of freedom was destroyed by violence...it seemed usefless to attempt to establish

---

[60] Nancy Prince often did not live at the same address for more than a year at a time. In 1846-47, her address is listed as 37 Belknap and in 49-50 Boston Directory, she is listed as "tailoress" address, house rear 25 Belknap. The following year lists her at house rear 60 Myrtle, and in July 51-July 52, house 8 Southac. After 1852, she is not listed in the directory again until 1858 and 1859, when she is listed, not as "tailoress" but as "widow" at the address 32 Garden (Boston Directories, varying publishers). The above mentioned addresses are within a few blocks of each other in the west end of Beacon Hill, where the black community was concentrated. It is probable that she lived in multiple-family dwellings, or that she was a boarder in a rented room or boarding house (Horton, Black Bostonians, 16) which would have been more economical.

> a Manual Labor School, as the government was so unsettled that I could not be protected (57-60).[61]

As the narrative comes to a close and towards home, Prince's discussion of treachery enroute from Jamaica to New York stresses racial difference and the tenuous relationship between slavery and the unofficial "criminal status" of free blackness.[62] Alone among the passengers on board, Nancy Prince guesses the captain's deceitful plans to detain them in Key West: "the whites made themselves comfortable, while we poor blacks were obliged to remain on that broken, wet vessel" (76) because of laws requiring free blacks to be put in custody. Her suspicions reinforce a pattern we have seen: Nancy Prince as a shrewd detector of avarice and deceit, who heroically stands as God's agent. This oppression is based on race rather than on gender and conveys a model of heroism in the face of adversity; it is a model emphasized in male slave narratives, and includes isolated heroism, stark courage, and keenly edged rationality. Prince resists oppression by speaking and acting even as her mobility is restricted; her empowered voice intervenes from the troubled ship and sounds again in her narratives.

---

[61] The agitation Prince describes is probably the repercussions of several "outbreaks,"in 1842, where the natives openly practiced Myalism (Alleyne, 88-9), gathering together to "pull obeahs and catch the shadows from cotton trees" (Beckwith, 158). During 1841 and 42, revivals in the practice of Myalism took place in twenty-two plantation villages, partly because of economic hardships, the result of a decrease in wages and competition from the influx of African immigrants recruited by Alexander Barclay (Schuler, 40).

[62] I am indebted to Jenny Franchot for this terminology.

A severe storm forced the water-logged ship to stop on the Mississippi near New Orleans. Prince observed colored men from ships being dragged to prison; Capt. Tyler forced her to see the "awful sight" of a vessel of slaves, full of "young men, girls and children bound to Texas for sale!"(80). Prince is warned not to say anything to the blacks she sees on land, and once again in Key West she is told by the captain that had she gone ashore "they intented to beat you" (81). She responds to threats of violence, interrogation and surveillance by calling out and asking if her taunters believe in God, and reproaches them for the violent actions and the suffering they have caused. "...there is a God and a just one that will bring you all to account" (78). Her body's mobility halted, language and voice become the unbound lash of verbal retribution; Nancy Prince "kills" her taunters with rhetoric: drawing on a form of signifying in the African-American tradition, she repeats and reverses their claim to believe in God (Gates, Figures in Black 240-1). "I asked them if they believed there was a God. 'Of course we do,' they replied. 'Then why not obey him?' 'We do.' 'You do not'"(78).

Lost the Power of my Arms

In 1843, after returning to New York and then Boston, Nancy Prince is left "poor in health and poor in purse, having sacrificed both, hoping to benefit my fellow creatures" (83). She returns to the theme of the preface to the second edition, where she reminded readers that she refused the support of the

benevolent societies for widows, but solicited "the patronage of my friends and the public in the sale of this work...as my health and strength are gone." In the 1856 edition, in the preface she wrote of losing "the power of my arms."[63]

She is symbolically castrated by such a loss of power. The synechdoche of arms links Nancy Prince to her heroic rescue of her sister, of leading the rock throwing rebellion against the slavecatcher, of grasping a horse's leg to save her life. Powerful arms recall her strenuous work as a domestic servant, and later as a tailoress, transforming frail "woman's sphere" into the masculinized black womanhood symbolized by Sojourner Truth's bared, muscular arm, telling her audience "ar'n't I a woman! Look at me! Look at my arm!" (Painter, Abolitionist Sisterhood, 141). The loss of her arms and strength marks the aging body's boundaries and its

---

[63] We can surmise from Prince's accounts her poor health and perhaps the loss of the power of her arms--were long-terms effects of several injuries described in the narrative, and at least in one account of mistreatment aboard a boat that was detailed in a letter to The Liberator. She dislocated her left shoulder in 1841 when she fell "through an open trap door, down fifteen feet on hard coal," while visiting Mrs. Ingraham's house to raise funds for her proposed labor school (56); her injury was compounded by the exposure she received while on deck all night, because Captain Comstock, on passage from New York to Providence, refused to let her have a cabin ticket or her money back, and two colored chambermaids, refused to find a bed for her "and behaved with great rudeness and violence...In consequence of this exposure, I took cold, and have ever since been much worse" (The Liberator, Sept. 17, 1841). Her work as a dressmaker and tailoress would have strained her physically where she was already vulnerable. "The habits of the sempstress are indicated by the neck suddenly bending forward, and the arms being, even in walking, considerably bent forward or folded more of less upward from the elbows" (Penny, Five Hundred Employments Adapted to Women, 310).

immobility after a life of hard physical labor. In losing physical power, she must become more dependent on the kindness of friends and strangers, linking her material well being with the purchasing of her book, which might be said to stand in as a phantom limb [4]. The cathexis of arms and hands used to write the narrative emphasizes and denotes the limits of Prince's utilitarian body. Under conditions of oppression and limited opportunies, one's power is undermined and lost.

She closes her narrative with the image of a little child, bowed in silent humility and prayer, "willing to be purified though with fire, and accept it meekly "(88). This child can become a seraph, one of the highest orders of angels, which recalls saintly little Eva from Harriet Beecher Stowe's Uncle Tom's Cabin. In allegorized Christian myth, the stage of life denoted by childhood refers to a time of innocence, and therefore suggests a regressive, nostalgic conclusion. The achievement of salvation and knowledge of God's saving grace was a convention from spiritual autobiography that bestowed a fundamentally positive identity on its subject, such as access to love and forgiveness (McKay, 140-41). Prince seems to perceive life and death as on a continuum, which is part of the African and African American religious tradition (Peterson, 83).

---

[4] After the amputation of a functional extremity, the phantom limb is a sensation experienced in close to 100 percent of cases. Here, I am using the term to suggest Nancy Prince's desire for her body's wholeness and restored power, and the use of the physical book as a "memorial" or replacement.(Grosz, 70, 73).

In the allegorical poem, "The Hiding Place," on the final page of the second and third editon, the narrator foregoes the world's "tumultuous noise" and "wealth and honors I disdain" ; "For peace my soul to Jesus flies;...I want no other hiding place." The trope of hiding place is very similar to itinerant preacher Jarena Lee's "secret place" or "closet" which provides an alternative to the secular, capitalist world (Peterson, 83).

Later in the poem, Prince refers to her journey through the wilderness, returning to an Old Testament image used by both Puritans and slaves, and a theme that dominates Christian guide books. "I'm in a wilderness below/Lord guide me all my journey through/Plainly let me thy footsteps trace/Which lead to heaven, my hiding place." Her hiding place in heaven turns out to be a triumph "in redeeming love." Thus, the metaphor of a hiding place is ultimately a heavenly one, suggesting an eternal home in submission and death that promises peace no material existence can provide. The domestic homecoming in New England is minimalized and elided as she time travels to imagine the final rest. However, in "hiding/place" we are reminded of Nancy Prince's success in remaining hidden in her narrative and in history even as she reveals her special places to us. Hiding for Prince, like for the slave Harriet Jacobs, is a site of doubleness, of presence and absence, a useful strategy to ensure that by choosing where and when to hide, she will eventually arrive at her desired destination.

Cheryl Fish

Chapter 2

Travelling Medicine Chest: Mary Seacole "Plays Doctor" in Panama and the Crimea

Mary Seacole, a travelling widow who wrote and published Wonderful Adventures of Mrs. Seacole in Many Lands [1] (London, 1857) in order to earn a living in the face of financial ruin and failing health, was a free-born woman of color from Kingston, Jamaica, the daughter of a Jamaican creole mother and Scottish father.[2] While Seacole and Nancy Prince both travelled in Russia and the Caribbean black

---

[1] All references are to the Oxford/Schomburg edition of Wonderful Adventures of Mrs. Seacole in Many Lands, a reprint of the 1857 edition, unless otherwise noted.

[2] In Jamaica, the term Creole "was used in its original Spanish sense of criollo: born in, native to...and it was used in relation to both whites and slaves...where the society is multi-racial, but organized for the benefit of a minority of European origin" (Brathwaite, xv). Seacole's mother was a free black who ran a boarding house, Blundell Hall, in Kingston that catered to naval and army officers and their families (Alexander and Dewjee, 13). Whether or not she was free born, or granted her freedom is unknown, as is the status of her relationship with Seacole's Scottish-officer father, whose name was Grant. It was common practice for white men to take black or colored mistresses, according to Douglas Hall, "those men who could afford it were often generous to their mistresses and to the children produced by their union" (Neither Slave Nor Free, 209). Barbara Bush notes the complex framework of sexual relations between blacks and whites in Caribbean slave society, noting both sexual exploitation and "close loving bonds between black and white...and the degree of money and property left by whites to mulattos was a cause for concern and controversy in plantocratic circles"(Slave Women in Caribbean Society, 115).

Atlantic to work and perform significant interventions as exceptional black women claiming public space, their narrative strategies, personal and national identities and readerships were distinct. While Nancy Prince's voice was infused with the language of New England Calvinist allegory and abolitionist moral suasion, aimed at a readership mixed in gender and race, Mary Seacole's ironic "yellow" picara mediates between the pleasures and pathos of war and empire, in an effort to, in her words "become a Crimean heroine!" (76.)[3] In doing so, she valorizes both her commonality with "Englishness" and her creole Jamaican otherness for an idealized English reader.[4]

---

[3] Donna Perry, in her essay "Initiation in Jamaica Kincaid's Annie John," points out that Annie becomes the hero of her own life, an effect Perry attributes to the tradition of African story telling, which was continued in the West Indies. Kincaid's writing models were stories she heard, and what she calls her mother's writing of her life as it was told to her. Perry contrasts the models presented by women of color and third world women with the fate of Western heroines, "who are usually forced into prescribed roles and scripts"(248). Since Florence Nightingale was the most famous "heroine" of the Crimean War, I read Seacole's desire as an attempt to present her life as an alternative, but not unrelated, version of heroism.

[4] A controversial passage in Virginia Woolf's A Room of One's Own comes to mind here: "It is one of the great advantages of being a woman that one can pass even a very fine negress without wanting to make an Englishwoman out of her"(52). One might think of Mary Seacole's notions of mimicking the dominant discourse to see her objectifying herself as an Englishwoman while also remaining a Jamaican Creole. Woolf's implication that women do not practice the same colonizing gaze as men, however, is not suggested by Seacole. Whereas Woolf (somewhat unsuccessfully) tries to distance herself from racist discourse, Seacole often signifies, puns, or tropes on her color and "Englishness." For instance after the battle of Tchernaya, she was one of the first to ride down "and very much delighted seemed the Russians to see an English woman. I wonder if they thought they all had my complexion" (188). Anca Vlasopolos and Jane Marcus take up this passage from Woolf in Reconfigured Spheres: Feminist Explorations of Literary Space, Ed. by Margaret

Seacole's authority rests on proving herself as an "other" worthy of heroism and support, a mobile "mammy"[5] whose love of war and nurturing of English soldier-"sons" is stronger than the possible threat her presence represents. In the Crimea, for instance she was refused as a nurse by the officials in power; travelling to the front on her own, she faced the challenge of "redeeming" the name of sutler or camp follower from "suspicion of worthlessness, mercenary baseness, and plunder" (W.H. Russell, Preface to Wonderful Adventures,viii).

Within the tradition of Western travel writing, Seacole presents a version of the mercantile energy that marks what Mary Louise Pratt calls the "capitalist vanguard" of European travellers who descended on South (and Central) America in the first half of the nineteenth century (Pratt, 148-9). While Seacole shares with these traveller/writers an anti-esthetic stance, she focuses on pragmatic action and economic rhetoric.

Higonnet and Joan Templeton, Univ. of Massachusetts Press, 1994.

[5] The term "mammy" in this chapter refers to particular stereotypes that were drawn upon to portray Mary Seacole, and stereotypes she herself appropriated as forms of accommodation and proof of her good-naturedness, but also to parody and indirectly undercut those in power. But the term "mammy" has different meanings, depending on context; the most common use of the term in the American and Anglo tradition evolved during slavery, assigning black women attributes "diametrically opposed to those that define womanhood in general." This included exaggerated physical features, a comedic quality, and aggressive behavior with other blacks, particularly males, but submissiveness to white owners or employers (Jewell, From Mammy to Miss America, 36-8). When Seacole, however, is called "Mami" by one of the wounded men in the Crimea, and she explains that the man had known her in the West Indies "and so called me by the familiar term used by Creole children"(163). "Mammy Wattah" is a West African folk figure, a mermaid who charms a man who is then forever loyal to her (Barthold, 112).

Her purpose is partially distinguished from these men who often claim travel as its own triumph, and from the Victorian lady "exploratresses" who occupy bourgeois houses in the tropics, creating indoor worlds from which to sally forth (Pratt, 159) into otherness.[6] Mary Seacole transforms exploratress into "doctress," asserting a knowledge of healing based on practices of Afro-Jamaican women with a methodology and success rate often superior to more traditional doctors.[7] By seizing her right to mobility as a "female Ulysses"(2) who lights out for colonial territories, Seacole practices both medicine and commercial proprietorship in Panama and the Crimea. Her temporary huts become functioning British hotels combining outpatient clinic, pharmacy, restaurant, and gathering place, dwellings from which to recreate provisional friendships and family romances of Empire and hearth.

In repeatedly pointing to herself as an adventurer, as exemplified in the title "Wonderful Adventures," Seacole

---

[6] Pratt focuses on Flora Tristan and Maria Callcott Graham.

[7] Alexander and Dewjee point out that Mary Seacole and her mother were part of a tradition of Jamaican doctresses whose knowledge and expertise was respected by powerful Europeans, such Lady Nugent, "the first lady of Jamaica, 1801-5" who was attended by a local woman, Nurse Flora, as well as by European doctors, upon the birth of her son. At Port Royal in 1780, Horatio Nelson was nursed by Couba Cornwallis through a dangerous fever; in the U.S., both Susie King Taylor and Harriet Tubman nursed soldiers, using medicines derived from roots and herbs (13, 42). Beckwith notes that in Jamaica, midwives were paid a salary by the government and by families who could afford a fee; they also were familiar with herbal medicines as household remedies(55). For a historical perspective on black women nurses in the U.S., see Darlene Clark Hine, Black Women in White: Racial Conflict and Cooperation in the Nursing Profession, 1890-1950 (Bloomington: Indiana UP, 1989).

distinguishes herself as a natural traveller in addition to claiming authority and the right to tell her story based on her strong, skilled, working woman's body:

> I must pause to set myself right with my kind reader...I do not deny...that I am pleased and gratified when I look back upon my past life, and see times...when I have been enabled to benefit my fellow creatures suffering from ills my skill could often remedy...if...in the following pages, the account of what Providence has given me strength to do on larger fields of action be considered vain...still I cannot help narrating them, for my share in them appears to be the one and only claim I have to interest the public ear...I am not ashamed to confess--that I love to be of service to those who need a woman's help (26).

Critics in the popular press were already valorizing a certain kind of traveler as well as his relationship to an armchair traveller/reader, named as the "true artists" of the journeying/book-making populace. "These are the men who invest travel with a vague romance, which is not to be discovered in the countries they visit, but in that subtle sympathy which satisfies the reader that his author is not only a travelled man, but a traveler" (unsigned review, Putnam's Monthly, June 1855, 565). Needless to say, this "real" traveler was probably not engaged in productive work, nor did he plan to earn his livelihood in the process; Paul Fussell goes as far as to say that "to constitute real travel, movement from one place to another should manifest some impulse of non-utilitarian pleasure" (Norton Book of Travel, 21). When Victorian women took the masculinized labels "adventurer" and "explorer" for themselves, notes Cynthia

Enloe, they were bound to engage with a bundle of contradictions; in order for a woman of color to move in the black and white Atlantic in the 1840s and 50s, she would have to prove herself useful and accommodate on some level the dominant discourses of race, nationality and gender (Bananas, Beaches and Bases, 23). [6] For as we can see in Seacole's continued denial of egoism as a motive for writing her narrative, even as she admits to feeling self-gratification from her work, she must carefully negotiate with her reader in order to claim public space. In soliciting support from her readers, Seacole covered much ground: she provided entertaining stories of success amidst adversity, valorized British bravery and war efforts against the Russians in the Crimea, and finally, after adopting a number of what Frantz Fanon called the mother country's cultural standards (18), asked her readers to become participants in her success story, lest it should come to an end.

Seacole as Travelling Medicine Chest

Seacole negotiated with a number of complex identities in her travelogue: she is a "yellow" woman, a position she inhabits to mediate between black and white, and British and West Indian subjectivities. She creates herself as an

---

[6] As Amy Robinson suggests in her provocative essay, "Authority and the Public Display of Identity," by attaching one's identity to the "mother" country and adapting certain forms of mimicry, the formerly colonized subject "is always already constituted as derivative of a truer self" but Mary Seacole's "ironic distance from authenticity may prove an insurgent guide" (Feminist Studies 20, 540-1).

industrious, pragmatic healer in order to distance herself from the "lazy" creole stereotype while simultaneously authorizing her Afro-Jamaican medical practices. To do so, she becomes a non-threatening, non-sexual "aunty" in Panama and "mother" at the Crimean war front, a signifier for nourishment or a "nursing" black mother's breast, healing, cooking and wielding her "stout" body and soft heart (7). In this guise, she is distinct from the tough cross-dressing women passing through the Panamanian frontier, and the camp-following assortment of wives and prostitutes, as well as the proper Victorian lady nurses and volunteers to be found in the Crimea.

In this chapter, I shall argue that through the use of what I am calling a "mobile subjectivity," in this case figuring the laboring female body as travelling medicine chest, Mary Seacole physically and discursively "dissects" and heals bodies at the Panamanian frontier and the Crimean war front. In doing so, she bridges the gap between curing and caring just at the historical moment when these practices were being split off by gender and professionalized into the separate spheres of doctoring and nursing (Ehrenreich and English, 40). Moreover, the Crimean War was a site for the contestation of healing roles based on gender as it intersected with class hierarchies; Seacole's narrative, together with the comments about her made by other Crimean memoir writers, point to her ability and need to earn money as

one marker of her class and cultural difference. Although Seacole has been reclaimed by English scholars as a black British colonial subject, I shall be claiming her also as a traveller of the Americas, whose interventions on both sides of the Atlantic and survival strategies exceed simplistic categorizations.

While scholars have noted Seacole's "glorification of war" (Alexander and Dewjee, 9) her "enthusiastic acceptance of colonialism in the aftermath of slavery" (Paquet, 651) and her position as a "surrogate white mother" in a "paternalistic colonial paradigm" (Robinson, 547), I am interested in how a relatively privileged free woman of color travelled away from post-emancipation Jamaica to locations dominated by American and then British colonizing presences and used her restlessness as a calling card, textually negotiating with race, imperialism, and femininity to both embrace and refute categorizations. Even if Mary Seacole does mime certain dominant discourses as a colonial subject, I shall claim she does so with a difference (Smith and Watson, xx)--practicing versions of gendered and racialized parodying, inverting, generalizing, signifying, and excessive homage and flattery--this in a double-voiced discourse that destablizes her identity and the colonial paradigm. Therefore, she becomes in relation to Englishness what Judith Butler calls "a failed copy, as it were" (Gender Trouble, 146) speaking from what Homi Bhabha identifies as a "hybrid displacing space" (The

Postcolonial Critic, 57-8). This space "turns the discursive conditions of dominance into the grounds of intervention" (Bhabha, quoted in Young, Colonial Desire, 23). Therefore, I shall examine the ways in which a mobile subjectivity--expressed discursively through shifting spacial coordinates, as well as in a chorus of dialogic voices--enables Mary Seacole to accommodate discourses of Empire even as she attempts to charmingly disrupt and refigure them. How does she become that figure of metonymy and difference that Punch called "the right man in the right place who can--the right woman was Dame Seacole"("A Stir for Seacole," 6 December, 1856) in the Crimea where there were hierarchies and tensions among doctors and nurses? I shall also look closely at some of the mechanisms through which this travelling Creole "supermammy" who dared to trespass [9] at the warfront was brushed aside by historians after her figurative fifteen minutes of fame, while Florence Nightingale became synonymous with heroic nursing and the reform of the medical profession.

Narrator as Picara

For her travelogue, Mary Seacole adapts a female version of the picaro or rogue narrator used by writers like Daniel Defoe and Lord Byron; the picaresque traditionally relies on

---

[9] I am indebted to Jane Marcus for the term "the politics of trespass," which she uses to describe Virginia Woolf's desire in A Room of One's Own and Three Guineas to encourage those excluded from institutions of power by gender, race, or class to "step on the grass of the cloistered quadrangles of ancient..universities, and by extension, on the territories..."("Registering Objections: Grounding Feminist Alibis" in Higonnet,172).

episodic, realistic adventures and a wandering protagonist. The picaresque offers the possibility of satire and demands a high degree of reader participation to persuade the reader of the truth of the narrator's version (Reed, 31). Seacole often addresses the reader directly, explaining her rationale and justification for participating and persevering in what might seems like strange journeys for a middle-aged Jamaican woman. This draws the reader's interest and makes Seacole's boldness less threatening; as Sara Mills points out, women often use humor and irony in travel writing to mark the text when difficult transitions are being made (198); the picara specifically uses verbal dexterity to enter different societies "to pull off her scams" (Kaler, The Picara, 153). In Mary Seacole, we have a picara who brings the historical legacy of the creole language of West Indian blacks, which contains many double entendres and the use of satire. Language was a tool of resistance among slaves, especially females (Bush, 158); Jamaicans have been known to use riddling, proverbs, lies, and toasts in their speech, as well as imitative talk (Beckwith, 198). Although Seacole does not write in Jamaican dialect, her sense of humor and sassiness may be traced to her island roots and she appears to be a master of skillful word play and indirect verbal gestures including the chiasmas, or use of repetition and reversal, to illuminate or draw attention to the "real" status of a

particular pretense.[10] Moreover, writing as picara-heroine allows for improvisation, so she can show herself responding with wit and pluck to the dangers, racism, surprises, and challenges that befall her -- without coming off as a victim or resorting to an overdose of self-righteousness or sentimentality.

Seacole's occasional emphasis on female vanity, however, is exemplified in her opening sentence, where she sets the tone by omitting the year of her birth (1805): "as a female and a widow, I may be well excused for leaving off the precise date of this important event"(1). This statement reinforces sexist white stereotypes about the mulatta woman as lively and sensible, yet vain, haughty and irascible (Edward Long, quoted in Brathwaite, 177) and also mimics and brings recognition of what Anthony Trollope called "the tricks and graces of English ladies" (86) while for the moment ignoring the West Indian tradition of respecting older women for their wisdom and knowledge of folklore and healing (Bush, 154). The fact that Seacole can choose to playfully omit her birthdate as it would

---

[10] Henry Louis Gates, Jr. explores many modes of black structures of feeling as expressed through figurative language in his groundbreaking work on signifying in Figures in Black and The Signifying Monkey: A Theory of Afro-American Literary Criticism. He claims the chiasmas is perhaps the most commonly used rhetorical figure in slave narratives, and throughout subsequent black literature; the chiasmas is a trope that serves to reverse the master's attempts to turn a human being into a commodity, revealing verbal ability and therefore sharing humanity in common with Europeans (Signifying Monkey, 28). Mary Seacole was free-born and discusses slavery in conjunction with her prejudice against the U.S.; however, I would claim her text "tropes on" and revises other texts by Africans in Europe and the Americas.

reveal she is "of a certain age" also calls attention to and reverses a trope that is central to the slave's narrative. The missing birthdate is an indication of the slave's powerlessness and his or her position outside the discourse of human history. "By far the larger part of the slaves know as little of their ages as horses know of theirs" wrote Frederick Douglass (in Gates, Classic Slave Narratives 255). Omitting her birthdate might signify the erasure of other distinctions between the history of Jamaican slaves and the free colored population, who were growing increasingly wealthy in urban areas, the most successful working as journalists, lawyers, teachers, innkeepers and merchants, clearly the class from which she came (Hall, Neither Slave Nor Free, 202).

Here and elsewhere Mary Seacole uses feminine wiles to "flirt" with her Victorian male reader and his possible expectations about her even as she concurrently emphasizes the non-sexual nature of her "plump" motherly body. This has the effect of distancing her from the figure of the working female body associated with sutlers and prostitutes, displacing excitement and pleasure into the sexualized language she uses to describe the thrill of watching a bombardment. It is an "excitement which became intense...so keen and feverish and so deadened to danger had the excitement and expectation made us" (168). I shall return to this language and the spectacle of gazing at bombardments in a section on the Crimean war.

War and Death as Equalizers

In Panama and the Crimea individuals of varying nations were locked in a struggle to claim wealth and power. Mary Seacole "followed" her brother Edward to Panama in 1850 and then, having been denied a place as a nurse in the Crimean war effort, she became a sutler, selling provisions and serving as doctress to the troops. She performs seemingly contradictory vocations of "war profiteering" and selfless healing by standing in to soldiers (and readers) as a synecdoche for "mother" and "home." In both locations, British hotels are extensions of her presence. As Amy Robinson argues, it is the advent of capitalism which produces Seacole as "surrogate mother" (548). The context of commodification and imperialism that propels Britain into the Crimea, drumming up nationalism and excitement about war, also authorizes Seacole's claim to perform heroic action and write about it for public consumption, but in the patriarchal context where "women may serve the military, but they can never be permitted to <u>be</u> the military. They must remain 'camp followers'" (Enloe, <u>Khaki</u>, 15) or ladies like Florence Nightingale, who encroached on male territory, but who did so in a fashion that captured the public's desire for a "ministering angel" of the hospital, the nurse who knew her place. Nursing was transformed in the mid-nineteenth century, "from the most menial of women's work to the most exalted through the commitment of pure and selfless women" (Vicinus, <u>Independent Women</u>, 90).

Yet the liminality of war with its rituals and strange

compression of time and space enables one to transgress boundaries of masculinity and femininity, race, and class, and break down essentialized notions between war making and caregiving (Ruddick, 119). Through her narrative account of her participation at the scenes of war and death, which she names as "the great levellers" Seacole is able to subtly deconstruct power relations and institutionalized racism and sexism. For it is in succumbing to disease and wounds from combat that "strong" men become weak like children, and a healthy Jamaican woman of color becomes an enabling body, an agent who in these circumstances might make the difference between life and death for a British officer. It is in this uncanny inversion of colonial power, with the citizens of the mother country usually represented as manly and strong and other races or colonial subjects portrayed as feminized and childlike, that "mother" Seacole expresses Creole affection for the English in terms suggesting symbolic infanticide or a pieta canvas: the most lovable Englishman is a dying soldier.

As she puts it in a kind of double entendre when referring to the 1853 outbreak of yellow fever among the English in Jamaica, instilled in the hearts of creoles such as herself is "an affection for English people and an anxiety for their welfare, which shows itself warmest when they are sick and suffering" (60). And displaying her homeopathic knowledge, based on creating symptoms similar to those which cause disease, Mary Seacole demonstrates what she calls the

Afro-Jamaican inclination to the healing arts. Remedies for diseases that "attack foreigners...are found growing under the same circumstances which produce the ills they minister to. So true is it that beside the nettle ever grows the cure for its sting" (60). One might read the choice of words in this statement as an allegory of West Indian retribution; in succumbing to particular diseases that "attack them" in the West Indies, the British are being repaid for their legacy of colonial invasion.

Racializing Travel

Mary Seacole draws attention to her race and her gender throughout her narrative in different ways than Nancy Prince did, reminding us that racialized meanings have been deployed and internalized with many variations among black women. Evelyn Higginbotham, drawing on Bakhtin, notes how the language of race has always been double voiced, "serving the voice of black oppression and the voice of black liberation" (Signs, 267). Seacole connects race and travel in the opening pages of Wonderful Adventures of Mrs. Seacole in Many Lands, not by suggesting a heritage of slavery and diaspora that brought Africans to the West Indies, but by identifying with her Scottish soldier-father's love of camp-life and "the impulse to be up and doing" rather than risk an association with the stasis of "'lazy Creoles' (as) applied to my country

people" (2).[11] On her first trip to London, street boys poked fun at her and her companion's complexion: "I am only a little brown--a few shades duskier than the brunettes whom you all admire so much; but my companion was very dark, and a fair subject for their rude wit" (4). Thus, she distinguishes the mulatto or colored subject from the darker negro, whose complexion justifies ridicule; her appeal to a white readership is expressed through using the logic of similarity and difference with "English" definitions of beauty. In making distinctions between mulattos and negroes at certain times in her narrative, she uses classifications that were dominant in Jamaica and the Caribbean in the pre- and post-emancipation period--that of the assumed superiority and privilege of the colored or mulatto over the black. In other places, however, she draws attention to her color (phenotype) to expose and express the relationship between races, highlighting ambiguities between "passing" and "mixing." She focuses on racism rather than gender discrimination, exposing those who attempted to thwart her and other "worthy" blacks. Thus, I shall examine how Seacole relies on shifting notions of her race and skin color in relation to those she encounters in locations outside Jamaica, using it to signify and mark herself as a text and to appeal to her readers' assumed

---

[11] Anthony Trollope also associates the level of one's energy with the race and ethnicity of "forefathers." "No Englishman, no Anglo-Saxon, could be what he now is but for that portion of wild and savage energy which has come to him from his Vandal forefathers" (63).

"civilized" sensibility. While "yellow" is a term often used by others to define Seacole as black or other, she calls herself "yellow" to define herself as other than black and not quite white. "Yellow" or mulatta can also mark Seacole as an indeterminate West Indian subject, seen as occupying what Paul Gilroy calls a bastardized identity, "between the Britishness which is their colonial legacy and an amorphous, ahistorical relationship with the dark continent and those parts of the new world where they have been able to reconstitute it" (Union Jack, 45).

Discloses Writing Strategy

Whereas Nancy Prince was "authorized" to travel in that she accompanied her husband to Russia and was invited to accompany an American mission to Jamaica, Mary Seacole makes her unofficial status clear. Authentication, therefore, becomes central to her narrative's purpose. In including numerous testimonials from high ranking officers and soldiers, prominent citizens, and famous London Times war correspondent W.H. Russell, she is establishing the value of her work, the right to trespass on territories, and the failure of the establishment to recognize her talent because of race and class discrimination. Having provided the reader with these outside "endorsements," texts that are placed in dialogue and "speak for" her, Seacole feels free to disclose her method of organizing her narrative and therefore accounting for its motions, discontinuities, and gaps, an apparatus excluded by

Nancy Prince. In relation to the Crimean war:

> I am fully aware that I have jumbled up events strangely, talking in the same page, and even sentence, of events which occurred at different times; but I have three excuses to offer for my unhistorical inexactness. In the first place, my memory is far from trustworthy, and I kept no written diary; in the second place, the reader must have had more than enough of journals an chronicles of Crimean life, and I am only the historian of Spring Hill; and in the third place, unless I am allowed to tell the story of my life in my own way, I cannot tell it at all...I shall continue to speak from my own experience simply...(146-7).

This statement reveals a strategy of doubleness; first she "undercuts" and qualifies her authority to speak by emphasizing difference from the traditional war chronicle, as hers will be less "historical" and based on the (less important) experiences at Spring Hill. But then, she claims the autobiographical imperative on her own terms, as purposefulness gives her the right to do it her way, or not at all. By anticipating and seeing herself through the imagined gaze of another--in this case, the hypothetical male reader--she accommodates his (projected) desire for historical accuracy and linearity by calling attention to her way of jumbling things up, or "improvising" while also raising key questions about the process of constructing a testimony. In mentioning the difficulty of relying on memory, and admitting that she travels textually by juxtaposing time and space through the lens of her own experience, Seacole refuses the totalizing, linear discourse of war. She does not attempt to hide all the seams. Thus, even as Mary Seacole admits to the

perceived weaknesses in her method of decentering, she valorizes this kind of "disruption" of difference by refusing to do it any other way.[12]

At the Crossroads: A "Taxonomic Gaze" in Panama

Mary Seacole's travel narrative has a very brief chapter on her personal life and childhood in Jamaica. Let us recall that Nancy Prince's narrative began with a section on her youth to set up her connection to commercial deportation and domestic responsibilities brought on by her mother's incapacity, while Mary Seacole erases the legacy of Jamaican slavery and life after emancipation. She illustrates her ambition to be a healer with a brief description of her mother, who ran a boarding house called Blundell Hall and was an "admirable doctress." Seacole emulates rather than separates from her mother: "It was very natural that I should inherit her tastes; and so I had from early youth a yearning for medical knowledge and practice which never deserted me" (2)[13]. Seacole does not reveal the extent of medical knowledge

---

[12] Ziggi Alexander and Audrey Dewjee believe the tone of this statement indicates that the role of the book's editor, whose initials appear on the title page as W.J.S., was minimal. They conclude Seacole would not have allowed for much interference and Sir William Russell and Lord Rokeby, two of Seacole's high-ranking "authenticators" would not be party to "any deception regarding the book's true authorship"(38-9).

[13] Black women in the Caribbean, following West African traditions where women held positions as "religious leaders, magicians, healers and seers...came to hold respected positions in the slave community as obeah and myal practitioners, herbalists and doctresses" (Barbara Bush, Slave Women in Caribbean Society, 154). In her story "Girl," Jamaica Kincaid reminds us of how an Antiguan mother in the 20th century passes down her knowledge of making

she may have picked up from observing military surgeons at work in the nearby camp of UpPark or the military station at Newcastle, near her home (Alexander and Dewjee, 1982, 3). As Sandra Paquet notes, "The Jamaican social and cultural landscape is reduced to her narrow professional interests...self revelation does not begin in earnest until her departure for Panama, at the age of forty-five"(658).

After the deaths of her husband and mother, neither of whom we learn much about, the focus shifts to two major locations, coinciding with specific historical occasions as monumental spectacles. The California Gold Rush and Crimean War transform frontiers into sites of contestation, disorder and colonial expansion: they are "crossroads," geographical contact zones where disparate peoples and ideologies clash and struggle for power and prizes. In figuring her movement at these crossroads, Seacole blurs discourses of science and sentiment, two distinct traditions in imperial narrative by men (Pratt, 76-8), aligning self legitimation with scientific status and colonial expansion. This is a bold move for a woman of color, and Seacole's aligning with these traditions paves the way for her narrative of medical expertise.

---

medicine for various purposes along with other components of "woman's work." In the process of indoctrinating her daughter, she casually and ironically juxtaposes "this is how to make a good medicine for a cold" with "this is how to make a good medicine to throw away a child before it even becomes a child" (<u>At the Bottom of the River</u>, __). Mary Seacole was also brought up by "an old lady...who could scarcely have shown me more kindness had I been one of (her grandchildren"(2) which meant she had two strong women as role models.

At the New Granadian[14] frontier, Mary Seacole, in the tradition of the Western travelogue, compares and classifies the behavior of English, American, Panamanian, Indian natives and other men and women travellers through what I am calling her "taxonomic gaze." Many of the narratives by travellers to the West Indies in this period use taxonomic descriptions to categorize, objectify and assign a moral and intellectual hierarchy to whites, mulattos, blacks and the offspring that resulted from miscegenation, ostensibly to educate and enlighten readers back home, but also to satisfy a taste for exotic otherness and to illustrate emerging scientific and anthropological theories of race and its role in human evolution. As Eric Leed has noted, from the Renaissance on, travel accounts had become highly elaborate methods of appropriating the world as information (188); just as topography had been catalogued, so too were humans. In what was an early and influential account of racist observation and classification in descriptive travelogues, Edward Long, a Jamaican judge and slaveowner, in his 1774 History of Jamaica, established a connection between the negro and the ape, which he explained in terms of the great chain of being (Cantor, Images of the Negro in Colonial Literature, 41) Following Long and other travellers, it was commonplace to write of racial difference with disgust, assumed inferiority, but also with

---

[14] New Granada was comprised of the present day Panama and parts of Colombia.

what Robert J.C. Young calls colonial desire: "a covert but insistent obsession with transgressive, inter-racial sex, hybridity and miscegenation" (Colonial Desire, xii). While fascinated with relations between the races, the superiority of the whites was constantly reinscribed and naturalized. For instance, Anthony Trollope (who incidently stayed at Blundell Hall in Kingston, when it was run by Seacole's sister Louisa) had sections in his narrative based on racial categories and hierarchies which he used to make generalizations about the contact between English planters and the Afro-Jamaicans. In the chapter "Jamaica--White Men," he wrote, for example "where white men and black men are together, the white will order and the black will obey, with an obedience more or less implicit..." (87). Another traveller to Jamaica believed that miscegenation mingled the best qualities of blacks with those of whites, but was most interested in the way "the white blood of the island shall be absorbed" over time: "...amalgamation appears to be to the negro a sort of purifying process, by thich the more soft and feeble qualities of his nature are carried off to give place to those of more refinement and force" (Benjamen P. Hunt, "Voyage to Jamaica," The Dial, Oct., 1843, 240-243).

Leaving Jamaica, Mary Seacole nevertheless draws on familiar systems of classification in order to claim a place for the "yellow woman with the cholera medicine" that later legitimizes her participation in the Crimean War. In Panama,

the English are set up as "civilized" while the Americans are bullies and racists, and the Native Spanish and/or Indians are superstitious and lazy; her argument, however, is constructed on the basis of the behavior of the people she observes and her own admitted cultural bias (against Americans) rather than on scientific theories. By establishing hierarchies among races, nations, and genders in Panama, Seacole is performing a number of contradictory but common interventions and authentications. For example, she displaces any critique and legacy of British slavery and colonial power onto the Americans, whom she groups together as an indistinguishable mass of vulgar southern slaveowners. She notes that when an American was arrested, in this case for a highway robbery, a crowd of "brother Americans" abused and threatened the authorities, here the black alcalde (mayor), "...all of them indignant that a nigger should presume to judge one of their countrymen"(45).

New Granada, as it was then called, was dominated by an American presence; in fact by December, 1850, Americans had "taken over" managing most of the hotels, bars and transport facilities (Holliday, 416) but according to other travellers's accounts, the Americans were of varied classes and from all parts of the nation. Getting to San Francisco via Panama "was the clean-fingernails route..the way of the wealthy, the well-educated, and the fastidious"(Jackson, 119). Gamblers and Congressmen mixed with more ordinary folks lured by the

promise of gold. Seacole's portrayal of Americans' arrogance, bigotry and buffoonery make them seem like caricatures, not unlike Mark Twain's send up of the duplicitous carpetbaggers The Duke and The King in his picaresque Adventures of Huckleberrry Finn.

Despite her humor and stereotyping she makes some striking and significant claims. Most importantly, she valorizes free blacks in New Granada, many of whom are former American slaves, to argue for the industriousness, good sense and benefits of relocation to Central and South America, thereby engaging in the debate on emigration already underway in the United States and in Britain. Martin Delany had mentioned South and Central America as locations offering opportunities for African Americans, and William Wells Brown, a fugitive slave, had travelled to Europe, publishing The American Fugitive in Europe in 1855; like Seacole, Brown found the English less prejudiced than Americans. In addition, Jamaican blacks had come to New Granada because of opportunities to work as boatmen (Griswold, 46); another traveller remarked on how Jamaican mulattos at Chagres were "saucy, active and strong as white men and know as well the worth of money. They are the workers of the country" (William Swain, quoted in Holliday, 437). Seacole's emphasis on her own exceptionality may have led her to focus on blacks who had been American slaves instead of on the successes of her countrymen. "It was wonderful to see how freedom and equality

elevate men, and the same negro who perhaps in Tennessee would have cowered like a beaten child or dog beneath an American's uplifted hand, would face him boldly here, and by equal courage and superior strength cow his old oppressor"(43).

By making an example of the lawlessness, arrogance and brutality of slaveholding Americans abroad and the success and leadership roles of blacks as citizens with equal rights in New Granada, she also challenges white supremacy and points out the contingent nature of slavery; for in New Granada (just like England) "that on a slave touching its soil his chains fall from him"(52). This, you may recall, is a situation exactly opposite the one noted by Nancy Prince, where a free black could become enslaved upon entering a Southern U.S. port.

Seacole illustrates the effects of power and the ideology of white supremacy, whereby an alternative relationship cannot even be imagined, by narrating an account of a young American woman "whose character can be best described by the word 'vicious'"(52). The woman became ill at the town of Gorgona and beat her slave so that "her cries were so distressing that Gorgona could stand it no longer, but broke into the house and found the chattel bound hand and foot, naked and being severely lashed"(52). The astonished mistress and slave were taken to the alcalde, "himself a man of color and of a very humane disposition." The woman was asked to explain her cruelty and did so

> with the coolest unconcern...the alcalde must be drunk or a fool...to interfere between an American and her property. Her coolness vanished, however, when the alcalde turned round to the girl and told her that she was free to leave her mistress when she liked (52).

But the slave had a baby back in New Orleans and "had we not persuaded her to the contrary, she would have sacrificed her newly won freedom for the child's sake." Seacole does not know the outcome of this case, but such examples serve several purposes: reinforcing the cruelty of American slaveowners and her support for the cause of abolition, while allowing the white English reader to distance himself from any duplicitiousness in slavery or racism. In addition, any prejudice that her reader may have been inclined to feel toward Seacole's participation as a healer and proprietor at the Crimean War front could seem more shameful after reading about and laughing at the ridiculous spectacle and cruelty of American racism in New Granada.

The names of the hotels in New Granada towns indicate the way they performed as markers of nationhood. Mary Seacole's brother Edward ran the Independent Hotel in Cruces, while American hotels dominated the landscape, with names such as United States Hotel, Crescent City Hotel and Hotel Americano. American travellers reported that the service at American-run hotels ran from "courteous and attentive to the wants of travellers" (Griswold, 46) to "indifferent" (Taylor, 27), to "hog holes hardly fit for a dog to eat at" (Swain, quoted in Holliday, 437),while women travellers were more likely to

remark on how the "hotels" often had "no floor but the ground for my bed, a valiece for a pillow...I wept bitterly" (Mary Ballou, quoted in Levy, 34). Mary Seacole's general putdown of American travellers passing through is not placed in the context of competition she may have faced in running her British Hotel. At any rate, she forbade gambling, and offered special services such as a "black barber...the rivalry to get within reach of his huge brush was very great; and the threats used by the neglected, when the grinning black was considered guilty of any interested partiality, were of the fiercest description"(38). Her use of the term "grinning black" here and occasional mention of "nigger" in the narrative reveals that she sometimes resorted to pejorative terminology and stereotypes that reflected accepted racial hierarchies in Jamaica, with "white" "colored" and "negro" as distinct categories in social structure (Hoetlink, 47), which would not be unfamiliar to English and American readers. Thus, her terminology reveals a bias based on color which serves as a kind of marker of class difference that overlaps with socio-economic class.[15] In response to an American's July 4th toast to her as "the best yaller woman He ever made...but I du reckon on your rejoicing with me that's so many shades removed from being entirely black____; and I guess, if we could bleach

---

[15] Hoetlink adds "the chances of upward mobility as well as the maximum distance of this mobility are unequal" for each of the white, colored and negro categories in Caribbean society. The inequality is determined by physical characteristics; racial categories are therefore superimposed on socio-economic ones (50).

her by any means we would..."(47) Seacole claims that if her complexion "had been as dark as any nigger's, I should have been just as happy and useful, and as much respected by those whose respect I value" (48). But Seacole continues to draw attention to color in her descriptions of those she meets and those who work for her. In addition to hiring a black barber, she travelled from Jamaica with two servants, a black man named Mac and "a little girl" named Mary who is identified as "yellow"(57) and in another place as "my little black maid"(39). Thus, in travelling Seacole assumes a position of power over a black man and a younger female, yet without a husband she must still justify her status as "an unprotected female."

Autopsy as Mediation: Science and the Text of Nurture

Interestingly, the disorder, vice and chaos that spring up around the traveller's crossroads become a provisional homeplace to showcase Seacole's rationality and skills, that while based in folk traditions, are superior to the superstitions and irrational Catholicism of the native Indians and Spaniards of Cruces, whom the Priests encourage to prostrate in prayer rather than use common sense. "The poor cowards never stirred a finger to clean out their close, reeking huts or rid the damp sheets of the rotting accumulation of months"(27).

One particular incident narrated by Mary Seacole stands out for me as signifying her mediating position between

Western notions of rationality and Afro-Jamaican beliefs such as myalism while at the same time deconstructing gender roles. In addition, the inclusion of this incident provides Seacole with a base from which to anticipate objections to her claim for power/knowledge as a doctor. While Seacole often embraces the role of the mother, in describing her decision to perform an autopsy on a dead baby, she is mixing her "caregiving" capacities with her desire for scientific knowledge that places her outside "delicate" true womanhood and challenges the text of nurture. This happened in the same historical time frame when Harriot Hunt was asked to leave Harvard Medical School because the rituals of the dissecting room and mysteries of the body were thought to "unsex" women and detract from the dignity of the school (Acterberg, 146, 149).

After being called on to help the family of a mule owner suffering from the cholera that was rapidly spreading, Seacole and the "bravest of the women" restored some order. She sits with her last patient in her lap:

> a poor, little, brown-faced orphan infant, scarce a year old, dying in my arms, and I was powerless to save it. It may seem strange...but I thought more of that little child than I did of the men who were struggling for their lives, and prayed very earnestly and solemnly for God to spare it (29).

When it died (for Seacole refers to the child as "it") Seacole decides to "...examine it" to learn about the way cholera operated. "I was not afraid to use my baby patient thus. I knew its fled spirit would not reproach me, for I had done all I could for it in life"(30). She bribes the man who

takes away the dead to go with her to the thick bush by the river, where using a substitute scalpel, she performs

> my first and last post mortem examination...at that time the excitement had strung my mind up to a high pitch of courage and determination; and perhaps the daily, almost hourly scenes of death had made me somewhat callous. I need not linger on this scene, nor give the readers the results of my operation; although novel to me, and decidedly useful, they were what every medical man well knows (30).

Cutting open the brown child might have seemed less than shocking to Seacole's English reader, who by the time her narrative was published had probably heard of her medical expertise in the Crimean War and were mourning the loss of English sons. Yet, this behavior was outside of acceptable female decorum. It seems to provide self-authorization for Seacole as a worker to share a common experience with "what every medical man well knows". In some sense, a post mortem can be seen as an embodied border crossing between death and life, a physical acting out of the colonial gaze that underlies the need to classify and name in order to understand and differentiate. Seacole's narrative juxtaposes nurturing the baby in its final hours of life with her use of it in death as a specimen or body of knowledge, transforming woman's hands into a scientist's tool for dismantling. However, I do not mean to suggest that Seacole believed in biological differences between the races or used people of color as specimens, which was the case for some European "doctor-scientists" who thought certain maladies were peculiar to blacks, and who came to Jamaica to study the effects of

tropical diseases on Europeans (Wilkins, 29). If anything, comparative anatomy would illustrate how differences in race, nationality and class are culturally constructed. In Michel Foucault's words, external differences "fade, merge and mingle as they approach the great, mysterious, invisible" depths of the inner primary organs that are "unreachable except by dissection, that is by materially removing the colored envelope" (The Order of Things, 268-9). In fact, Mary Seacole ignored her taxonomic rankings when it came to medical practice in New Granada; she treated those who could afford to pay, "but the great majority of my patients had nothing better to give their doctress than thanks. The best part of my practice lay amongst the American store and hotel keepers, the worst among the native boatmen and muleteers. These latter died by the scores and among them I saw some scenes of horror I would fain forget if it were possible"(27).

Nevertheless, Seacole clearly lets her readers know she never again used a corpse as a "guinea pig," lest they suspect her of any strange West Indian practices or of conducting post mortems on Englishmen. In mentioning that the baby's spirit would not reproach her, she is referring to Myal practice of normally letting the body's spirit or duppy rest for a period before burial (Pigou, 24). After burying the body, Seacole and her accomplice "stole back into Cruces like guilty things" (30). The "guilt" is compounded by her revelation that she made some blunders in her attempts to cure cholera, losing

patients she may have later been able to save. At the end of the chapter, Seacole herself comes down with the disease, which seems like her "punishment" for transgressing (34).

By disclosing her remedies for cholera, Seacole is authenticating her knowledge, and refusing to hide under the veil of professionalism. She also may have sought to alleviate stereotypes about Jamaican healers associated with forms of obeah or the supernatural by naming mustard plasters, calomel, mercury and boiled cinnamon as common remedies for cholera, some of which were used by European doctors. But narratives by doctors in Central America or at the Crimean front do not often disclose techniques or name remedies in this manner, perhaps preferring to preserve their doctor's mystique; these omissions also reflect the confused state of classification and treatment of diseases that predominated in this period.[16] C.D. Griswold, an American surgeon for the Panama Railroad Co. who wrote an account of his service there, blamed most illness and fever on the behavior of the patient, especially the use of stimulating drink (95). Mrs. Foote, in her Recollections of Central America and The West Coast of Africa (London, 1869)

---

[16] In the Crimea, many doctors did not receive instruction that would prepare them for the kind of disease they would encounter; in terms of classifying disease, distinctions were often inaccurate; "lasting well into the nineteenth century, there was also the confusing battle between those who accepted contagion as the means of spread of certain infective diseases and those who believed in the miasmatic theory. The uncertainty of diagnosis led to confused treatment..for most fevers, quinine was used blindly" (John Shepard, The Crimean Doctors: A History of the British Medical Services in the Crimean War, 53-4).

tells of the assumption by poor Nicaraguan Indians that a foreign woman must have "knowledge of the healing art." Taking out her homeopathic box, she gives the children with whooping cough "globules of belladonna, much to the awe and astonishment of the assembled mothers"(20). Thus, an herbal remedy could seem practical or exotic, depending on the person and context in which it is administered. Englishwomen travellers may have carried homeopathic boxes, but Mary Seacole knew enough about remedies for tropical illnesses that "the course of treatment which saved one man, would, if persisted in, have very likely killed his brother"(32). Interestingly, in one history of the Crimean war, Mary Seacole is recalled as having in her medicine chest "the secret of a recipe for cholera and dysentery; and liberally dispensed the specific alike to those who could pay and those who could not" (Kelly, 162).

In the Crimea, whether or not one is paid for work is a significant social fact, for as Anne Summers has persuasively illustrated, paid nurses in that war were distinguished from lady volunteers. Summers uses the term "non-lady" to indicate a woman who might reasonably expect to work for her livelihood, very often working <u>for</u> a lady ("Pride and Prejudice" 51, emphasis added). Mary Seacole, as an independent mulatta widow who is not too proud to earn money from those who can afford to pay or to waive fees for those who cannot, does not fit neatly into any of the roles

prescribed for women in the Crimean War--lady volunteer, paid nurse, wife following her husband to battle, tourist observing the theater of war. Amy Robinson claims Seacole poses her "'self' in contrast to almost all the women and men, white and black, she encounters in the course of her adventures, in an attempt to disable the categories which would make her peripheral or silent or poor" (543). I want to claim, however, that the categories that emerged in the Crimea were outside of Seacole's jurisdiction; I am interested in how her working body, in its movement from British hotel to battlefield and elsewhere, is often figured through the synecdoche of "woman's hands," which displaces her as a specific working woman of color. The emphasis on hands and their many associations mediates among categories such as doctor and nurse, nurse and lady, merchant and mother, English/citizen-subject and Jamaican ex-patriot, all cultural roles that Mary Seacole would play. For in the Crimea, unlike New Granada, the field was crowded with those who wanted to make themselves useful and as the war was the first to be reported on "live," with the London Times reporter W.R. Russell filing stories by telegraph from the front, there were many seeking publicity and promotion. Seacole cannot appear to threaten the soldiers, doctors and Miss Nightingale herself; thus, her ironic picara juxtaposes "man's place" with woman's; feeds and heals her soldier sons while wearing her bonnet; serves tea and rides out to help when bullets fly; and sings

her own praises in harmony but lets upper class Englishmen sing even louder.

Arrival and Departure: Performing Gender in Liminal Space

Like Nancy Prince, Mary Seacole calls attention to gender in several ways in her narrative, such as noting women's participation and behavior when it is outside of traditional women's sphere. Both Seacole and Prince assumed a maternal role or exhibited concerns they labelled as "motherly" outside of biological motherhood.[17] But unlike Prince, Mary Seacole draws attention to herself in contact zones dominated by male travellers and soldiers by wearing her "trademark" dress and bonnet, markers of her gender and anglo-Jamaican identification, often in striking colors, yellow and red, with "the smartest" styles of hats. As Alison Blunt notes in her study of Mary Kingsley, gender ambiguities arise from "temporary license to behave in ways constructed as masculine while travelling but remaining constrained within the context of acceptable feminine conduct"; thus discourses of explorer/observer may be juxtaposed with feminine self

---

[17] Alexis Soyer, the French chef who became close friends with Seacole during the war, mentioned the presence of 'the Egyptian beauty, Mrs. Seacole's daughter Sarah' or "Sally" several times in his narrative Soyer's Culinary Campaign (London, 1857), and J.A. Rogers in his entry on Mary Seacole in World's Great Men of Color (New York, 1947) mentions a daughter Sally who aided Seacole in her Crimean canteen-hotel-hospital (496). Alexander and Dewjee note that Soyer was probably mistaken, but even so "it is odd that Mrs. Seacole makes no reference to Sarah in her autobiography"(43, note 22).

consciousness about appearance and behavior (72). In her dress, Mary Seacole's "maternal" or feminine presence is noted; most illustrations of Seacole play up her flamboyant dresses and hat or bonnet and minimize the threat of her politics of trespass and medical intervention. Along with her bonnet, she is often noted as being stout, with a large bosom or behind, or as smiling, wearing a pleasant countenance so admired and non-threatening to her English public and consistent with the mammy stereotypes outlined by K.Sue Jewell and as part of what bell hooks calls a "longing for a racist past when the bodies of black women were commodity, available to anyone white who could pay the price" (Black Looks, 62). A writer in the Kingston, Jamaica Gleaner in 1905, went as far as calling Mary Seacole a "type" of Jamaican hotelkeeper, women who were generous and fat "...they usually sat at one of the entrances to their spacious halls like some Olympic deity, profoundly conscious of their own importance, and English to the backbone" (author unknown, Gleaner extract, 7-8).

The discourses of explorer and "lady traveller" are blurred when Seacole narrates a humorous scene of her arrival in Panama introducing the geography as it appears to her as well as how her appearance marks the landscape. After the railway portion of the trip, she had to climb a hill, and notes how her light blue dress, white bonnet prettily trimmed and "chaste" shawl, had become stained by the red Gatun clay as she makes her descent to the river side (13). This scene of

arrival symbolizes the liminality of travel, the crossing of boundaries, moving away from more fixed gender roles at home into the ambiguous states of flux on the other side of the hill, performing gender over spacial coordinates. Seacole does not don male attire in New Granada, although she notes that many women, especially after returning from the freedom of San Francisco were "in no hurry to resume the dress or obligations of their sex"(20). While such behavior may seem inappropriate to Seacole on one level, on another she appears to admire these women who "rode their mules in unfeminine fashion but with much ease and courage"(20). She especially takes note of European or American women who are passing through, like the performer Lola Montez "in the full zenith of her evil fame, bound for California...dressed ostentatiously in perfect male attire...she carried in her hand a handsome riding-whip, which she could use as well in the streets of Cruces as in the towns of Europe"(41). Montez, born in Ireland, had changed her name and transformed herself into a Spanish dancer who was known for performing a spider dance, and for delighting and charming men as well as fighting them (Levy,127-9). Seacole would not desire to be "shown up" by one whose level of outrageousness was marked by lack of propriety and restraint. Nor does Seacole comment on the successful native businesswomen who assumed gender roles outside of "true womanhood"; Mrs. Foote had noted Nicaraguan women's self sufficiency and economic skills: "in the absence

of their male relations (they) transact all commercial affairs in a way that is astonishing to an English lady...there are far fewer cases of dreadful poverty amongst women than in other countries. The poorest widow will sell her last gown to convert it into goods... (62) while J.M. Letts described a meeting with a proprietress, "one of the most extensive landholders in New Granada and one of the most wealthy" who cuts cane with a machete, lives in a thatched hut and whose husband "was entirely naked and seemed to devote his attention to the care of children" (California Illustrated, 29).

Seacole notes how women alone in New Granada "kept aloof from each other" (18); she herself longs for female society but finds the women "who crossed my path were about as unpleasant specimens of the fair sex as one could well wish to avoid"(50). She claims they are mostly Southerners, and therefore racist, but when it came to medical treatment, "I forgot everything, except that she was my sister, and that it was my duty to help her"(50). Sisterhood for Seacole comes with her touch, as the hands that heal know no racial, class or national borders.

Refused as a Crimean Nurse

It is much more difficult for Seacole to attribute racism (or ageism) to the English ladies who turn her down as a nurse in the Crimean war. Seacole devotes a whole chapter of her narrative to her attempts to serve officially in the Crimea, for both the excitement and delight she would take in serving

her English "sons"; she wanted to "carry my busy...fingers where the sword or bullet had been busiest and pestilence most rife"(75). When she was rejected, she narrates how she devised a scheme to "trespass" and travel there at her own expense to set up a store in partnership with Mr.(Thomas) Day, a distant connection of the late Mr. Seacole; at a later point, she disrupts the narrative's progress by referring the reader back to this chapter to peruse for a second time, as she is still angry over being turned down for official service, and she wants to be "in her reader's face" about it. She didn't become "the right wo(man) in the right place" by mere accident, she emphasizes, but by devising her own route to get there.

It is at this point that Seacole makes a distinction between her "old strong-mindedness" and obstinacy which is "in no way related to it--the best term I can think of to express it being 'judicious decisiveness.'" Strong mindedness is what prevents her from giving up although "so regularly did each successive day give birth to a fresh set of rebuffs and disappointments" (76). "Strong mindedness," however, was already a pejorative term being used by Victorians to label women as offensive and pushy, a way of "aspiring after manhood" although women novelists like Elizabeth Gaskell, George Eliot and Caroline Norton were using the term "strong minded" to refer to courageous actions of women characters (Helsinger, 93).

Nevertheless, Seacole's contrast between strong

mindedness and obstinacy--the latter emphasizing the unreasonable and stubborn--can be read as a displacement for her dismay and anger at the unreasonable behavior of those who turned her down despite obvious qualifications. She applies for a post of hospital nurse at the War Office, the Medical Department, and to Elizabeth Herbert, wife of Secretary of War Sidney Herbert, who with Mary Stanley, were recruiting nurses after Florence Nightingale had left for Scutari with the first party of nurses in October, 1854. Seacole, in her attempt to diplomatically contain her bemusement, says she refuses to

> blame the authorities who would not listen to the offer of a motherly yellow woman to go to the Crimea and nurse her 'sons' there...In my country, where people know our use, it would have been different; but here it was natural enough -- although I had references and other voices spoke for me --that they should laugh, good naturedly enough, at my offer (78).

She constructs herself and the authorities here through use of analogy and creates a doubleness of polite accommodation and outraged dissent that will mark her Crimean writing; she is both a "harmless" motherly yellow woman who the English, unlike the Jamaicans, can easily dismiss, and yet claims her authority as a medical practitioner with references who should be impossible to dismiss. All this is to prove to her readers in a forceful manner that her desire to serve was "not unnatural" (78) in a country where what was "natural enough" was to discount someone like her. By using the terms "natural" and "unnatural," her discourse is embedded within Victorian ideologies, whereby an unmarried woman's desire to

participate in the spectacle of war without the proper connections was seen as suspect and inappropriate. The term "they know our use" is an indication of dissemblance between the British and Jamaican colonial hierarchy, who at least take advantage of the skills of doctresses. Seacole uses the passive voice in the plural form to objectify herself and indirectly indict the British authorities she says she refuses to blame.

Seacole's strong-mindedness or willfulness in her desire to support the war effort also calls attention to and deconstructs the oppositions of "mother" and "war" and make us see how often caregivers have, in Sara Ruddick's words, "devoted their energies to war." Seacole's desire creates a dialectic between her sense of powerlessness and her power, which is a rationale similar to the one militarists use to justify the need to keep fighting their opponents (Ruddick, 119).

Eventually, Seacole is forced to implicate **directly** the British for practicing transnational racism she had heretofore displaced onto Americans, but she does it by blaming the "ladies" and not the patriarchal military establishment. "Was it possible that American prejudices against colour had some root here? Did these ladies shrink from accepting my aid because my blood flowed beneath a somewhat duskier skin than theirs?"(79) Race was certainly one of the factors, but most likely her age, nationality and strong-mindedness were also

held against her; many of the paid nurses came from Catholic or Anglican nursing sisterhoods. Anne Summers points out that both ladies and nurses who were accepted in Stanley's and Herbert's party were supposed to be about thirty years old, although at least one paid nurse, Elizabeth Davis, also a travelling servant and nurse, was about 60 when the war broke out (Summers, "Pride and Prejudice" 37, 39). Seacole was 50.[18]

Thus, Mary Seacole's unusual position in the Crimea--in terms of her location near the front, and in her occupation as proprietor and doctress-- was the result of a mobile subjectivity. Here I am using that term to suggest a form of defiant trespassing and the creation of a home space where she had been denied a place, and also to prove the prejudice was a gross mistake. She also had emotional support from those soldiers who had known her in Jamaica, and assistance from Mr. Day, who helped finance her British Hotel, although he did not participate much in the day-to-day operations.

"Unofficial" but "Celebrated" Status

Because of her limited options, Seacole positioned herself in the Crimea as both insider and outsider. Her "unofficial status" as healer and proprietor comes outside the

---

[18] An especially ironic aspect of the bias against Seacole is made clearer by Mary Stanley's complaint about the difficulty of finding qualified nurses who "wished to go from a good motive. Money was the only inducement"(quoted in Summers, 39); Seacole wrote, "I was so conscious of the unselfishness of the motives which induced me to leave England--so sure of the service I could render among the sick soldiery, and yet I found it so difficult to convince others of these facts" (79).

auspices of institutionalized medical and nursing personnel, and yet she was known as somewhat of an institution in herself--the French chef Alexis Soyer referred to her as "the celebrated Mrs. Seacole" (232) and other Crimean memoir writers preface her name with an adjective along those lines. But what does it mean to be a "celebrated person" and what actions are being celebrated? For instance, Doctor Douglas Reid mentions her as "a celebrated person...a coloured woman, who out of the goodness of her heart and at her own expense, supplied hot tea to the poor sufferers while they were waiting to be lifted to the boats"(13). Reid's emphasis on how Seacole served tea to as many as 200 sick men in one day, and his subsequent mention of her receiving a Crimean medal after the war, leaves out her medical interventions, as if recognition were solely for the serving of tea.

Mary Seacole's working body and spatial presence at the Crimea are significant to my argument about the deployment of mobile subjectivity. For she was closer to the front than other women who had made the journey to the scene of war, and was known to have placed herself under fire in her attempts to tend to wounded soldiers; in addition, her unofficial status in some sense allowed her to move somewhat more freely and remain uncategorizable. As Anne Summers points out, by the outbreak of the Crimean War, "women who had moved freely in and out of army society as sutlers, cooks, nurses and seamstresses were now excluded; henceforth their relations

with soldiers were restricted to the personal...the female presence in camp...was almost by definition disreputable" (Angels and Citizens, 27).[19] On the nursing end, Florence Nightingale worked in the hospital in Scutari, and came to inspect the hospitals on the Crimean peninsula, but did not reside there; nor did she provide medical attention under fire.[20]

In spacial terms, Mary Seacole built her British Hotel at a crossroad she called "Spring Hill," located on the high road between the harbor at Balaklava and the British army headquarers near Kadikoi, enroute to the battlefields and Sebastopol across the Crimean peninsula. That gave her the visibility and access to a great number of passersby, who would partake of her offerings, which included varieties of food and drink, medicine and outpatient care, as well as social interaction and conversation. Spring Hill, with its protection and huge stores of meats and other comfort items can stand in geographically as the inversion of the dreaded, claustrophobic, subterranean trench. It is a homespace

---

[19] The women who came to the Crimea included wives who were "on the strength" and therefore approved by a soldier's commanding officer; they were more or less confined to Barracks in Scutari away from the front (Compton 20-1); "unofficial wives," were ignored by officials and lodged outside of barracks, some living in tents or ditches, resorting to drink and prostitution, as the Queen's Regulations were against the employment of army wives in official capacity (Sigsworth and Wyke, 90; Compton, 42).

[20] On the participation of the Russian nurses corps, see Enloe, Does Khaki Become You?, 96-97, and John Shelton Curtiss, Russia's Crimean War (Durham: Duke UP, 1979), 462-5.

strategically built, and one from which Seacole makes forays to hospitals and battle sites.

The location of the British Hotel and its relation to Mary Seacole as a presence--are connected in other accounts where she is mentioned, usually briefly. Lady Alicia Blackwood, who was put in charge of the barracks where the soldiers' wives lived, remarked on how Seacole had "wisely pitched her tent equally close" to the railway that ran from Balaclava to army headquarters:

> doubtless she had a view to facilitating the transport of her stores also to her warehouse...one must appreciate the wisdom exhibited by the good old lady not only in providing every variety of article..and not withstanding the heavy prices at which her goods were sold, no one grumbled...if (her prices) were slightly usuriously added to on her behalf towards others, it was always remembered that she had..personally spared no pains and exertion to visit the field of woe, and minister with her own hands such things as could comfort or alleviate the sufferings of those around her (262-3).

Blackwood and Mrs. Bracebridge ran a store in Scutari where provisions and clothing could be bought. Piers Compton suggests that although the atmospheres were very different, there was a "gentle rivalry" between the Blackwood's and Seacole's establishments, although the store at Scutari was assisted by funds and contributions (Compton, 134). That rivalry could have contributed to Blackwood's complaint about Seacole's prices. Most accounts of Seacole are fraught with a tension between seeing her as a practical but opportunistic capitalist and a good natured "old" mother who risked death to tend to the needs of others. Her subsequent bankruptcy is

offered as proof against what seems to me a suspicion about a black woman who would profit from the Englishman's yearning for home and comfort foods; we are reminded of the burden placed on black women to account for what might be perceived as overstepping the boundaries of their proper place when it comes to successfully accumulating money. For instance the defensive letter written by Nancy Prince to the abolitionist press, explaining that funds donated for her proposed school for orphans had been placed in the custody of an American missionary after she had abandoned the project.

Discourse of Rivalry

In fact, a discourse of rivalry that surrounded the reform of military nursing, in this case between women and often based on differences such as class and institutional affiliation, has been displaced or absent in many Crimean narratives by English writers but noted by scholars and historians of the war. As Cynthia Enloe reminds us, women who are presences in military campaigns have learned to view each other as rivals--whether ideological, sexual or nationalistic (Bananas, 91). In Compton's account of women in the Crimean War, he constructs a romanticized account of two high spirited, competitive Victorian "ladies," Lady Erroll and Mrs. Frances Duberly[21], and suggests that Nightingale wanted

[21] Erroll, along with a maid, accompanied her husband, a captain in the rifle brigade, as did Frances Duberly, whose fine horsemanship and flirtations with officers are contrasted to her "stick in the mud" husband, the regimental paymaster of the 8th Hussars, or cavalry. Compton notes that upon hearing of the arrival

Seacole out of her Barracks hospital in Scutari because "for all its great size, (it) was not big enough to contain both Mrs. Mary Seacole and Florence" (131).

Scholars have noted the rivalries and power struggles between Florence Nightingale and other women who came to work. John Shepard writes of tensions between Nightingale and Miss Clough, the only woman to nurse in a regimental hospital during the war (other nurses were at base hospitals far from the front). When Nightingale objected to this appointment, Clough reminded her that she had no authority over nurses in the Crimea; both women had friends in high places and strong, competitive personalities (Shepard, 503-5). In addition, Nightingale was apparently upset over the recruitment and arrival of a group of Catholic sisters of Mercy, which convinced her that her friends the Herberts and Mary Stanley had been intriguing behind her back to reinforce the Catholic presence in the hospitals (Summers, 42).

Some Crimean War narratives have noted the hierarchies, based on class, gender and perceived expertise, among the medical personnel in the war.[22] There were tensions between

---

of Captain Cresswell's wife, "a great he woman" they forgot their own rivalry and were so "frightened" they put on their most feminine attire "to give themselves confidence "(55). Compton often paraphrases Duberly's narrative, Journal kept during the Russian War. London: Longmanns, 1856.

[22] Medical personnel were divided into a hierarchy of five ranks: Inspector-General of Hospitals; Deputy-Inspectors; first-class surgeons; second-class surgeons; and assistant surgeons (Baylen and Conway, 11). The hierarchies in the Crimean War could be seen as mirroring what Paul Starr calls "the hierarchical

doctors--regular army and civilian, and with nurses-- Joseph O. Baylen and Alan Conway in their introduction to Dr. Douglas Reid's war letters, write of the hostility of the doctors and their leader, Dr. John Hall, toward Florence Nightingale's proposed reforms of the unsanitary hospitals. The medical officers were antagonistic, and some may have even obstructed her work, because they "feared that cooperation with her would evoke negative reports from their superiors and thus prejudice their opportunities for promotion"(19).[23] "Outwardly there was politeness, but difficulties were put into the way of 'the bird' as some of them called her behind her back" (Cook, 182). Nevertheless, Nightingale's challenge kept nurses subordinate to male physicians, and she allegedly told her nurses "never to do anything for the patients without the leave of the doctors" (quoted in Cook, 182). Training emphasized character rather than skills. "The Nightingale nurse was simply the ideal lady, transplanted from home to the hospital, and absolved of reproductive responsibilities. To the doctor, she brought the wifely virtue of absolute obedience. To the patient she brought the selfless devotion of a

---

character of the society" for in England, physicians, formed a small professional elite, followed in prestige by surgeons who practiced a craft, and apothecaries, who followed a trade (37).

[23] It was difficult for doctors to receive promotions, and assistant surgeons received very poor pay for their services; yet, the doctors objected to what they perceived as an intrusion on their turf. The surgeons and Dr. Hall wanted to be the only ones to criticize the work of the medical department; they resented W.H. Russell's reports in The Times and must have felt especially threatened by a woman's intervention and leadership.

mother"(Ehrenreich and English, 36). Yet, while she demanded absolute obedience from her nurses, Nightingale was anything but submissive to doctors. "She defied rather than obeyed the doctors..it is not surprising then that Florence Nightingale's vaunted devotion to duty gave rise to paradoxical situations"(Bolster, 19).

Seacole and Nightingale

For a long time, Mary Seacole's and Florence Nightingale's names and accomplishments have been disassociated, as one became a legend while the other was soon forgotten[24]. A few recent publications attempt to revive the comparison directly: the Canadian edition of Wonderful Adventures of Mrs. Seacole (Stratford: Williams-Wallace, 1989) is called "Jamaican Nightingale" and Eric Huntley has written a children's book, Two Lives Florence Nightingale and Mary Seacole (London: Bogle-L'Ouverture, 1993) in which he compares

---

[24] Charity Funds were set up for both Nightingale and Seacole. Most of the 44,000 pounds collected in tribute to Nightingale's work were transferred to her to use as she saw fit; the fund "offered her the best opportunity to put into concrete form her dissatisfaction with existing patterns of nursing" (Summers, Angels and Citizens, 68) On the other hand, the Seacole Fund was directed by a committee that held a four-day "Grand Military Fete and Benefit" that included 1,000 performers and nine military bands; the company went broke and withheld the money due to her (Alexander&Dewjee, 34; Fryer, 252). Nightingale's reputation was promoted through intense merchandising of her name and image, as poems, woodcuts, songs, stationary, and portraits were churned out; "life-boats and emigrant ships..children, streets and race horses were named after her"(Cook, 266-7). Nightingale shunned publicity, but spread her influence through her teaching and training schools, but her strongest "weapon" was her pen, as a steady stream of letters and texts "maintained her reputation and mapped out the boundaries within which the subject of military nursing could be discussed" (Summers, Angels, 71).

and contrasts the prejudices both had to overcome as heroines of the Crimea; In Sherlena Chamberlain's one-woman performance as Seacole in a London production by Theatre of the Oppressed, "The lady of the lamp is upstaged by Seacole" (Spare Rib, April, 1992 , 21).[25]

Soon after the Crimean War ended, the distinction in their legacies was anticipated and expressed in a letter by "DA MERITUS" to the London Times:

> While the benevolent deeds of Florence Nightingale are being handed down to posterity with blessings and imperishable renown, are the humbler actions of Mrs. Seacole to be entirely forgotten, and will none now substantially testify to the worth of those services of the late mistress of Spring Hill? (Nov. 14, 1856)

The many references to Mary Seacole's kindness and her portly, old, brown working body may be read as a marker of difference from representations of Florence Nightingale, who

---

[25] Efforts to recover Mary Seacole's reputation and work came first from Jamaican nurses and medical personnel. In the centenary year of the Crimean War, 1954, the Jamaican Nurses Association elected to call their projected Kingston headquarters Mary Seacole House; a residence hall at the University of the West Indies and a ward in the Kingston Public Hospital were also named for her. But in England, it was not until 1973, when the British Commonwealth Nurses' War Memorial Fund and a Jamaica women's group based in London, collaborated to reconsecrate Seacole's grave in the Catholic cemetery at Kensal Rise, London. Due to the overwhelming requests for information on Seacole after an 1980 exhibit "Roots in Britain," Ziggi Alexander and Audrey Dewjee published first their pamphlet on Mary Seacole, and followed that with the 1984 reprinting of Wonderful Adventures (Alexander and Dewjee, "Editor's Introduction,"40). Jamaica-born novelist Michelle Cliff evokes Mary Seacole's legacy in her novel No Telephone to Heaven (1987)in the figure of the nameless "yellow doctress," a registered healer in a Jamaica hospital, but also seems to misread Seacole's contribution, associating her "dashing figure" with Scutari (not the Crimean front) and with healing those who were the "Queen's cavalries" while Cliff's transsexual character Harriet "nursed all manner of illness and wound, turning from none (168-171).

was described as slender, delicate, upper class, an efficient bureaucrat, the lady with the lamp hovering over the poor solider, in a Victorian lady's dress and cap. Alexander Kinglake, the historian of the Crimean War, called her the "Lady-in-Chief," a strange cross between a "dragon lady" and mesmerizing redeemer of inept men: he noted her keen intelligence, power over men in authority and a will that made her an effective, yet compassionate "dictator" (Invasion of the Crimea Vol. VI, 417-428). She was represented as real and yet unreal, as men idolized her at a distance, "kissing her shadow" as she passed (Cook, 237) an example of the "inaccessible" white woman. Mary Seacole, on the other hand, was corporealized as nourishing mammy, soldiers remembering her as "that black breast pillowing his head" who if he let himself imagine, could be comforted by the illusion that she was his mother (Compton, 136). This image of the mammy and her large, comforting bosom was, according to K. Sue Jewell, constructed by men to gratify their needs, while keeping the woman in her "proper" place (41) in relation to whites.

Mary Seacole's representations of her brief meetings with Nightingale are illuminating, revealing her strategy of accommodation, sometimes bordering on parody in order to create a place for her own travelling medicine chest. With a sergeant friend she had bumped into, Seacole went to the hospital to present Nightingale with a letter of introduction. "I think Mrs. B (Bracebridge) who saw me, felt more surprise

than she could politely show (I never found women so quick to understand me as the men) when I handed her Dr. F's kind letter respecting me, and apologized for troubling Miss Nightingale" (89). Seacole describes Nightingale as

> a slight figure, in the nurses' dress, with a pale, gentle and withal firm face, resting lightly in the palm of one white hand, while the other supports the elbow--a position which gives to her countenance a keen inquiring expression, which is rather marked. Standing thus in repose, and yet keenly observant--the greatest sign of impatience at any time* a slight, perhaps unwitting motion of the firmly planted right foot -- was Florence Nightingale--that English woman whose name shall never die, but sound like music on the lips of British men until the hour of doom (91).
>
> *Subsequently I saw much of Miss Nightingale, at Balaclava.

Seacole hands her the note and Nightingale asked in a "gentle but eminently practical and business-like way, 'What do you want, Mrs. Seacole--anything that we can do for you? If it lies in my power I shall be very happy.'"

Seacole tells her of her dread of a night journey by caicque (light Turkish rowboat) and offers to nurse the sick for the night; no room is to be found for Seacole, "but at least a bed was to be unoccupied at the hospital washerwoman's quarters"(91). Seacole is non-plussed by this; she immediately writes that washerwoman are soft-hearted folks, and this one "welcomes me most heartily"(91). "Soft-hearted" is a term she used earlier to describe herself. Her easy conversation with the washerwoman and invalid nurses, sharing "scraps of our respective biographies" contrasts with the somewhat uneasy

"tick" she uses to describe Nightingale's static yet inquiring gaze and impatiently tapping foot. Irony signifies the class difference between Nightingale and herself--as she contrasts easy acceptance by the washerwoman, with whom she converses and shares stories as a peer, with the understanding that she must present a letter to "speak" for her when making initial contact with Bracebridge and Nightingale. In emphasizing Nightingale's paleness and whiteness, Seacole calls attention to race to mark their difference without naming it as such and in the same passage mentions Nightingale's already immortalized legacy, anticipating that her name "shall never die on the lips of Englishmen," an embodied, timeless voicing by men would ensure the passing of story into history. Seacole's biography was shared orally with working class and invalid women in a barracks hospital, but men's written testimonies were enclosed in her own autobiographical text, perhaps with the hope of immortalizing her name. Seacole interestingly juxtaposes the fact that she has a book "filled with hundreds of names of those who came to me for medicines and other aids" (133) with another "book" or publication, Punch. The magazine "allowed my poor name to appear in the pages which had welcomed Miss Nightingale home" by printing the poem "A Stir for Seacole" that exonerated her "nursing and dosing deeds." Thus she simultaneously marks the success of her medical remedies and the writing that inscribes her into history, but does so with humility in relation to

Nightingale's ready-made legacy. Her asterisk notes that she saw much of Nightingale (at Balaclava, where Nightingale inspected the hospitals) yet Seacole only mentions her one more time and briefly, when the lady was ill (148).[26]

Seacole creates a dialogic effect again in letting other voices intermingle with her discourse of justification and accommodation, which helps to expose the double-bind of the necessity of sounding such a trumpet. However, the French chef Alexis Soyer, in his Crimean memoir, Soyer's Culinary Campaign published the same year as Seacole's Wonderful Adventures (1857) quoted Seacole as saying something different about Nightingale: "'I am sure if the lady had known I was here, she would have called to see me'" (Soyer, 233). In his depiction, the difference in perception and power between the two women becomes clearer. He mentions that Seacole said "'You know Monsieur Soyer, that Miss Nightingale is very fond of me. When I passed through Scutari, she very kindly gave me board and lodging'." His response: " This was about the twentieth time the old lady had told me the same tale" (Soyer,

---

[26] In a brief account, J.A. Roger's compares Seacole with Nightingale in terms suggesting the former is more hearty and better able to withstand hardships. "Mrs. Seacole, without waiting for the arrival of Miss Nightingale went into this place of horrors, comforting the men and with deft-accustomed hands...She remained in the Crimea until some time after the war, having stood the hardships better than Florence Nightingale who had been ordered home because of illness," (World's Great Men of Color, 1947, 496-7). This comparison reinforces the notion of a kind of frail "true womanhood" for upper class white women and a hearty, powerful, "workhorse" masculinized body for black women, while also acknowledging Seacole's significance.

435). Soyer had written of his own relationship with Nightingale as they worked together to improve hospital facilities, where his task was to bring order to the kitchens and to introduce better cooking methods. By emphasizing Seacole's namedropping, he draws attention to her "need" for self-legitimation through association with Nightingale. Soyer inadvertently contrasts the styles of two "celebrated" women by emphasizing the professional "seriousness" of the one and the humorous, mammy-like qualities of the other. The nicknames he uses for Nightingale and Seacole remind us how such naming embeds ideology: Nightingale is called "Sister of the Brave" while Seacole is La Mere Noire. Both monikers convey a woman's age and familial role, but only Seacole's is based on race and includes no homage to her work. Soyer makes other comments about Seacole's color, all with a light, humorous fondness, contrasting her dark complexion, for instance with her "daughter" Sally's fair one (252). Seacole, of course, draws attention to her own complexion, but it is part of her strategy of shifting her subject position in relation to particular situations and actions she takes.[27]

---

[27] Seacole challenged Soyer to "a trial of skill" in cooking, one of the only direct "confrontations" in the text. "I always flattered myself that I was his match, and with our West Indian dishes could of course beat him hollow...the gallant Frenchman only shrugged his shoulders, and disclaimed my challenge with many flourishes of his jewelled hands...and all because I was a woman, forsooth. What nonsense...when I was doing the work of half a dozen men" (149). Soyer does not mention Seacole's challenge in his memoir; she seems to retaliate or "signify" on his refusal here, with bravado and wit, but feminizes Soyer while using language of a more violent nature to emphasize her "masculinity" in the realm

While Seacole seems to go out of her way to show her respect for Nightingale, albeit with an undercurrent of irony that slightly undercuts, it is noteworthy that Nightingale makes only a slight mention of Seacole in her Crimean letters, expressing disapproval, seeing her as an interference in the important organizing of military bureaucracy.[28] This disapproval is not surprising, considering how fragile Nightingale's authority seemed to be, although as Evelyn Bolster has argued, "she respected no one, and any threat, real or imaginary was enough to throw her into a passion..." (18).

Perhaps it is fear of erasure that makes Seacole devote a whole chapter to sounding her own trumpet somewhat reluctantly, but alerting her readers that she "must solicit..attention to the position I held in the camp as doctress, nurse and 'mother'"(124). Rather than mentioning any hostility she may have received from doctors, some of whom thought she was a "cunning and resourceful quack" (Compton, 135; Shepard, 507), Seacole instead flattered them

---

of cooking, usually seen as "woman's work." Soyer had gained recognition for widespread "scientific" applications of cookery, improving the quality of army food and inventing a portable stove for the regiments.

[28] Conversation with Martha Vicinus, who with Bea Nergaard, edited a selection of Nightingale's letters, Ever Yours, Florence Nightingale, Selected Letters (Cambridge: Harvard Univ. Press, 1990). Of the 10,000 extant letters Nightingale left, Vicinus and Nergaard chose those that they felt "represented the full range of Nightingale's interests"(1). The exclusion of Seacole illuminates the difficulty in documenting black women's historical agency and the part white women may play in such exclusion.

excessively, stressing her humble position in the hierarchy, writing of her desire to help "the kind-hearted doctors, to be useful to whom I have ever looked upon and still regard as so high a privilege"(125). Without putting down any of the doctors or their remedies, she hypothetically asks her reader to imagine himself as wounded, and describes the additional benefits she offered:

> they could and did get at my store sick comforts and nourishing food...I was very familiar with the diseases which they suffered most from, and successful in their treatment (I say this in no spirit of vanity)...That the officers were glad of me as a doctress and nurse...don't you think that you would welcome the familiar figure of the stout lady whose bony horse has just pulled up at the door...and whose panniers contain some cooling drink, a little broth...I tell you, reader, I have seen many a bold fellow's eyes moisten at such a season, when a woman's voice and a woman's care have brought to their minds recollections of those happy English homes (125-7).

In touting herself as doctress, she is sure to mention her nurturing and nourishing as signifiers of mother and home--here she humorously calls attention to her "stout" form in comparison to her bony horse, which signifies the mammie's full, nourishing body at a time when food was hard to come by. Zora Neale Hurston would later compare the "nigger woman" to the mule, as both were exploited for their labor by others, usually men; but here, Seacole's labor restores order from chaos to revive the "helpless" men who are in no position to exploit. This is a context in which her assertiveness can be accepted and even appreciated. With her large, powerful body and magical broth, she seems like a cross between the African female archetypes of Conjure woman and Mammy-Wattah described

by Bonnie Barthold, but instead of sexual liaisons with many men, often part the potency as well as the threat of such women, Seacole offers the child-like men her symbolic breast.

After noting the vulnerability of a wounded man, she indirectly boasts of her success rate by including testimonies from those she cured of dysentery, diarrhea, cholera, jammed fingers, and inflammation of the chest. Some claimed "nothing served me until I called on Mrs. Seacole" or "Mrs. Seacole cured me after three doctors had fruitlessly attempted to" (129-131).

Observing/Participating in the "Thrill"

The spectacle of the Crimean war is brought to and from England by the visual metaphors of reading and observing, two ways for noncombatants to participate in the "theatre of war." For instance, as W.R. Russell sent dispatches to the Times, reporting on shortages of supplies and medical personnel, the spread of disease and inadequate facilities, he helped make the Crimean war the first "media" event, and late in the campaign, a tourist attraction.[29] A gap was created, it seemed, between seeing, knowing, describing, and acting in war, as one can "see" but still remain somewhat detached or

---

[29] Interestingly, in at least one reference that suggests an identification with Seacole, Russell applied the term "camp follower" to describe the way he as a reporter was perceived by Lord Raglan, the commander of the British forces. "I was regarded as a mere camp-follower whom it would be impossible to take more notice of than you would of a crossing-sweeper--without the gratuitious penny. It never came to my mind to feel either surprise or indignation on that score"(Atkins, The Life of Sir William Howard Russell, 193).

lose the power to describe. The hermeneutic circle is broken, because seeing is not necessarily connected to knowing; it depends on one's geographical location and time/space coordinates. This gap is made evident by Seacole, who notes

> just as a spectator seeing one of the battles from a hill..knows more about it than the combatant in the valley below...so you, through the valuable aid of the cleverest man in the camp, read in the Times' columns the details of that great campaign while we, the actors in it, had enough to do to discharge our own duties...so very often a desperate skirmish or hard-fought action, the news of which created so much sensation in England, was but little regarded at Spring Hill (147).

Or in recollection, the memory "prefers to dwell upon what was pleasing and amusing," (136) which suggests deliberate concealment between what one visualizes, internalizes and recreates in writing. Seacole first describes the specularity of bombardment, but becomes a mobile participant/observer, shifting between the audience and the stage, to use the theatrical metaphors that dominated war discourse in the nineteenth century (Paul Virilio, quoted in Gallagher, 8). She is in "attendance" at Cathcarth's Hill to watch the second bombardment of Sebastopol, but longs "to see more of warfare, to share in its hazards"(148). By sharing in its hazards, she gains the right to express machismo and intense enjoyment experienced through cathexis, as watching the bombardment and the threat of shells exploding nearby is a liminal zone of eroticized thrill. The only time in the narrative that Seacole uses language that reveals a temporary relaxation of her maternal posture comes in her discussion of

watching the bombardments, and in putting herself at risk in coming under fire.[30]

These actions combine the traditionally marked male and female division of war experience: men "see battle" while women are the primary, passive spectators (Gallagher, 5). Thus, in placing herself under fire by tending to the wounded at battlefields, and expressing excitement regarding bombardment in sexualized language, Seacole bonds with male soldiers and becomes a warrior figure in her own right. She proudly gains access to pass by stations set up to stop stragglers and spectators from reaching the battlefield; the men "raise a shout" for her, their voices overturning previous failures to pass into official Crimean service. But instead of gun or sabre, she carries a travelling medicine chest, here a large bag flung across her shoulder, filled with "lint, bandages, needles, thread, and medicines," as well as sandwiches, fowls, tongues, ham and wine and spirits (156), to nourish and nurture. Her excitement and restlessness come from watching battles from the popular overlook Cathcart's Hill, connecting her to the soldiers who had grown so used to being in peril from shelling they "found it difficult to get on without a little gratuitous excitement and danger" (155). Yet

---

[30] Undoubtedly, she was not the only woman to come under fire, but her willingness to do so was noted by W.H. Russell in a letter to the editor of the London Times (April 11, 1857). Some of the Russian sisters of mercy, who served as nurses to the Russian troops, came under fire in Sevastopol at first-aid points and while crossing the bay, bullets, cannonballs and bombs feel close by (Curtiss, 464).

under fire, the most masculine of activities, she never loses sight of her female propriety, which has the effect of somehow undermining or minimizing the image of the warrior on her horse entering the forbidden battlefield. She is transformed back into an absurdly misplaced Victorian matron: when a shot or shell would come close, those around her yelled "'Lie down, mother, lie down...and with very undignified and unladylike haste I had to embrace the earth...one, more thoughtful than the rest, would give me a helping hand, and hope the old lady was neither hit nor frightened" (157). The image of her falling fearfully to the ground is of course one that might be associated with feminine frailty, a destablizing image, as if she wants to remind readers of her age and the absurdity of her presence on the battlefield. She does not compare her results there or in the hospitals directly with that of the "kind-hearted doctors," but in a choice of words that undercuts her flattery, writes that the doctors who finally attended to patients she had helped "looked more like murderers" (158). She breaks her pattern of deference by including a few choice words that allude to their incompetence.[31]

---

[31] Russell, in a letter, but not in his memoirs, made the comparison, saying he had seen Seacole "go down under fire...and a more tender or skillful hand about a wound or broken limb could not be found among our best surgeons" (London Times, April 11, 1857). Seacole repeats his testimony to indirectly make the comparison; repaying his compliment, she writes of watching him witnessing the scene under fire, taking notes, and offering a helping hand as well.

War Tourism: In Search of Pleasure at the Front

Battles and bombardments were broken up by spells of inaction, as "pleasure was hunted keenly" instead of the enemy's territory. Attempts were made to recreate British sporting and leisure activities in a carnivalesque display that brings home Elaine Scarry's point that by seeing war as "a continuation of peace or peacetime activities" the specificity of the structure of war and its destruction can be elided (77). The firm of Inman, shipowners, ran low-cost trips from England to the Crimea, five pounds per person for a fortnight, including accommodations and visits to Constantinople and the Crimean battlefields (Compton, 137). This brought an influx of upper-class tourists, who along with officers, attended dances, picnics, parades, hunts, races and theatricals which had become part of the official recreation activities for the British and French. A photograph of two ladies in their full-hooped crinoline ballgowns, posing with a gentleman in front of a line of canons, becomes a frame from which to think of the "uniformed" body and its relationship to imperial and secular spectacle. It seems absurd to transport the pageantry of the upper class English body, dressed in fashionable evening wear to collide as it were with the reality of war, which even in temporary hiatus is associated with dismembered and decaying bodies. However, in a description based on her observation from the hill, Seacole is conscious of the gap between such performance and reality:

"the dark-plumed Sardinians and red-pantalooned French spread out in pursuit and formed a picture so excitingly beautiful that we forgot the suffering and death they left behind" (164). In "still movement" on the hill, she freeze-frames her gaze, seeing the "picture" as it is forming in time and space and yet names death which is being obscured. Recall her description of Florence Nightingale's gaze--"standing thus in repose and yet keenly observant"(90); here Seacole deploys this posture quite significantly to expose the seductive beauty of battle choreography, dissecting her own sense of the war's excitement even as she gets caught up in it.

The "interruptions" with social life remind us that war, in Elaine Scarry's analysis, is a

> suspension of the reality it constructs, the systematic retraction of all benign forms of substance from the artifacts of civilization, and simultaneously, the mining of the ultimate source of substantiation, the extraction of the physical basis of reality from its dark hiding place in the body out into the light of day... (137)

Piers Compton suggests Mary Seacole's role at the races, which the upper class ladies and gentlemen attended, "was as usual, to scoop in a little profit, while also making herself useful in case of accidents" (152). But in her account, the movement from the shock of loss and death one minute to the frivolity in the next allows other sideshows to take place, therefore forcing her to take the moral highground as her embodied heroism is displaced by resurgent performances of nation, gender, and race . Coffeehouses and balls create carnal "dangers...for the young and impulsive" until the abode

of a "bad Frenchwoman" is "purified" by a fire (162); Seacole helps to lace the men into their crinoline dresses for theatricals; English races "imitate old familiar scenes at home" including boots and jackets and silk caps, as well as soldiers in blackface, pretending to be "Ethiopian serenaders" with banjos (183). These sections and comments mark Seacole's and the others' transition from knowing their "place " in the Crimea, to a liminal period of carnivalesque disorder and transgressive behavior before peace which evokes nostalgia for the racial hierachies of home. For Seacole, peace signifies her ruin, as the "extensive additions to our store..were now unsalable" (189) and reminded her that she "had no home to go to"(192); the career soldier she uses as an example is a stand in for herself: "the peace would bring no particular pleasure...whereas war and action were necessary to his existence."

Reading Beyond the Ending

It is in the final pages of her narrative that we see an example of her outrage emerging through embodied action, an alternative use for her nurturing hands. She smashes all her cases of wine with a hammer rather than give them to their former enemies, the Russians (196). This embodied strength had been employed in carrying patients off the battlefield and in knocking a bunch of plundering Frenchmen in the head with a bell when they accused her of being a Russian spy (175).

Although the end of the war halts this particular

adventure and leaves Seacole, like Nancy Prince, "wounded" and "bankrupt" (198), she continues to travel and her mobility creates the possibility of encounters with friends from the war. She uses the metaphor of "up-hill work" to describe the necessity of beginning again in "the summer of life" (193) completing her narrative not with a prayer but a list of the names of high-powered men who authenticated her work. Back in London, she meets Crimean veterans in

> omnibuses, in river steamboats...in quiet courts where taking short cuts I lose my way oft-times...the very newspaper offices look friendly as I pass them by...now would all this have happened if I had returned to England a rich woman? Surely not (199).

Seacole returns to a trope of inversion, asking a rhetorical question whose answer effectively undercuts and contextualizes her neediness, lest she seem bitter to her readers. In fact, as Mary Seacole is celebrated in a four-day Festival Benefit at Royal Surrey Gardens in late July, 1857, she is ready to carry her medicine chest to another crossroad in the service of empire, this time to India where the British were trying to put down the latest rebellion. "'Give me my needle and thread, my medicine chest, my bandage, my probe and scissors, and I'm off" she allegedly said to the Secretary of War ("The Seacole Festival," London Times, July 30, 1857). But Seacole did not go to India; her sister Louisa Grant told Anthony Trollope "Queen Victorian would not let her go, her life was too precious" (23). Seacole spent the rest of her life shuttling between Jamaica and England; she built herself

a "charming little bungalow" in Kingston (M. Stewart, Gleaner extract, 12) but in 1873, she was working for the Princess of Wales as a "rubber," the forerunner of the masseuse (A.C. Whitehorn, Gleaner extract, 10). When she died on May 14, 1881, she had been living in London, and left a small fortune to her sister and other friends and relatives[32] (Alexander and Dewjee, 37-8); upon the death of her sister Louisa in 1905, a slew of letters came to the Kingston Gleaner, sparking a resurgence of memories about Mary Seacole and her book, as Jamaicans celebrated and recovered one of their own. Their voices offer information, sometimes disparate, as they make meaning of Seacole's life and narrative. As I have argued, her transnational interventions emerge as a witty and complex writing of the journey as a dialectic between imperial conflict and the power of woman to heal. Her strategy of accommodation and resistant truth telling complicates and destabilizes categories of gender, race and national identity. Seacole's entertaining and wonderfully provocative travelogue should be required reading, as it forces us to rethink the literature of travel, war, the picaresque tradition, and life writing from the Americas.

####

[32] She left some money and a diamond ring to Queen Victoria's half-nephew, Count Gleichen and her "best set of pearl ornaments" to his eldest daughter (Peter Fryer, 252). She had known Gleichen in the West Indies and the Crimea, and he carved a bust of Seacole in 1871; along with two of her four Crimean War medals, it is held by the Institute of Jamaica in Kingston (Alexander and Dewjee, 36).

Cheryl Fish

Chapter 3

Encountering Hybridity: Margaret Fuller and America in Transition

The circumstances under which Margaret Fuller travelled to the American Great Lakes in 1843 present a departure of sorts from the transnational excursions taken by Mary Seacole and that other Bostonian whose travels concern us, Nancy Prince. The most obvious personal differences--that of Fuller's race, age, education, and familial background--get at the heart as to how identity, access to language, and position in writing one's travels becomes an integral part of the epistemological quest itself. For Margaret Fuller, travelling West to the American frontier was an opportunity for self-growth as well as a part of her elite education, a substitute for the desired-but-deferred tour of Europe, site of culture, civilization and the myths she found most enduring.

Forced by circumstances to go West into "nature" instead of East into "culture," Margaret Fuller fashioned a hybrid form of American travel writing based partly in European and Romantic ideals and style, but also informed by the tragedy of Native American removal and the hardships faced by frontier women. Summer on the Lakes, in 1843 [1] is a hybrid text, what I

---

[1] All references to Summer on the Lakes, in 1843 will hereafter be referred to as SL; the edition I use is University of Illinois Press, 1991, with an introduction by Susan Belasco Smith.

am calling a poetic-ethnography, transcending the travelogue through its blend of autobiography, history, critical reading and a gendered and race-based analysis of the promise and tragedy of Westward expansion. In this chapter I shall explore the concept of hybridity --the mixing of different persons or things--as a critical process and thematic subject of Fuller's travels and her textual representations of them. SL as a text registers the pressure of different genres and a number of ambivalent moments in Fuller's own life as she negotiated between her private and public selves; her anxieties and excesses are often displaced or embedded in a discourse of loss we find throughout SL. Hybridity presents a promise and threat as part of Fuller's search for positionality; she manipulates disjunctive discourses to articulate her mobile subjectivity as a form of evolving national and personal identities. I begin the chapter by looking at how Fuller was influenced by theories of racial mixing as well as by a desire for women to lead a life in which they are "fit" in body and mind. Then, I illustrate the importance of reading the letters and journal she wrote during her liminal movement from New England to the West and back, material she omitted from SL that more explicitly registers her ambivalence about being a tourist, writer, and public intellectual. Throughout the chapter, I refer to three women whose "case studies" Fuller wove into her narrative---that of Fanny P., Mariana, and the Seeress of Prevorst. I see these

figures as the keys to understanding Fuller's use of hybridity and excess as a form of cultural critique through which she envisions a more enlightened, insightful, and ethical American self. I conclude my reading of SL with a close analysis of what these women signify, linking them in some ways to Fuller's contradictory positions on Native Americans, her rejection of the idea of sexual amalgamation, and a desire to divest herself of European influences in order to become a more integrated American subject. The excessive bodies and desires of the three women or "witches" as I sometimes refer to them-- signify Fuller's claim for social space for those whose acceptance she believed would preclude the American form of genius: women whose "large impulses are disproportioned to the persons and occasions (they) meet, and which carry (them) beyond those reserves which mark the appointed lot of women"(SL, 64); foreigners who could adapt to change and become productive citizens; and partially assimilated, "noble" people of color.

American Genius, Amalgamation, and Concepts of Fitness

Through her mobile subjectivity and encounters with certain forms of European and American otherness, Fuller's poetics incorporate the idea of transgression, racial amalgamation and the desire for more varied gender roles. As a critic writing in 1846, Fuller would envision the ample field and vast prairie she encountered in summer, 1843, as part of the terrain from which a particularly American genius

would emerge, one of a "mixed race, continually enriched with new blood from other stocks." She elaborated:

> The day will not rise till the fusion of races among us is more complete...till this nation shall attain sufficient moral and intellectual dignity to prize morality and intelligence no less highly than political freedom" (Papers on Literature and Art, 124).

In SL, this "fusion" has not yet been achieved; America's moral climate and the racial hybridity of its people is in what Fuller called a "transition state," which she would illustrate in personal, temporal, and supernatural terms based in part on Charles Fourier's concept of the "aromal state," a manifestation of psychic energy through which transitional moments lead to social harmony.[2] In pointing to this state,

---

[2] Christina Zwarg discusses the influence of Fourier, one of Franz Mesmer's many French followers, on Fuller's Summer on the Lakes in 1843. "Believing that our souls 'experience a series of rebirths and transmigrations' formed 'by the element we call Aroma," Fourier theorized that a productive cultural critique depended on such transitional moments" (Feminist Conversations, 116-117). Elizabeth Peabody, writing in The Dial on a Fourier convention that had recently taken place in Boston, noted that if Fourier's twelve fundamental passions "do not find their developments...they become principles of disorder and produce what we see now all around us--a world lying in wickedness and dead in sin" (April, 1844, 476). While Fourier does not appear to directly address what part miscegenation or mixing of cultures might play in the perfection of Earth, one could see how his language of transmigration and progressive development could be read in light of hierarchical race theories, or appeal to Fuller as a theory of social change that avoids direct confrontation with questions of race (while addressing gender and class inequality). In addition, many of the German Romantic thinkers Fuller was familiar with explored concepts of German spirit and the universal; as Reginald Horsman argues, the American intellectual community had absorbed European racial and scientific theories of the superiority of the Anglo-Saxons, and linked their own pasts with Teutonic or Aryan roots (Race and Manifest Destiny, 4-5). The connection between German Romantic thought and American concepts of race is worthy of greater study, especially in relation to Fuller and Emerson's ideas.

Fuller, like other Romantics, was reacting against the Enlightenment's grand claims for civilization. The Romantic writers were influenced by Rousseau's notion of the Noble Savage and Herder's anthropological analysis that linked place with level of achievement. In the nineteenth century the word culture began to be distinguished from the word civilization as "an alternative...to express other kinds of human development, other criteria for human well-being, and crucially, 'the specific and variable cultures of different nations and periods'" (Robert J.C. Young, Colonial Desire, 37). Johann Herder, the German writer whose Outlines of a Philosophy of the History of Man, (1784-91) was an influential text in the formation of racial and anthropological theories in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, simultaneously set up two models of cultural development--one based on the rootedness and organic unity of a people and their local culture, and the other suggesting that the development of the human race was based on the grafting of different cultures, through migration and intermixture (Young, 41-43). The ideas of the German Romantics intertwined with popular theories on the science of race and the myth of Anglo-Saxon superiority "to bring a new fervor to the exaltation of the Germanic past" (Horsman, Race and Manifest Destiny, 27). Fuller engaged with several of the new racial theories on hybridity from Europe and America which by the 1840s had "become a standard discursive feature of any book on natural history or race";

she evoked the "melting pot" or amalgamation thesis, which claims that mixing people produces a new race with distinctly new characteristics. Amid the "mushroom growth" of the West, she aims to "perhaps foresee the law by which a new order, a new poetry is to be evoked from this chaos" (SL, 18); her law, however, seems to be a product of theories of "decomposition" and "proximate and distant species," which admit the failure or weakness in some mixed unions, especially in this case, those of the Native American and Caucasian as opposed to those of varying European descent (Young, 11, 18).[3]

The failure and potential of America as a site for freedom and a model of racial fusion and gender equity was suggested in SL in a number of ways, including Fuller's portraits of hybrid foreign women, Fanny P., Mariana, and the Seeress of Prevorst, whose startling feminine presences and ideas were as large in scope as the vast prairies Fuller admired. In addition, in the Native American tale "Muckwa, Or

---

[3]. Elsewhere, Fuller had elaborated on her amalgamation thesis, which included only European nations whose natives were emigrating to the U.S. at that time (with the exception of the Jew, whose nationality is unspecified): "...we do want that each nation should preserve what is valuable in its parent stock. We want all the elements for the new people of the new world. We want the prudence, the honor the practical skill of the English; the fun, the affectionateness, the generosity of the Irish; the vivacity, the grace, the quick intellect of the French; the thorough honesty and capacity for philosophic view and deep enthusiasm of the German Biedermann; the shrewdness and romance of the Scotch--but we want none of their prejudices. We want the healthy seed to develop itself into a different plant in the new climate. We have reason to hope a new and generous race, where the Italian meets German, the Swede, the Jew. Let nothing be obliterated, but all be regenerated..."("Deutsche Schnellpost," in Life Within, and Life Without: Essays and Poems, 175).

the Bear," incorporated into Fuller's travelogue, a union between a male hunter and a female bear produces children that do not blend the qualities of each, but remain distinctly human or animal and are therefore doomed to be alienated and separate. [4] These examples and others illustrate Fuller's concern with the concept of "fitness"--Darwin would take this up extensively in an evolutionary sense in his Origin of the Species(1859)--but in SL, her focus is related mainly to women's particular difficulty in adapting to the ruggedness

---

[4] Stacy Spenser compares Fuller's use of the Indian as a racialized figure from which to "approach the contested ground of nineteenth-century gender ideology," with that of domestic novelists such as Lydia Maria Child, Catherine Maria Sedgwick and Harriet Beecher Stowe.("Women Writers and the Literary Journey, 1832-44," 23). Missing from Fuller's text, but nevertheless implicated, is the question of amalgamation between blacks and whites, which by the time Fuller wrote SL, was a topic of fascination and conjecture, often based on the example of the West Indies, where emancipation had taken place. In "Voyage to Jamaica," Benjamin P. Hunt claimed that amalgamation between whites and blacks would create when "the white blood of the island shall be absorbed" Anglo-Africans who would "surpass every other people of the tropics"; for the negro, amalgamation "appears to be...a sort of purifying process, by which the more soft and feeble qualities of his nature are carried off to give place to those of more refinement and force"(Oct, 1843, 244, 240). Fuller supported abolition, and noted in her New York Tribune review of Frederick Douglass's narrative (June 10, 1845), that such work was evidence of the innate capacity of the negro, but she was turned off by what she felt was the dogmatic zeal of the Garrisonian abolitionists. Yet, in the same review, she indicated her feelings on black and white miscegenation by citing the opinion of "two wise and candid thinkers--the Scotsman Kinmont...and the late Dr. Channing--both thought the African race had in them a peculiar element, which if it could be assimilated with those imported among us from Europe, would give to genius a development, and to the energies a character of balance and harmony, beyond what has been seen heretofore in the history of the world" (Life Without and Life Within, 122). For Fuller's complex relationship to abolition, see Francis E. Kearns, "Margaret Fuller and the Abolition Movement,"Journal of the History of Ideas, Vol. XXV, 1964, 120-27.

and physical demands of Western life, thrust upon them during emigration. Fuller also wonders how women, including herself, could achieve balance or fitness between mind and body with the impractical education and rigid gender codes prescribed for them. I read SL as a text that posits an evolving formulation of the process of the meaning of nationhood, selfhood, and activism as mediated by familiar and different bodies in motion, approaching varying states of hybridity and social change. Fuller's mobile subjectivity is figured in relation to the traditions of the picturesque and sublime, which often draw attention away from her body through the use of displacement and synecdoche. There are moments, however, when Fuller directly refers to her own bodily sensations, particularly feminized expressions of withheld pleasure that finds release through her fingertips, throat and mouth. In my reading of her chapter on Niagara, I contextualize these references.

With its blend of observation and concern with the intermingling of emigrants who would create a new race of Americans, Summer on the Lakes, in 1843 can be read as a gesture towards ethnography, and as a fantasy or would-be emigrant's guide to the frontier by one who, because of growing awareness of a desire to break with her New England past, cannot go home again. Like the America that was in the process of forming itself by incorporating and yet distinguishing itself from the various ethnicities and

nationalities of its peoples, Fuller was also personally in transition, trying to divest herself of what she saw as the painful cost of her patriarchal classical training, yearning to contribute as a woman to American letters. As I have already argued, because of ideological restraints placed on people of color who moved freely in the public sphere, Mary Seacole and Nancy Prince as free black women of the Americas, connected their impulse to travel and authority to write with benevolent labor. On the other hand, Margaret Fuller was a traveller in a less utilitarian sense -- she was what I shall call a "transitory Transcendentalist," passing through, sight-seeing and surveying the results of empire building and the flow of Westward emigration that by 1843 included thousands of Americans and Northern Europeans. Because of her embrace of the Romantic and Transcendentalist zeitgeist of her times, geographical travel and the soul's journey were part of the same dynamic circulation of the self actively seeking greater metaphysical truths. Part of this romantic aesthetic was also bound up with considering oneself a traveller, exemplifying independence and originality in one's relationship to people and landscape, as opposed to the tourist, who by the mid-nineteenth century was already associated with vulgarity, cliche, and repetitiveness (Buzard, The Beaten Track, 3-5). Yet during the summer of 1843, Fuller was both a traveller and a tourist; the juxtaposing of the terms is meant to suggest Fuller's aspiration to be the historically "noble" traveller--

the seeker who undergoes a heroic and often painful quest for personal meaning and who desires to learn from experiences with the unfamiliar, offering instruction to readers as well. In Fuller's case, a traveller whose mind is always at work, never truly removed from critical thinking. On the other hand, with a time limit of a few months, travelling peripatetically on and off the beaten track, she was more of a tourist than an emigrant, exile, or ethnographer. Her work at this point was less physically demanding (though not necessarily less tiring) than was Prince's or Seacole's and her body subject to fewer overt dangers; she had removed herself from the teaching and caregiving duties that had bound her to New England for years. As she toured her own country, she passed through Niagara, Illinois, Michigan and Wisconsin territory, staying in the homes of various relatives and acquaintances as well as in hotels for almost four months and was alone for nine days at Mackinac Island. Her modes of transit included rail, steamboat, carriage and wagon. But she was a reluctant tourist, expressing what James Buzard defines as the anti-tourist rhetoric of the nineteenth century.

Sites of Contradiction: Inclusiveness and Distrust

In this uneasy transitional state, Fuller anticipated many of the tensions theorists of travel writing and anthropology have been studying in the past decade as they examine the power relations inherent in travelling. In her ethnographer's mode, Fuller wonders how to best "study" the

other while remaining conscious of what Adrienne Rich calls "the politics of location," a process that takes gender, race, and class analysis into account. While Fuller offers no theory, her inclusion of and yet inherent distrust of relying solely on her experience as a form of authentication, and her discussion of her own awkward outsider's position as "white Eastern intellectual lady" in the land of unbridled physicality and masculine ambition, indicates a willingness to interrogate rather then conclude. Both reading and travelling rely on a gaze that is fixed and mobile, Emerson's "transparent eyeball" with wings, and both processes involve a hermeneutic of interpretation. However, in the actual contact zone, unlike the textual one, there is the gaze of the other to consider. We might say in travelling, she is being read even as she reads, and anticipates being read again after she writes, adding another dimension (a triple approach?) to what Trinh T. Min-ha calls the "double-approach":

> the seer is seen while s/he sees. To see and be seen constitutes the double approach of identity; the presence to oneself is at once impossible and immediate...travelling allows one to see things differently from what they are, different from how one has seen them, and different from what one is ("Other than Myself/My other Self," 22-3)

The challenge of writing is how to represent these differences that create a gap between expectation and experience --and Margaret Fuller was forever fascinated by flux, mutability and change. But she found herself an observer in the life of emigrants she came in contact with; SL was not

the "potential emigrant's guide" that Caroline Kirkland's popular 1839 A New Home--Who'll Follow proclaimed to be. Since Fuller had a less clear-cut purpose and yet placed great expectations on the reception of SL, we can view her survey of travel literature and inclusion of other voices in her text as a continuation of her already established dialogical critical writing, where her point of view is expressed from within a conversational format or as a counterpoint to other ideas. She juxtaposed her limited experience among the Indians by incorporating other more "authoritative" ethnographic texts and therefore intervened, albeit somewhat belatedly, in the historiography they would create. But her hybrid text is also a product of anxiety; before she felt she could write her travelogue, she spent time in the Harvard library reading travel accounts that covered the Great Lakes region, so she should go "over the ground with them, and shall not continue my own little experiences till I have done with theirs" (LMF 3:160). This desire to defer her own project until she had first read what others wrote reinforces her lack of confidence in her ability to write, especially when compared to her conversational ability. Part of her difficulty has to do with what Elaine Showalter calls the sites of contradiction "where the writer's conflict between her internalization of patriarchal rhetorical forms and her need to articulate a feminine subjectivity reveals itself"("Miranda and Cassandra," 320). Going public in writing always entailed a feeling of

being cut off from intuitive, spontaneous expression through which Fuller's body, especially her eyes and head, conveyed her spontaneous, electrifying intelligence. In describing her verbal skills, she emphasized her physicality and the way her assertive, dancing gaze projected eclectic and electric knowledge. In conversation with men she thought she had a real advantage, wheeling and darting hither and thither and seizing "with ready eye all the weak points, like Saladin in the desert." Men "do not see where we got our knowledge...it is quite another thing when we come to write, and without suggestion from another mind, to declare the positive amount of thought that is in us" (Memoirs of MFO, 1:296). Nevertheless, when Fuller sat down to write Summer on the Lakes in 1843, she identified herself as a woman of letters who had been writing, editing, teaching, and leading her famous "Conversations" for women since 1839, spreading her influence among New England's intellectual and cultural elite. Her travelogue was written and received as a product of culture and of a cultured mind, but her gendered critique of nation building and Indian removal as well as her digressive writing style and inclusion of supernatural subject matter caused some readers to dismiss the work, or in one case, label Fuller as a "heathen priestess."[5]

Despite the generally acceptable oddities and sketchbook

---

[5] Orestes Brownson, Review of Summer on the Lakes, Brownson's Quarterly Review, 6, Oct., 1844, 546.

quality we find in much travel writing, Fuller's brother Arthur created an abridged version of SL after her death in an attempt to create a sense of unity. He cut out lengthy sections he found irrelevant or "not immediately integral" to the text; his 1856 version became the preferred edition as late as the 1960s in Perry Miller's Margaret Fuller: American Romantic, with the result that Fuller's hybrid, desultory text was kept from us. The very digressions that Miller found an such a "monstrosity," alert us to Fuller's anxiety about becoming a public intellectual (it turns out she was right to have been worried) and contextualize some of her positions in Woman in the Nineteenth Century. Reducing SL's scope and bowdlerizing its puzzling excesses (including the narratives of Mariana and the Seeress) also meant we were unable to fully appreciate and evaluate Fuller's legacy as a travel writer of importance. In fact, we might link her whole oeuvre to a style and content based on a kind of hybrid dialogism, comprised of a visionary agenda that is both pragmatic and utopian, drawn from contact with, ambivalence about, and transformation of difference.[6]

---

[6] As Dorothy Z. Baker points out, Arthur Fuller left out passages that blamed the white man for Indian drunkenness, and many passages on Native American myths and rituals. He also cut the Mariana and Seeress passages, which focus on women of excess, while keeping in the tale of Captain P., which gives witness to masculine virtue (unpublished paper). Perry Miller writes of SL: "The full text is a potpourri of a sort fashionable in the nineteenth century but tedious today. In this convention, reports on scenes alternate with random associations or with insertions of brazenly extraneous matter..the effect on a modern reader is that of an intolerable monstrosity" (116). Annette Kolodny, writing in 1984, qualified the

Transforming Personal and National Identity

Margaret Fuller identified with and yet distanced herself from associations with New England and other New Englanders (and like Nancy Prince, hoped her barbs would wake up readers there). It became a frame of reference in order to point out hypocrisy and self-righteousness, as well as a critique of the vulgar materialism of the emigrants, who in Fuller's mind bore the responsibility for passing down the strain of American genius Fuller anticipated.[7] On the boat crossing Lake Erie, she observed the people were

> almost all New Englanders seeking their fortunes. They had brought their habits of calculation, their cautious manners, their love of polemics. It grieved me to hear these immigrants who were to be the fathers of a new race, all from the old man down to the little girl, talking not of what they should do but of what they should get in the new scene (SL, 12).

Margaret Fuller's escape from New England was fraught with her sense of how she had been limited by polemics and personal obligations. Like Nancy Prince, Fuller had assumed

---

relationship of the "digressions," what I see as narratives of "grotesque" women, in terms of how they provided a connection to Fuller's reading of frontier life: "the stories of Mariana and the Seeress of Prevorst, having no obvious relation to western travel, do not immediately identify themselves as integral to the text. But, in fact, they served Fuller as crucial thematic glosses on her larger understanding of the position of women on the frontier" (The Land Before Her, 125).

[7] Benjamin P. Hunt, in his Dial essay, "Voyage to Jamaica" offered candid remarks on what he felt to be the general feeling of racism among white New Englanders. He tells of a young man, the son of a West Indian planter, who had spent a year in New England. "'And I thank God,' he gravely proceeded, 'for my timely visit to New England; it has enabled me to imbibe the northern prejudice against color, which I think will be of great service to me on my return'" (Oct., 1843, 241-2).

the responsibility for managing the care of her many siblings in the absence of a father and seeming incapabilities of a mother[8]; travelling for both became the temporary escape from "keeping house" as well as a chance to observe oppression that only strengthened their resolve to inform others and become more active reformers. In Fuller's case, her journey was contingent upon the financial backing of friends.[9] Thus, while Fuller faced some of the same financial burdens as Prince and Seacole, the narrative of her 1843 trip was constructed within very different parameters. We find some of the same anxieties of authorship, expressed on a conscious as well as unconscious level, but Margaret Fuller wrote her narrative out of a commitment to an already evolving feminist activism; her attention to race and class oppressions emerged from this

---

[8] The sudden death of Fuller's father in 1835 left the family in shock; Margaret reluctantly gave up her planned trip to Europe to become the new "paterfamilias" of her family; as Charles Capper writes, "Margaret had inherited from her father both a fortitude and a zeal for action that gave her the self-confidence to conceive of doing what her mother could not"(Margaret Fuller: An American Romantic Life, 163). Fuller managed her father's estate and the family finances, as well as homeschooled her brothers and sister. Nancy Prince had been in charge of placing some of her siblings in houses as servants, or in finding them places to board, as well as claiming at least partial financial responsibility for her mother, who appeared to have bouts of mental illness.

[9] A letter to her friend Sarah Shaw indicates that money sent before she left on her trip was at least partially for lessons Fuller had given Shaw. It was "was three times what I should have thought of, if indeed I had put any precise value on the time I gave you...you will be glad to know that it puts me entirely at ease about my journey. I shall not be obliged to hurry home..."(Letter of Margaret Fuller, 3:127). In the midst of her trip, she received a letter from James Freeman Clarke, who was back in Boston by then, along with $50, "so that you may not be hurried by want of means"(JFC to MF, July 10, 1843, MH, v. 10, p.10).

feminist consciousness, rather than the reverse which was the case for Prince and Seacole. Eventually, Fuller would note how power, fear, and domination operated across culture and race, which led to a growing interest in what would soon be voiced as socialism; by the time she wrote her letters from Italy for the New York Tribune, she observed "I listen to the same arguments against the emancipation of Italy, that are used against the emancipation of our blacks; the same arguments in favor of the spoliation of Poland as for the conquest of Mexico, I find the cause of tyranny and wrong everywhere the same..."(Letter XVIII, Dec. 1847, The Essential Margaret Fuller, 409).

However, Fuller's ambivalence over what she considered the inevitability of Indian removal, and her use of race as category of identification that served primarily to develop her theories on gender oppression,[10] is indicative of the difficulty of formulating a discourse of inclusiveness whereby

---

[10] In Stacy Spencer's dissertation chapter, "Subjectivity, Race and Reading 'The Indian': Margaret Fuller's Summer on the Lakes, she persuasively argues that Fuller first identifies with the oppression of others, particularly Indians, but ultimately "defines the female subject against the racialized other.. who can never be wholly severed from the narrator herself. In banishing the Indians, Fuller seeks to banish her own desires. Summer projects discomfort with its own insights..."(75). Pamela Cheetwood Sellers, drawing on Richard Slotkin, notes how the Indian became something of a literary device for the Romantics. "Slotkin notes that the plight of the Indian came to the attention of the American public only after he had been divested of most of his land and his rights. Then he could be treated with sympathy and elevated to a kind of heroic status...Fuller exalts the Indian to the lofty position of wounded, silent noble throughout her book" ("Margaret Fuller's SL: It in Not Good Enough Merely to be Here" Ph.D. dissertation, Michigan State, 1992, 106-7).

women and other oppressed groups could act together in solidarity. If she believed that assimilation and purification of undesirable traits were necessary steps in a creation of a "new race" of Americans, we can see how difficult and contradictory it would be to envision a solidarity based on the disparate and troubling elements in the American political unconscious. In addition, Fuller's liminal movement through new landscape and encounters with otherness seemed to overwhelm her with a form of colonial desire. She draws on the vocabulary of eugenics to verbalize her obsession with who was most "fit" to be part of the hybrid race of Westerners from which American genius would someday emerge. This obsession probably had some connection to Fuller's conflict regarding the expression of her sexuality and/or eroticism; the psycho-sexual complexity of her friendships with men and women in the appropriate historical context has only begun to be limned by scholars, and ideally we would include a more in-depth analysis of the ways in which Fuller expressed and suppressed these desires.

Despite this conscious and unconscious fascination with concepts of fitness, Fuller's concern with the effects of emigration on the collective psyche of America as well as on individual lives reveals that like Nancy Prince, her resistant truth telling challenged a number of the myths that "a better life" would be waiting for those who relocated. Through the deployment of a mobile subjectivity, both women came to see

empire building and white patriarchal domination as being at odds with the American Declaration of Independence; they revealed the mechanisms of power, whereby the rights of one group were used to justify the silence, torture and death of another.

In any event, all three women interrogated institutional power by mobilizing their subjectivity and setting down in new territories--each made intercultural and transnational contact between ways of knowing and acting in the Americas and Europe, and in doing so transformed the relationship between national and personal identities for themselves, and for others who felt their influence. Fuller eventually travelled to Europe and found herself caught up in the whirlwind of the Italian revolution, an experience which caused her to gain an appreciation for the zealousness of the American abolitionists and to rethink earlier concepts of nationality; but during the period I am concerned with here, her contact with European thought came mainly through her education, reading and identification with the ideas of mentor figures including Thomas Carlyle, Johann Wolfgang Goethe, Charles Fourier, Germaine de Stael and George Sand, as well as her close friendship with Ralph Waldo Emerson.

While Nancy Prince and Mary Seacole wrote about journeys that took them away from their home countries when they were widows in their 40s and 50s, Margaret Fuller was single and 33 when she travelled through Niagara and the Great Lakes

states, accompanied by, at different times, James Freeman Clarke, his sister Sarah and his brother William. This distinction in her age and marital status becomes significant when we realize that part of her theoretical and personal quest in SL is to probe the question of how and if a woman of outstanding powers might find an appropriate male counterpart and how men and women could lead a life that balanced the impulses of mind, body and soul. She had been struggling with issues surrounding relationships, including that of friendship and of marriage, before her trip. But in writing a narrative that takes as part of its subject the power of landscape, and the processes of mobility and resettlement, the heterosexual unions suggested by the families of new emigrants, she could perform a kind of mediation between external objects and the internal states they suggest, mapping her desire to find a "place" as a woman and public intellectual. Convincing research by Martha L. Berg and Alice Perry and the publication of Fuller's June-October, 1844 journal, indicates that during the summer of 1843 she may have fallen in love with William Clarke, who was her travel guide on the Rock River. This segment of her journey brought her the greatest pleasure and she wished it could have been "unending" (SL, 41); details about her feelings, however and the question as to whether William "is most engaging as a companion, or most to be loved as a man" were omitted from the travelogue although their traces are there (Letter to James Freeman Clarke, July 28,

1843, cited in Berg and Perry, 43).

Letters and Journals: Desire, Dislocated

My reading of SL is partially informed by what Fuller left out--much of what I call her private narrative of desire, dislocated -- as expressed in letters and journal extracts written during her travels and in the year that followed. I also quote from other sources, such as her Memoirs, which Emerson, claimed was comprised of many "private portfolios, never intended for press" (Vol. 1:244). [11] Part of what emerges from these "dislocated" or extant texts is a greater sense that Fuller is imagining herself as a potential emigre from New England, joining with regional brethren and Northern Europeans to settle in what was then the West (of course history shows us that she did soon leave New England for good, but for New York City and then Europe, not the West). In addition, this dislocated material contains references that are more overtly corporeal and are written in a voice that

---

[11] Here I must qualify what I mean by "private." Fuller and her friends often circulated and read part of each other's journals and letters, so even these are written with the knowledge that at least a select few might see them, part of what David Robinson calls "relational discourse"(6). Within this "private" discourse, however there was another level of feelings so intense they could not or would not be written about; for instance, Fuller devised a code "donzella lagune" (the lady in waiting by the lake); at times one or both of the words appear to remind herself but keep others from knowing certain intimate thoughts (Berg and Perry, 43). Therefore, Fuller constructed various levels of private and semi-private writing. Linda Kauffman in her study of epistolary fictions, writes that "passion is transgressive, woman is disorder, and discourses of desire are repressed"(Discourses of Desire,20); Fuller reserved or encoded much of her expression of transgressive passion in her letters, journals and poems.

articulates raw emotionalism, neediness, and sentimentality that Fuller found repugnant and excessive in the public writings of others, especially women. For instance, she wrote of George Sand's travelogue Lettres d'un Voyageur (1837), "...What do I see? An unfortunate bewailing her loneliness, bewailing her mistakes, writing for money! She had genius and a manly grasp of mind, but not a manly heart! (Memoirs MFO, Vol. 1:249). And of Madame de Stael: "sentimental tears often dimmed the eagle glance...her intellect...with all its splendor, fed on flattery..."(Woman in the Nineteenth Century, 94) Ironically, of course, Fuller had something in common with Sand and de Stael: she wrote SL with the hopes of earning some money to help support her family, and she enjoyed being the object of attention and admiration. But Fuller's narrative voice excludes direct references to many of her own anxieties and desires; instead it displaces and transforms her quest for home and vocation, a kind of longing for elsewhereness, with a hybridized text that mixes the sublime with what I am calling the deformed sublime, as well as by including anecdotes and poems about unrealized potential and death, and heteroglossia of many voices speaking.

In terms of an actual journal kept during her 1843 travels, Fuller noted how "scarce" her record was "for the days were so full of new impressions that there was not time left to tell of them but all that was seen is fresh in

memory"(LMF, 3:147).[12] This "gap" between her actual experience and how she would write about it illustrates the conflict she intuited between "living" and "writing" and "internal" and "external" processes, expressed again and again throughout her works.[13] Yet her reliance on her own memory can be seen as a kind of bridge between dualistic paradigms, the means through which the external is internalized and then externalized anew as it is written. In relying on her own memory for significant cues, Fuller contradicted her statement that she needed "suggestion from another mind" in order to write. It also helps us to understand the pressures that may have brought about her chronic headaches.

Another factor that created anxiety for Fuller was the specter of criticism from those whose opinions she valued. She wrote to Emerson, "don't expect any thing from the book about the West. I can't bear to be thus disappointing you all the time"(LMF, 3:159-160). In reading some of her letters and

---

[12] In the Houghton Library's collection, Volume V of the Works of Fuller includes "extracts from journal 1843, Journal to the West," written as fragments on pages 41-79.

[13] Although I am suggesting that Fuller's resolve to first read other critics to both draw on and distinguish her travel writing represents an anxiety about how she would fit into a tradition, she also expressed confidence in the ability of her memory to recall and reflect upon "thoughts still half developed" ("Works" V, 41). This language echoes Wordsworth's description of poetry as the spontaneous overflow of powerful feelings that are re-created after being recollected in tranquility. This is but one example as to how Fuller had internalized romanticism and its influences as part of her interpretive process and method of inquiry. For an in depth analysis of Fuller and romanticism, see Julie Ellison, Delicate Subjects: Romanticism, Gender and the Ethics of Understanding. Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1990.

journals along with the published text of SL as well as other relevant published work, I hope to illuminate and translate the processes through which her mobile subjectivity was split and yet intertextual, as she created various bodies of representation for different readers.[14] In addition, as I have argued elsewhere, in expressing her frustration with the limits of writing to contain a performative female energy, Fuller was attempting to subvert what Lacan defines as the symbolic order, in what can be read as an early attempt at ecriture feminine and a deconstruction of the binary oppositions between writing and speaking.[15] However, since SML was to be her first full-length book of "original" writing (rather than translations), and we know how self-consciously she spent time in the library constructing what Nicole Tonkovich calls "a literary artifact worthy of preservation and aesthetic contemplation" (82) it is clear she had solidly moved into accepting the common historical practice of

---

[14] Incidently, as a critic, I have taken an approach contrary to Fuller's; I took copious notes as I read SL to get down my thoughts and reactions before reading what other critics and scholars had written. I am interested in what the order of reading "other" texts has to do with the writing of your "own" in terms of interference, influence and voice; perhaps in drawing on other writers and quoting them extensively, Fuller anticipated post-structuralism's shift to the meanings readers create as they interact with a text, minimalizing the writer's "intention" but actively collaborating, as in translations, to create interpretations.

[15] "'Unconnected Intelligence'": Darting (Dial)ogues in Margaret Fuller's Letters and Early Criticism," paper presented at conference "Margaret Fuller and American Cultural Critique: Her Age and Legacy" Babson College, April 29, 1995.

privileging writing over speech.[16]

"Deforming" the Sublime

Fuller's experimentation with form and aesthetic principles places her in the tradition of the English and American Romantics, who as Stephen Adams argues, "developed a dramatic, explorative literature of process--an art that generates moments of insight caught from fleeting, often contradictory perspectives"("That Tidiness We Always Look For," 250-1).[17] There is no doubt that Margaret Fuller's aesthetics were influenced by Romantic theories of the sublime and the picturesque; Jeffrey Steele claims that Fuller identified with the victims of power and detached herself from persons or places in order to appropriate the sublime and picturesque in terms of specular pleasure (Introduction, The Essential Margaret Fuller, xxiii-xv). He identifies a double discourse in SL, one that in the first three chapters causes Fuller to avoid political awareness in favor of seeking

---

[16] Sharon Cameron claims scriptism serves as a means of installing a literary canon that devalues much of the oral tradition (Feminism and Linguistic Theory, 166). Despite Fuller's acknowledgment of her own difficulties with writing compared to speaking, her observation that the storytelling of the Native Americans did not enable them either to record or protest their degradation to a significant audience, would have only reinforced the primacy of writing as a form to document and create culture.

[17] As Pam Hirsch has pointed out in her essay on the English Romantic painter Barbara Leigh Smith Bodichon, what is usually called "Romanticism" is actually male Romanticism, "and that women's differing sense of self makes the assumption of the role of Romantic visionary especially difficult for women" (184, note 13) although a writer like George Sand had claimed Romanticism--with all its "guilty frenzy, its warped sexuality, its despair"--for women (Ellen Moers, Literary Women, 201).

picturesque pleasure, and the other that begins in the third chapter, associated with loss and mourning, as exemplified by the lot of the frontier women and the defeated but promising characters of Mariana and the Seeress of Prevorst. I would argue, however, that throughout SL, Fuller problematizes the picturesque and sublime with the discourse of the grotesque, which can be a rewriting of or version of the "deformed" sublime (Harpham, 20) to signify a feminist critique of the traditional coding of the picturesque as male (Buzard, 16). Fuller's hybrid form of visionary otherness incorporates the threat of powerful women and the annihilation of the Native Americans, particularly the men. In doing so, she decenters her body, that of the Eastern spinster/intellectual in transition. According to Bakhtin's theory of the Renaissance body, the grotesque is "unfinished, outgrows itself, transgresses its own limits" and is associated with open body parts, the mouth, genitals, breasts, phallus, potbelly, nose, anus (Rabelais and His World, 26) while the classical body emphasizes the head as the seat of reason, and emphasizes the "tongue of official literature or of the ruling classes (154). Bakhtin notes these two categories where not fixed and immutable "each in turn formed by the redrawing of the boundaries of the other" (Stallybrass, "Patriarchal Territories," 124). In her letters and diaries, Margaret Fuller had often drawn attention to her classical body in pain by mentioning her headaches as she was struggling to write,

wrestling with various demons and discomforts. But in SL, Fuller's headaches are not mentioned and her "nerves" are cited only in Chapter One; in fact she wrote that her health had benefitted from the trip (Hudspeth, 3:133) but after her return to Cambridge, the headaches came back too. She displaces her headaches and her sense of her own grotesque body onto her portraits of mobile, supernatural, charismatic women who see beyond the here-and-now.[18] Similarly, the demise of Native Americans as relayed by Fuller is a transformation of bodies she finds alternatively "classical" and "grotesque"into versions of the deformed or drunken grotesque. Therefore, although she wishes to define them on their own terms, and points out how most people "either exalt the Red man into a Demigod or degrade him into a beast" (SL, 109) Fuller often places Native Americans at one extreme or

---

[18] If we survey representations of Fuller's physical presence and her temperament, we find her often classified as grotesque, or even hysterical. For example, in Memoirs of MFO, Emerson wrote: "Her extreme plainness--a trick of incessantly opening and shutting her eyelids--the nasal tone of her voice--all repelled"(Vol. 1, 202) while W.H. Channing wrote "the emotive force in her, indeed, was immense in volume...Margaret seemed a bacchante, prompt for wild excitement..eager desire, with energetic purposes filled her with the consciousness of large latent life and yet the lower instincts were duly subordinated to the higher"(Vol 2, 93). In his book Some Queer People, Ladbroke Black described her as "the perfect Freud hysteric"(56) and Perry Miller recalls "she was monumentally homely...her hair was stringy and her neck abnormally long (xvii). Paula Blanchard wrote: "It is little wonder that Margaret, as the bluestocking par excellence of her time, was afflicted...with a variety of 'neurotic' characteristics; the supercharged feelings which found expression in hyperbole...the quasi-erotic intensity of her friendships with both sexes; and the hysterical illnesses (to the degree they were hysterical)" Margaret Fuller: From Transcendentalism to Revolution, 137.

the other.

The figure of the Seeress, a German clairvoyant to whom Fuller devotes almost a whole chapter, embraces one of the principles of picturesque composition by decorporealizing her body: she is a medium, through which objects exhibit themselves clearly and distinctly (Gilpin, Three Essays on Picturesque Beauty,18). If the Seeress is something of a cipher, she is also a bit of a cyborg, transgressing boundaries, suggesting potent fusions and dangerous possibilities between human and animal, nature and machine (Haraway, 152-3)in a way that Margaret Fuller cannot. In deforming the sublime, Fuller offered proof of the failure of the majority of Americans to accept women who exemplified powerful examples of otherness; in a letter, she noted how readers of SL were amused with her account of the Seeress and Mariana, figures they could "admire at poetic distance, that powerful nature that would alarm them so in real life" (Hudspeth, 3:198). This might also be said of the dominant reaction to Native Americans.

Silenced Tourist, Thwarted Ethnographer

Although attracted to the sense of boundlessness she felt during her journey, Fuller appears to have been frustrated by the limits of the tourist's gaze and the lack of sympathetic conversation to the point of feeling silenced and unnoticed. She wrote to Emerson from Chicago on August, 17, 1843: "I have not reached forth the hand, neither has it been offered to me.

I am silenced by these people, they are so all life and no thought, any thing that might fall from my lips would seem an impertinence I move about silently and look at them unnoticed" (Hudspeth, 3:143). Her emphasis in the letter on the hand that she would not extend and the lips that stayed shut reveal the still movement of the disengaged tourist. And what's more, Fuller's travels on the prairie did not enable her to live among the Native Americans or emigrants long enough to study them in depth or to capture and translate their native languages and local dialects as did other travellers or budding enthnographers. Her letters and journal reveal what is not explicitly expressed in the text: the degree to which Fuller felt like an outsider in her travels, and how her identity as an Eastern intellectual increased her sense of insignificance--she was used to being the object of strong reactions. The texts of desire, displaced, also show how deeply she sought to find a place where she felt she could belong.[19] Her emphasis on the difficulty of women's lives

---

[19] Fuller wrote in a letter to William Channing, that since beginning of her journey

> I have not been lead to express one thought of my mind with warmth and freedom since I have been here, and all I have ever learnt or been is useless as regards others in the relations in which I meet them as traveler or visitor. I dare say it might not be so, if I lived here, and had quiet tasks of my own. Then I should meet people, only as a natural affinity brought us together...My friend, I am deeply homesick, yet where is home...I must be gone, I feel, but whither? (Hudspeth, 3:142).

In her journal she wrote: "What I had nobody wanted...It seems little not to feel more at home in any quarter of the globe. Yet here, too, with a few to love and something important to do, I could be content to live"(Works V:51-3). Since Fuller felt that

as "captives" often taken West against their will (Kolodny, 123) can be read as a form of mediation then, a "reality check" that tempers her fantasy of finding a home amid the prairie's expansiveness and welcoming wild flowers. Thus, Fuller's sense of the limits of projecting her body and voice to connect meaningfully with others suggests a desire for mutual recognition. She seems willing to settle at moments for access to the truly sublime, which meant navigating by instinct and curiosity, like Byron or Wordsworth, going without guides that ladies required. Unlike George Catlin standing at the helm of his canoe, "steering its course the whole way among snags and sand bars" while two men paddled (North American Indians, 1) Fuller ends her journey in a canoe guided by two Indian men, taking a "shoot" down the rapids that to her chagrin, only lasted four minutes. She mourns her inability to "enter into that truly wild and free region; shall not have the canoe voyage, whose daily adventure, with camping out at night beneath the stars, would have given an interlude of such value to my existence" (SL, 148). She was not among the great tide of emigration, but she was psychically projecting herself as a would-be emigre and potential mother of the new race. Fuller can neither imitate nor be the other, not the Indian, not the emigre, but neither

---

interpretation and translation were interchangeable acts (Zwarg,70) that created community, she included secondary texts by other writers and her own interpretation of their words as substitutes for the exchanges she longed to make.

can she be the mere tourist or colonizer. Her narrative accounts of Mariana, Fanny P.,the Seeress and other travellers reflect her yearning to travel out of bounds, into that wild zone where women make direct contact with nature and truth, translating other languages of desire. Fuller's desire to emigrate and to move beyond the sphere of Concord was not triggered, but nourished by this journey, and thus she projected her thwarted sense of being a part of a community that could embrace her transgressive desire.[20]

Despite a concern with being silenced and ignored, she did incorporate her actual contact with and reading of Native Americans into her text. Therefore, instead of pitching her tent in the native village to conduct her fieldwork, "dwelling/research" like Malinowski in the Western Pacific in the 1920s (James Clifford, "Travelling Cultures, 98), or the white who "goes native" as did Natty Bumppo in Cooper's Leather-Stocking Tales, Fuller encounters Native Americans as she walks from her hotel to their encampments; she finds them alternatively civilized and uncivilized. When a thunderstorm

---

[20] During 1839-40, for instance, years when Jeffrey Steele claims her grief for her unmourned dead father returned, Fuller confronted her ambivalence over the influence of Timothy Fuller that "became symbolic for Fuller of similar conflicts that women in general felt in the face of patriarchal influence"(Steele, "The Call of Eurydice" in Influence and Intertextuality, 279-81). That mourning caused Fuller to want to break out, and she kept evoking her desire to travel beyond the familiar. She wrote Carolyn Sturgis: "I long to do something frivolous to go on a journey or plunge into externals somehow. I never can, my wheel whirls round again"(Hudspeth, 2:107). And to Emerson: "I am like some poor traveller of the desert, who saw, at early morning, a distant palm, and toiled all day to reach it" (Hudspeth, 2:121).

breaks out, she ends up in an Indian lodge; a sick girl inside the hut moves to give Fuller a dry place, as "they seemed to think we would not like to touch them"(SL, 74). This spacial gap and the void of physical contact can be read as symbolic of tourist/stranger's inability to connect with authenticity and as a yearning for the touch of the other; Fuller's parasol becomes the marker of the white woman's difference, the Chippewa and Ottawa people "probably looking upon it as the most luxurious superfluity a person can possess, and therefore a badge of great wealth"(SL, 111). In her journal, Fuller notes that she would have played the part of trader, exchanging items that signify perspective cultures and genders, with the man who was "charmed" by the umbrella for the desired souvenir "if he had the model of a canoe...for I fear not to be able to get one"(Houghton, Works, 5:79). Although Fuller claims a desire to make contact with the other, in her transition state, the real exchange is based on the curious artifacts of respective cultures, rather than on a more meaningful connection. At other times, Fuller does communicate with Chippewa and Ottawa women "by signs" and realizes the limits to her contact: "Whatever the Indian may be among the whites, he is anything but taciturn with his own people"(SL, 108).

Niagara as Border: Nation and Female Desire

The first chapter of SL inscribes Fuller's mobile body in liminality, caught between the classical and the grotesque in

the "arrival" scene. She inscribes her anxiety about writing and pleasing her projected readers more thoroughly here than in other chapters, (except the final one, with which it shares a particular symmetry) and we might claim it as an unnamed prologue to the book. In this chapter, Fuller records her frustration with the unfamiliar as always already known, part of the psychic territory of travel.

Because Niagara is a site of the specifically American sublime, a watery marvel cited by travellers as proof of America's glory as a nation,it marks her arrival on the border of nation, female desire and representation. There, she establishes the grounds for formulating a subjectivity that is willing to evolve and constantly reinvent itself; but as part of the process of journeying to unknown terrain, Fuller, like other women travellers going West, projected fantasies through and into the topographies she encountered (Kolodny, The Land Before Her, xii). However she always included voices and opinions of other travellers. Noting that another writer had the opposite sense of Niagara than what she felt, she sought to let go of the ego's desire to control: "For all greatness affects different minds each in its 'own particular kind' and the variations of testimony mark the truth of feeling...one should go to such a scene prepared to yield entirely to its influences, to forget one's little self and one's little mind"(7).

The initial disappointment yet "quiet satisfaction"

Fuller feels upon arriving is the result of the predictability of Niagara and a negotiation with her need to take an anti-tourist stance; in spacialized terms, she already knew from books and drawings, "the position and proportions of all objects here; I knew where to look for everything, and everything looked as I thought it would"(4). As John Berger writes of the power of the reproduction of a work of art

> the meaning of the original work no longer lies in what it uniquely says but in what it uniquely is. The bogus religiosity which now surrounds original works of art and which is ultimately dependent upon their market value...its function is nostalgic (Ways of Seeing, 21-23).

For Fuller, the bogus religiosity and commodification of landscape is signified by the tourist who spits into the falls, "with an air as if thinking how he could best appropriate it to his own use"(5); his act introduces her comment on the American love of utility, which when taken to the extreme, as exemplified throughout the narrative, transforms the Westward settler into a more permanent tourist who misappropriates the sublime in the service of commercial crassness.

Despite the spacial predictability of the scene, Fuller discovers a positionality from which to negotiate the "continual stress of sight and sound" that had caused her nerves to get "braced up" (SL,3). Every great expression, Fuller realizes, furnishes to the faithful observer "its own standard by which to appreciate it. Daily these proportions widened and towered more and more upon my sight, and I got at

last, a proper foreground for these sublime distances"(4).

"Seeing the full wonder of the scene" creates an "undefined dread, such as I never knew before, such as may be felt when death is about to usher us into a new existence"(4). The sublime "trampling" of the water "seizes" Fuller's senses, and reminds her that the force of nature creating such a wonder also created the Indian, "that race, with their powerful instincts and insusceptibility of culture"(Houghton, Works V, 43). She is then haunted by a vision of the grotesque: "naked savages stealing behind me with uplifted tomahawks; again and again this illusion recurred..."(4). This is the first time, aside from her epigraph, that she mentions Native Americans in a text whose partial agenda is to mourn the eradication of a people from whom other Americans have much to learn. Her initial mention of them is an imaginary, rather than real encounter, and that is focuses on the Indians as savages, insusceptible to culture. A would-be victim, Fuller exemplifies the stereotype of the white woman as desirable prey to the dangerous, sexualized male of color. Her hallucination bears a resemblances to John Vanderlyn's 1804 paining "The Death of Jane McCrea," which depicted the captive Jane kneeling with raised arms before two powerful tomahawk-wielding Native Americans, one of whom was preparing to scalp her. As Tina Zwarg notes, "Unhappy with the images of the violent Indian and vulnerable maiden," Fuller "tried to think them away" (100-101). Yet she cannot shake the image

off; she still looks behind in fear. Another implication is that she recognized herself as a "trespasser" and the Indian was only protecting his turf. It is interesting to note that in her journal extract, but not in her published text, after mentioning the imagined foe, Fuller wrote of having "petty thoughts which I did not wish to have, and painful feelings rose up which have long seemed quelled" (Houghton, Works V:45) connecting the fear with painful, repressed memories. But for Fuller "sorrow brings truth"(1844 journal, Berg and Perry, 42) and the fear of the savage is not without an attraction to the wildness and sexuality associated with the Indian brave, who as she will reveal, has been symbolically "castrated" by the white man whose hog has replaced the Indian's rattlesnake. The "omnivorous traveller, safe in its stupidity easily makes a meal of the (snake)...whom the Indian looks on with a mystic awe"(SL, 29).

Referring to the bird that was a symbol of America, she notices an eagle who is chained as a plaything,"addressed by the vulgar with the language they seem to find most appropriate...that of thrusts and blows"(7). The violence seems to be an expression of the foreboding fear and ambivalence her arrival had generated; upon reaching her hotel, she notes "I felt a strange indifference about seeing the aspiration of my life's hopes"(8). The juxtapositioning of the sublime, expansive, masculine power of the falls, and the enclosed domestic site of tourism represented by her hotel,

introduces a classed or privileged frame for viewing landscape, that of a protected middle-class feminized position, evoking "strange indifference."

But the references to a threatening phallic thrusting that require a corresponding containment give way to that of a physically pleasing sensation from the rapids. It is a kind of orgiastic release that surges up through Fuller's body. As opposed to the falls, which she knew from the pictures, having seen the

> tumbling, rushing rapids, and heard their everlasting roar, my emotions overpowered me, a choking sensation rose to my throat, a thrill rushed through my veins, 'my blood ran rippling to my finger's ends.' This was the climax of the effect which the falls produced upon me--neither than American nor the British fall moved me as did these rapids (8).

Fuller's emotions are overpowered, and expressed as an embodied but not voiced "choking sensation" that sends a thrill all the way to her fingertips. Thus the supposed violence of being choked, or cut off from the place of verbal articulation, results in a thrilling sensation in another part of the body. The motion of blood rushing and rippling seems particularly akin to the "electric fluid" Fuller claimed moved through the body of a woman of genius, as well as the geography of pleasure that Luce Irigaray identifies as woman's, multiple, complex and subtle.[21] Moreover, the

---

[21] Charles Capper claims that Fuller associated water with the maternal; womb- and tomb-like cradling temptations showed up in recurring nightmares of wading in a sea of blood, what he reads as manifestations of ambivalent feelings about maternal love. But in the passage he quotes from one of Fuller's letters, the

movement from throat to fingers suggests a flow of power from the place of speech to that of writing, giving herself permission to enjoy it. The language in the above passage is similar to and yet a departure from the transcendence described by George Catlin, one of the travel writers whom Fuller read and most admired, as he sat to write on a summit of a "phallic" precipice: "Man feels here, and startles at the thrilling sensation, the force of illimitable freedom--his body and mind seem to have entered a new element" (North American Indians, 165). Fuller expressed a greater sense of freedom in the expansiveness of the prairies; there, she projected a feminized, sentimental fantasy of a scene where "nature still wore her motherly smile and seemed to promise room...for the delicate, the thoughtful, even the indolent or eccentric"(SL, 38). In Chapter two in a dialogue with her travelling companions, James and Sarah Clarke, Fuller imagines herself as a gnome or earth-dwelling person who works in secret. The mysterious earth dweller suggests great mother figures like Demeter; as Gilbert and Gubar point out, the womb-shaped cave is the place of female power, "one of the great antechambers of the mysteries of transformation" (Madwoman in the Attic, 95). Fuller returns to symbols of interiority throughout the text.

When Fuller returned to the rapids in the moonlight, her

"undulations of all earthly things most lovely" tempt her heart to "leap forth" creating a sense of aroused attentiveness in the human frame (Capper, 172).

inspiration waned. "I felt a foreboding of a mightier emotion to rise up and swallow all others...I saw how here mutability and unchangeableness were united...Happy were the first discoverers of Niagara, those who could come unawares upon this view...whose feelings were entirely their own"(9). Here, Fuller articulates a rising emotion of her desire to dominate, the power returning to her "grotesque" open mouth that would " swallow up" all others, a metaphor of devouring, like a vagina dentatta. But as she expresses this desire to take control, she notes that her reaction to Niagara must be derivative and linked to a past that has already been inscribed.

In travelling, she had wanted to throw off her "books and pens and thought," as she wrote to Emerson before embarking, not to be followed by The Dial's proof sheets, taking wing "for an idle outdoors life, mere sight and emotion" (Hudspeth, LMF, 3:124). Her desire for surprise, idle pleasure, and the use of the gaze seems to have been awakened, but it is in a dialectic with fear and limitation as to her own aspirations as a writer and the meaning of the nation's growth. For she was witnessing first hand the extent to which the reality of the "American dream" was invested with the imperative of compromise: on the one hand development meant necessary progress and opportunity, but on the other, it destroyed the wilderness and communities of Native Americans.

Journeying out of Concord and Cambridge even for this short period had deep implications for Fuller, and as she

crossed bodies of water in liminal movement, she envisioned how her fellow passengers would greet their new lives. The landscape itself signified a difference between New England and the West:

> Here land and water meet under very different auspices from those of the rock-bound coast to which I have been accustomed. There they meet tenderly to challenge, and proudly to refuse, though not in fact repel. But here, they meet to mingle, are always rushing together, and changing places; a new creation takes places beneath the eye (12).

The tropes of land and water meeting at Lake Erie suggest a heterosexual union in the context of sexual love and fruition, rather than of terror and rape contemplated at the falls by the image of the naked savage (Spenser, 49). In addition, the language Fuller uses here resembles her formulation of the male and female principles in her Dial essay "The Great Lawsuit: Man versus Men. Woman versus Women" which she had completed before embarking on her journey. This theory is informed by Fuller's interest in mesmerism and alchemy, as well as influenced by some of the ideas of Goethe and Fourier: "Male and female represent the two sides of the great radical dualism. But in fact they are perpetually passing into one another. Fluid hardens to solid, solid rushes to fluid. There is no wholly masculine man, no purely feminine woman"(43).

While the topography suggests sexual mingling and a new creation that can be read as the grafting of different cultures, Fuller was also setting up stark contrasts between

the wildness of the Indians she saw camped out along the bank and the rudeness of the white settler. The "they" she wants to distance herself from are mostly New England emigrants, who she calls "hordes of vulgar barbarians who crowd the landings. How unworthy they seem to these shores, of these sunsets, these moonlights"(Houghton, Works V, 49). This was consistent with stereotypes of vulgar tourists, whose very presence signified modernization and technological advancement and nostalgia for the "good old days."

Hybrid Ingredients in the Witch's Cauldron

As she writes of her disappointment in the emigrants, she seems to imagine herself as one who would be a better, more responsible emigre. In the midst of this projection, she incorporates one of her "digressions," a story told within the frame of an encounter with a fellow passenger. This is the story of Captain P and his wife, Fanny, one of many examples of men and women in the text who are wrongly suited as marriage partners. Mrs. P is also the first of the three female witches, grotesque outsiders who are powerful, but ultimately thwarted figures.

Her story, so suddenly introduced, offers the reader a riddle of interpretation.

Mrs. P. is from the lower classes, a "painted woman" who rides up in a fruit cart to her wedding; she is portrayed as having manners and tastes that "were not at that time gross, but her character showed itself hard and material. She was

fond of riding...her style in this, and in dress, seemed the opposite of P.'s; but he indulged all her wishes..." After a few years of marriage, Mrs. P. started to drink and as a result makes public scenes that embarrass Captain P. and cause the storyteller's mother and father, his close friends, to leave the table at which the foursome were dining and to ponder the meaning of such an attachment: "it is never pleasant to know that a heart, on which we have some claim, is to be given to another" (SL, 16). The explanation of how the noble Captain P. ended up with this in- appropriate woman is that he suffers as a "martyr" for his "hour of passion...when these overintellectual beings do swerve aside, it is to fall down a precipice...but he was not one to sin without making a brave atonement, and that it had become a holy one..." (SL, 17). Fuller claimed the story's "moral beauty touched me profoundly" (SL, 13). It is embedded in Fuller's struggle to reconcile her disgust with the "mushroom growth" of the West and her desire to judge the signs of conquest "not with stupid narrowness to distrust or defame." Her answer to this dilemma is to "perhaps foresee the law by which a new order, a new poetry is to be evoked from this chaos, and with a curiosity as ardent but not so selfish as that of Macbeth, to call up the apparitions of future kings from the strange ingredients of the witch's caldron" (SL, 18).

Rather than merely mourn "the rudeness of conquest" that has devastated the land and the Native Americans, Fuller

desires to be hopeful and distance herself from a narrow polemic associated with New England. The "new order evoked from chaos" can be read as Fuller's acceptance of death or transgression as a necessary transition towards rebirth. She recasts and engenders de Crevecoeur's melting pot as a witch's caldron, an image signalling her interest in powerful but grotesque seers like the Weird sisters in Macbeth, who make predictions as to how America's new race will emerge from out of strange hybrid ingredients. The emigrants, like Banquo, have the potential to "get kings, though thou be none" (Macbeth, I,iii, 67). Catherine Clement reminds us that the witch or sorceress is an agent of transformation: "she acts: the old culture will soon be the new. She is mixed up in dirty things...she handles filth, manipulates wastes, buries placentas" (Newly Born Woman, 36). Therefore, the chaos of Fanny P., signified by her unruly and inappropriate appetite for drink and an open mouth that utters a "volley" of abusive words, are recuperated by Captain P.'s sacrifice, suggesting that a "new order" can come from vice if one adopts an ethic of moral accountability and self-sacrifice. Here, the male (who on some level stands in for the vulgar male emigrants) must make sacrifices if he indulges in selfish and immoral behavior, as the fallen woman is a product of her class and cultural constraints; Fuller seems to have split her feelings about Native American annihilation--the sacrifice that will usher in the new order--in the story of Captain and Fanny P.

Fanny's alcoholism links the grotesque woman with the fate of the Indian after he had been plied with alcohol by whites, and the frontier women who "very frequently become slatterns" because a "city education has imparted neither the strength nor skill now demanded"(SL, 38).

When we read the text of SL in dialogue with Fuller's letters and journal, it becomes clearer that Fuller felt on some level that she was being too judgmental in assessing those she encountered; for all her stated desire to "judge things by their own standard" she nevertheless felt superior to the people who live in a "general dullness that broods over this country, where so little genius flows, and care, business and fashionable frivolity are equally dull" (Houghton, Works, V:57) Thus, her desire in her public text is to relax some of that overly critical tendency and to compensate for the loss of what was wild and free with the discourse of progress. She expresses this hope by calling for unspecified forms of "new intellectual growths" (18) whose present unattainability is suggested in her allegories of loss, suffering and misguided connections between men and women.

It is telling that the figure of the fallen woman is juxtaposed with Fuller's call for a new creation that emerges from the witches' cauldron. In my estimation, Fuller could more readily identify with Captain P. because he took responsibility for his probable "hour of passion" and entanglement with a woman from the lower classes, becoming

heroic by making a sacrifice. Fuller knew that "over intellectual beings" such as herself, were unbalanced, and at some point, boundaries could be crossed. The liminality of travel had stirred a variety of longings in Fuller. Fanny P. could stand in for a part of herself Fuller feared and projected, the "hard and material side" or the witch, seeking pleasure and the freedom to speak with the "vulgar sarcasm" and rage that alcohol induced in Fanny; Fuller certainly felt rage and anger over the loss of her close friendships with Anna Barker and Sam Ward when they chose to marry, and frustration at the perceived limits of her friendship with Emerson. As Fuller travelled away from New England, site of "cant" and "overintellectualization," she struggled to lose herself and maintain control. Fanny P. is a figure with whom Fuller could safely distance herself and yet whom embodied some of her fears: for instance, Fanny was poor. Since Fuller's father had died and left the family without much income, she had acquired a fear of poverty (Capper, 166).

As to the sensual aspect of life symbolized by Captain and Fanny P., the tale illustrates that one must pay for such indulgences. Despite its embrace of German romanticism, Transcendentalism was informed by the legacy of Puritanism; as Frederick Augustus Braun notes, the sensual nature of man was mistrusted; it was often contrasted with the "purer" spiritual side of human nature (Margaret Fuller and Goethe, 79). Fuller could accept the sensual if it was subsumed by a physical and

mental purity. Among her friends, she defended Goethe, on whom she had planned to write a biography, against charges of excess sensuality and immoral sexual behavior while personally she was troubled by what she knew and what she could not find out (Capper, 173-4). Fuller's Dial sketch "Leila" is one example through which Fuller figured the mythical reunion of woman with her female double, but it required "nunlike dedication" for the self to be reborn "...virgin dedication necessitates purification, a burning away and sublimating of desire"(Jeffrey Steele, "Recovering the 'Idea of Woman'," 124). In Victorian America, the figure of the loose woman stood for disease and fear of contamination; Sander Gilman writes of the dominant male construction of images of the sexualized female "are attempts to undermine the tradition of the female as the beautiful object, by claiming that the innate nature of their beauty is a mask for decay, a mortality rooted in their iconographic role as the object of desire" ("Goethe's Touch" 226). Fuller's celebration of woman's divine purity and her advocation of celibacy as preferable to an unsuitable marriage was not totally incompatible with the Victorian association of women as the "purer" and more "moral" of the sexes, and the association of female sexuality outside of marriage with sin and baseness. Like Mary Wollstonecraft, Fuller traced female deviance to an excessive "love of dress, love of flattery, love of excitement" (Woman in the Nineteenth Century, 146); especially among the lower classes, that could lead to theft

and prostitution. In Woman in the Nineteenth, Fuller would write with sympathy toward prostitutes as a result of conversing with a group of them at Sing-Sing Prison.

In her text, Fuller creates improvisatrices who attract and threaten both men and women; she "kills" these women to signify the impossibility of their limitlessness when coupled with their desire to be loved and understood for who they are. Captain P. is the "heroic victim" punished for digressing outside his class, but in general, the marriages she refers to in SL are doomed to fail because the country had a shortage of men who were "man enough to be a lover!" to women whose minds contain "large impulses...But some men come not so often as once an age, their presence should not be absolutely needed to sustain life"(SL, 64). Fuller not only refuses to incorporate the sentimental marriage plots of the novels of her day into SL, but anticipates the resulting madness and suicide of ambitious and artistic women imprisoned in domestic roles that American writers Kate Chopin and Charlotte Perkins Gilman depict in their fiction in the 1890s. Thus, her grotesque women, which I shall return to shortly, transgress the limits of their material body and the symbolic order; they encompass some of the irony, perversity and utopianism of Donna Haraway's cyborgs in an earlier incarnation. Their "downfalls" are both reactions to realistic cultural boundaries that undermine the expansive "new poetry" and Fuller's own internalization of the dominant discourse that

punishes women who travel too far off course.

Before turning to Fuller's portraits of Mariana and the Seeress of Prevorst, we journey to the chapter where Fuller grants her fantasies the freest reign: in Chapter Three, she "loses her way" and encounters "Eden" or the realm of myth, a nostalgic longing for the Western origin story where the Indian brave might be mistaken for Apollo (SL, 33). On the other hand, the material reality of the lives of emigrant women bursts this bubble, as Fuller-the-tourist riding in a wagon finds women overworked and unhappy in their prairie cabins. And she finds arrowheads and Indian pottery in the sod, reminders of how recently "they were driven away"(SL,33).

Fuller's 'Wild' West: Boundless and Bounded

The joys and divinity of limitlessness are expressed in Chapter Three--the section where she notes the high point of her trip. "I say that limitlessness is alone divine, that there was neither wall nor road in Eden that those who walked there were lost and found their way just as we did..."(SL, 40). But boundlessness is experienced in a dialectic with the recognition of limits and in fact, the cycle of rebirth and death, as exemplified in the "elegy" that concludes the chapter, a poem for painter Washington Allston. Limitation is gendered and based on the politics of (re)location; frontier women, as products of the East, cannot shake their education and "inappropriate" values when uprooted to become new women of the West. On the other hand, Fuller associates a balanced

and varied life--a form of hybridity--with a man of the East who had been chosen to go to Chicago, and was transformed into Western man: William Hull Clarke, with whom she appeared to be quite taken.[22] Clarke, and Fuller's libidinal economy of limitless pleasure are associated with the unwritten, unmapped, and unstudied, which links them to the "wildness" or "uncivilized" nature of the Indians before the white settler was "victor in the chase." But this transformation from Eastern to Western takes place in the context of a fantasy of Eden domesticized and feminized rather than caused by violent domination. "No route.. but a garden interspersed with cottages, groves and flowery lawns.."(SL, 41), where the boyish qualities of a man can be expressed rather than excessive machismo of the hunter who has no qualms in banishing the Indian and then feeling "the aversion of the injurer for him he has degraded"(SL, 72). Fuller's "friend" in SL remains unnamed, as "such frank kindness would feel ill requited by its becoming the means of fixing many spy-glasses" is most refreshing for "his unstudied lore, the unwritten poetry which common life presents to a strong and gentle mind. It was a great contrast to the subtleties of analysis, the philosophic strainings of which I had seen too much"(SL, 42). Yet in her journal, she gives his initials, W.C., noting

---

[22] Clarke (1812-78) had moved to Chicago in 1835, where he operated a drug store with other family members. Apparently he had first met Fuller in 1836 when they both visited the Boston Athenaeum (Berg and Perry, note 12, 43).

> ...there was the constantly that slight excitement which keeps the spirit in the alert; and W.C. was the pleasantest person...he has the spirit of light, fun and adventure, delicate perceptions and a good deal of wit, knows every anecdote of the country, whether of man or deer...He knows his path as a man, and follows it with the gay spirit of a boy. We do not see such people in the East; it requires a more varied life to unfold their faculties..."(Houghton, 5:75).

The days spent on the Rock River evoked for Fuller the fantasy of the balanced life and "fair chance of happiness" she sought; on the Illinois prairie she noted, "the poet, the sportsman, the naturalist would alike rejoice...with a very little money, a ducal estate may be purchased, and by a ...moderate labor, a family be maintained..."(SL, 37). She wrote to her favorite brother Richard that during this part of the journey, she daily thought of him. "And there, I thought, if we two could live and you have a farm which would pay twenty times as much for the labor, and have our books and our pens...how happy we might be for four or five years, at least as happy as fate permits mortals to be" (Hudspeth, 3:133).

Fuller's poem "Ganymede to His Eagle" composed on July 4 on the height called Eagle's Nest suggests desire mingled with fear and the expectation of disappointment as Ganymede waits for Jove, who is coming for him in the form of an Eagle. Her use of a homoerotic relationship and a shape-shifter indicates a displacement of strong emotions onto other supernatural or hybrid classical figures who express their neediness in verse or in a story as-told-to-Fuller through a mediating narrator. The boy Ganymede worries that he has been forgotten as he

waits "upon the lonely spring", referring to himself as a tired sojourner on the mountain, "My feet are weary of their frequent way,/The spell that opes spring my tongue no more can say"(36). Fuller was attracted to the romantic pathos of the forlorn lover who waits; here she connects intense longing with a sensation that goes beyond speech. In her 1844 journal, her code for silence and self-censorship, of the emotion which must not be written is "donzella lagune" translated as "the lady-in-waiting by the lake."[23]

Following the Ganymede poem, she juxtaposes her fantasy of living happily on the Prairie with the realization that the wives of the settlers have even more hard work to do than before:

> ...when they leave the housework, they have not learnt to ride, to drive, to row alone....Seeing much of this joylessness and inaptitude, both of body and mind, we hope they (the little girls) would grow up with strength of body, dexterity, simple tastes...But...everywhere the fatal spirit of imitation, of reference to European standards, penetrates(SL, 38-9).

Europe and America: Otherness in Transition

Fuller had written elsewhere of her own desire to divest

---

[23] In an entry written a year later on the anniversary of her esctactic July 4 in Illinois, her desire for love triggers a memory and a headache:
O I need some help. No I need a full a godlike embrace from some sufficient love...My head aches. Last year this day was the Ganymede day. The full music of soul amid that resplendent beauty of nature...All its pictures of supernatural loveliness pass before my eyes. Here all looks so mean!..I read Tennyson...I love him. I will write to him this evening" (July 4, 1844, Berg and Perry, 71).

herself of what she called the "European mind" in order to contribute specifically as an American: "How much those of us who have been formed by the European mind have to unlearn and lay aside if we would act here. I would fain do something worthily that belonged to the country where I was born, but most times I hear it may not be" (Hudspeth, 2:125). Her training in European thought had distanced her from other Americans, creating: "a premature and excessive culture in the thoughts of Europe, which I have had slowly to undo or transmute to live in my own place and with my own people" (Hudspeth, 3:156). As someone who sees herself as culturally European, she seems unwilling to let go of Eurocentric categories in reading the American landscape and its people. "Europe" in the classical and modern sense performs a dual function as a trope--it becomes the mirror and standard by which America is measured and yet within Fuller's narrative, European foreigners have the potential to breed or become future Americans. Europe is associated with what Freud called the uncanny, a sense of dread regarding memories and feelings associated with childhood events. In Fuller's case this meant overintellectualism, dogma, the law of the father, and the literal father--Timothy Fuller. Sometimes, New England is a metonmym for Europe in the text, associated with domestic obligations and limitations and Fuller's position as "phallic mother" who mimics men even as she incorporates more archetypal feminine goddesses and imagery into her writing and

self culture (Steele, "Recovering the 'Idea of Woman,'108). Thus, Fuller's "anxiety of influence" as an American writer appears to be expressed through her attraction/repulsion with Eurocentrism and European ideas, the father and mother lands rather than with a single "forefather" or "foremother" figure. If Harold Bloom's model metaphorically defines the poetic process as "a sexual encounter between a male poet and his female muse" (Gilbert and Gubar, 47), Fuller internally split her own persona between what she labelled Minerva and the Muse, standing respectively for the "masculine" and "feminine" principles; her sense of poetic process and new intellectual growths comes from mixing "strange ingredients," myths and traces of animals, humans, poetry and technology, cyborg ingredients, in the witch's cauldron.

As Fuller read the women of Illinois and Wisconsin, she couldn't help but be reminded of how unfit she sometimes felt for the balanced life she longed for--and how both education and rigid gender roles had contributed to Fuller's and the prairie women's unfitness to adapt to their time and place. She projected herself into a would-be reformer who could change the future course of history, calling for good schools "planned by persons of sufficient thought to meet the wants of the place and time, instead of copying New York or Boston, will correct this mania"(SL, 39).[24] Susan J. Rosowski has

---

[24] Earlier, Fuller had entertained the possibility of teaching in Cincinnati, where she thought of establishing a school, and to quench her desire to "try life for a time" (Capper, 139,

argued that in SL, Fuller develops the idea of giving birth to a nation as distinctly female ("MF, an Engendered West and SL, 139); but I posit that the ideal, honorable America and American Fuller gives birth is both sublime and grotesque. This American hybrid would have the classical head of the European or Easterner on an "American" body that would be as strong, wild, and free as her ideal Western man or Indian in his former glory. Continuing to employ the maternal metaphor, she would write of America as a "willing foster mother" whose children "need wise tutors to prevent them from playing, willingly or unwilling, the viper's part." This would be accomplished if all this "new blood" is "purified, assimilated, or it will take all form of comeliness from the growing nation" (Life Without and Life Within, 176). Thus, William Hull Clarke the down-to-earth pharmacist, exhibits hybrid qualities that are both "masculine" and "feminine" cultured and wild, without undergoing racial or ethnic mixing. He does not present the threat of a Native American man or a lower class immigrant.

---

146). By the summer of 1843, Fuller had already been a teacher in Boston and Providence and wanted to rely more on her writing to earn a living. In Woman in the Nineteenth Century, Fuller's call to open a variety of employments to women and to give girls instruction in "as fair a field as boys" would be her way of ensuring that in the future, women would be better prepared to face upheaval and change. In an 1845 review essay, she had suggested a plan through which a teacher's training center would be set up in Cincinnati, with a central committee "raising funds, finding teachers and places where teachers are wanted. The passage of thoughts, teachers and funds, will be from East to West--the course of sunlight upon this earth"(New York Tribune, 30 Sept. 1845).

Assimilation's Attraction; Amalgamation's Sorrow

If Fuller is both attracted to and frightened by Native American men before conquest, her analysis of Indian women reinforced and expanded her critique of gender roles and pointed to the contradictory nature of her feelings on amalgamation. Mrs. Schoolcraft, one of the women travellers Fuller quotes, had remarked that Indian women "have great power at home." Not satisfied to measure power by domestic influence alone, Fuller concluded

> This power is good for nothing, unless the woman be wise to use it aright. Has the Indian, has the white woman, as noble feeling of life and its uses, as religious a self-respect, as worthy a field of thought and action, as man? If not, the white woman, the Indian woman occupies an inferior position to that of man (SL, 113) [25]

Fuller measures gender oppression cross-racially by asking if women have access to viable options, using a spacialized term that emphasized her desire to see thinking women as agents of change (expanding Emerson's notion of "man thinking"): a worthy field of thought and action. Interestingly, the Indian woman who Fuller seems to admire most is an English-speaking attendant on the boat from

---

[25] Charlene Avallone argues that "lineaments of gynocentric tribal culture increasingly appeared in Fuller's growing feminist thought, sometimes through obviously conscious assimilation, sometimes without Fuller's conscious recognition"(4). For instance, in Woman in the Nineteenth Century, Fuller evokes the Indian girl who "dedicates herself to the Sun, the Sun of Truth" to articulate her point about women's need for autonomy and freedom from helplessness. "I would have woman lay aside all thought, such as she habitually cherishes, of being taught and lead by men" (quoted in "The Red Roots of White Feminism in Margaret Fuller's Writings,"1).

Mackinaw to Sault St. Marie. She had left her husband and supported herself and her child

> by going as a chambermaid in these boats. Now and again her husband called on her and asked if he might life with her again; but she always answered, no. Here she was far freer than she would have been in civilized life. I was pleased by the nonchalance of this woman, and the perfectly national manner she had preserved after so many years of contact with all kinds of people (SL, 146).

This woman assimilates in order to survive materially (she speaks English and has a job in the tourism industry) and yet she maintains her ethnic folk identity. She reveals the paradox that undermined traditional hierarchies regarding "civilized" and "uncivilized" life; as a "floating" chambermaid on the frontier she enjoys more freedom and independence than she would have had in a similar predicament in the city. In light of Fuller's use of the European as both the tradition worth emulating and the identity that needed to be transformed in order to become the hybrid American, it is telling that the only contented woman Fuller claims she has heard of is an Englishwoman who said "she had seen so much suffering in her own country that the hardships of this seemed as nothing to her"(SL, 72). This is especially noteworthy, since Fuller made generalizations based on geographical and cultural essentialism to highlight the distinct process of acculturation for the present and next generation: while the American men and women "are inexcusable if they do not bring up child so as to be fit for vicissitudes...all should be fitted for freedom and an independence... but the star of the

Europe brought a different horoscope...The Arabian horse will not plough well, nor can the plough horse be rode to play the jereed"(SL, 77). Her sense is that one's past position and socialization process could prevent him from adapting to a new situation; but Americans, as citizens in the land of freedom, must fulfill their nation's mission and create flexibility, and hence, fitness. Yet her contented Englishwoman and Morris Birkbeck, an Englishman whose travel books she admired, could be some of the best stock to go into the cauldron [26]. Birkbeck was a "visionary": "one of the men I should think of as able to be a truly valuable settler in a new and great country" (SL, 65). But like the other visionary foreigners she introduces, he died prematurely in a heroic fashion, and was ahead of his time, "but the time is growing up to him"(SL, 66).

Temporality plays an important role in Fuller's vision; her personal fears are bound up with feeling stuck in the past while in her optimistic mode she looks to the future and sees America and America's children in the same predicament. In SL, she is concerned with the gradual emergence of a new race and a distinctly American genius; in Woman in the Nineteenth Century, she details the specific barriers to gender equity and calls for new possibilities for women based on republican American ideals, envisioning a millennial allegory of history

---

[26] Birkbeck was the author of Letters from Illinois (1818) and Notes on a Journey in America, (1818).

> in which nations in time exemplify the unfolding of ideas, and in which the mental emancipation of women, the increasing recognition that they are human beings and individual souls, signifies a world progress identified particularly with the United States, where the doctrine that all men are created equal 'cannot fail sooner or later to be acted out'(Nina Baym, American Women Writers and the Work of History, 229).

In SL, Fuller's sense of the foreign is always present, although unstable and in a dialectic with what was or might become an example of the moral and intellectual American. Fuller herself had been identified as "foreign", by Emerson and others: "In the first days of our acquaintance, I felt her to be a foreigner," Emerson noted in The Memoirs of Margaret Fuller Ossoli (227); during her Western travels her feelings of dislocation gave her the sense of being a foreigner or other in her own country. Therefore, the "foreign" can be a sign of exotic otherness that represents a barrier to fitness and personal happiness. Fuller's use of hybrid figures signified her ambivalence about the process of transformation on a personal and national level: one the one hand there was the necessity for change in order to grow or be reborn, but on the other hand, the American genius could not yet appear, as the timespan for "our people in a transition state...lasts rather longer than is occupied in passing bodily the oceans which separates the new from old world" ("American Literature" 122). In the transition state, ethnic or cultural identity should not be totally shed, and inter-racial amalgamation could be deferred, but assimilation must take place. The Indian chambermaid and another woman who has "a mixture of

Indian blood" mentioned by Fuller in a letter to Emerson (but not in SL) are examples of what Fuller finds picturesque and non-threatening in the transition process (in contrast to the male's uplifted tomahawk): "Her melancholy eyes, slow graceful utterance, and delicate feeling of what she has seen attract me. She is married here and wears our dress, but her family retain the dress and habits of their race"(Hudspeth, 3:130). Fuller's appreciation of mixed-blood or hybrid women is similar to many traveller's appreciation of mulatta women, whom they found charming, while mulatto men were seen as greater threats.

Although she gives voice to the view that amalgamation between white and Indian "would afford the only true and profound means of civilization," she ultimately rails against interracial mixing. "Those of mixed blood fade early, and are not generally a fine race. They lose what is best in either type, rather than enhance the value of each, by mingling. There are exceptions..but this, it is said, is the general rule"(SL, 120), which advances the theory of decomposition and distant species that claims mixed breeds either die out quickly or tend to degeneration (Young, 18). Fuller includes a Native American tale (she does not specify from which tribe) "Muckwa, or the Bear" which reinforces her feeling that racial amalgamation does not produce offspring that physically or culturally mix the best of each partner, but become inferior copies of the original; The Indian Hunter and she-

bear have two sons, "one of whom was like an Indian, and the other like a bear." The mother bear favors the bear-child, and Muckwa cannot stop from hunting bear, and kills his sister-in-law. In the end, the she-bear tells Muckwa to return to his people, as "since you have lived among us, we have nothing but ill-fortune. The Indian and the bear cannot live in the same lodge, for the Master of Life has appointed them different habitations" (SL, 126). According to folklorist Barbara Fass Leavy, animal bride tales reflect the fear that women will exercise an ever present potential for widespread destruction of the social order; men who takes bear wives are "drawn to the beasts' complete unsocialized behavior, and at the same time are repulsed by it" (Swan Maiden, 240, 235). For Fuller, this tale can exemplify and displace her fascination and ambivalence regarding Native American and Caucasian amalgamation while also allegorizing the oppression of women; Fuller calls the tale "a poetic expression of the sorrows of unequal relations" (SL, 127).

While Fuller dismisses or defers amalgamation between what she perceives as more distant racial types, she recognizes the value of Native American culture and spirituality:

> Their moral code, if not as refined as that of civilized nations, is clear and noble in the stress laid upon truth and fidelity. And all unprejudiced observers bear testimony that the Indians, until broken from their old anchorage by intercourse with the whites...were singularly virtuous (SL, 128)

The mythical realm that Fuller turns to at length in her

text signifies the transition state between whites and other non-white cultures and the gap between European and Native American religious and spiritual practices. She quotes other travellers on Indian rituals which align them with the Western tradition, such as James Adair, author of History of the American Indians (1775) who wrote "The Indians have as much belief and expectation of a future state as the greater part of the Israelites seem to have" (SL, 130), which would appeal to Fuller's desire to compare Indian traditions to recognizable Western ones. But Adair wants Indians to be kept under the dominion of whites; Fuller is much more ambivalent about the humanity of "the Europeans who took possession of this country...Had they been truly civilized or Christianized, the conflicts which sprang from the collision of the two races might have been avoided, but...the mass has never yet been humanized"(143). Although the demise of the Indians was inevitable, Fuller realizes the bias inherent in creation of history. "The historian of the Indians should be one of their own race" but the interpreters of such history appear to be non-Indians (SL, 142). Her conclusion is to call for individual accountability and perhaps a governmental policy that would not repeat patterns of domination and misguided sympathy:

> Let the missionary, instead of preaching to the Indian, preach to the trader who ruins him...Let every legislator...try for that clear view and right sense that might save us from sinning still more deeply. And let every man and every woman, in their private dealings with the subjugated race, avoid all share in embittering, by

> insult or unfeeling prejudice, the captivity of Israel (SL, 144).

Hybrid Women in the Transition State

Fuller links Native Americans to her portraits of Mariana and the Seeress of Prevorst both directly and indirectly. For instance, she finds an exotic, "Oriental cast" in the faces of the Seeress and Guess, the inventor of the Cherokee alphabet, which suggests that one of the results of her interest in phrenology was that a belief that physical characteristics could reflect intelligence and intuitive powers: "...intellect dawning through features still simple and national, presents very different apparitions from the ...faces of a broken and cultured race, where there is more to divine than see" (SL, 140).[27]

Furthermore, Fuller feels herself a kindred spirit with those who valorize the deeply intuitive and are open to the supernatural sense of time and space. Free Hope, the allegorical figure who expresses Fuller's position on controversial psychic practices such as magnetism and mesmerism, claims "All my days are touched by the supernatural, for I feel the pressure of hidden causes, and the presence, sometimes the communion of unseen powers" (SL, 79). Mariana and The Seeress suggest woman's agency in the transition state, bridging past, present and future by

---

[27] Margaret Fuller on at least two occasions, had her head examined by the phrenologist-publisher Orson Fowler (Stern, 231). See Madeline B. Stern, "Margaret Fuller and the Phrenologist-Publishers," Studies in the American Renaissance, 1980, 229-237.

creating a dialectic between life and death, experience and intuition, Europe and America, masculine and feminine. They are not non-challant, however, like the English-speaking Indian woman on the boat.

The Seeress, who in her trances blends "poetic facts with their scientific exposition" can be seen as a would-be practitioner of the "new intellectual growth" that Fuller claims as the legacy of America's future, but this woman cannot live in her body and must abandon her role as wife and mother. The fact that she transcends corporeality signifies her "unfitness" for material life. On the other hand, mesmerism was thought to be a method of transcending the body only to displace its pain. According to Rev. Chauncey Hare Townshend, one of the leading experts on mesmerism in the period, mesmeric influences were thought to "restore equilibrium to the bodily forces." He claimed that "under its beneficial action I have seen headaches cured, fatigue disappear and trifling body ailments removed in a short time" (Facts on Mesmerism, 332). This paradox illuminates Fuller's desire to seek remedies for her own bodily ailments through displacement, alternative medicine, and writing as a form of oscillation between feeling pain and expressing anxieties.

I read Mariana and The Seeress as grotesques who encompass some of the qualities associated with the witch and the hysteric. Freud connected his "hysterical" patients with the possessed, diabolical women described the fifteenth

century "witchhunter's manual," Malleus Maleficarum. and Catherine Clement brilliantly rethinks Freud to map the transgressive power of the sorceress and hysteric in her essay "The Guilty One." "The sorceress...incarnates the reinscription of the traces of paganism that triumphant Christianity repressed. The hysteric, whose body is transformed into a theater for forgotten scenes, relives the past, bearing witness to a lost childhood that survives in suffering" (The Newly Born Woman, 5). Both figures are linked to the return of the repressed, and to the power of the archaic in the Imaginary, vis-a-vis its relation to the Symbolic; the history of sorceress and hysteric is connected to spectacle and sexuality. As Stallybrass and White have argued, the thematics of carnivalesque pleasure, which were too disgusting for bourgeois life except as sentimental spectacle, "returned at the level of subjective articulation, as both phobia and fascination, in the individual (hysterical) patient" (Politics and Poetic of Transgression, 182-3). It seems to me that Mariana has more of the hysteric's qualities, while the Seeress of Prevorst is a kind of sorceress; Mariana's fits of passion, her highly stylized gestures include that include carnivalesque pastiche and parody reflect her repressed and rejected large desires. The Seeress, who in Fuller's description goes out of her body, hovering above it, does not hold back; through her electrical connections with the other world, she moves on "she lets the past be past,

neither repeating its pain nor craving its pleasures...the seer's gaze achieves a vision of the whole as whole precisely because it refuses the temptation to totalize" (Levin, The Opening of Vision, 457-8).

It is telling that Mariana's story, acknowledged as partially autobiographical, is associated with Fuller's own troubled childhood, while the Seeress might be said to represent Fuller's future in terms of her move out of Concord and the complex, material and utopian vision she would soon present in Woman in the Nineteenth Century. These figures point to a lack of equilibrium in women's lives and relationships, and enable Fuller to voice her disappointment and suggest possible alternatives.

Mariana, of Spanish Creole blood on her father's side, encounters disappointment in school because of her nonconformity, which expresses through excessive theatricality, passion and wit. After being humiliated there, she briefly recovers her spark through her friendship with an older woman ("the feminine character to whom Freud gives the role of homosexual other; the character with whom the hysteric 'identifies'" Clement, 53) , but falls in love with Sylvain, a man who can not see or understand her deep power and intellect. She loses her appetite, falls sick and dies, "a fine sample of womanhood, born to shed light and life on some palace home...wrecked through the affections only" (SL, 61, 64). In failing to find the ideal man and reconstitute the

family, the hysteric's narrative calls into question the social structure of the family (Clement, 45); Fuller uses the portrait of Mariana as a mark of "the defect in the position of woman...to a man of equal power...many resources would have presented themselves" (SL, 64).

Inserting forty pages on The Seeress of Prevorst in Chapter Five was a bold move for Fuller, and one that got her in trouble with some readers, including her biographer Thomas Wentworth Higginson. He scolded her as if she had run off at the mouth: "this showed the waywardness of a student and talker, rather than the good judgment which she ought to have gained in editing even the most ideal of magazines" (Margaret Fuller Ossoli, 197). Yet Fuller's account of the Seeress, which is a translation, a review and an allegory all in one, is about claiming power and large amounts of personal and social space. In Fuller's account, doctors and the community try to deny and degrade her exceptional powers, but the dignified Seeress rises above such pettiness. She can conjure up past spirits and predict the future for those on earth; she can heal herself more effectively than most doctors, by doing the opposite of what they suggest. Born Fredericka Hauffe in a small German hamlet whose inhabitants are very susceptible to "magnetic and sidereal influences" (SL, 83), she goes into a clairvoyant state at night. In this magnetic state, she described a machine she wished to have made for her treatment, one of which was to make a vapor bath out of vegetable

substances. In other words, she exercised her own will over the medical men (with the exception of Kerner, who is portrayed as the only doctor who respects and does not aim to control her), which was precisely what was considered so threatening and hysterical about women who claimed access to mediumship. As Ann Braude has argued, spiritualists, while manifesting extremely feminine qualities were seen as challenging the dominant order. They were likely to reject

> male headship over women-or indeed of any individualism over any other--whether in religion, politics or society. Spiritualists believed that the advent of spirit communication heralded the arrival of a new era, one in which humanity...would achieve hitherto impossible levels of development. While other radicals struggled to reconcile their commitment to individualism, with their believe in the sovereignty of God, spiritualists found in their faith direct divine sanction for advancing social change (Radical Spirits, 6)[28]

The new era that spiritualists proclaimed was similar to Fuller's millennial vision of America; it accounts for her sense of American genius as an outgrowth of the idealized fusion that would take place when racial and gender harmony was in place. As attracted as Fuller is to this "beautiful

---

[28] We can see the threat mesmerism presented in this excerpt of a letter that Nathaniel Hawthorne wrote to his wife Sophia regarding her interest in spiritualism: "I am unwilling that a power should be exercised on thee, of which we know neither the origin nor the consequence...Supposing this power arises from the transfusion of one spirit into another..there would be an intrusion into thy holy of holies--and the intruder would not be thy husband!...dearest, thou must remember...that thou art now a part of me, and that by surrendering thyself to the influence of this magnetic lady, thou surrenderest more than thine own moral and spiritual being..."(Letter, Oct. 18, 1841, quoted in The Blithedale Romance Norton Critical Edition, ed. Seymour Gross and Rosalie Murphy, New York: W.W. Norton, 1978, 242).

secret of nature, and the fashioning spirit which loves to develop and transcend" she finally comes back to earth and a sense of fitness that is based on balance. This spirit

> loves no less to moderate, to modulate, and harmonize, it did not mean by thus drawing man onward to the next state of existence, to destroy his fitness for this....These functions should be in equipoise, and when they are not we see excess either on the natural..or the spiritual side, we feel that the law is transgressed (SL, 98-99).

This passage contains ideas that I read as related to those in which she envisions a new race of Americans as a mix between what is "valuable" in each parent stock and what is different and unique as "a different plant in the new climate." Although her evocation of eugenics seems racist to us now, I believe she conceives of the transition state as a moderating, partial standpoint rather than a totalizing or conclusive one. Fuller could embrace it as a space for potential social change and yet exert some form of agency and control. Her journey into America had brought about constant awareness of the need to change as one faced repressive barriers; she embraced American democratic ideals and yet feared what America might become. Her poetic ethnography became a form of writing and reading culture nationally, transnationally, and supernaturally, as she takes on the contradictory discourses of her era and processes them through her fascinating and always difficult vision.

######

WORKS CITED--INTRODUCTION

Alexander, Ziggi and Audrey Dewjee. "Editor's Introduction" Wonderful Adventures of Mrs. Seacole in Many Lands. Bristol: Falling Wall Press, 1984.

_____. Mary Seacole: Jamaican National Heroine and 'Doctress' in the Crimean War. London: Brent Library Service, 1982.

Capper, Charles. Margaret Fuller: An American Romantic Life: The Private Years. New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1992.

Chevigny, Bell Gale. The Woman and The Myth: Margaret Fuller's Life and Writings. Boston: Northeastern Univ. Press, 1994.

Clifford, James. "Travelling Cultures," in Cultural Studies. Ed. Paula Treichler et al. New York: Routledge,1992.

Davies, Carole Boyce. Black Women, Writing and Identity. Migrations of the Subject. New York: Routledge, 1994.

Easton, Alison. "The Body as History and 'Writing the Body': The Example of Grace Nichols" in Journal of Gender Studies. Vol. 3, No. 1, 1994, 55-67.

Foster, Frances Smith. Written By Herself. Literary Production by African American Women, 1746-1892. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1993.

Fuller, Margaret. Papers on Literature and Art. New York: Wiley & Putnam, 1846.

_____.Summer on the Lakes, in 1843. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1991.

Gilroy, Paul. The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double Consciousness. Cambridge: Harvard Univ. Press, 1993.

_____.'There Ain't No Black in the Union Jack' The Cultural Politics of Race and Nation. Chicago: Univ. Of Chicago Press, 1987.

Grosz, Elizabeth. Volatile Bodies: Toward A Corporeal Feminism. St. Leonards, Australia: Allen & Unwin.

Hudspeth, Robert. The Letters of Margaret Fuller. 6 Vols. Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1982-1994.

Lawrence, Karen R. Penelope Voyages: Women and Travel in the British Literary Tradition. Ithaca: Cornell Univ.

Press, 1994.

Loggins, Vernon. The Negro Author: His Development in America to 1900. Port Washington, NY: Kennikat Press, 1964.

Miller, Perry. Margaret Fuller: American Romantic. A Selection from Her Writings and Correspondence. Gloucester, MA: Peter Smith, 1963.

Mills, Sara. Discourses of Difference: An Analysis of Women's Travel Writing and Colonialism. London: Routledge, 1993.

Peterson, Carla L. Doers of the Word: African-American Women Speakers and Writers in the North, 1830-1880. New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1995.

Pratt, Mary Louise. Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation. New York: Routledge, 1992.

Prince, Nancy. A Narrative of the Life and Travels of Mrs. Nancy Prince. Written by Herself. Second Edition. in Collected Black Women's Narratives ed. Henry Louis Gates. New York: Oxford/Schomburg Library, 1988 [Reprint of 1853 edition]

_____. The West Indies. Being A description of the Islands. Progress of Christianity. Education and Liberty Among the Colored Population Generally. Boston: Dow & Jackson, 1841.

Seacole, Mary. Wonderful Adventures of Mrs. Seacole in Many Lands. New York: Oxford/Schomburg Library, 1988 [Reprint of 1857 ed.]

Zwarg, Christina. Feminist Conversations: Fuller, Emerson and the Play of Reading. Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1995.

WORKS CITED--CHAPTER ONE

Journeys and Warnings: Nancy Prince's Resistant Working Body in New England, Russia, and Jamaica

Alleyne, Mervyn. Roots of Jamaican Culture. London: Pluto Press, 1988.

Annual Report of the Boston Female Anti-Slavery Society. Right and Wrong in Boston. Boston: By the Society. Issac Knapp, Printer, 1836,7.

Bakan, Abigail B. Ideology and Class Conflicts in Jamaica: The Politics of Rebellion. Montreal: McGill Univ. Press, 1990.

Baker, Houston. Blues, Ideology and Afro-American Literature. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1984.

Barash, Carol. "The Character of Difference: The Creole Woman as Cultural Mediator in Narratives About Jamaica." Eighteenth Century Studies. Vol. 23, No. 4, 1990, 406-424.

Barclay, Alexander. Remarks on Emigration to Jamaica Addressed to the Colored Citizens of the United States. New York: James Norden & Co., Printers, 1840.

Barthold, Bonnie J. Black Time: Fiction of Africa, the Caribbean and the U.S. New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 1981.

Bartram, William. Travels of William Bartram. Ed. Mark Van Doren. New York: Dover Publication, 1955

Barthelemy, Anthony G. "Introduction," Collected Black Women's Narratives. Oxford/Schomburg Library, 1988.

Benjamin, Jessica. The Bonds of Love: Psychoanalysis, Feminism and the Problems of Domination. New York: Pantheon, 1988.

Beer, Gillian. Talk, "Unnatural Selection? The Peoples of Darwin's Beagle Voyage," CUNY Graduate Center, Nov. 4, 1994.

Blackett, R.J.M. Beating Against the Barriers: Biographical Essays in 19th Century Afro-American History. Baton Rouge: Louisiana State Univ. Press, 1986.

Blakely, Alison. Russia and the Negro: Blacks in Russian History and Thought. Washington, D.C: Howard Univ. Press, 1986. Forward, Albert Parry.

Bolster, Jeffrey W. "To Feel Like a Man: Black Seamen in the Northern States." Journal of American History Vol. 76, No. 4, March, 1990, 1173-1199.

Bolt, Christine. The Women's Movement in the U.S. and Britain from 1790s to 1920s. Amherst: Univ. Of Mass. Press, 1993.

Boston Directories, Various publishers, 1823-1860.

Bourne, Stephen. The Uncle Toms and St. Clares of Jamaica. London: Thomas Bosworth, 1853.

Boylan, Anne M. "Benevolence and Antislavery Activity Among African-American Women in New York and Boston, 1820-1840,"in The Abolitionist Sisterhood. Women's Political Culture in Antebellum America. Eds. Jean Fagan Yellin and John C. Van Horne. Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1994.

Braxton, Joanne M. Black Women Writing Autobiography. Philadelphia: Temple Univ. Press, 1989.

Brown, Gillian. Domestic Individualism: Imagining Self in Nineteenth-Century American. Berkeley: Univ. of California Press, 1990.

Bunyan, John. The Pilgrim's Progress. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1965.

Candler, John. West Indies. Extracts from the Journal of John Candler. Whilst Travelling in Jamaica. London: Harvey and Darton, 1840,41.

Carby, Hazel V. Reconstructing Womanhood: The Emergence of the Afro-American Woman Novelist. New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1987.

Carmichael, Mrs. Domestic Manner and Social Conditions of the White, Colored and Negro Population of the West Indies...Vol. 1. London: Whittaker, Treacher & Co., 1833.

Chambers-Schiller, Lee. "A Good Work Among the People: The Political Culture of the Boston Anti-Slavery Fair" in The Abolitionist Sisterhood, ed. Yellin and Van Horne. Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1994.

Child, Lydia Maria. The Right Way The Safe Way, Proved by Emancipation in the British West Indies and Elsewhere. New York: Negro Universities Press, 1969 [reprint of 1862 ed].

Clifford, James. "Travelling Cultures," in Cultural Studies. Ed. Paula Treichler et al. New York: Routledge, 1992.

Culley, Margo. "What a Piece of Work is 'Woman'! An Introduction," in American Women's Autobiography: Fea(s)ts of Memory. Ed. by Culley. Madison: Univ. of Wisconsin Press, 1992.

Curtin, Philip D. Two Jamaicas: The Role of Ideas in a Tropical Colony, 1830-65. Cambridge: Harvard Univ. Press, 1955.

Curtiss, Mina. "Some American Negroes in Russia in the Nineteenth Century." Massachusetts Review, Spring, 1968, Vol IX, No. 2.

Davies, Carole Boyce. Black Women, Writing and Identity. Migrations of the Subject. New York: Routledge, 1994.

Delany, Martin. The Condition, Elevation, and Destiny of Colored People in the U.S. New York: Arno Press, 1968 [reprint of 1852 ed]

Edwards, Paul, Editor. Equiano's Travels. London: Heinemann, 1967.

Equiano, Olaudah. The Interesting Narrative of the Life of Olaudah Equiano, or Gustavus Vassa, The African in The Classic Slave Narratives, ed. Henry Louis Gates, Jr. New York: New American Library, 1987.

Ferguson, Moira. Colonialism and Gender Relations From Mary Wollstonecraft to Jamaica Kincaid. New York: Columbia UP, 1993.

Foster, Frances Smith. "Adding Color and Contour to Early American Self-Portraitures: Autobiographical Writings of Afro-American Women." In Conjuring: Black Women, Fiction and Literary Tradition. Eds. Marjorie Pryse and Hortense Spillers. Bloomington: Indiana Univ. Press, 1985.

_____. Written By Herself, Literary Production by African American Women, 1746-1892. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1993.

Frederick, Bonnie and Susan H. Mcleod. Woman and the Journey:The Female Travel Experience. Pullman: Washington State Univ. Press, 1993.

Friedman, Lawrence J. Gregarious Saints: Self and Community in American Abolition, 1830-1870. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press.

Garrison, William Lloyd. Thoughts on African Colonization. New York: Arno Press, 1968 [Reprint of 1832 edition].

Gates, Henry Louis Jr. Figures in Black: Words, Signs and the'Racial' Self. New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1987.

Gilroy, Paul. The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double Consciousness. Cambridge: Harvard Univ. Press, 1993.

Grimke, Sarah. Letters on the Equality of the Sexes and Other Essays. Ed and with an introduction by Elizabeth Ann Bartlett. New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 1988.

Grimshaw, William H. Official History of Freemasonry Among the Colored People In America. New York: Macoy Publishing and Masonic Supply Co., 1971.

Grosz, Elizabeth. Volatile Bodies: Toward A Corporeal Feminism. St. Leonards, Austrailia: Allen & Unwin.

Gruesser, John C. "Afro-American Travel Literature and Africanist Discourse," Black American Literature Forum. Spring, 1990, 5-20.

Gurney, Joseph J. Familiar Letters to Henry Clay of Kentucky Describing A Winter in the West Indies. New York: Mahlon Day & Co., 1840.

Hall, Douglas. "Jamaica" in Neither Slave Nor Free: The Freed Man of African Descent in the Slave Societies of the New World. Eds. David W. Cohen and Jack P. Greene Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Univ. Press, 1972.

Hansen, Debra Gold. "The Boston Female Anti-Slavery Society and the Limits of Gender Politics" in The Abolitionist Sisterhood, eds. Jean F. Yellin and John Van Horne. Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1994.

Hartsock,Nancy. Money Sex and Power: Toward a Feminist Historical Materialism. New York: Longman, 1983.

Hilton, John T. "Reminiscences" in The Woman's Era, August 1894, 4-5.

Horton, James Oliver and Lois E. Horton. "The Affirmation of Manhood: Black Garrisonions in Antebellum America," in Courage and Conscience: Black and White Abolitionists in Boston. Ed. by Donald M. Jacobs. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1993.

_____. Black Bostonians: Family Life and Community Struggle in the Antebellum North. New York: Holmes & Meier, 1979.

Horton, James Oliver. Free People of Color: Inside the African American Community. Washington, D.C.: Smithsonian Institute Press, 1993.

Houchins, Sue E. "Introduction" to Spiritual Narratives. New York: Oxford/Schomburg Library, 1988.

Hunter, J. Paul. The Reluctant Pilgrim. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Univ. Press, 1966.

Jacobs, Donald M. "A History of the Boston Negro from The Revolution to the Civil War." Dissertation, Boston University, 1968.

_____. "W.L. Garrison's Liberator and Boston's Blacks 1830-65." New Eng Quarterly, June, 1971, 259-277.

James, Stanlie M. Theorizing Black Feminisms: The Visionary Pragmatism of Black Women. London & New York: Routledge,1993.

Jensen, Joan M. and Sue Davidson, Eds. A Needle, A Bobbin, A Strike: Women Needleworkers in America. Philadelphia: Temple Univ. Press, 1984.

Jones, Jacqueline. Labor of Love, Labor of Sorrow, Black Women,Work and The Family from Slavery to the Present. New York: Basic Books, 1985.

Kish-Sklar, Kathryn. "Women Who Speak for an Entire Nation: American and British Women at the World Anti-Slavery Convention, London, 1840." In The Abolitionist Sisterhood,eds. Yellin and Van Horne.

Kolchin, Peter. Unfree Labor: American Slavery and Russian Serfdom. Cambridge: The Belknap Press of Harvard Univ. Press, 1987.

Kolodny, Annette. The Land Before Her: Fantasy and Experience of the American Frontiers, 1630-1860. Chapel Hill: Univ. Of North Carolina Press, 1984.

Lawrence, Karen R. Penelope Voyages. Women and Travel in the British Literary Tradition. Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press,1994.

Leed, Eric J. The Mind of the Traveler. New York: Basic Books,1991.

Levesque, George A. "Inherent Reformers--Inherited Orthodoxy: Black Baptists in Boston, 1800-1873." Journal of Negro History. No. 4, 1975, 490-525.

Lewis, Matthew Gregory. Journal of a West India Proprietor, Kept During a Residence in the Island of Jamaica. London: John Murray, 1834.

Meyer, Annie Nathan, Ed. Woman's Work in America. New York: Henry Holt & Co, 1891.

Michie, Helena. The Flesh Made Word: Female Figures and Women's Bodies. New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1987.

Miller, Floyd J. The Search for a Black Nationality: Black Emigration and Colonization, 1787-1863. Urbana: Univ. of Illinois Press, 1975.

Mills, Sara. Discourses of Difference: An Analysis of Women's Travel Writing and Colonialism. London: Routledge, 1993.

Murdoch, Kenneth B. Literature and Theology in Colonial New England. Westport, Ct: Greenwood Press, 1970.

Painter, Nell. "Difference, Slavery and Memory: Sojourner Truth in Feminist Abolition" in The Abolitionist Sisterhood, Eds. Yellin and Van Horne.

Peck, Nathaniel and Thomas S. Price. Report of Messers. Peck and Price...Delegates to Visit British Guiana and the Island of Trinidad for the purpose of Ascertaining the Advantage to be Derived by Colored People Migrating... Baltimore: Woods & Crane, 1840.

Penny, Virginia. Five Hundred Employments Adapted to Women with Average Rate of Pay in Each. Philadelphia: John E. Potter & Co., 1868.

Peterson, Carla L. "Doers of the Word: Theorizing African-American Women Writers in the Antebellum North," in The (Other) American Tradition ed. by Joyce W. Warren. New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 1993.

_____. "Doers of the Word" African-American Women Speakers and Writers in the North, 1830-1880. New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1995.

Pratt, Mary Louise. Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation. New York: Routledge, 1992.

Prince, Nancy. A Narrative of the Life and Travels of Mrs. Nancy Prince. Written by Herself. Second Edition. in Collected Black Women's Narratives ed. Henry Louis Gates. New York: Oxford/Schomberg Library, 1988 [Reprint of 1853 edition]

_____.The West Indies, Being A description of the Islands, Progress of Christianity, Education and Liberty Among the Colored Population Generally. Boston: Dow & Jackson,1841.

_____. Letter, to "Mr. Garrison," The Liberator, Boston, Sept. 17, 1841.

_____. Letter, "To the Public," The Anti-Slavery Standard, New York, May 25, 1843.

Reynolds, David S. Beneath the American Renaissance: The Subversive Imagination in the Age of Emerson and Melville. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1988.

Ripley, C. Peter, Ed. Black Abolitionist Papers. Chapel Hill:Univ. Of North Carolina Press, 1985.

_____ et al, Eds. Witness for Freedom: African American Voices on Race, Slavery and Emancipation.Chapel Hill: Univ. of North Carolina Press, 1993.

Rosezelle, Pat Alake and Maria C. Lugones. "Sisterhood and Friendship as Feminist Models" in The Knowledge Explosion:Generations of Feminist Scholarship. Ed. Cheris Kramarae and Dale Spender. New York: Teachers College/Athene Series, 1992.

Schuler, Monica. "Alas, Alas Kongo": A Social History of Indentured African Immigration into Jamaica, 1841-65. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Univ. Press, 1980.

Smith, Sidonie and Julia Watson. "De/Colonization and the Politics of Discourse in Women's Autobiographical Practices"in Decolonizing the Subject: The Politics of Gender in Women's Autobiography. Minneapolis: Univ. of Minnesota Press, 1992.

Smith, Stephanie A. "Heart Attacks: Frederick Douglass's Strategic Sentimentality," Criticism, 34, Spring 1992.

Smith-Rosenberg, Carroll. "Domesticating 'Virtue': Coquettes and Revolutionaries in Young America" in Literature and the Body: Essays on Populations and Persons. Selected Papers from the English Institute. Ed. Elaine Scarry. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Univ. Press, 1986.

_____. Disorderly Conduct: Visions of Gender in Victorian America. New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1985.

Spenser, Stacy. "Women Writers and the Literary Journey, 1832-44," Dissertation, University of Michigan, 1991.

Spurr, David. The Rhetoric of Empire: Colonial Discourse in Journalism, Travel Writing and Imperial Administration. Durham: Duke Univ. Press, 1993.

Stanton, Elizabeth Cady et al. History of Woman Suffrage. Vol 1. 1848-1861. Salem, N.H: Ayer Publishing, 1985

Stephens, John L. Incidents of Travel in Greece, Turkey, Russia and Poland Vol II. New York: Harper & Bros. 1840.

Stewart, Maria W. Essays and Speeches in Maria W. Stewart, America's First Black Woman Political Writer. Ed. Marilyn Richardson. Bloomington: Indiana Univ. Press, 1987.

Stewart, Robert J. Religion and Society in Post-Emancipation Jamaica. Knoxville: Univ. of Tennessee Press, 1992.

Sturge, Joseph and Thomas Harvey. The West Indies in 1837. London: Dawsons of Pall Mall, 1968 [reprint of 1838 ed.]

Thomas, Mary Elizabeth. Jamaica and Voluntary Laborers from Africa, 1840-65. Gainesville: Univ. Presses of Florida, 1974.

Trollope, Anthony. The West Indies and the Spanish Main. London: Dawson's of Pall Mall, 1968 [Reprint of 1860 edition]

Turner, Edward R. The Negro In Pennsylvania--Slavery, Servitude, Freedom 1639-1861. New York: Arno Press, 1969 [reprint of 1911 ed.]

Waddell, Hope Masterton. Twenty-Nine Years in The West Indies and Central Africa, A Review of Missionary Work and Adventure 1829-58. London: T. Nelson & Sons, 1863.

Walters, Ronald G. "Introduction," to A Black Woman's Odyssey Through Russia and Jamaica: The Narrative of Nancy Prince. New York: Markus Wiener, 1990.

Wesley, Charles H. Prince Hall: Life and Legacy. Wash. D.C.: U.S.Supreme Council 1977.

Williams, James. Narrative of Events Since the First of August, 1834 by J.W. an Apprenticed Laborer in Jamaica. London: John Haddon, 1838.

Wright, Philip. Introduction, to The West Indies in 1838 by Joseph Sturge and Thomas Harvey. London: Dawsons of Pall Mall, 1968.

Yee, Shirley J. Black Women Abolitionists: A Study in Activism, 1828-1860. Knoxville: Univ. of Tennessee Press, 1992.

WORKS CITED--CHAPTER TWO

Travelling Medicine Chest: Mary Seacole "Plays Doctor" in Panama and the Crimea

Acterberg, Jeanne. Woman As Healer. Boston: Shambala, 1991.

Alexander, Ziggi and Audrey Dewjee. "Editor's Introduction" Wonderful Adventures of Mrs. Seacole in Many Lands Bristol: Falling Wall Press, 1984.

_____. Mary Seacole: Jamaican National Heroine and 'Doctress' in the Crimean War. London: Brent Library Service, 1982.

Atkins, John Black. The Life of Sir William H. Russell, The First Special Correspondent. Vol 1. London: John Murray, 1911.

Barthold, Bonnie. Black Time: Fiction of Africa, The Caribbean and the United States. New Haven: Yale UP, 1981.

Beckwith, Martha. Black Roadways: A Study of Jamaican Folk Life. New York: Negro Universities Press, 1969.

Bhabha, Homi K. "The Postcolonial Critic" Arena, 96 (1991) 47-63.

Blunt, Alison. Travel, Gender, and Imperialism:Mary Kingsley and West Africa. New York: The Guilford Press, 1994.

Bolster, Evelyn. The Sisters of Mercy in the Crimean War. Cork:The Mercier Press, 1964.

Brathwaite, Edward. The Development of Creole Society in Jamaica,1770-1820. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1978.

Bush, Barbara. Slave Women in Caribbean Society, 1650-1838. Bloomington: Indiana Univ. Press, 1990.

Butler, Judith. Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity. New York: Routledge, 1990.

Cantor, Milton. "The Image of the Negro in Colonial Literature," in Images of the Negro in American Literature ed. Seymour Gross and John Hardy. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1966.

Compton, Piers. Colonel's Lady and Camp Follower.The Story of Women in the Crimean War.New York: St.Martin's 1970.

Cook, Sir Edward. The Life of Florence Nightingale. London: McMillian, 1914.

Curtiss, John Shelton. Russia's Crimean War. Durham: Duke Univ. Press, 1979.

Douglass, Frederick. Narrative of the Life of Frederick Douglass. in The Classic Slave Narratives ed. Henry Louis Gates, Jr. New York: New American Library, 1987.

Ehrenreich, Barbara and Deidre English. Witches, Midwives and Nurses: A History of Women Healers. Old Westbury: The Feminist Press, 1973.

Enloe, Cynthia. Bananas, Beaches and Bases: Making Feminist Sense of International Politics. Berkeley: Univ. Of California Press, 1990.

_____. Does Khaki Become You? The Militarization of Women's Lives. Boston: South End Press, 1983.

Fanon, Frantz. Black Skin, White Masks. New York: Grove, 1967.

Foote, Mrs. Recollection of Central American and the West Coast of Africa. London: T. Cautley Newby, 1869.

Foucault, Michel. The Order of Things, An Archaeology of the Human Sciences. New York: Vintage, 1994.

Fryer, Peter. Staying Power: The History of Black People in Britain. London: Pluto Press, 1984.

Fussell, Paul, Ed. The Norton Book of Travel. New York: W.W. Norton, 1987.

Gallagher, Jean. "The World Wars and The Female Gaze," Ph.D. Dissertation, Grad. School, City University of New York, 1994.

Gates, Henry Louis Jr. Figures in Black: Words, Signs and the 'Racial Self. New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1987.

Gilroy, Paul. 'There Ain't No Black in the Union Jack' The Cultural Politics of Race and Nation. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1987.

The Gleaner (Kingston, Jamaica) from Schomburg Library Clipping file on Mary Seacole.

Griswold, C.D. The Isthmus of Panama and What I Saw There. New York: Dewitt and Davenport, 1852.

Hall, Douglas. "Jamaica"in Neither Slave Nor Free: The Freedman of African Descent in the Slave Societies of the New World. Ed. D. Cohen and J. Greene. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins UP,1972.

Helsinger, Elizabeth K. et al, eds. The Woman Question: Society and Literature in Britain and America, 1837-1883. Vol. 3 New York: Garland, 1983.

Higginbotham, Evelyn. "African American Women's History and the Metalanguage of Race" Signs 17, Winter, 1992, 251-274.

Hoetlink, H. The Two Variants in Caribbean Race Relations. Translated from the Dutch by Eva M. Hooykaas. London: Institute of Race Relations/Oxford University Press, 1967.

Holliday, J.S. The World Rushed in: The California Gold Rush Experience An Eyewitness Account of Nation Heading West. New York: Simon & Schuster, 1981.

hooks, bell. "Selling Hot Pussy: Representations of Black Female Sexuality in the Cultural Marketplace" in Black Looks: Race and Representation. Boston: South End, 1992.

Jackson, Donald Dale. Gold Dust. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1980.

Kaler, Anne K. The Picara: From Hera to Fantasy Heroine. Bowling Green: Bowling Green Popular Press, 1991.

Kelly, Mrs. Tom. From the Fleet in the Fifties: A History of the Crimean War. London: Hurst & Blackett, 1902.

Kinglake, Alexander. The Invasion of the Crimea. London: Blackwood, 1887.

Leed, Eric. The Mind of the Traveler from Gilgamesh to Global Tourism. New York: Basic Books, 1991.

Letts, J.M. California Illustrated. New York: 1852.

Mills, Sara. Discourses of Difference: An Analysis of Women's Travel Writing and Colonialism. New York: Routledge, 1993.

Paquet, Sandra Pouchet. "The Enigma of Arrival: The Wonderful Adventures of Mrs. Seacole in Many Lands. African American Review. Vol. 26, Number 4, 1992, 651-663.

Pigou, Elizabeth. "A Note on Afro-Jamaican Beliefs and Rituals"Jamaica Journal, May-June, 1987.

Pratt, Mary Louise. Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation. New York: Routledge, 1992.

Reid, Douglas Arthur. Memories of the Crimean War, Jan. 1855-June 1856. London: The St. Catherine Press, 1911.

_____. Soldier-Surgeon The Crimean War Letters of Dr.Douglas Reid. Eds. Joseph O. Baylen and Alan Conway. Knoxville: Univ. of Tennessee Press, 1968.

Robinson, Amy. "Authority and the Public Display of Identity: Wonderful Adventures of Mrs. Seacole in Many Lands." Feminist Studies 20, No. 3 Fall 1994, 537-557.

Rogers, J.A. World's Great Men of Color. Vol. II. New York, 1947.

Ruddick, Sara. "Notes Toward a Feminist Peace Politics" in Gendering War Talk ed. Miriam Cooke and Angela Woollacott. Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1993.

Scarry, Elaine. The Body In Pain: The Making and Unmaking of the World. New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1985.

Seacole, Mary. Wonderful Adventures of Mrs. Seacole in Many Lands. Edited by W.J.S. with an Introductory Preface by W.H.Russell. London: James Blackwood, 1857.

Shepard, John. The Crimean Doctors: A History of the British Medical Services in the Crimean War. Liverpool: Liverpool Univ. Press, 1991.

Sigsworth, E.M. and T.J. Wyke. "A Study of Victorian Prostitution and Venereal Disease" in Suffer and Be Still: Women in the Victorian Age. Ed. Martha Vicinus. Bloomington: Indiana Univ. Press, 1972.

Smith, Sidonie and Julia Watson. "De/Colonization and the Politics of Discourse in Women's Autobiographical Practices" in De/Colonizing the Subject. ed. by Smith and Watson. Minneapolis: Univ. of Minnesota Press, 1992.

Soyer, Alexis. Soyer's Culinary Campaign. London: G. Routledge & Co., 1857.

Starr, Paul. The Social Transformation of American Medicine. New York: Basic Books, 1982.

Summers, Anne. Angels and Citizens: British Women as Military Nurses 1854-1914. London: Routledge Kegan Paul, 1988.

_____. "Pride and Prejudice: Ladies and Nurses in the Crimean War." History Workshop,16, Autumn, 1983, 32-56.

Taylor, Bayard. Eldorado or Adventures in the Path of Empire. New York: George P. Putnam & Co., 1856

Trollope, Anthony. The West Indies and the Spanish Main. London: Dawsons of Pall Mall, 1968. [Reprint of 1860 edition]

Vicinus, Martha. Independent Women: Work and Community for Single Women, 1850-1920. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press,1985.

_____. Suffer and Be Still: Women in the Victorian Age. Bloomington: Indiana Univ. Press, 1972.

Walcott, R.A. Letter to the Editor, Kingston Gleaner, July 27, 1905. From Schomburg Library Clipping File.

Wilkins, Nadine. "The Medical Profession in Jamaica in the Post-Emancipation Period." Jamaica Journal Vol. 21, No. 4, Nov. 1988-Jan. 1989, 27-32.

Woolf, Virginia. A Room of One's Own. New York: HBJ, 1957.

Young, Robert J.C. Colonial Desire: Hybridity in Theory, Culture and Race. London: Routledge, 1995.

WORKS CITED--CHAPTER THREE

Encountering Hybridity: Margaret Fuller and America in Transition

Abrams, M.H. Natural Supernatural: Tradition and Revolution in Romantic Literature. New York: W.W. Norton, 1971.

Adams, Stephen. "'That Tidiness We Look for in Woman': Fuller's Summer on the Lakes and Romantic Aesthetics." Studies in the American Renaissance (1987):247-64.

Avallone, Charlene. "The Red Roots of White Feminism in Margaret Fuller's Writings" forthcoming, Revisioning Knowledge and the Curriculum:Feminist Perspectives. Lansing: MSU Press

Bakhtin, M.M. Problems of Dostoyevsky's Poetics. Trans. Caryl Emerson. Minneapolis: Univ. Of Minnesota Press, 1984.

_____. Rabalais and His World. Trans. Helene Iswolsky. Cambridge: MIT Press, 1968.

Baym, Nina. American Woman Writers and the Work of History, 1790-1860. New Brunswick: Rutgers Univ. Press, 1995.

Berg, Martha L. and Alice De V. Perry. "The Impulses of Human Nature: Margaret Fuller's Journal from June Through October 1844." Proceeds of the Massachusetts Historical Society, Vol. CII, 1990:38-126.

Berger, John. Ways of Seeing. London: BBC and Penguin, 1972.

Blanchard, Paula. Margaret Fuller: From Transcendentalism to Revolution. Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley, 1987.

Braude, Ann. Radical Spirits: Spiritualism and Women's Rights in Nineteenth Century America. Boston: Beacon Press, 1989.

Braun, Frederick A. Margaret Fuller and Goethe. New York: Henry Holt and Co., 1910.

Buzard, James. The Beaten Track: European Tourism Literature and the Ways To Culture, 1800-1918. Oxford: Clarendon Press,1993.

Cameron, Sharon. Feminism and Linguistic Theory. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1985.

Catlin, George. Letters and Notes on the Manners, Customs and Conditions of North American Indians. Vol. 2. New York: Dover Publications, 1973 [Reprint of 1844 edition]

Capper, Charles. Margaret Fuller: An American Romantic Life: The Private Years. New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1992.

Clement, Catherine and Helene Cixous. "The Guilty One," in The Newly Born Woman. Minneapolis: The Univ. Of Minnesota Press, 1988.

Clifford, James. "Travelling Cultures" in Cultural Studies Ed. Paula Treichler et al. New York: Routledge, 1992.

Ellison, Julie. Delicate Subjects: Romanticism, Gender and the Ethics of Understanding. Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1990.

Fuller, Margaret (Ossoli). Life Without and Life Within Or: Reviews, Narratives, Essays and Poems. Ed. by Arthur B. Fuller. Boston: Brown, Taggard and Chase, 1859.

_____. Memoirs of Margaret Fuller Ossoli. Ed. R.W. Emerson, J.F. Clarke, and W.H. Channing. 2 vols. Boston: Phillips, Sampson, 1852.

_____. Papers on Literature and Art. New York: Wiley & Putnam, 1846.

_____. Summer on the Lakes, in 1843. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1991.

_____. Women in the Nineteenth Century. New York: W.W. Norton & Co., 1971.

Gilbert, Sandra M. and Susan Gubar. The Madwoman in the Attic. New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 1979.

Gilpin, William. Three Essays: On Picturesque Beauty, On Picturesque Travel and On Sketching Landscape. Westmead, Hants: Gregg International Ltd, 1972 [Facsimile of 1792 ed]

Glaser, Hermann. The German Mind of the 19th Century: A Literary and Historical Anthology. New York: Continuum, 1981.

Haraway, Donna J. Simians, Cyborgs and Women: The Reinvention of Nature. New York: Routledge, 1991.

Harpham, Geoffrey Galt. On the Grotesque: Strategies of Contradiction in Art and Literature. Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1982.

Hirsch, Pam. "Barbara Leigh Smith Bodichon: Artist and Activist" in Women in the Victorian Art World. Ed. Clarissa Campbell Orr. Manchester: Manchester Univ. Press.

Horsman, Reginald. Race and Manifest Destiny: The Origins of American Racial Anglo-Saxonism. Cambridge: Harvard Univ. Press, 1981.

Hudspeth, Robert. The Letters of Margaret Fuller. 6 Vols. Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1982-1994.

Hutchinson, Steven. Cervantine Journeys. Madison: Univ. of Wisconsin Press, 1992.

Kolodny, Annette. The Land Before Her: Fantasy and Experience of the American Frontiers, 1630-1860. Chapel Hill: Univ. of North Carolina Press, 1984.

Leavy, Barbara Fass. In Search of the Swan Maiden: A Narrative on Folklore and Gender. New York: NYU Press, 1994.

Levin, David Michael. The Opening of Vision. New York: Routledge, 1988.

Min-ha, Trinh T. "Other than Myself/My Other Self" in Travellers Tales: Narratives of Home and Displacement. Ed. George Robertson et al. London and New York: Routledge, 1994.

Moers, Ellen. Literary Women: The Great Writers. Garden City, NY: Anchor/Doubleday, 1977.

Peabody, Elizabeth P. "Fourierism," The Dial April, 1844, 473-483.

Rosowski, Susan J. "Margaret Fuller, and Engendered West and Summer on the Lakes. Western American Literature, Vol XXV No. 2, August 1990, 125-144.

Sellers, Pamela Cheetwood. "Margaret Fuller's Summer on the Lakes, in 1843: It is not Good Enough Merely to Be Here." Ph.D. Dissertation, Michigan State Univ., 1992.

Showalter, Elaine. "Miranda and Cassandra: The Discourse of the Feminist Intellectual" in Tradition and the Talents of Women, ed. Florence Howe. Urbana: Univ. of

Illinois Press, 1991.

Smith, Susan Belasco. "Summer on the Lakes: Margaret Fuller and the British," Resources for American Literary Study, Vol. XVII. No. 2, 1991, 191-207.

Spenser, Stacy. "Women Writers and the Literary Journey, 1832-44." Doctoral Dissertation, Univ. of Michigan, 1990.

Stallybrass, Peter. "Patriarchal Territories: The Body Enclosed"in Rewriting the Renaissance. Ed. Margaret W. Ferguson et al. Chicago: Univ. Of Chicago Press, 1986.

_____ and Allon White. The Politics and Poetics of Transgression. Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1986.

Steele, Jeffrey. "The Call of Eurydice: Mourning and Intertextuality in the Writing of Margaret Fuller" in Influence and Intertextuality In Literary History. Ed. Eric Rothstein and Jay Clayton. Madison: Univ. Of Wisconsin Press, 1991.

_____, Editor. "Introduction" The Essential Margaret Fuller. New Brunswick: Rutgers Univ. Press, 1992.

_____. The Representation of the Self in the American Renaissance. Chapel Hill: Univ. of North Carolina Press, 1987.

Tonkovich, Nicole. "Traveling in the West, Writing in the Library: Margaret Fuller's Summer on the Lakes" in Legacy, Vol. 10, No. 2, 1993, 79-102.

Townshend, Chauncey Hare. Facts on Mesmerism With Reasons for A Dispassionate Inquiry into it. New York: Harper & Bros.,1842.

Young, Robert J.C. Colonial Desire: Hybridity in Theory, Culture and Race. London and New York: Routledge, 1995.

Zwarg, Christina. Feminist Conversations: Fuller, Emerson and the Play of Reading. Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 1995.